

# **Globalization, Prostitution and Sex-Trafficking**

Corporeal politics

**Elina Penttinen**

Routledge Advances in International Relations and  
Global Politics

# Globalization, Prostitution and Sex-Trafficking

Globalization has been traditionally interpreted as a phenomenon that takes place at macro level and is determined by states and markets. This book takes a different approach to understanding globalization, showing how, through the global sex trade, globalization is embodied and enacted by individuals.

*Globalization, Prostitution and Sex-Trafficking* illustrates how the global sex industry feeds on complex global flows. Drawing on extensive fieldwork on the trafficking of Russian and Baltic female sex workers, the author demonstrates how the embodiment and reiteration of globalization on the bodies of gendered individuals are tied to the larger processes of globalization. In this book Appadurai's framework of landscapes of globalization is developed into a framework of shadow sexscapes in order to illustrate how the global sex industry feeds on complex global flows and in turn operates as a form of shadow globalization.

This book will be of interest to students and researchers of international relations, globalization and gender studies.

**Elina Penttinen** is a postdoctoral researcher at Tampere Peace Research Institute (TAPRI) at the University of Tampere, Finland.

## Routledge advances in international relations and global politics

- 1 Foreign Policy and Discourse Analysis**  
France, Britain and Europe  
*Henrik Larsen*
- 2 Agency, Structure and International Politics**  
From ontology to empirical enquiry  
*Gil Friedman and Harvey Starr*
- 3 The Political Economy of Regional Co-operation in the Middle East**  
*Ali Carkoglu, Mine Eder and Kemal Kirisci*
- 4 Peace Maintenance**  
The evolution of international political authority  
*Jarat Chopra*
- 5 International Relations and Historical Sociology**  
Breaking down boundaries  
*Stephen Hobden*
- 6 Equivalence in Comparative Politics**  
*Edited by Jan W. van Deth*
- 7 The Politics of Central Banks**  
*Robert Elgie and Helen Thompson*
- 8 Politics and Globalisation**  
Knowledge, ethics and agency  
*Martin Shaw*
- 9 History and International Relations**  
*Thomas W. Smith*
- 10 Idealism and Realism in International Relations**  
*Robert M. A. Crawford*
- 11 National and International Conflicts, 1945–1995**  
New empirical and theoretical approaches  
*Frank Pfetsch and Christoph Rohloff*
- 12 Party Systems and Voter Alignments Revisited**  
*Edited by Lauri Karvonen and Stein Kuhnle*
- 13 Ethics, Justice & International Relations**  
Constructing an international community  
*Peter Sutch*
- 14 Capturing Globalization**  
*Edited by James H. Mittelman and Norani Othman*

- 15 Uncertain Europe**  
Building a new European security order?  
*Edited by Martin A. Smith and Graham Timmins*
- 16 Power, Postcolonialism and International Relations**  
Reading race, gender and class  
*Edited by Geeta Chowdhry and Sheila Nair*
- 17 Constituting Human Rights**  
Global civil society and the society of democratic states  
*Mervyn Frost*
- 18 US Economic Statecraft for Survival 1933–1991**  
Of sanctions, embargoes and economic warfare  
*Alan P. Dobson*
- 19 The EU and NATO Enlargement**  
*Richard McAllister and Roland Dannreuther*
- 20 Spatializing International Politics**  
Analysing activism on the internet  
*Jayne Rodgers*
- 21 Ethnonationalism in the Contemporary World**  
Walker Connor and the study of nationalism  
*Edited by Daniele Conversi*
- 22 Meaning and International Relations**  
*Edited by Peter Mandaville and Andrew Williams*
- 23 Political Loyalty and the Nation-State**  
*Edited by Michael Waller and Andrew Linklater*
- 24 Russian Foreign Policy and the CIS**  
Theories, debates and actions  
*Nicole J. Jackson*
- 25 Asia and Europe**  
Development and different dimensions of ASEM  
*Yeo Lay Hwee*
- 26 Global Instability and Strategic Crisis**  
*Neville Brown*
- 27 Africa in International Politics**  
External involvement on the continent  
*Edited by Ian Taylor and Paul Williams*
- 28 Global Governmentality**  
Governing international spaces  
*Edited by Wendy Larner and William Walters*
- 29 Political Learning and Citizenship Education Under Conflict**  
The political socialization of Israeli and Palestinian youngsters  
*Orit Ichilov*
- 30 Gender and Civil Society**  
Transcending boundaries  
*Edited by Jude Howell and Diane Mulligan*

- 31 State Crises, Globalisation and National Movements in North-East Africa**  
The Horn's dilemma  
*Edited by Asafa Jalata*
- 32 Diplomacy and Developing Nations**  
Post-Cold War foreign policy-making structures and processes  
*Edited by Justin Robertson and Maurice A. East*
- 33 Autonomy, Self-governance and Conflict Resolution**  
Innovative approaches to institutional design in divided societies  
*Edited by Marc Weller and Stefan Wolff*
- 34 Mediating International Crises**  
*Jonathan Wilkenfeld,  
Kathleen J. Young,  
David M. Quinn and Victor Asal*
- 35 Postcolonial Politics, the Internet and Everyday Life**  
Pacific traversals online  
*M. I. Franklin*
- 36 Reconstituting the Global Liberal Order**  
Legitimacy and regulation  
*Kanishka Jayasuriya*
- 37 International Relations, Security and Jeremy Bentham**  
*Gunhild Hoogensen*
- 38 Interregionalism and International Relations**  
*Edited by Heiner Hänggi,  
Ralf Roloff and Jürgen Rüländ*
- 39 The International Criminal Court**  
A global civil society achievement  
*Marlies Glasius*
- 40 A Human Security Doctrine for Europe**  
Project, principles, practicalities  
*Edited by Marlies Glasius and Mary Kaldor*
- 41 The History and Politics of UN Security Council Reform**  
*Dimitris Bourantonis*
- 42 Russia and NATO Since 1991**  
From cold war through cold peace to partnership?  
*Martin A. Smith*
- 43 The Politics of Protection**  
Sites of insecurity and political agency  
*Edited by Jef Huysmans,  
Andrew Dobson and Raia Prokhovnik*
- 44 International Relations in Europe**  
Traditions, perspectives and destinations  
*Edited by Knud Erik Jørgensen and Tonny Brems Knudsen*
- 45 The Empire of Security and the Safety of the People**  
*Edited by William Bain*
- 46 Globalization and Religious Nationalism in India**  
The search for ontological security  
*Catrina Kinnvall*

- 47 Culture and International Relations**  
Narratives, natives and tourists  
*Julie Reeves*
- 48 Global Civil Society**  
Contested futures  
*Edited by Gideon Baker and David Chandler*
- 49 Rethinking Ethical Foreign Policy**  
Pitfalls, possibilities and paradoxes  
*Edited by David Chandler and Volker Heins*
- 50 International Cooperation and Arctic Governance**  
Regime effectiveness and northern region building  
*Edited by Olav Schram Stokke and Geir Hønneland*
- 51 Human Security**  
Concepts and implications  
*Shahrbanou Tadjbakhsh and Anuradha Chenoy*
- 52 International Relations and Security in the Digital Age**  
*Edited by Johan Eriksson and Giampiero Giacomello*
- 53 State-Building**  
Theory and practice  
*Edited by Aidan Hehir and Neil Robinson*
- 54 Violence and Non-Violence in Africa**  
*Edited by Pal Ahluwalia, Louise Bethlehem and Ruth Ginio*
- 55 Developing Countries and Global Trade Negotiations**  
*Edited by Larry Crump and S. Javed Maswood*
- 56 Civil Society, Religion and Global Governance**  
Paradigms of power and persuasion  
*Edited by Helen James*
- 57 War, Peace and Hegemony in a Globalized World**  
The changing balance of power in the 21st century  
*Edited by Chandra Chari*
- 58 Economic Globalisation as Religious War**  
Tragic convergence  
*Michael McKinley*
- 59 Globalization, Prostitution and Sex-Trafficking**  
Corporeal politics  
*Elina Penttinen*



# **Globalization, Prostitution and Sex-Trafficking**

Corporeal politics

**Elina Penttinen**

First published 2008  
by Routledge  
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada  
by Routledge  
270 Madison Ave, New York, NY 10016

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business*

This edition published in the Taylor & Francis e-Library, 2007.

“To purchase your own copy of this or any of Taylor & Francis or Routledge’s collection of thousands of eBooks please go to [www.eBookstore.tandf.co.uk](http://www.eBookstore.tandf.co.uk).”

© 2008 Elina Penttinen

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilized in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data*

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

A catalog record for this book has been requested

ISBN 0-203-94542-5 Master e-book ISBN

ISBN10: 0-415-42099-7 (hbk)

ISBN10: 0-203-94542-5 (ebk)

ISBN13: 978-0-415-42099-0 (hbk)

ISBN13: 978-0-203-94542-1 (ebk)

**To Miika**



# Contents

<i>Preface</i>	xii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
1 Introduction: the silent point of globalization	1
2 Bio-power and subjectivation in the globalized world economy of sex	15
3 Sexscapes of globalization: constructions of subject and object positions in landscapes of globalization	38
4 Narratives of embodied globalization of Russian prostitutes working in the erotic clubs in Helsinki: reflections on one night in Helsinki from the position of a whore, a client and a researcher	58
5 Sounds of silence in Lapland: narratives of trafficking in women across Finnish–Russian and Norwegian borders	89
6 “The land of perverts”: the domain of subjectivity from the position of an object to the global village – narratives of foreign erotic dancers in Finland	112
7 Conclusions: narratives of corporeal politics	134
<i>Notes</i>	144
<i>Bibliography</i>	156
<i>Index</i>	164

# Preface

This book has been a journey to discover what kind of subjectivities and new forms of agency are produced by globalization. I have looked at how globalization could be understood as a form of bio-power that produces embodied subjectivity through self-discipline and adjustment to power. Following Foucault I wanted to see how globalization is inscribed on bodies and how individuals are subjectivated by globalization, that is, produced as subjects. Very soon it became clear that these subjectivities were not gender neutral; instead they were very much gendered and also ethnicized. I realized that globalization produces different forms of agency depending on one's gender and ethnicity, which concretize in the global sex industry that I see operating as a form of shadow globalization.

This exploration I have taken has meant embarking on two different journeys that at least seemed separate and very unrelated from each other at first, but which in the end merged to such an extent that I could not see them as disconnected anymore. The first exploration was about searching how a question such as the one on embodied subjectivity could be presented in the land of the international relations (IR) discipline. How in IR could I find or talk about corporeal globalization of any kind, whether masculine or feminine. At first it did seem like a futile task. On the maps that I was given were drawn primarily nation-states, their relations, and, later, international institutions and regimes, multinational corporations and other financial institutions. These maps were coherent and neat; they did not include individual bodies, or rather individual bodies as such were not effective in the international. Gendered subjectivity would have been unresearchable according to them. They were maps of the international, and they were supposed to show me what the international is and where it can be found.

With these maps I could not find the shadow neighborhoods, the marginal, the alleyways of IR, that were still in the international but polished of the mainstream IR maps. Nor could I find the more mundane, taken-for-granted things such as the kitchens, backdoors or bedrooms where the international takes place. The mainstream IR maps were disengaged from the bodies in the international and also from the very bodies that had drawn the maps in the first place.

In order to be able to find or see these embodied expressions of the inter-

national, I had to find myself another map, an alternative map. This was the one of feminist IR. It had been there all along, but I had to search for it and find it myself. It was not given to me in the way as the malestream map had been. These feminist IR maps that I found had more details; they were not simplified or polished but included a variety of subjectivities and experiences; they pointed to gendered effects of the international and how the international is done by gendered individuals. With these maps I was able to find places that were omitted from the other maps; I was able to see experiences that were excluded and hear voices that had been silenced. I was able to see how globalization is inscribed on skin.

With these maps of feminist IR in my hands I began my second exploration. This exploration did not take place in the safety of the university building, in the libraries or in the safety of my own room. It meant going out beyond office hours to places where globalization is embodied by the ethnic eroticized others – to places that can be described as the silent points of globalization, such as the nightclubs and sex bars where Russian prostitutes come to solicit their clients, erotic clubs where Baltic women strip, or parking lots and camping sites in northern Finland where the trafficked women from Murmansk take a break before continuing their journey. In these kinds of places, standard IR or social science methods proved to be completely useless. I could not make recorded interviews. I could not even make notes while we were there. I can tell you, showing up with a notepad in a sex bar will not get you very far.

But more importantly, I soon realized that it was impossible to remain in a position of a neutral observer. I could not distance myself from the field; I was there with it and my gender and ethnicity affected the way “things” turned out. And so I could not hold on to the safety of a cool and distanced IR researcher. The women I encountered always questioned why I would come to such places. They questioned my gender and my sexual orientation and also my ethnicity. I had to explain to them why I was interested in them, why I study prostitution. And why I get paid for doing research and they have to prostitute themselves. This is the kind of stuff that is polished out of IR textbooks in which individual people as research objects turn up often as numbers and statistics that cannot interrogate the researcher of her motives.

My goal was to meet with these women, engage in dialogue, listen and witness the ways in which they adjusted to the bio-power of globalization. I wanted to grasp something of their everyday lives, how they coped and managed with their position as the eroticized other. And from these meetings in the offbeat destinations at the strangest hours, I wanted to write narratives of corporeal politics of globalization, to write how globalization is enacted in these specific places, how it is embodied and reinvented by these women performing the position of the “Eastern girl.” The feminist IR maps showed me that this could be done. I was able to see and write how globalization materializes in concrete places and how it is reinvented and reproduced by gendered individuals in their everyday lives.

With the malestream IR maps, I was not able to get at these things. In the mainstream maps there were no drunken clients, no chain-smoking Russian

prostitutes, no flirting, no loud music or striptease performances or no uncomfortable researchers negotiating their identities in places where they were unwelcome. In the IR maps, the position of the writer is distanced; he writes in the neutral language of science. He has the power over the narrative, and with the neutral language he can confirm that he controls the material he is writing about. Malestream IR maps guide writers to tell coherent stories with clear beginnings and endings.

Writing in this way would have certainly been easier, and I could have at least tried to fool the audience that I had control over my research and the material. But when it came to the point that I wanted to write the report of my field research, I noticed that the story would unfold differently depending on the position I took as a writer. I could tell the IR story, with the voice from “nowhere,” but then emotions and awe could not be included. I could write an angry feminist narrative, but then many of the theoretical things that I found important would not fit in easily. I could write personal narratives of amazement that were less political and also fictive narratives of the fieldwork, which would bring the reader close to the events. These different narratives together complimented each other and I realized I could not select one single narrative with which to represent all that I wanted to say. The first story that I wanted to write was not surprisingly the narrative of IR, but in a more personal, angrier and political way. While I was writing this story, “A personal feminist voice with friends,” I noticed that my own perceptions and my own politics concerning prostitution, and sex work in general, came from my background in IR. Then I noticed that the study of IR had affected me as person. It affected the things that I would pay more attention to, things that I would value over others and things that I felt most passionate about.

But if I had just written the narrative according to mainstream IR style, important things would have been missing. I could have written out my own uncomfortable moments; I could have omitted the things that had surprised me and caught me off guard. I could have left out the things that did not go as planned, and I could have ironed out the diversity of the women’s voices and experiences of the sex work they do and also their reactions to or rather resentment of Finnish culture.

Still, mainstream maps could have been appealing. With them I would not have gotten into so much trouble. I could have kept my life a lot simpler. The IR maps were so infatuated with macro-level phenomena and nation-states that they would not get into the mess of illustrating how globalization had affected individual people. In most of these IR maps, globalization was something that happened out there; it could be pictured as being channeled by nation-states, or something that also states must subject to. It had to do with the globalization of the world economy, triumph of liberalism and master narratives of democratization. I, on the other hand, wanted to find how globalization is enacted in the everyday lives of gendered individuals, the kind of opportunities, constraints and necessities it generates. I wanted to see how globalization materializes at the level of the particular and the body, how sex-specific bodies respond to and reit-

erate the globalization they are subjected to and subjectivated by and take the Foucauldian question “*One needs to study what kind of body the current society needs....*” into the context of globalization and ask what kind of bodies the current globalized world requires and indeed produces.

I argue in this book that the body in demand in the current globalized world is the body of an eroticized exotic woman, who adapts to the rugged landscape and fitness tests posed by globalization processes, by traveling or being trafficked to the West for the purposes of sex work. She adapts to globalization by subjecting to sex work and by appropriating and enacting the position of the exotic erotic Eastern girl. This position of the Eastern girl has emerged as a site that can be appropriated by someone who is both from the East and a woman. It is a product of Western imagination. It is a position that enables also the appropriation of the truly masculine and Western subjectivity. The Eastern girl is a body that listens, which mirrors back the masculine subject so that he can gaze at himself in her.

The position of the Eastern girl can be characterized as that of an abject. She enables a client to see himself in her, and thus she forms him as a coherent subject. But her position is not simply about being an object or a victim. Her position is not simply about oppression. The abject does enable for the man to enact his subjectivity by being able to buy her time, body and services, but she also takes advantage of this performance of the erotic other. She instrumentalizes that position only to express that that is not who she is “really,” she does not tell anything of herself, she only expresses out loud those things that he wants to hear and what is expected from her as the erotic other. From this performance she can make her business.

These positions of the client and the prostitute are expressions of new kinds of agency and subjectivity that emerge at global conjunctures. They are the result of complex global flows that form what Appadurai calls landscapes of globalization. But the positions of the client and the prostitute are fundamentally different. They are both produced by globalization, but whereas the client exists in the domain of subjects of globalization, the Russian woman exists in shadow globalization. For her, globalization manifests as corporeal constraints. And whereas the client moves through the landscapes of globalization, taking advantage of new opportunities for travel and consumption, she moves and is moved in the shadow sexscapes of globalization.

I want to stress here that the sexscapes of globalization in which these women move and are moved do not need to be clear and separate red-light districts in global cities, which people can choose to either see or ignore. They can be isolated places in the landscapes of northern Finland and Norway, which are known only to the people involved in the network.

How to write about the silent points like this one in the context of the discipline of IR? Certainly it is not a task that should be given up just because it is not easy. We as IR scholars must be ready to risk the comfortable grounds that ensure our control over determining what and where the international is. We must open ourselves to be able to listen and hear beyond our preconceived ideas about the international, how it can be studied and, most importantly, what the

international can tell us. It indeed means studying the silent points, but not only that; it means voicing out loud the questions that are not safe to ask within the discipline and writing in a way that exposes our situatedness as researchers. It means moving away from monolithic master narratives toward plurality of expressions, using literature, fiction, poetry, personal narratives and the arts. It means writing in a way that the reader can feel, so that she is also compelled to care and cannot hold onto the position of a distanced spectator no more than the writer could.

We must allow ourselves to be surprised, let ourselves be uncomfortable, even cold at times, and give up the safety of our offices and books that gain dust on the shelf. I propose that we must be ready to risk the comfortable grounds of the scientist and enter into a dialogue with all those expressions of the international that do not fit easily into mainstream IR maps. I am not saying that there is no life in books or that we could not be tormented or amazed in our offices with the things we learn. Neither am I implying that the truth is out there in the real world as raw material for us to discover and make sense out of.

I believe that the discipline of IR is not so fragile that it could not handle multidisciplinary approaches, such as the new ethnography that I have used or any other innovative methods. What I propose instead is that we must be open to go beyond the things that we are used to, things we are familiar with, and not be fooled that the one map of mainstream IR would be enough to grasp the multiple manifestations of the international.

# Acknowledgments

Writing this book has taken courage and faith. It has meant taking risks in the academic traditions and also in the very research practices that have taken me out of libraries and seminars and into the world of the sex industry. And so I find myself indebted to many individuals for support and encouragement, without which this book would have never been possible.

But this project has not been only about my own faith, but even more so about the faith of my supervisors: Professor Jyrki Käkönen from the Political Science Department at the University of Tampere, who opened the possibilities for beginning this research project, and Professor Tarja Väyrynen, the Head of Tampere Peace Research Institute (TAPRI) in which I completed this manuscript. I owe warm-hearted thanks to Jyrki for believing in my project from early on and helping me to get really going with my research, even offering his own office as a place where I could write while there were no rooms available at our department and ensuring the funding of my research at Tampere University.

And Tarja, again words are not enough. I am indebted to you for so much, not only for helping to get the funding from the Academy of Finland that enabled me to complete the project and for giving me a place at TAPRI to do this work, but mostly for being there always in the right way. In the beginning when I started working at TAPRI, when I had doubts, you always restored my faith that my topic was researchable and meaningful. You called it giving ego massage and saw the moment when I needed it the most. And then, when I had completed writing all the chapters and it was time to make it into a coherent book, you urged me to always strive for clearer arguments and reader-friendly text. I thank you for demanding a lot from me. If this text is of any quality I owe it to you.

As this book was originally a PhD thesis, I find myself indebted to the reviewers, Professor Christine Sylvester and Professor Didier Bigo, for appreciating the riskier stuff in the manuscript and for restoring my faith in stretching the limits of what can be done in IR. The comments of Christine Sylvester mean the world to me, for throughout this project her writings have worked as an inspiration and example of what can be done with IR and how IR can be written. Having her read my attempts to write feminist IR is the greatest honor.

I am indebted also to Professor Matti Hyvärinen, who got me started with the narrative method and encouraged me to take the route of new ethnography,

saying “It is risky, but I can really see it working with the kind of material you have.” Without your enthusiasm with narratives and kindness in sharing your knowledge, I would have never discovered the possibilities of scientific writing that the narrative turn enables. Many warm thanks also to Professor Suvi Ronkainen, University of Lapland, who also helped me with questions on methodology and took time to give advice and also enabled me to get into contact with other colleagues working with similar questions. Many thanks also to Jaana Vuori and Tuula Gordon at the Department of Women’s Studies at Tampere University.

I am also very grateful to all my colleagues and staff at TAPRI and the Department of Political Science and International Relations at the University of Tampere. I want to thank all of you for creating an enthusiastic and intellectual and also a fun and exciting workplace. I want to especially thank Samu for being supportive and taking the time to help me with all sorts of questions and practical issues throughout these years, and Alina for her patience and sense of humor while I was completing my script for review and was going slightly mad in the office we shared.

A number of people have influenced this research process and offered their help in intellectual insights with regard to power and globalization. I have benefited enormously from discussions with Philip Cerny, Howard Lentner, Henri Goverde, Bas Arts, Mark Haugaard, Erkki Berndtson and Tomohisa Hattori. Special thanks also to Professor Stephen Gill for suggestions on how bio-power manifests in the globalized world.

I want to thank also the anonymous reviewers and their many insightful comments about the manuscript, which helped me to push it forward. Many warm thanks to Roland Caldbeck for proofreading my manuscript and for helping to put this in the final form. Without your help and advice, this project would have taken much longer and been quite arduous.

I want to thank the editors at Routledge, Heidi Bagtazo, Harriet Brinton and Amelia McLaurin, for helping out with many questions and also giving me time to edit the final manuscript.

But this book would never have been possible without my fieldwork assistants Irakli Beridze, Arseniy Svyarenko and Vazgen Arakelyan, who were willing to come with me to erotic clubs and other offbeat destinations at the strangest hours. Thank you for help in getting into contact with the Russian and Russian-Estonian women and translating their words to me and for your interpretations and comments on the things and places we have seen together. I am indebted to all the Russian and Russian-Estonian women who took their time and were willing to share their experiences and thoughts about their life in Finland with me. I also want to thank all the managers of the erotic bars in which I was allowed to do my research and talk to erotic dancers.

Many thanks also to the staff at the Pro-Support Center, Jaana Kauppinen, Minna Huovinen, Merle Hani and Maire Henno, for sharing information about prostitution in Helsinki and taking me along to sex bars.

I want to also thank the police officers in Tampere, Riihimäki, Helsinki and Ivalo for information on prostitution and procuring. Many thanks also to Rajajooseppi Border Guard Authority, especially to Lieutenant Colonel Uljas Turunen.

I am indebted to all the people in Utsjoki who were more than helpful in uncovering the trafficking scene in the region: Sirkka Kōrkkö-Guttorm, Maaret Länsman, Aslak Pieski and Elle Ravna. I want to thank all of you for your help and most of all for your friendship. I want to dedicate a fond thought to Annukka Aikio, now deceased, and thank her and her husband Samuli Aikio for opening their home to me. You not only helped me in refining my narrative on prostitution in the north of Finland, but supported me in a personal crisis that occurred while I was there.

For a working mom, one of the most crucial things is knowing that her children are well cared for. I have been fortunate to have the most inspiring and loving women with whom I could trust my children for day care during this project. I am indebted to Marja Koistinen for the excellent day care of my three children, allowing me to concentrate fully on my work. I want to thank also Eeva Launonen for helping with child care while I was on maternity leave with my second child, thus giving me much valued time for my own thoughts and editing work, and also her sisters Heli and Helena. Warm thanks also to Julia Wirén, who helped us out when our third baby was born.

I am indebted to my family and friends for their love and support during these years of research and writing. I have dedicated this book to my husband Miika, who has supported and understood my research project. I know it must have been frustrating to answer people who were always asking your thoughts and feelings about your wife going to sex bars and talking to prostitutes. I owe so much to your crazy sense of humor that pulled me out at times of despair. Thank you also for providing the practical things, taking care of the kids and the house while I was intensely working with my thesis. And certainly I owe thanks to my children Mikael, Elias and Sofia for filling all my free time with such action and speed that it was impossible to think about work-related issues.

I want to express my gratitude to my parents for their love, support and generosity and always being there for me. I owe warm thanks to my in-laws, who also volunteered to take care of the children, enabling me to fully concentrate on writing and editing. Many thanks also to all my sisters Rea, Johanna and Minna and my brother Lauri for believing in me and adding humor to my project. Many thanks also to my friends Mirka, Katja and Hanna with whom I could let out steam about the things I encountered in sex bars. Warm thanks to Karoliina for inspiration and good advice.

I am also truly and absolutely indebted to Mokkamestarit, for providing me with the fuel with which to write this book. Thank you for your excellent café latte! (Without it I would not have remained sane, or awake). And last I want to thank my two dogs, who took me out daily for mind-clarifying walks in the forest.

As already mentioned in the above narrative, this research was financially supported by the Academy of Finland, the University of Tampere, the University of Turku and also city of Tampere. A small portion of Chapter 5 has been previously published in *Canadian Woman Studies/les cahiers de la femme*, Vol. 22 No 3, 4, in the issue on Migration, Labour and Exploitation: Trafficking in Women and Girls.



# 1 Introduction

## The silent point of globalization

A Russian-Estonian woman is dancing in an erotic bar in Tampere, an expanding former industrial town, which now rides on the high tide created by boom in information technology. It is late evening and the bar, where the woman dances, is small and cozy. There are several Finnish men seated around the stage, watching her as she strips herself and dances completely naked in front of them while simulating phallic sex.<sup>1</sup> They have come to see an “Eastern girl” perform their erotic fantasies. There are no Finnish women either dancing or in the audience. There is a Finnish woman tending the bar, and this is the usual way the gendered and ethnicized labor is organized in bars like this; there is also a Finnish male bouncer. After her dance, she slips into her G-string and goes around the bar asking for tips. The men obey her and give her the usual 20 FIM (€3.50), slipping it into her G-string. This is a moment of touch and also small talk. The woman smiles and flirts and advertises a private show – a dance especially for “you.”<sup>2</sup> She makes the movements and gestures that one would associate with the stereotypical image of the female in heterosexual sex. The men seem to be pleased; they are getting their money’s worth. And what about her? In two weeks she has made 9,000 FIM (€1,500) for herself, even after all expenses have been paid and cuts taken by the bar and by her own manager. This is the kind of money that would have been impossible for her to make, let alone save, back home in Tartu, Estonia. After working for three weeks, she will go back, finish her degree in clothing design, then hopefully go on to a medical school and maybe some day work abroad for “real.”

In this short story, there are many levels of globalization taking place. The obvious point simply is that, before globalization and the breaking down of the Soviet borders, there were no such possibilities for Russian or Baltic women to travel and work abroad. It is also with the emergence of globalization, in the form of liberalization of commercial erotic culture, that Finland has become enmeshed in the commercial sex business. Before the 1990s, there were no erotic clubs where these “Eastern girls” could work. Before the 1990s, the “Eastern girl,” meaning a sex worker of any age of Baltic or Russian origin, did not exist discursively. The name “Eastern girl” has been associated with sexual drive and also moral looseness, meaning that an “Eastern girl” has no hang-ups over engaging in immoral work, but also cannot be trusted – she may steal, cheat

## 2 Introduction

and so on; but primarily she has been defined by her sexuality. This is due to the globalization of information flows that provide the “Eastern girl” with information of different places – some of them remote – in Finland, where there is a demand for sex workers. Before globalization of the world economy, Finnish people did not talk of “Eastern girls,” but with the commercialization and the advent of the sex business, “Eastern girls” has become a concept. The Finnish sex business demands and relies on these women, who are exchangeable and exotic and are willing to satisfy the sexual demands of the male customers.

This book addresses prostitution as a consequence of international politics. In this book, I will show how globalization produces prostitution as a means to cope with globalization. Therefore, I will show also that globalization concretizes as prostitution at the individual level and that prostitution and sex-trafficking present how globalization operates as subjectivating bio-power. This book’s approach toward the issue of prostitution is different from that of most of the literature on prostitution politics, which tends to focus on the ideologies behind legislative measures toward prostitution, the interpretation of the client–prostitute relationship and the definitions of prostitution and trafficking. Furthermore, the manner in which this book approaches the issue of globalization is different from what is familiar to the majority of mainstream international relations (IR) literature, by addressing how globalization manifests itself in everyday lives.

In most IR literature, globalization is simplified into economic, political or cultural terms and discussed and debated upon in two ways. First, there is the assumption that globalization takes place in the world out there. It follows from this assessment of globalization that there is debate on where exactly globalization takes place, what counts as globalization and what drives the globalization processes. As somewhat distinct from the first debate on globalization, I see the debate on how globalization is theorized. Of course, this is related to the assessment of where globalization is seen to take place and, accordingly, the theorizing of globalization falls also easily into isolationist camps. Therefore, in the theories of globalization, it is conceptualized as an economic or a politico-ideological or a cultural process (see also Berndtson 2000). Therborn (2000: 152–153) categorizes the discourses in similar terms, identifying them as competition economics, “sociocritical,” state (im)potence, cultural and planetary ecology.<sup>3</sup> These different perspectives have opposed each other and have competed with one another; and only a few theorists have worked to find a synthesis of the different aspects characteristic of globalization (Appadurai 1996).

Instead of debating over where globalization takes place and what globalization is, I want to emphasize the connection between theories and practices of globalization. I see the discussion on globalization as a form of discourse by which is considered to be globalization is constructed. Therefore, by discussing globalization, we are also constructing globalization (see Peterson 1996). The weakness I identify in much writing on globalization in the context of IR is that the focus is most often on macrolevel agents and events. Globalization is discussed in the context of the global economy from a critical theory perspective<sup>4</sup>

or as competition economics,<sup>5</sup> relations of states<sup>6</sup> or in terms of politico-ideological developments such as democratization and the universalization of human rights.<sup>7</sup> Therefore, the debate on who generates globalization is also centered on these macrolevel agents. What I find missing for the most part are the concerns of questions of power and the individual. As portrayed in so much IR literature, it would appear as though there are no individuals who are affected or who do globalization and as though globalization is something that happens above and beyond individuals; and the issues of gender and ethnicity are most often overlooked in defining and theorizing what globalization is.

However, feminist approaches to globalization bring together, for critical review, most of what has been said about globalization. Still, even in the feminist debate on globalization, the focus is on gendered effects of globalization, rather than on the question of a gendered construction of globalization (see Chow 2003). Yet, it is in the feminist-oriented discussion that the questions of the theory and practices of globalization that inform my own analysis have been raised.

The definitions of globalization point to the interconnectedness of distant locations in shaping events and consequences, namely, the space-time compression due to technological innovations and cultural flows. Globalization is sometimes seen as universalization and homogenization of culture in the American style consumer society (Berndtson 2000)<sup>8</sup> or instead, taking form through fragmentation and localization as well as through marginalization of peripheries by the affluent centers. Along with the word “globalization,” which has become part of everyday usage, there are also terms which attempt to describe the complexity and contradictions of globalization by saying the world is going through “framegration” or “glocalization.” Globalization can be seen as the continuity of world politics or as a fundamental transformation from the past. Although there are many different and contradicting accounts of globalization, I agree with Jens Bartelson (2000: 180) that, although “there is no agreement on *what* globalization *is*, the entire discourse on globalization is founded on the agreement *that* globalization *is*.” (italics original). And, as McCormack (2002: 105) argues, “Globalization attracts so much current theoretical attention because it is a simple (perhaps the simplest) way of defining the messy and all-too-often violent conflict of human interaction.” He also argues that the name “globalization” has itself become a category that contains all the different elements of globalization. Therefore, the name and the meaning attributed to it are being continuously contested in various fora (McCormack 2002).

The term “globalization” resists and eludes any easy or simple definition. It is also often stated that one cannot talk of globalization in singular, but instead, globalization should be assessed in plural as it takes many forms and thus “globalizations” is a more appropriate term (Therborn 2000).<sup>9</sup> What is singular about globalization is rather the different discourses on globalization, which do not engage in dialogue with each other (Therborn 2000; see also Maclean 2000). However, these authors seem to have left feminist conceptualizations of globalization off their lists and do not address questions of method in researching or writing about globalization.

## Feminist conceptualization of globalization

The feminist debate on globalization rounds up the different discussions presented above by gendering the economic, cultural and politico-ideological analyses of globalization. The feminist approaches to globalization in IRs can be roughly categorized into standpoint feminism and postmodern feminism.<sup>10</sup> The first line of questioning involves, “Where are the women in globalization?” focusing on the gendered impacts of globalization as in the marginalization and relative impoverishment of women, but also the manner in which women contribute to globalization by their cheap labor in the global assembly line. The postmodern feminists also focus on how sex and gender are produced through globalization processes by bringing into question the masculinist bias inherent in systems of power and knowledge that contribute to globalization (see Chow 2003).

I want to elaborate in a few words on how globalization is conceptualized by using feminist lenses. Important texts, for example, are Anne Sisson Runyan and V. Spike Peterson’s (1993) *Global Gender Issues*; Jan Jindy Pettman’s (1996) *Worlding women*; and Meyer, Mary K. and Elisabeth Prügl (eds) *Gender Politics in Global Governance* (1999). The main theme that arises from these texts in terms of globalization is the focus on how neoliberal economic restructuring has affected women in discriminating ways. The criticism is directed at the inherent masculine bias and gender blindness in neoliberal practices, but also, on a deeper level, at matters concerning science and modern epistemology<sup>11</sup> according to which economic restructuring processes have been legitimated. In this way, the feminist criticism is extensive, for it addresses masculinism in the recent economic processes in terms of questions of power and knowledge that underline principles and practices of globalization. In this respect, feminist critics have also been skeptical about the triumph of liberalism and have on many occasions pointed to the unsustainability of economic growth as a means for progress or development. Feminists have criticized the triumph of liberalism being inherently based on a relationship of exploitation and criticized its inherent euro-centrism and gender bias.

Feminists argue that globalization, perceiving it to mean the globalization of production and consumption, could not have happened, had not the women been the silent contributors in “maquiladoras” and sweatshops (see e.g., Peterson and Sisson Runyan 1993, Pettman 1996, Wichterich 1998). Therefore, it is exactly women’s cheap labor that has enabled globalization to take place as female workers have been essential for transnational corporations that want to maximize profits. However, exploitation of women as cheap labor is based on masculinist bias and the institution of patriarchy. Women are considered not to need the same level of income as men since they are assumed to bring only secondary income to the family or else to be so young that they will soon marry, start a family and leave the workplace. Therefore women are paid less than the minimum wage on many occasions (Wichterich 1998, Ehrenreich and Russell Hochschild 2002). In addition, women are attractive workers for global produc-

tion since they are assumed not to unionize and to accept oppressive working conditions so as to gain any income at all.

However women's cheap labor in the global assembly line is not the only type of work that has been represented as attractive. An important part of the discourse is also the large numbers of women working in organized prostitution. It has been shown how important prostitutes are in attracting tourists, businessmen and transnational business. Pettman (1996) has followed Cynthia Enloe's<sup>12</sup> (1988) lead in extensively covering the links with sex tourism, hospitality services and trafficking in women for purposes of prostitution, mail-order brides and domestic servants. The feminist analysis also relates to colonialism, economic restructuring, growing internationalization and indebtedness in state economies due to the imposed policies of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and World Bank. Pettman calls this system "the International Political Economy of Sex" as the gendered impacts of international and national policies so evidently shape women's position and possibilities to deal with economic restructuring, thus constituting sex work also as a means for coping with globalization. This aspect of the sex specificity of forms of agency, as a constituting factor of the international political economy of sex, will be taken up in the following chapter on the construction of gender and ethnicity in the globalized sex market.

The feminist criticism of globalization as a form of power and knowledge aims to deconstruct and reconstruct how globalization is produced as a form of discourse. The criticism addresses the masculine bias in knowledge production through valorized dichotomies, reductionism and gender-blind empiricist methods (see e.g., Harding 1991). It is acknowledged that, as globalization poses theoretical and practical challenges to IRs, it may also open space for remapping these fields in more gender-sensitive ways. This is grounded in the arguments of the integral nature of discourses in reshaping world politics and vice versa. Peterson (1996) argues that the feminist project is important in responding to the empirical and epistemological weaknesses of IR theory in analyzing globalization. What feminists propose is to acknowledge the relational quality of world politics instead of its separation into states-markets, public-private and internal-external binary oppositions. Moreover, Peterson claims that postmodern feminism can account for the complexity and contingency of the globalizing world, for its strategy is in contextualizing, comparing and critically reflecting rather than in the search for objective truth and origin or ahistorical methods and theories.

An important part of the feminist project is not only the deconstruction of Western masculine-biased knowledge production but also the aim to give voice to those who have been marginalized (Krause 1996). This is important since feminism is not only an academic debate but also a political project, connected with political women's movements, that aims at ending women's discrimination in all forms. Globalization, as it is understood in terms of interconnectedness and overcoming of the tyranny of distances and borders, also enables the transnationalization of the feminist political project. This is evident in global

## 6 Introduction

women's movements, in transnational collaboration of women's non-governmental organizations and also in the attention and recognition that feminist issues have received at the level of the UN, such as its observance of 1976–1985 as the United Nations Decade for Women and also the holding of the 1995 United Nations World Conference for Women in Beijing. Women's rights form an important part of a more general "human rights" discourse and, within this debate also, the violence against women in the globalized world has received strong emphasis and weight (Krause 1996). The best means to achieve the goals are also questioned and, therefore, participating in male-dominated institutions, such as the UN, is seen as futile from the point of view of the feminist project.<sup>13</sup>

What is probably one of the most important things that comes through the feminist academic and political (if these can be separated) projects is the openness and sensitivity toward different kinds of knowledge and voices. The feminist project, as it maintains that there is no ungendered experience, also makes interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary approaches possible in academic research. The result is that, with these streams of feminist inquiry and interventions, a new kind of space for plurality of voices and discourses opens, making also the remapping of theories and practices of globalization possible. My own project stems from these feminist-informed perspectives on the study of globalization, thus making it possible also to address the question of agency and sex specificity in the theory and practices of globalization.

### **Globalization as corporeal politics**

This book addresses prostitution and sex-trafficking in the context of globalization as corporeal politics. In this book I take the familiar question, "Where are the women in international relations?" presented by feminist scholars in IR, and I present it in terms of, "Where are the sex-specific and ethnicized bodies in the context of globalization?" I am going to address globalization as a form of bio-power, drawing on Michel Foucault and Judith Butler; this is discussed in more detail in Chapter 2. I will argue that globalization subjectivates, that is, produces sex-specific and ethnicized subject positions that are incorporated and embodied. In other words, I am going to be looking at how globalization concretizes at the level of the body and how, in turn, the sex-specific and ethnicized bodies enact and reiterate globalization. I will be exemplifying the corporealities of globalization by looking at the operations of the global sex industry. I will develop from the basis of Arjun Appadurai's framework of landscapes of globalization, creating a framework of sexscapes of globalization in Chapter 3 in order to show how the global sex industry feeds on the complex global flows. These complex flows form global conjunctures in which new forms of agency and subjectivity are created. This is developed further in the narratives of corporeal globalization presented in Chapters 4–6, in which I explore the new forms of subjectivity and agency enacted in the global conjunctures of Finnish sex bars, brothels and parking lots where the sex trade takes place.

In this book, I will show how the global sex industry operates through a

complex system of global flows and how it operates in correlation with the processes of globalization, in turn benefiting from them and also how it accordingly subjectivates in a gendered and ethnicized manner. Conceptualizing the global sex industry as a part of the globalized world economy implies several things. First of all, the global sex industry can be conceptualized as shadow globalization. What I mean by shadow globalization relates partly to how the shadow economy is theorized and defined as comprising illicit, informal, domestic and unrecorded activity (Fleming *et al.* 2000). However, by shadow globalization I also mean activities that have been made possible by global flows of information, technology, finance and people, that are taking place in informal and illegal ways, but in the shadows in terms of otherness of the domain of subjectivity of global world economy.

My aim is to conceptualize the global sex industry in the context of the overall processes of globalization. In this respect, I see it as shadow globalization, operating in relation to globalization of the world economy and also reiterating and reinventing it, but from the shadows by taking advantage of disjunction and construction of otherness.<sup>14</sup> Globalization of the world economy, then, is seen marking the domain of subjectivity established by power/knowledge, which takes shape through global governmentality. I will discuss this further in the following chapter.

Second, both these forms of globalization, the global village kind and shadow globalization, operate as forms of subjectivating power, producing and requiring certain kinds of subjectivities, which result in agency and also in the incorporation of the position of the subject. This means that subjectivity acts on and activates bodies, is performed through bodies and constrains bodies. These embodied positions exemplify the bio-politics of globalization. They result in incorporation and embodiment of gendered, economic, cultural and social as well as ethnicized relations that are shaped by globalizing processes. I argue that these embodied subject positions are gendered and ethnicized, resulting in different forms of agency, challenge and opportunity along gender and ethnic divides.

However, I also follow Appadurai in arguing that globalization is fundamentally disjunctive. I see the global sex industry as representing shadow globalization, a zone that the “abject of globalization” inhabit. For the abject bodies of prostitutes and other sex workers, globalization does not open up new opportunities or possibilities of agency, but instead, it creates concrete constraints and controls. I am going to show that the category of the abject, of the ethnicized other woman engaged in sex work, needs to be maintained in order for the category of the subjects of globalization to exist. Still, the position of the abject is seen as a form of limited agency, as this position is one that disrupts order and can destabilize the domain of subjects. These sex-specific and ethnicized embodiments and enactments of globalization are investigated by the case study of foreign sex workers in Finland. From the fieldwork that I have done in the places where the sex trade takes place in Finland, I construct narratives which exemplify the corporealities of globalization and the sex-specific forms of agency that have developed.

### **The narrative turn (in International Relations)**

I have argued elsewhere (Penttinen 2004) that the discipline of IR operates as a form of exclusionary power that excludes voices and forms of expression outside the sphere of IR. Indeed, maintaining the boundaries of the discipline in place requires power. These boundaries have to be established time and again, which means that the boundaries are not beyond contestation and challenge (see also Enloe 1996). The feminists and post-structuralists have done a lot to stretch the boundaries of IR so that the “unsaid” of IR has been highlighted and brought under critique and reconstruction (see Ashley 1989 and Der Derian in the same volume).

This stretching of IR has also been the motivation to write this book by using the possibilities offered by the narrative turn. I have wanted to avoid the writing of IR in the familiar hierarchic and inherently masculinist logico-scientific form. Instead, I propose to write IR in an open and subjective form, that is, in a narrative form that is both embodied and the embodiment of IR.

Bochner (2001) sees the narrative turn as both turning away and turning toward. He summarizes these narrative turns as follows:

The narrative turn moves away from a singular monolithic conception of social science toward a pluralism that promotes multiple forms of representation and research; away from facts and toward meanings; away from master narratives and toward local stories; away from idolizing categorical thought and abstracted theory and toward embracing the values of irony, emotionality, and activism; away from assuming the stance of disinterested spectator and toward assuming the posture of feeling, embodied and vulnerable observer; away from writing essays and toward telling stories.

(Bochner 2001: 135)

This turning does not mean, however, that the logico-scientific form of writing and analytical approach to stories and texts would be excluded. The narrative turn is not about new forms of exclusion. Instead, the narrative turn, as mentioned at the beginning of Bochner’s list, is about turning toward plurality. In this way, the narrative turn does not imply that the normative social science writing should be eliminated. On the contrary, with the narrative turn, the different forms of privilege that have been established in the scientific community are challenged and sensitivity for these privileges is called for. This means the sensitivity of the position of privilege of the researcher as well as the privilege of the exclusionary scientific community. One thing that the narrative turn emphasizes is to avoid such positions of privilege and hierarchy as those established in mainstream social science.

The narratives of corporeal globalization that I write arise exactly from these points that stress plurality instead of a master narrative of IR and by the acknowledgment of the power that is required to control the role of the scientist

as well as to assess what counts as science. I do not want to be taking on the position of privilege of a distanced spectator-scientist in relation to data and pretend that this kind of position would even be possible.

The narratives I write are as much about doing research as they are the stories of the people involved in sex traffic between Finland and Russia and thus illustrate how globalization is incorporated by the people involved in the sex industry. In the narratives of corporeal globalization, I combine information gathered during fieldwork and my own observations of the relationships between clients and prostitutes, erotic dancers and pimps. The fieldwork I have done is very much researching the impossible. In fact, while doing my fieldwork, it has become obvious that I am involved in researching the silent point of globalization. Therefore, the way in which I have done my research, the limitations I have faced and the manner in which these have affected the research process have to be brought into the text.

What I have wanted to do is to write about the experiences of women, especially women regarded as social others, and reveal how the international or political world is inscribed on their lives and their bodies. In one sense, the objective of my research has been to show the micro-physics and bio-power of globalization. Thus, I have wanted to challenge by this example the issues which are deemed worthy of attention in the context of the discipline of IR. Writing the research in a narrative form also challenges the genre of writing in mainstream IR that has relied on logico-scientific writing, which, however, has been challenged by postmodernists, especially by feminist postmodernists (see Ashley 1996, Sylvester 1996).

My own personal quest involves the will to stretch the boundaries of IR research discipline. The stretching I wish to accomplish is in terms of what can be researchable in IR, what kind of methods are used in IR research and how the research is written/reported. The need for new kinds of approaches in terms of research topics and methods calls for bringing gender sensitivity into IR, or making visible the sex specificity of research questions, methods, producers and users of knowledge in IR. Darby (2003) raises these similar issues and argues that IR has operated as a colonizing discipline that colonizes different forms of knowledge. He criticizes the practices of exclusion of knowledge in IR and the lack of interdisciplinary research and mentions how mainstream IR is closed to other disciplines of research, such as development studies and postcolonial studies. He claims that IR has taken over the concept of the "international" and separated it from the ordinary and lived experiences of people who are nevertheless affected by and live in the international society as is the case of people living in, for example, postcolonial societies.

Not only has the discipline of IR separated the concept of the "international" from ordinary lives, but also from bodies or corporealities of individuals. I want to reflect here in a few words how Grosz (1993) explains the development of dualism in modern science in relation to the conceptualization of the body. Grosz's interest has been in addressing the question of the body in philosophy and looking for reasons for its exclusion and neglect. Grosz (1993: 6) argues that

the dualist thinking, institutionalized by Cartesian tradition, has dominated modern science for the last 300 years. Descartes has established not only dualism between mind and body – this had already been done by Plato – but, rather more importantly, also the separation of mind/soul from nature and conversely detaching the body as separate from the mind and as belonging to the realm of nature. This has several consequences. Whereas the body belongs to the natural world following its natural laws, it is also deemed secondary to the mind. The human mind, as it is capable of reasoning, is separated from the natural world and is thus capable of producing objective and pure knowledge from the natural world. Indeed, Grosz argues that the dualist thinking is much to blame also for the separation of natural sciences from the social sciences. It is responsible for the elevation of consciousness above corporeality (Grosz 1993: 8). The body has been relevant only in terms of being the object of knowledge in natural science (*ibid.*), but has not been relevant in terms of production of knowledge.

The narrative turn responds to this issue of separation between mind and body by aiming to produce knowledge where the embodied position of the researcher is acknowledged and made visible. Additionally, the aim is to write in such a way that the texts can be felt, thus provoking an emotional response (see Ellis and Bochner 1993, Bochner 2001). This is one way how the narrative turn aims to overcome the hierarchic binary opposition of mind and body as established by the Cartesian tradition.

It is important to note here that when the hierarchic dichotomy of mind and body had been accepted, this had consequences on other binary pairs that go alongside the mind and body. As the female is associated with the secondary term, it implies that woman cannot be a subject of knowledge. The female, being perceived as associated with nature and the private sphere, is categorically outside the possibility of producing knowledge that could be acknowledged as science. Grosz (1993) argues that it is as though the female body is more biological, more natural than the male body, and indeed, as though the male body is free from biology “as it represents the realm of the mind.” The important element of this criticism has been the focus on dualisms and the hierarchies that have been used to explain the “natural” inequality between men and women and which has been used to deny women’s access to public and knowledge production. Here, then the feminist point is emphasized that the identity of the knower in modern epistemology is most often a male mind (Sylvester 1998).

Bochner (2001) also discusses how the valorization by a distanced analyst in relation to data shows a strong male ethos. The qualities of the scientist that are valued and regarded as the requirements of good research, that is, research that counts as science, show a strong binary that valorizes the masculine over the feminine. Bochner (2001: 144) claims that the call for “methodological purity and disengaged reason” is “unmistakably macho.” The scientist as “cool, under control, detached and analytical” (*ibid.*) clearly represents masculine qualities, which gain their valorized position in making the feminine as a secondary category. In this manner, the feminine qualities are excluded from what counts as science. Bochner (2001: 146) brings forward Jane Tompkins’ point on ongoing

war waged “against feeling, against women, against what is personal” in the academy. In this way, the emphasis of objectivist, distanced research implies that the scientific community looks down upon forms of knowledge that are associated with women and the feminine, such as emotion and the private.

### **Writing autoethnography: writing subjective and situated narratives**

No textual staging is innocent.<sup>15</sup>

(Foucault)

All texts are personal statements.

Denzin and Lincoln (1998: 413)

The narrative turn is grounded in the ontological statement that “people live by stories,” that our lives are storied (see e.g., Whitebrook 2001). Then stories are closely linked with how identity and subjectivity are formed. If the stories are limited and limiting, so are different expressions of life and possible lived spaces limited (Richardson 1990, 1997). Whitebrook explains that, “The political aspect of identity rests on an understanding of the self as social, ‘situated’, and narratives of identity as embedded in others stories, including the wider stories of social and cultural settings” (2001: 4).

Inclusion of the writer’s self into the text is informed by the feminist thesis that “our politics start with our feelings” (Grosz 1993: 20). In terms of the narrative turn, this refers also to the understanding of narrativity and identity construction. Following the ontological assumption that people live by stories and that our lives are storied, it entails that the personal narrative that reveals the situatedness and subjectivity of the author is connected to the larger cultural narratives. The feminist thesis of the “personal” being political relates also to the acknowledgment of the role of sex-specific bodies in knowledge production.

Personal narratives are not simply about revealing the inner self to the audience, thus being confessional, but through the personal one can also reveal something about the larger structures of power. This means that the personal is constructed in relation to the cultural settings, that personal selves are not isolated from the world and others, but are formed in relation to the others and are so formed especially through the different narratives of the self, others and the world. The personal is then related to the public and not categorically separate from it. Therefore, personal narratives are necessarily already filled with meta-narratives and narratives by others. Personal narratives can also offer ideas of boundaries of possible narratives, which again, convey the possibilities of lived spaces.

Sparkes (2002) discusses how autoethnography rests on the assumption that it is possible to learn about the general through the particular and therefore, writing individual experience is also about writing social experience. Subjective

experiences are part of the world and so these experiences are not private. In this way, writing autoethnography also challenges the hierarchic binary pairs intrinsic to modern epistemology, such as subjective and objective, self and other. Sparkes (*ibid.*) writes how the self has become the silenced other in the practices of modern epistemology. It is something that has been excluded and made secondary to the objective, public and rational. What is important here is that these two aspects, the personal and emotional and the rational and objective, do not cancel each other out. Instead, autoethnography does not merely try to bridge the gulf between these two sides, but rather demonstrates how these two sides are not opposites at all, but overlap and coexist.

The attention that Grosz gives to the body as a mediator between psychical inner space and what is publicly observable is closely related to the goals of the autoethnographic project of knowledge production. For Grosz, overcoming the dualism between mind and body means thinking of subjectivity through the concept of corporeality. This means regarding the body as something which is between nature and culture. Grosz explains that this means that we cannot regard the body as a kind of natural raw material nor as a purely social and cultural product which would lack “its own weighty materiality” (Grosz 1993: 21). Then, in terms of the question of the body, moving between binary opposition, between nature/culture and mind and body means thinking in terms of embodied subjectivity and psychical corporeality (Grosz 1993: 22). Approaching the body as such, as a mediator between inside and outside, helps to overcome dualistic thinking that is characteristic of modern epistemology in terms of methodology and representation of data. Moreover, Grosz stresses that the body must be stressed as a cultural product. This argument is linked to the basis of autoethnography, that is to say, learning about the general from the particular. This is also crucial in writing my own research of corporeal globalization. Grosz does not mean by the understanding of the body as a cultural product, that the body is purely social. Rather, for her, the body is a pivotal point in binary pairs. Grosz explains that the body is not part of the binary pairs, instead it is both sides of the dichotomies between “self and other, private or public, psychical or social, instinctive or learned, genetically or environmentally determined” (*ibid.*: 23). Therefore, Grosz argues, we also need new terms to be able to discuss the body outside and beyond binary pairs (*ibid.*: 24).

In the narratives of corporeal globalization, I am writing about bodies that are out of place, homeless or marginalized and, in this case, writing openly about sexual difference. The bodies that represent different sexes and ethnicities that interact in the global sex industry are acknowledged as political sites as well. Bodies are seen then as sites, points of mediation between private and public, self and other, and not immutable raw material that follows the laws of nature. In this respect the body of the prostitute, whore, sex worker or stripper is an exemplary body. It is in itself a site that is politicized in debates for and against prostitution, but more importantly, in terms of my own research, the body is a site onto which power is inscribed, drawing on Foucault (1980). Focusing on particular bodies is a way to learn about the general, that is, the powers involved

in determining the domain of subjectivity in the context of globalization. In order to grasp this particular and to be able to tell through the particular about the general, the methods of new ethnography (Richardson 1990, Ellis and Flaherty 1992, Bochner 2001, Ellis and Berger 2002, Sparkes 2002) have been employed, involving intimate detail, concrete experience and literary strategies, including examples of poetry, fiction and personal narratives and drawing the reader into an active relationship with the text.

The narratives I write are about corporeal shadow globalization in the background of the zone of the abject, and by doing this I try to move between the binary opposition between mind and body as discussed by Grosz. Here also, Butler's (1993) investigation on the position of the abject body and the social abject is crucial, as is Irigaray's theory on the mechanics of fluids (Irigaray 1985). Thus, the purpose is to extend the investigation of IRs beyond the division between private and public and national and international by discussing the corporeal politics of globalization. In this way this book aims to transcend boundaries between subject and object. At a particular level, it means also transcending or extending those boundaries which determine what is researchable within the discipline of IR, what kinds of topics count as worthy of attention and how knowledge about such issues is gained.

This also means that I want to be sensitive about my own authority as the author, which leads me to follow the narrative turn and write the results of my research in the way enabled by the new ethnography. Thus, by employing the narrative mode in writing, I want to let go of the form of writing that reproduces the binary opposition and position of otherness of the object of research. In this case I want to also refrain from reproducing the social otherness of the sex workers in writing about their embodied subjectivities in the context of globalization. Instead, what I try to do by the method of narratives is to describe the corporeal globalizations as sites of agency, which are positions of "subjectivity" for the abject. I have already expressed my objection to boundaries between subject and object and between passive and active. I am keen not to portray the trafficked woman as a victim that needs to be saved by those who are situated in a more privileged western position (see also Pettman 1997). This includes problematizing my own embodiment of globalization along with that of the international sex workers and also includes my own position of subjectivity into the text.

I acknowledge that the boundaries which mark domains of the subject and the abject are human constructs, discourses and texts that inhere relations of power. This exclusionary power is also present in the meta-narratives of modern epistemology and logico-scientific forms of writing. In my own writing, I want, at least, not to reinforce these boundaries. I want to wonder about them, question them and question my own position and prerogatives in the process. This is why I decline in this book to use common positivist methods and forms of representation so familiar to main(male)stream IR.

Writing in a narrative form is both a political and ethical choice, but most importantly, a bridge between objective and subjective knowledge, science and

literature, fact and fiction. The aim is to bring forth an alternative form of writing in the field of social sciences and thus overcome the hierarchies, masculinities and power positions that are central to mainstream writing. The narrative turn is a means by which the researcher can be open about the context and situatedness of the knowledge produced and about her own biases and values that she brings to the text. Nevertheless, it is also a matter of offering something that the reader can associate with. In one sense, what is offered here is what the reader can feel, without assuming that these feelings represent raw material and discarding the baggage that comes along with the notion of experience. It is also a matter of writing texts that move and thus slightly chip away the valorized binary between mind and body.

## 2 Bio-power and subjectivation in the globalized world economy of sex

Maybe the target nowadays is not to discover what we are but to refuse what we are... We have to promote new forms of subjectivity through refusal of this kind of individuality which has been imposed on us for several centuries.

(Michel Foucault 1983: 216)

Prostitution and trafficking in women is a highly political topic and it divides people into for and against camps.<sup>1</sup> Prostitution – and trafficking in women especially – is often conceptualized as a violation of human rights and violence against all women. On the other hand, there are the voices that speak for the rights of the prostitute, saying that prostitution is rather a form of sex work and should be regarded as such and therefore, it should be protected in the same way as are other forms of labor. Most strongly, the debate over defining trafficking in women involves the debate over forced prostitution, on the one hand and voluntary prostitution, on the other, also including therein the aspects of being “forced to choose” (Doezema 1998). The latter conceptualization refers mainly to the lack of alternatives to sex work, which causes women to turn to prostitution as the most profitable option, rather than being directly coerced or tricked into prostitution by third parties such as pimps, boyfriends, criminal networks and so on. The debate involves discussion of whether a prostitute is selling herself or simply her sex. The former standpoint reflects, according to Doezeema (1996), a patriarchal ideology that associates woman’s identity with her sex and that considers virginity and chastity as woman’s highest value. It has been criticized that understanding foreign prostitutes as victims, whether of direct force or of a poor economic situation, is a discursive means to reclaim these women’s honor, and which then indirectly condemns all prostitution as bad and as violation against all women (Wijers 1998). It is argued that this attitude silences those prostitutes who refuse to be victimized and do not feel degraded by the sex work they do. The problems in these debates are the different variations of sex work and conditions under which it is done. It is difficult to fight for or against prostitution since there is no single identity or experience of a sex worker. By analyzing trafficking in women, prostitution and sex work in the context of globalization of the world economy, I do not want to distinguish between forced and voluntary

prostitution, as this is very often an impossible task. I will also use the terms “sex worker” and “prostitute” interchangeably since I do not want to limit the name of “sex worker” to the professional prostitute only. The term “sex worker” allows reference to be made to erotic dancers who differentiate themselves from “prostitutes” and who are a forgotten group in almost all of the discussions on sex work and prostitution (an exception to this is Stark 2006)<sup>2</sup>. Here I will also use the term “sex-trafficking” in the context of the global sex industry, thus focusing on the operation of sex-trafficking as representing a form of shadow globalization.

I want to distance myself from the definition of trafficking in women, discussed above, that is seen as victimizing and silencing. Instead, I want to emphasize the position of the prostitute or the trafficked woman as a corporeal consequence of globalization and thus showing also a form of agency, albeit in a constrained and controlled manner. This agency is the agency of the abject and will be discussed in more detail below. The term “sex-trafficking” is useful, for it at once implies the hierarchic relationship of women in sex work and their traffickers in the global sex industry and refers to the larger economic structures, conditioning the position of the women in sex work. Thus, the term is useful, for it does not romanticize the position of the prostitute as some pro-sex work literature does by emphasizing sex work always as an expression of sexual freedom (cf. discussion in Kong 2006, Brewis and Linstead 2004). My standpoint toward prostitution and sex work in general comes from the background of international political economy combined with post-structuralist theorization of bio-power and subjectivation.

In this discussion on prostitution and sex-trafficking, understood as corporeal politics of globalization, I try to avoid falling into the political camps, although they are seductive, appealing and convincing. Instead, I argue that the position of the prostitute is formed through the operation of the bio-power of globalization. Therefore the position of the prostitute is a result of subjectivation.<sup>3</sup> Subjectivating bio-power turns individuals into subjects and ties individuals to their self-identity (Foucault 1983: 212). Therefore, I address the position of the prostitute or the sex worker as a sex-specific, ethnicized position produced by the bio-power of globalization and not as a question of whether prostitution is about violence or sexual freedom. Moreover, I do not look at the relationship and negotiation between client and prostitute or at the question of prostitute’s rights or women’s rights as the crucial issue concerning the “nature” of the global sex industry.<sup>4</sup> This assessment of sex work could be useful for those parties who debate on definitions of sex work and trafficking in women. The formation of subjects is not a sex-neutral or gender-neutral process. It is produced as corporeal materiality. Indeed, the prostitute, most commonly a woman or a girl, exposes the sexual nature of this subjectivation process. The subjectivation process requires the other, the abject who is outside social recognition and therefore socially dead. The category of the other is formed during the process of subjectivation and needs to be maintained by the socially recognized subjects.

This chapter deals with the process of subjectivation and formation of the cat-

egory of the other. I will look at the corporeality of these positions and thus emphasize the body of the subject as a mediator of the subjectivation process. The body is seen, much as how Grosz (1993) theorizes the relation between body and knowledge, as a mediator of power. The material instance of the body is produced on the body and enacted by the bodies, and thus becomes reinvented and redone. The surface of the body is a site on which the “inside” and “outside” of the subject meet. The approach toward prostitution is thus different from the prostitution politics debate as the position of the prostitute is seen as a site to be incorporated and re-enacted through the body. I focus on bio-power and population as formulated by Foucault (1980, 1983, 1988) and developed by Judith Butler (1990, 1993, 1995, 1997) into performativity of subjectivity. This discussion on subjectivation grounds the following argument in prostitution as a form of corporeal adaptation to the governmentality of neoliberalist globalization. I will argue that the neoliberalist governmentality of the globalized world economy of sex creates the domain of subjects as a population of consumers and the zone of the abject as consumable bodies. This does not imply that these positions are stable and predetermined; rather, these positions concretize how the dominating discourse of neoliberalism produces and enacts gendered, ethnicized subjects and the abject into being, which reiterate and re-enact this dominating logic of consumerism and marketization through their bodies.

In this respect the sex workers’ rights movements, which emphasize the profitability of sex work and present it as such a rational choice as opposed to other forms of labor and which ground the arguments in individualist freedoms to earn money through commodification of sexuality, do not seem radical at all. Indeed, they are not a form of resistance nor are they in any way counter-hegemonic to the dominating discourse of the neoliberalist world economy.<sup>5</sup> Instead, they follow the principles of marketization and consumerism by arguing for the commodification of the private or personal and thus bringing it into the gaze of power. Engagement in prostitution is presented as a rational choice and as an activity which is beneficial to the society as a whole. I will come back to this before the end of the chapter in discussion of bio-politics and the formation of population in the context of the globalized world economy.

When arguing for the right of the individual to buy and sell sex, one should ask, what kind of a right is it? Is it a freedom from something or it is a right to freedom to do something (cf. Aradau 2004). Moreover, these questions should be gendered and also ethnicized; so, attention must be paid to identify the gender and ethnicity that are appropriating the freedom to consume and the gender and ethnicity that are in turn formed as the consumable. Thus, embodying the position of the body in demand is presented as a rational choice. This project seems to be more involved with discovering who we are as subjects according to the dominating logic of marketization than with refusing who we are as referred to in the opening quote.

In this respect the pro-sex workers aim for recognition of subjectivity within the population of consumers created by neoliberalist governmentality. However, this takes place through exclusionary practices of determining who belongs to

the category of sex worker and who counts as a real “prostitute.”<sup>6</sup> Then, for example, women who prostitute on the street in order to gain money to buy drugs for their use are rather “drug addicts” and not “prostitutes,” since the term “prostitute” is reserved for professional sex workers. According to this same logic, the trafficked women or foreign prostitutes who sell sex because of economic necessity would not count as prostitutes as they do it out of necessity and not professionally. In this way the prostitutes that fight for social recognition of their profession aim for subjectivity and overcome their position as social others. This, as well, is an exclusionary practice, since it is done by differentiation of “real and professional sex workers” from “drug addicts,” “trafficked women” and “ethnic others.” In this way the silence of the object is reinforced by the Western professional prostitutes, as the prostitutes’ rights movements do not for the most part speak for the rights of these vulnerable groups and do not recognize what they do as sex work.

The anti-trafficking feminist debate enters into problems similar to those of the pro-sex work debate. In this respect they are closer than either side would ever agree. Again, what is at stake is subjectivity. I have argued elsewhere (Penttinen 2006) that the feminist discourses against prostitution and trafficking in women also function to reinforce the subject position of a Western feminist by creating and maintaining the category of the woman in prostitution as a victim and a silenced other. I argued that the Western feminist embody, in this project of saving “other” women, an inherently masculinist position of protector. The establishment of the position of the “protector” requires the formation and maintenance of the category of “the protected.” In this binary, the protected are formed as passive recipients of protection and are formed necessarily without agency (cf. Young 2003; and also Aradau 2004). They are supposed to be thankful for the protection or aid given to them by their protectors (Hattori 2006). In this respect, it does not make sense to “save” the women so that they would be recognized subjects and having agency, for this would undermine the subjectivity of the Western feminist as a protector (Penttinen 2006). This is evident in the implication of policies to prevent prostitution and trafficking in women, which result in making the position of the individual woman in prostitution more vulnerable (Thorbeck 2002, Aradau 2004).<sup>7</sup>

I will now move on to explain in more detail Judith Butler’s theory of subjectivation on the basis of Foucault’s discussion of power and subjection and move toward the discussion of the bio-power of globalization by the end of the chapter. This detailed discussion on power and subjection paves the way for my analysis of globalization as a form of bio-power operating through landscapes and their shadow sexscapes discussed in the next chapter. The consequences of the corporeal politics of globalization are further explored in the narrative chapters that focus on the embodiment of the position of subjectivity and otherness in the sexscapes in Finland.

### **Three modes of becoming a subject**

What do Foucault and Butler mean by individuals becoming subjects of power? What does this becoming or turning into a subject mean and how does this subjectivation take place? Butler argues that subject formation happens for Foucault through the body (Butler 1997: 83). It is a bodily materialism (Braidotti 1991: 78). For Foucault the knowing subject is an effect of power. It does not exist prior to knowledge production and certainly does not produce knowledge; but it is, indeed, produced as a site, that is to say, as embodied subjectivity that normative practices aim to control (Braidotti 1991: 78–79).

Butler (1997) insists that the implications of subjection are important, since by becoming a subject one gains social recognition as well as the position of agency. Butler (1997: 11) insists, however, that power forms or formulates the subject through subordination and yet, the possibility of being subordinated is dependent on power already having formed the subject, namely, the speaking “I” or “we” of the social body (Butler 1997, 1995). Indeed, the subject is not the producer of knowledge but its effect and is dependent on the production of subjectivity as an embodied site of agency in the social context. Foucault defines the subject in terms of relation to the dominant power and relation to oneself in terms of self-knowledge. Foucault (1983: 212) explains that, “The subject means subject to someone else by control or dependence and tied to his own identity by a conscience or self-knowledge. Both meanings suggest a form of power that subjugates and makes subject to.”

Foucault explains that the process of subjugation in terms of tying oneself to an identity happens in three modes of objectification. These three modes constitute different ways of categorization of the subject, processes of normalization and naming of the subject. These modes of objectification describe how “in our culture human beings are made into subjects” (Foucault 1983: 208). These are: first, the way in which the speaking subject is objectified through linguistics and philology, or objectivizing the subject through wealth and economics, meaning the subject who labors and who is productive. Second, the objectivizing of the subject takes place through dividing practices. These dividing practices mean that the subject is either divided in herself or divided from others in terms of, for example, homosexual or heterosexual, sane or insane, legal or illegal and moral or immoral as in a “good woman” or a prostitute that the Madonna/whore binary also exemplifies. Third and last, the way in which a person turns herself to a subject, which Foucault exemplifies through his studies on sexuality. In other words, how individuals “have learned to recognize themselves as subjects of ‘sexuality’” (ibid.). This last mode on how individuals turn or become subjects is the main concern for this chapter. However, this turning into a subject does not take place in isolation from the other two modes, namely, the linguistic subject, or the formation of the subject through binary oppositions.

The first mode of objectivizing the subject has been of great concern to feminist postmodernism (Braidotti 1991, Butler 1995). According to Foucault, the laboring and productive subject of the discourses of wealth and economics is

constituted especially by this scientific classification which produces the subjectivation of rational economic man as a category. These discourses of life, labor and language have, then, functioned to constitute a subjectivating discipline that is held universal and also logically progressive (Rabinow 1984). Braidotti emphasizes Foucault's analysis of "how the subject of modernity is a discursive site that gives rise simultaneously to the notion of embodiment" (Braidotti 1991: 80). This subject of modernity, the individual as established by bourgeois liberalism, is granted "property, freedom and protection by law" (*ibid.*).

The formation of a subject as a linguistic category is central in Butler's approach to subjectivation. A subject, as a linguistic category, is a "site" that individuals can assume and come to occupy. As Butler writes "Individuals come to occupy the site of the subject (the subject simultaneously emerges as a "site"), and they enjoy intelligibility only to the extent that they are, as it were, first established in language" (Butler 1997: 10–11). Butler explains that the terms "individual" and "subject" need each other in order to be understood. There is a circular effect already in this; these two terms cannot be reduced to one another and they are not interchangeable, but the subject can speak of itself in the third person. What is important here is that there is a circular move in voicing the subject. The subject, which is given account by being voiced, is also simultaneously presupposed; or the subject that is presupposed comes into being through the act of narrating the subject. However, the ambivalence here is that the subject is formed by subordination that entails autonomy. Butler explains that the power of subjection is also power that is assumed by the subject. Following Foucault, she stresses the ambivalence at the point where the subject emerges (Butler 1997: 7). However, the subject is always first established in language, which also refers to the paradox of subjection, meaning that in language the subject refers to something that has not happened yet (Butler 1997: 4). An individual then "seeks" a name that comes from outside and reinstates it, or rather, rearticulates it and thus does it anew (Butler 1997: 18).

Coming back to Foucault's modes, the second mode of objectivizing the subject refers to the dividing practices that are the categorizations of the individual, as explained above. These categorizations of individuals to the position of the other have resulted in physical isolation or confinement from the society. Foucault has studied how the categorization and confinement of the poor, the insane, vagabonds and criminals has taken place at different times and how this classification of the abnormal or dangerous individuals has been linked with the different practices of clinical medicine or penal institution (Foucault 1997: 51–57; cf. also Rabinow 1984).

However, this categorization and the following exclusion relates also to the way in which Butler describes the formation of the zone of the abject, those who are socially dead, as central to the subject formation. The socially dead individuals, the excluded abject bodies, mark for the subjects the risk of death that is integral to the formation of the subject (Butler 1997). Therefore also, the category of the socially dead has to be maintained, because through this maintenance, the realm of the subjects is also reinstated. The socially dead represent

the abject bodies of homosexuals, AIDS patients and prostitutes (Butler 1993: 3). These abjects represent the “unlivable” or the “uninhabitable” positions which are nevertheless “densely populated” (*ibid.*).

The main concern throughout this book – and especially the narrative chapters – is still the third mode of objectification of the subject. In this category, the focus is on the way in which an individual turns herself into a subject through processes of self-knowledge and seeks recognition of her existence in the categorizations that come from the outside (cf. Foucault 1983, Butler 1997). This turning into a subject does not mean that the subject enacts the power that has formed her as a social subject in a continuous way.

Butler (1997: 13) explains that power always precedes the subject; but as it is enacted and assumed by the subject in the form of the subject’s own agency, its precedence is lost to the view. It is power that initiates the subject (as in naming the subject as a linguistic category, that is, as the speaking “I”); but as the power is assumed or appropriated by the subject, it does not directly continue in the same form. Butler says that “power not only acts *on the* subject, but in a transitive sense *enacts* the subject into being” (*ibid.*, italics original). Here Butler follows the Foucault’s formulation of power as something which acts on active subjects or rather something which activates the subject (Butler 1997: 84).

This discontinuity of the operation of power is also what gives the impression that power is in fact the effect of subjects and that it does not exist prior to subject formation. It conceals the precedence of power in the inauguration of the subject. What remains visible then is how subjects exercise power, and this action and use of power is what makes the order of precedence reversed and ambiguous (Butler 1997: 13–14). Butler writes that power operates on the subject in two ways. First, it is power that makes a subject possible. It is power that forms the possible condition for the becoming of the subject (as in the subject of modernity for Foucault). The other way is in the potential and possibility of the subject to reiterate power in his or her “own” enactment. It follows that power works in two temporal modalities: first, it is always prior to the subject, outside the subject and as a precondition for the subject, and second, “as the willed effect of the subject” (Butler 1997: 14). What is important to note here is that subjection is subordination that the “subject brings on itself,” and this subjection is the precondition for agency. The individual turns himself or herself into a subject, that is to say, the individual allows himself or herself to be subordinated by power because through this process the individual gains the position of agency as well as social existence.

Butler stresses that, not only is the subjugating power ambivalent, but the subject itself is the “*site*” of this ambivalence. The subject itself marks the temporality of power – that which precedes the subjects – and how the subject rearticulates power. Power that works on the subject can be altered by the subject. Thus, the temporality of power is concealed and the subject eclipses the condition of its emergence. However, exceeding power is not the same as escaping power or the end of power. Butler emphasizes that the subject “exceeds precisely that to which it is bound” (Butler 1997: 17). As such the subject itself cannot overcome or subdue the ambivalence which is integral to the subject’s

constitution; but it is tied to the temporal ambivalence which is prior to the subject and which is about to succeed. This forms the agency of the subject.

The investigation on an individual turning into a subject does not imply that there is an interior psychological space in which this “internalization” takes place. Instead, this construction of inner psychic space is in connection with the embodiment of subjectivity. As the site of the knowing subject is produced as the object of normative practices, so is the “inner space” created where this knowing of one’s subjectivity takes place and which is in turn incorporated. This is what Foucault means when he explains that the soul has an imprisoning effect on the prisoner, that is to say, “the soul is the prison of the body” (quoted in Butler 1997: 85). Individuals turn into subjects because subjection activates the subjects into being against the category of the socially dead.

The subject is vulnerable in this sense because its very existence is dependent on signs and categories of itself that are not the subject’s own. In other words “subjection exploits the desire for existence, where existence is always conferred from elsewhere; it marks a primary vulnerability to the Other in order to be” (Butler 1997: 20–21). This other refers to the category of the socially dead, the abject bodies.

### **Subject bodies and maintenance of embodied subjectivity**

I have discussed subjectivation with reference to repression and also the operation of subtle or seductive power that makes individuals subjects. In order to produce and maintain the domain of subjectivity, the category of the abject is required as well. Those who are deemed as abject bodies enable, through differentiation from them, the domain of subjects to exist.<sup>8</sup> The central feature of the abject is that it disrupts order and it threatens stability and harmony. Therefore, there is always danger associated with the abject.<sup>9</sup>

In my work, I use the concept of the abject as an analogy for the social abject. With the concept of the abject, I refer to the social others in a way that Butler discusses the role of homosexuals, HIV patients and prostitutes. The abject is a useful term for the social other, for it allows us to see that the position of the social other is not passive and simply oppressed. Instead, the abject has a position of agency in a way that the abject can be seen as a danger, as something which disturbs and disrupts social order.

The social abject is linked with the conceptualization of the abject as excrement – dead matter – that falls from the subject but which nevertheless belongs to the subject. The abject is therefore understood as something that belongs to the body of the subject, which reminds the subject of its death. The abject is not, therefore, directly the binary opposite of the subject or separate other. Instead, it is something which always belongs to the subjects, but which evokes horror and befuddles order, for it marks the permeability of the bodily boundary (Butler 1990). The dirt, or dead matter, which falls from the body is associated with pollution and contagion. Therefore, the body needs to be cleaned and purified from the dirt. The boundary of the body, the skin, functions as a site of social taboos

and is thus invested with power and danger (Butler 1990: 131–132). In fact, the skin marks not only the bodily boundary but is also a surface on which power is inscribed. Foucault explains how the body is the surface of inscribed events of power (Foucault 1980, 1977).

The coherence of the social body as a whole is at stake in the creation and maintenance of the category of the abject as a danger. Subjectivation is not a matter of individuals becoming subjects in isolation. Power forms the subjects as a social body or the population (Foucault 1980, 1988). In this sense, the agency and social recognition take place in respect of the domain of subjects as a whole. The social others are also constructed as a zone of abjects, meaning a population of others such as the category of prostitutes. The subjectivating power creates the zone of the abject similarly through the operation of bio-power or micro-physics of power. The abjectivating power is a corporeal materiality similar to the subjectivating power. But, whereas the subject is formed as an active subject, the agency of the abject is derived from the inherent danger and also fluidity associated with the abject. The abject is not without agency, in a manner representing passive and dead matter as the opposite of subject. Instead the agency of the abject is constrained and especially corporeal since it is associated with the bodily fluids and dangerous excrement. In my study, this means that the abject, that is, the foreign prostitute, upsets the order of the domain of subjects and the coherence of those who are the subjects of globalization.

I want to extend this notion of corporeal agency of the abject in relation to the domain of subjectivity. The abject is associated with the female body as seeping liquid, a body which resists clear boundaries and is *uncontained*. In this way it renounces the solidity of the rational subject. Woman is fluid that resists solidity and unified form. I want to turn here to the way in which Irigaray conceptualizes woman's speaking position through the "mechanics" of fluids (Irigaray 1985: 106–118). Irigaray explains how, in psychoanalysis, woman has been defined as a lack of, or a negation of, the male subject that is understood as the coherent and solid subject (Irigaray 1985: 86–105). Irigaray speaks of the feminine and the masculine through metaphors of mechanics of solids and fluids. She argues that the system where solids are given precedence over fluids is inherently dichotomous (ibid. 1985: 106–107). Irigaray argues that "*the feminine occurs only within models and laws devised by male subjects*" (ibid. 1985: 86, italics original). This means that there is only one sex instead of two. For this reason, the female does not have a subject position and thus she cannot speak. However, Irigaray (1985: 111) turns this around by arguing that a woman speaks fluid. This fluid is in opposition to solid, yet not directly. Fluid is different from solid, for it can change form. It reacts to pressure, heat and friction. It does not remain the same or identical with itself as the rational solid subject does. It speaks intelligibly only if it is "transformed by phallogocriticism" (Irigaray 1985: 111). Otherwise, what the woman-thing speaks is "continuous, compressible, dilatable, viscous, conductible, diffusible ..." (ibid.). So, woman is not completely voiceless, but speaks fluid, language that is hard for subjects to understand, that they must listen carefully in order to know what it says (ibid.). Yet, fluid exists

between two solid entities and reacts to their friction and pressure. It “mixes with bodies of like state, sometimes dilutes itself in an almost homogeneous manner, which makes the distinction between one and the other problematical” (Irigaray 1985: 111). Irigaray explains that it is for this reason that woman cannot hear or touch herself. Then, a woman is characterized as *awoman* as a *Zone of silence* (Irigaray 1985: 113, italics original). It exists as a mimesis of the solid subjects, more precisely as the mimesis of the desire of the solid subjects. It is the underside of desire, the necessary other that solidifies the subject. The woman-thing is thus mute in the economy of solid subjects.

The way in which Irigaray conceptualizes woman as fluid is closely linked to Kristeva’s discussion of the abject, which is also characterized as the object *a* (Palin 1996). Woman is fluid and has qualities similar to those of the abject: viscous, dilatable and so on. The woman-thing as fluid is also by nature unstable. This opens the possibility of understanding the woman, or the abject, as a position of agency. It resists the solid state by never staying identical with itself, by never being the same. In this way it can be seen disrupting the mechanics of solids. It certainly is mute in the sense that it cannot speak like the solid subject, yet it is not utterly voiceless. The fluid woman solidifies itself when it mimics the desire of the solid, when it performs the way in which feminine is defined in a phallogocentric economy. In this way, according to Irigaray, woman shows that she exists *elsewhere* than in the assigned position as the other, the object of desire. From this, one can conclude that the position of the abject or that of fluid has limited agency. Its constricted agency in the system where precedence is given to solids is derived from its possibility to disrupt the solid and its quality of not remaining the same.

The abject then exist in the zone of silence, yet using their abject qualities as their voice, they can be heard speaking and enacting their abjection. I will develop this agency and voice of the abject in the narrative chapters on the Eastern girls interacting with Finnish male clients in sex bars in Finland.

### **Subjectivation and corporeality**

Before continuing the discussion of subjectivation in relation to the governmentality of the globalized world economy I want to stress the corporeality of the subjectivation process. Both Butler and Foucault emphasize that the body is the site on which power operates. Subjectivity is something that is embodied, incorporated and enacted through the body. Subjectivating power is a form of bio-power, it requires that individuals internalize its logic and reproduce it in their actions in the form of self-discipline. Simultaneously, the inner space is created as pre-discursive, that is, as the space where this internalization of the logic of power takes place. Power produces the ideal and the norm in the form of the coherent and proper body that is inherently also masculine, as argued by Irigaray. Also, power produces the notion of the body of society as bio-power is not simply about control and production of individual subjectivities but of the population as a whole.

Globalization of the world economy has altered the ways in which bio-power operates. The rationalization of bodies has taken different forms and, most importantly, different scopes. In Foucauldian inquiries, it was the state and other organized institutions that operated as the grounds of bio-power. In terms of the globalized world economy, the primacy of states has decreased as modern capitalism has transformed into global and globalizing forms of power. However, this does not diminish the importance of asking how bio-power operates in the current world. As Foucault (1980: 58, italics added) emphasizes, “*One needs to study what kind of body the current society needs...*”

This question is also what drives my own analysis of globalization, meaning not only that globalization of the world economy operates as a form of bio-power, but also that the bodies, the specific corporealities that have resulted, tell us what globalization is. Thus, we do need to study what kind of bodies the current globalized world economy needs. Answering this question leads to the inquiry as to how the becoming of a subject within the globalized world economy is a gendered and ethnicized process, which is addressed in the following discussion and the next chapter. Moreover, it also leads to the inquiry as to what kind of bodies and experiences are deemed as abject and therefore denied subjectivity within the domain of globalization.

Still, what has to be kept in mind is that the subjectivating power is not simply oppressive, but is productive; it produces subjects. This enables emphasis to be placed on the ambivalence in the formation of the subject as well as in the formation of the abject. This eclipse, that power always precedes the subject, acting on the subject but also activating the subject so that the subject can re-instate or redo the power that preceded its becoming, is important. Keeping this in mind enables the inquiry about the forms of agency that the abject can take as well as the inquiry of how the subjects redo the power that has produced them. Then, it becomes also possible to discuss how the bodies produced by power reproduce and reinvent that power and alter the meanings they take. These thoughts are developed further in the following chapters on the position of prostitutes and clients at the global conjunctures of sex bars in Finland.

### **Governmentality: organized bio-power in the globalized world economy of sex**

I will now move the discussion from a specific analysis of the subjectivation process to an analysis of the organization of bio-power in the context of globalization. The central aspect of governmentality is the formation of the body politic or population that is guided through self-discipline and surveillance to lead to convenient ends, ends that bring individual and collective benefit. The bio-politic is formed through adaptation and adjustment to the technologies of power. Here the objective is not to trace the history of prostitution on a global scale, but to focus on prostitution and sex-trafficking as the effect of the governmentality of the globalized world economy. I will argue that prostitution has become a means of adaptation and adjustment for women in countries subjected

to the transition to a market economy or neoliberalist structural adjustment policies. I will show how the category of the prostitute or trafficked woman is formed as a population of social others in the context of the globalized world economy. As such, prostitution involves the incorporation of the market logic as it is presented as a rational choice at a time where there is a growing demand for exotic others in the global sex industry. Therefore I address prostitution as an effect of the bio-power of globalization.

### **Governmentality organized as bio-power**

Bio-power refers to the technique or microphysics of power that concerns the formation of the social body as a whole. It is not only a question about how individuals turn themselves into embodied subjects but, most importantly, about the development of the idea of the social body as a population. The body is captivated by the soul that forms, cultivates and shapes the body. This process is, according to Foucault, also tied with a historically specific imaginary ideal which is materialized on the body to serve specific interests and ends (Foucault 1980: 58; Butler 1997: 85). So, it is not only the individual who is subjected and disciplined according to specific historical ideal,<sup>10</sup> but the social body as a whole. Bio-power is, in particular, a form of discipline. It is a technology through which the human body is trained to be productive and orderly. It is a form of manipulation and control through which the body is objectified. This objectivation of the body means that the body becomes a site of training, manipulation, transformation and improvement (Foucault 1977). Such training, manipulation and shaping of the bodies is done in order to make bodies respond and obey and to increase the skills and force of the bodies to fit the requirements and the imaginary ideal constructed about the bodies. In other words, the concealed power which forms the subject becomes visible on the surface of the bodies.

Foucault claims that capitalism is precisely based on the discipline of the social body to fit the needs of production and economic processes (Foucault 1980: 100). For Foucault, capitalism is an example of the way in which bio-power subjects individuals in particular, as well as en masse. What takes place, in terms of the establishment of capitalism and bio-power, is the connection between the emergence of the idea of the body of society and the formation of liberalism as a form of discipline (Foucault 1997: 73). This process of emergence of a new kind of governance of the state is characterized by the term *governmentality*.

The concept of governmentality, according to Foucault (1991), includes mental and practical levels of governance. Governmentality is a result of mentality and the organization of conduct; it composes the “art of governance” directed at the social body that is formed as the population. The distinction between practices of government and governmentality is that the practices of government refer to the specific organization of power in certain settings, whereas governmentality refers to the underlying system of meaning of those practices, which also contributes to the concrete organization of governance as forms of discip-

line and surveillance. Governmentality refers especially to knowledge production and to the legitimating basis of what determines the truth about right and wrong kinds of conduct.

This legitimating basis, or regime of truth, which underlies practices of government varies over time. Foucault traces the governmentality of societies evolving from pastoral power of the early modern times according to Christian ethics to the governmentality of the nation-state and from then on to liberalist and neoliberalist form of governmentalities. In respect of this book, the notion of neoliberalist governmentality is most crucial. However, I want to emphasize the importance of the individual and collective governance as implicated in pastoral power in relation to how population is formed through the bio-politics of globalization.

Foucault explains that pastoral power was organized as a form of individualizing and totalizing system of power that included the governance of individual souls and also the collective governance of the flock (cf. e.g. Foucault 1988, 1983). The pastoral power was grounded in the perfect knowledge of the individual and the whole “flock,” referring to the social body or body of society. It is through this knowledge of the flock that the notion of the social body is created. With the notion of the flock, or population, the practices of governance, which are based on the underlying mentality, also emerge. In the case of pastoral power, this underlying mentality was the Christian ethics which determined how the flock should be governed and to what ends. The exact cause of success of the pastoral power in guiding individuals was the perfect knowledge. Here, the regime of truth meant the regime of confession, in which individuals were called to confess, whereby they revealed themselves to power and in turn were redeemed of their sins (Foucault 1997: 81). These practices ensured the goal, which was the salvation of the individual in the next world (Foucault 1983). Power and knowledge operated for the good of the individual and, in fact, for the good of the whole body of society.

Foucault (1983: 213–214) explains that state governance has evolved from pastoral power, taking the functions and individualizing practices of the church and extending them to a form totalizing governance of nation state. This meant that the state took and transformed the operation and tasks of the pastoral power of the church into a totalizing system of governance of the state. In the nation-state also, the idea of the good shepherd was incorporated in the organization of governance. The good shepherd, in this case the nation-state, guides the flock with complete knowledge, taking care of the flock and watching each of them individually and collectively. The state, on the other hand, extended the tasks of the church to include an even wider range of areas of life to be governed. But in the context of the nation-state, the goal was to ensure salvation in this world instead of the “next world” (Foucault 1983: 215). Governance was understood as “the right disposition of things, arranged so as to lead to a convenient end” (Foucault 1991: 93). “Things” actually meant men in their relations and links to wealth, customs, habits, ways of thinking, acting, and so on. Thus, governance as the right disposition of things meant the totalizing level of maintaining order

in the state and the individualizing level of guiding each individual to behave in the appropriate manner.

The production of knowledge among the population through governmentality requires that the system of meaning, the legitimating basis or system of beliefs are ingrained in the collective thought of the population. Through this incorporation of the mentality of governance into collective thought, the objectives and the ends of governance also gain shape. The success of pastoral power required that the Christian ethics of principle and practice were accepted as the truth. The key aspects in formulating and directing the governance of nation-states have been, and still are, *rationality* and *economy*. These key concepts link science-based truths about the right kind of conduct with the governance of the population. Dean (1999: 16) argues that, in the contemporary world, the mentality that directs the practices and the ends of governance is science-based knowledge. The scientifically produced knowledge about the economy, whether national or global, leads to responses by the nation-states at the level of policy and governance. The truth about economy and good governance constitutes a body of knowledge that becomes an uncontested mentality for governance. Scientific theory also is grounded in liberalism and neoliberal principles on the right kind of conduct, rendering these ideologies ahistorical and universal and thus giving them an air of timelessness (Tickner 1992: 71).

The practices of individual and collective governance change when the mentality of governance changes from liberalism to neoliberalism. The way in which the individual subject is determined also changes accordingly (Dean 1999: 18). Foucault (1997: 74) contends that liberalism should not be viewed as an ideology, but a practice that combines the principles of liberalism into a form of governance. For Foucault, liberalism is “a way of doing things,” it is a practice (*ibid.*). The governance of the liberalist democracy is directed at the population, who by striving according to convenient ends, benefit the state in return. The question, then, is one of limited government and governance that is formed through freedom. It is expected that as individuals are allowed to have freedom in pursuing their own goals, they will use this freedom responsibly. Bio-politics in this context means governing the population to use liberty responsibly. In this context, the question of governance is also the question of the right amount of governance. One should govern in the right amount, not too much. This idea still relates to the governmentality of global sex industry, for it is divided into legal and illegal forms; and the legal forms of the sex industry are seen as part of the leisure industry and consumer culture. On the contrary, the illegal forms, such as trafficking in women and children by organized criminal networks, are seen as a threat to the population of liberalist democracies (*cf.* Aradau 2004) and governed differently.

I also want to raise here the point of inclusion and exclusion concerning the production of the subject of the population. Liberalist governance is governance of society or civil society. The society functions as the thought space of the liberalist form of governmentality (*cf.* Dean 1999: 125). The administration of life in this context is also about the production of the norm and, as such, also a

project of exclusion of that which is seen as abnormal. The liberalist governmentality thus also operates as a dividing practice (Foucault 1997: 73–79), as discussed in relation to the three modes of subjectivation. As the liberalist project aims at rationalization of governance according to the principles and methods of liberalism, it also produces these principles at the level of the subject as the truth of the subject. The subject is one of responsible freedom. Here is an important point. Those who are excluded, such as the poor, the mentally ill, vagabonds and criminals, cannot exercise freedom. Yet, the Christian ethic prevails so that the excluded can be given aid. However, this aid should not be given unconditionally, but it can be given to the excluded if they show interest in ameliorating their position according to the principles of liberalist, responsible freedom. This relates to the responses on trafficking in women since there is a debate on whether the trafficked women should be given assistance. In this discussion, there has been a differentiation between the women who have been forced into prostitution and thus can be seen as “innocent victims” and those who have been trafficked for purposes of prostitution with their knowledge and consent. (Aradau 2004). The differentiation between forced prostitution and voluntary prostitution is problematic in this context, for it entails that the aid should be given only to those who have been forced into prostitution, for the violence they have had to experience is the kind that invokes empathy in the socially recognized subjects, who are the subjects of responsible freedom in liberalist democracies.

In terms of the operation of the global sex industry, I see the neoliberalist global governmentality to be more important, for it contributes to both illegal and legal forms of the sex industry, thus resulting in sex-specific body politics on a global scale through its logic of marketization. In this way, it is also governance through the economy in some respects, as in governance of liberal democracies. However, the truth of the economy changes. Neoliberalism relies on governance of market forces, forces that also exist “out there.” In this way states are also subject to the global market economy. (see Dean 1999: 149). Neoliberalism essentializes the market in practices of governance. Dean emphasizes that neoliberalist governmentality operates as a form of bio-power that forms the population, taking place through adjustments and adaptations to the dominating logic.

The essentialization of the market that Dean elaborates on operates as a “folding back” of the market in a manner similar to that of the eclipse of subjectivation that was discussed above. It establishes the domain of the subject through the discourse of values and norms characterized as “responsibility, initiative, competitiveness and risk-taking, and industrious effort” (Young 1993, quoted in Dean 1999: 162). These values characterize not only how government should operate, but also how individuals should act and behave within the society. It thus creates the domain of the subject as the market economy and, as such, also assumes the subject of that domain into becoming a consumer of government. This subject is no longer the subject of governance but rather the object of governance.

The rules of “enterprise” and the “consumer” characterize the conduct of individuals in the neoliberalist system and also determine the position of the individual subject (Dean 1999: 164). These rules operate as norms and values and also form a part of the discipline of social order. For instance, this system operates by reinventing government by making it entrepreneurial and making the citizen into a consumer of government. This means that the rules of enterprise and consumerism determine the actions and forms of agency of subjects. In this way, as Dean explains, the objectives of the government become also its means (Dean 1999: 172). The individuals become subjects in this society if they comply with the market logic, if they learn to help themselves according to the principles and means laid out by the dominating mentality of neoliberalist governance. In other words, if individuals want to gain a position of subjectivity in the neoliberalist system, they need to comply with its logic, they have to become subjects on the terms defined for them and they have to adapt to the norms and values of enterprise culture.

Here, the aspect of the subject of freedom assumes its specific form as the subject of neoliberalist freedom. The subject is endowed with free choice that operates within the neoliberalist logic. Consumerism is an activity that is produced as the right kind of conduct that leads to convenient ends for the society as a whole. This construction of subjectivity as consumerism is especially important as a legitimating factor of the legal sex business, such as erotic clubs and pornography, in the following ways. The consumer subjects of the sex business are seen as free and rational consumers, although the object they are consuming involves the objectification of another human being (woman, child, young male) into an object of consumption. Moreover, the sex business is seen as following laws of demand and supply taking place in the market and, in this way, avoiding the moral questions of content (cf. discussion in Jeffreys 1997, Pettman 1996, Näre and Lähteenmaa 1994). This has also implications on the illegal sex business, i.e. trafficking in women for the purposes of prostitution. It naturalizes consumerism as the normal and right kind of activity and also the use of other’s bodies as objects of consumption and thus legitimates the position of clients in buying sex. I will return to the discussion on the relationship between neoliberalism and libertarianism in the next chapter in the context of ideoscapes of globalization.

I want to still stress here that this process of subjectivation in the context of neoliberalist global governmentality is not gender-neutral. Instead, if one looks at the results of neoliberalist governmentality on the global scale, it is easy to see how these principles and practices not only impact men and women differently, but also create sex-specific positions of agency. This is most clear in the global sex industry, which I have briefly mentioned previously. What I mean is that, although the position of the consumer becomes the available means of agency in neoliberalist governance, this position is one that is available mainly in Western societies and especially for men. For women in countries subject to the transition of the economy and structural adjustment policies, adjustments and adaptations to neoliberalist governmentality imply occupation of a position in an expandable labor force as objects of consumption. In this way, becoming a

subject of neoliberalist governmentality is sex-specific and also relates to Butler's (1990) theory on performativity.

Runyan (1999) discusses how, in global governance, women are *framed* through neoliberal principles and policies. This framing of women, the assessment of women's vulnerabilities and the proposed remedies to counter the problems in the globalized world economy, also exemplifies how the domain of subjectivity is constructed. What is evident is that the domain of subjectivity is established through adaptation and orientation toward neoliberal practices. In situations in which women are seen having difficulty coping with market transition, the solution is seen to lie in the more effective tapping and intensification of the globalization process, entrepreneurship, access to technology, liberalization and privatization.

Runyan discusses the differences among the assessments of women's position in globalization of economies made by the proponents of the neoliberal agenda, such as the 1994 ECE country meeting,<sup>11</sup> the Commission on Global Governance and the countering NGO forces.<sup>12</sup> Runyan points out how the proponents of trade liberalization and market reform see women as beneficiaries of globalization due to the feminization of the labor force and the resulting economic and social independence as well as the potential for women to become entrepreneurs. However, women tend to work in the service industry on a temporary basis and are unattractive to private employers due to the lack of state-aided child-care, maternity leave and health-care, especially in former Soviet countries. These examples point out several negative effects that neoliberalist principles and practices have on women.<sup>13</sup>

### **Neoliberalist global governmentality and the global sex industry**

Approaching the subject of globalization of the world economy as a form of governmentality allows it to be analyzed in terms of the system of power discussed above. With regard to international prostitution and the global sex industry more generally, this approach allows a shift in attention from simplistic push and pull factors toward an understanding of how this system contributes to increasing international prostitution and accords sex-specific and ethnicized subject positions. In order to avoid simplistic and contradictory approaches to trafficking in women, this approach is necessary. There is also a call for analysis within "trafficking in women" debates to go beyond the push and pull factors referring to economic reasons and rationality in migration (Pellerin 1996, Jeffreys 1997, Uçarer 1999). Analysing prostitution from the point of view of the subjectivating power of globalization helps to overcome the binary approach and shifts the focus on how individuals are called and constrained into sex-specific or gendered subjectivity. From this perspective, the global sex industry is seen as an effect of global power, which also reiterates and reinforces the techniques and mentalities of the dominating system of power. Therefore prostitution is seen as an effect of international politics.

There have been extensive studies on how globalization of the world economy marginalizes women and results in a situation in which women have to find new strategies for survival. This was already briefly referred to earlier. For instance, Jan Jindy Pettman (1996) in *Worlding Women* and also Truong (1990) in her groundbreaking study *Sex, Money and Morality* have especially focused on the situation of women in Asia. In these studies, the focus has been on the explicit connections with the transition to market economies, and the increase in sex tourism and international prostitution. Pettman (1996: 200) sees the main conditioning factors of sex tourism as: militarized prostitution and trafficking in women, and the results of economic restructuring which have led to rural impoverishment, urban unemployment, the low status of women and the need of poor countries for foreign exchange. However, just as important is the demand for prostitutes from other ethnic communities, which makes their exploitation “easier” and which is the leading factor conditioning sex tourism and other forms of the globalized sex industry. In a number of feminist studies the gendered impact of neoliberal policies on structural adjustment has been made clear, as discussed previously.<sup>14</sup>

The relative poverty of women that is the result of neoliberalist governmentality can be seen as a major push factor for international prostitution. The analysis of international prostitution and trafficking in women that focuses on push-and-pull factors conceptualizes it as a migration issue (Uçarer 1999). This points to the factor often used to explain why women engage in prostitution, namely, the “women need the money” analysis (Doezema 1998); and it implies rationality in terms of “choosing” the destination country. Yet, it is not so simple as it appears to be.

Still, neoliberalist global governmentality is clearly connected with creating conditions in developing and post-Soviet countries that push women into prostitution.<sup>15</sup> Feminist critics have pointed out that neoliberalist macroeconomic policy represents masculinist bias and that, therefore, the impact these policies have on women has not been taken into account (Beneria 1982, Tickner 1992, Mies 1993, Pettman 1996, Bakker 1997). Neoliberalist governmentality is also seen as resulting in pro-patriarchal policies (Runyan 1999). In other words, women’s position in productive and reproductive labor does not count in macroeconomic policy making. Instead their position is seen as irrelevant and whether the policies affect women’s situation at all, or to what extent, are questions neither considered nor clarified. Rather negative effects are seen as unintended consequences (Runyan 1999). Gender-blind accounting methods of progress and growth leave out the relative impoverishment of certain groups, which are, in most cases, women (Lim 1998). This shows also that the conceptualization of growth and development are regarded as having nothing to do with sex or gender and, therefore, as not having gendered effects. More precisely, this means that women’s position, their work and relations in communities are not considered to be of importance.

The masculine bias within the globalization of the world economy is institutionalized in numerous ways. One such aspect is the invisibility of women’s

labor as well as women's reproductive labor in macroeconomic budgets (Bakker 1999). In terms of push factors for international prostitution, it means that the policies by which economic transition is directed disregard women's role and special needs in transition and tend to favor men in terms of the way in which new work opportunities are created. This results in the vulnerability of women in economic transition. For example, in Russia women have been the first to be laid off, and unemployment can be seen as a woman's problem. Most of the jobs women had in the erstwhile Soviet Union have been made redundant by the transition to market economy (Posadskaya 1994). Women's unemployment in current Russia is a manifold problem for historical and structural reasons, the extent of such unemployment being determined by the nature and the scope of jobs in which women have been employed and being aggravated by the current attitude toward women in market-led Russia.

Much discussion on trafficking in women for purposes of prostitution looks at the push factors described above. Trafficking in women for purposes of prostitution is therefore explained by the impoverishment of certain regions which then also become major sending countries or regions. A study on the economic and social bases of prostitution in Southeast Asia, however, complicates this idea. This extensive research including Thailand, Indonesia, Malaysia and the Philippines, funded by International Labor Office, showed how, in spite of the growth of national economies, prostitution and trafficking in women did not decrease, but instead, has increased and seems still to be growing (Lim 1998). It is stated that the macroeconomic policies adopted in these countries seems to result in the expansion of the sex sector rather than its reduction. To explain this, the report gives several reasons. An important factor is that, even though the national economies show significant progress, relative poverty affects especially the female population in several ways. The macroeconomic policies of these countries have resulted in urbanization and also materialization. These policies have also led to in the reduction of "agricultural employment opportunities while creating mainly low-waged jobs in manufacturing and services for women" (Lim 1998: 207).<sup>16</sup>

The research in these different countries indicates that there is a strong connection between the economic policies that encourage rapid urban development and the potential supply of women for sex work (Lim 1998). This is so because women migrate from rural areas to seek work in large cities; however, remunerative employment opportunities for them are limited and the wages they earn may not be enough even to cover living expenses, as the Indonesian case study shows. This can cause women to turn to sex work, for it seems to provide a better income.

This is also connected with the new consumerism that is spreading to remote rural areas. It emerges from these studies that as there is the possibility to get new consumer items and improve the standard of living through engaging in sex work, sending a daughter away for sex work also becomes a viable option. Supposedly, one can tell from which houses in rural areas girls have been sent away for sex work, for those are the houses that have televisions, extensions or where

renovations have been carried out. It is argued that “this demonstration effect serves as an incentive for other families also to send their children into the sex sector” (Lim 1998: 207). It is also evident in these country-specific studies that income from sex work is greater than from other forms of work, such as the textile industry. This can be an incentive for women to choose sex work and also for parents to send their children away for sex work.

Yet, there is another important factor contributing to the expansion of the sex sector in Southeast Asia and that is the growing demand for commercial sex. The growth of demand is also connected with the macroeconomic policies that have resulted in economic progress in the region. Studies in these countries show that the economic development has created increasing prosperity and an expanding middle class, resulting in “enhanced capacity and, very likely, a motivation of men to buy sexual services in a much wider and more sophisticated range of settings” (Lim 1998: 207–208). It seems then that, as there is a growing affluence among men, so there is also a growing demand for commercial sex. This is because buying commercial sex can be a means to assert one’s status and masculinity (*ibid.*).<sup>17</sup> Buying sex is associated with a pleasurable and luxurious lifestyle. Therefore, buying commercial sex is connected with new consumerism, is an enactment of subjectivity within consumer culture and is a form of hedonistic individualism which seeks pleasure through commercial sex. Yet, the sex business itself is also a part of the consumer society and leisure industry and not merely a means to access. In this respect, the position of the male client as a consumer of commercial sex can also be seen as benefiting larger structures. That is also a reason why the invention of a male client as a subject position serves the interests of those spheres who benefit financially from the global sex industry; and those are the Western states – through taxation, criminal networks and states that need the foreign currency (Mushakoji 2000, Thorbek 2003).

The Sex Sector report emphasizes the vested interests of national governments as the last conditioning factor of the growing sex trade. This is especially evident in the promotion of tourism by the government of Thailand and the simultaneous downplay of the HIV/AIDS factor in order not to scare potential tourists (Lim 1998: 208). Most of the foreign currency earnings in the region is received through tourism and it is therefore crucial for its economic development to promote tourism and also to safeguard the sex industry. The investments in tourism are great, especially in Thailand; an example showing why there are strong vested interests in the sex sector. However, there is also a demand in the public debate to improve the image of Thailand as a tourist destination country and as such shift the image away from being a sex tourist destination.

Another important means by which these countries receive foreign exchange is through export labor (Ehrenreich and Hochschild 2003). This contributes also to the increase in prostitution, although this line of work abroad is not directly promoted by national governments (Lim 1998). Yet, the networks that have been set up to deal with the legal flow of migration have also facilitated women seeking work abroad in prostitution and also the trafficking networks that force women into prostitution. In this way, the governments play a role in inter-

national prostitution, as they benefit financially from export of labor and as they indirectly facilitate the outflow of women into prostitution and the operation of illegal trafficking networks.

Moreover, the global sex industry is a profitable business that comprises legal and illegal forms. It has also been argued that legal sex businesses facilitate and increase the illegal sex trade. It does this in several ways. First of all, illegal prostitution often takes place in connection with legal sex businesses, such as sex shops, striptease bars and the like (Jeffreys 1997, Mushakoji 2000, Stark 2006). Here is the connection between the criminal networks that organize trafficking in women and local sex business owners. However, it is also argued that the advertisement for legal sex services, sex shops and phone lines makes the sex industry in general more visible and thus increases the demand of clients for the illegal services. (Laukkanen 2000). Moreover, nation-states benefit from the legal sex industry through taxation and indirectly from the illegal sex industry (Mushakoji 2000). Most importantly, the global sex business is rationalized as part of the leisure industry and as such becomes incorporated into the consumer society, following the neoliberal rationality of commercialization and marketization. The growing global sex industry, in its complex forms, can be seen to be in close conjunction with the underlying mentality, following the practice of neoliberal global governance. As such, it is this governmentality, emphasizing commercialization, liberalization of trade and rationalization of agents according to the logic of the market, which makes space for the emergence of world economy of sex.

### **Population of the globalized world economy: becoming a subject through adaptation**

The concept of population is a central part of governmentality. This aspect of population is easy to understand with reference to the shepherd–flock relation or the city–citizen relation. Yet, how is the population comprised in the neoliberal framework for global governance? I am going to argue here, following Dillon and Reid (2000), that the population is formed globally through adaptation to the dominating logic. This means that those who are able to cope with and tap in to economic globalization, become subjects of globalization and thus gain the position of agency. This is inherently a dividing practice. The domain of the subject, or the boundaries of the population, are formed through the neoliberal discipline. The practices and principles of neoliberalism were discussed as being comprised of marketization and commercialization. Here, I want to argue that these principles and practices mark the boundaries for the domain of subjectivity. Neoliberalist governmentality is intended as the administration of life; it is a form of bio-politics that also constructs the boundary between normal and abnormal lived spaces. It creates the domain of subjects of globalization as a *global neighborhood*.<sup>18</sup>

Neighborhoods have boundaries. They are also produced in terms of exclusion of the other. In other words, belonging to a neighborhood not only involves

feelings of connectedness within the neighborhood but also differentiation from those who do not belong to it. The excluded are those who do not have access to the domain of the market-oriented global neighborhood and who cannot thus incorporate the logic in their actions. Appadurai (1996) characterizes globalization of the world economy and culture by global flows of money, people, images, ideologies, information and technologies. Belonging to the global neighborhood requires that one can swim in these streams and flows of globalization and thus enjoy the benefits these streams can provide. I will come back to this in the next chapter.

I want to extend here to a slightly different formulation of population in the globalized world economy. Michael Dillon and Julian Reid (2000) reflect how discourses of molecular biology are used in the production of the twentieth- and the twenty-first-century ideas about population. The key point for them is that the notion of population changes “from being a mass of individual units to displaying a kind of collective intelligence as it flows across fitness landscapes” (Dillon and Reid 2000: 136). Population is then understood as a complex adaptive system “conceived in cybernetic terms.” The authors point to the conjunction of bioinformational sciences in changing the production system of global capitalism and also to the success these sciences have had in influencing the notions of population in the globalized world economy.

Dillon and Reid discuss molecular biology and genetic sciences in relation to global liberal governance, which they see as assimilating the view on life forms that these sciences developed – ideas about ruggedness, fitness and evolution of predetermined subjects – and incorporate it with forms of governance. Here, the question of freedom of the subject or adaptive life form is again important, for then it is the subject that determines itself how it responds to the demands that the rugged landscape has imposed. As Dillon and Reid state, “Adaptive life is life exposed, then, to the changing and continuous fitness tests posed by the rugged landscapes that the global governance of liberal peace set for it” (2000: 138). Here is the mark by which the population in global setting is formed. It is a question of individual, or local, adaptation to the demands imposed on it. In other words, it is a position of coping and responding and from then on having access to the dominating system and being accepted through adaptation. Dillon and Reid point to the conditional policies involved in giving development aid in this process. Then, in order to receive aid, that is to say, to be in a position of subjectivity and to have access to the global neighborhood, one needs to comply with the rules that have been set out, and as such, adapt to the dominating system of thought. Moreover, it requires not only adaptation or acceptance of the norm but also its reproduction (see also Hattori 2006).

### **Conclusions: the globalized world economy of sex as a complex system of power**

In most discussions on prostitution and trafficking in women, the question of power and international politics is often forgotten. When the debate centers on

the client–prostitute relationship, the discussion is isolated from larger economic and political processes. Even if these larger processes are taken into account, the operation of power involved in prostitution in particular or the global sex industry in general is not discussed adequately.

In this chapter I have tried to bring these aspects into the debate on prostitution and sex-trafficking by arguing that globalization operates as a form of subjectivating bio-power organized through the neoliberalist governmentality. I have emphasized that prostitution is a form of adaptation and adjustment to the governmentality in globalized economy. In this respect the position of women in prostitution and sex-trafficking involves subjectivation into the position of the gendered and ethnicized social others who are in demand in the global sex industry. To them, the bio-politics of globalization is adaptation and subjection to the abjectivating power of globalization that assigns them agency and subjectivity within the global sex industry, but which does not provide them social recognition as speaking subjects.

In this sense governmentality, in the context of the globalized world economy, operates in a form of disjunction and polarization. It creates the domain of subjects and the zone of the abject, both of which are corporeal positions but differently governed. The abjects are maintained in order to enable subjectivity to be re-enacted through both distinction and fascination with the horror that the abject evokes.

In the following chapter I will discuss how these positions formed by globalization are sex-specific and ethnicized. I will discuss how the adaptation to the rugged landscapes and fitness tests of the neoliberalist global governmentality differs along these divides. I characterize this operation of the bio-power of globalization, utilizing the framework of landscapes and shadow sexscapes of globalization, in which the other is forced to operate and find ways of coping with the inflicted constraints of space and time. Here the position of the prostitute or the trafficked woman is most relevant.

### 3 Sexscapes of globalization

#### Constructions of subject and object positions in landscapes of globalization

Nice, Charming, Sexual: Russian girls in Japan

([www.allaescort.com](http://www.allaescort.com))<sup>1</sup>

I will now use the maps laid out by Foucault and Butler in order to journey through globalization seeking out the body that current society needs. In order to make this journey, I need directions and guidelines on where to look so as to find and see these concrete corporeal expressions of globalization. When looking for the embodied subjectivity it is not evident which way to go, especially if one is schooled in the mainstream international relations tradition in which given maps guide toward looking at globalization in terms of the interactions of nation-states, international institutions and regimes, multinational corporations and other financial institutions

In the country of IR, globalization is coherent and neat. It is represented as a masculine coherent body which distinguishes itself from the feminine, the fluid, the discreet or the abject. Gendered subjectivity is unresearchable in these depictions of globalization that draws globalization of the powerful, that guides toward the city centers and the capitals of the world, whether financial or political, and that points toward other landmarks of the elite..

But this is not the landscape or the land of globalization where I want to go. Instead, I want to find the corporeal politics of globalization that is enacted in the private, in the mundane spaces of bedrooms, kitchens, backyards and the shadow neighborhoods. I want to go toward the uneasy, layered and complex globalization which resists easy definition and which resists staying the same.

The maps that I used to direct the beginning of my journey through shadow globalization were provided by feminist international relations. These maps and guides questioned the international relations of the powerful and directed me toward the powerless, toward the dailiness of IR in forgotten or silenced places. The feminist maps and guides had more details; they were not simplified or polished but included a variety of subjectivities and experiences; they pointed to the gendered effects of the international and how the international is done by gendered individuals (Sylvester 1994, 2002). With these maps I was able to find places that were omitted from the other maps and I was able to see experiences

that were excluded and hear voices that had been silenced. I was able to see how globalization is inscribed on the skin.

Yet, these maps did more to me than just enable me to begin the journey and find the gendered and ethnicized subjectivities of globalization. They also showed me how to write this globalization of otherness, avoiding monolithic master-narratives of normative social science writing and instead move toward plurality of expressions, using literature, fiction, poetry, personal narratives and the arts (see e.g. Sylvester 2002: 267–316). For this reason, in the following chapters, I will break away from the normative social science narrative still used in this chapter in order to bring in narratives of corporeal globalization from multiple registers of existence.

In this chapter I will use the language of IR to tell the story of how the global sex industry as shadow globalization operates through and in relation to global flows. I will develop these arguments by building on Arjun Appadurai's framework of globalization as complex global flows operating through landscapes of globalization. This framing of globalizing processes as landscapes serves the conceptualization of the global sex industry by constituting it as a shadow landscape of globalization or as the *sexscape*.<sup>2</sup> The sexscape itself does not represent a separate or distanced landscape, but rather is formed in conjunction with other landscapes of globalization. In other words, each respective landscape of globalization, although they already overlap, has the sexscape as its shadow landscape, mirroring and innovating the operations and means of that landscape. Its relation to globalization is similar to the relation of the abject to the subject. It is something which belongs to globalization and forms globalization of the subjects as a global village, as a domain of subjectivity. It is dangerous in the way it upsets order, but it evokes fascination too.

Within sexscapes the complex ways in which women engage in sexual-economic relationships are captured, whether as prostitutes, entertainers, strippers, temporary wives and men as clients or boyfriends, whether by establishing dominant gender relations or by extending them (see e.g. Kempadoo 2001). I will explain Appadurai's framework of landscapes of globalization and exemplify these landscapes with reference to the ways in which the shadow sexscapes operate. I will exemplify these sexscapes through information on the global sex industry and trafficking in women.

### **Globalization as a complex system of global flows: landscapes and sexscapes of globalization**

I argued in the previous chapter that globalization functions as a form of neoliberalist governmentality and that the social body in the context of globalization is formed through principles of marketization and consumerism. Here and in the following chapter, I want to extend this discussion and show how globalization shapes individual identities and subjectivities. Foucault's concept of bio-power, or technology of the self, allows this perspective.

I pointed out in the previous chapter that globalization of the world economy

can be seen as representing a dominating discourse that totalizes and individualizes, representing universalization of market ideology that is implemented through neoliberal policies and practices (cf. Penttinen 2000). However, I want to add here that although this universalizing logic is obviously there, the appropriation of it is complex and can take many forms. Therefore I do not claim that globalization manifests in a simplistic and unitary manner. Appadurai also (1994: 331) argues that the indigenization of master-narratives such as democracy may result in further disjunction through the continual changes in the meaning, derived from discourses in different parts of the world. Yet, these take place in relation to the master-narrative, although resulting in reinvention of principles, practices and forms of power. These new meaning-streams, to which Appadurai refers, respond to and reiterate the governmentality of the global market, through which the domain of subjectivity is established by combining the mentality of neoliberalism with the governance of the global market, in order to lead to convenient ends.

The subtle and complex processes of subjectivation in the globalized world can be reflected through Appadurai's (1994) framework which he develops in his book *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. I follow Appadurai's framework, for it overcomes the simplistic models that stress homogenization of the global economy, push and pull or center-periphery analysis of migration, surplus and deficit analysis of trade and consumer and producer accounts of development. These kinds of simplistic and isolationist models have been very common in most mainstream IR literature.

Appadurai (1994: 328) argues that, "The complexity of the current global economy has to do with certain fundamental disjunctures between economy, culture and politics which we have only begun to theorize."<sup>3</sup> The formulation of globalizing processes through landscapes then aims to overcome the simplistic (and binary) models with which globalization has been analysed. Appadurai (1996: 33) names the landscapes as *ethnoscapes*, *mediascapes*, *technoscapes*, *financescapes* and *ideoscapes*. These different landscapes of globalization take place in relation to each other and also represent the fluid irregularity of the global flows as well as the multitude of agents and means by which globalization takes place. These landscapes also differ from the position from which they are seen, whether from the point of view of multinationals or nation-states, or from the point of view of neighborhoods or individual people. Indeed, Appadurai (1996) argues that the last locus of agency in these landscapes is the individual, who by interacting and navigating in them not only experiences the larger constructs but also constitutes them, giving them new meanings. These landscapes are the building blocks of the *imagined worlds* that people live in.<sup>4</sup>

What is important is the way in which these landscapes characterize the formations of subjectivities and possibilities of agency in the globalized world. Appadurai (1994, 1996) argues that cultural identities have become globalized. Global forces that are in interplay with commerce, the media, national policies and consumer fantasies constitute these identities. These identities which had been tied to some kind of locality earlier have now become globalized with the

recent developments that contribute to these global flows. Identities are not stable or fixed but negotiated between globalizing forces and localized meanings. What seems to be taking place is a complex interplay of meanings that is being shaped by these global cultural flows, which deterritorialize local identities. Appadurai (1994: 325) talks about a new kind of neighborliness of the globalized world system, referring to how distant locations are brought into contact by inventions in telecommunications. He explains that these connections, overcoming distance and creating new possibilities of communication are currently taking place on such a scale thanks to the information technology advances – no invention has ever before created an impact of this magnitude. These technologies create new neighborliness across physical and ideational distances. I want to argue that shadow neighborliness is simultaneously created, one that can be characterized by the sexscapes discussed below. In other words, these new technologies and possibilities of globalization enable movement of people, which changes neighborhoods and creates diasporas, but which also brings about new kinds of distances and contact between the subjects and objects of globalization, for whom globalization is especially a corporeality.

### *Ethnoscapes*

By ethnoscapes Appadurai means “the landscape of persons who constitute the shifting world we live: tourists, immigrants, refugees, exiles, guestworkers and other moving groups and individuals” (Appadurai 1996: 33). Trafficked prostitutes can also be explicitly added to this list. The movement of these groups shapes the globalized world. Appadurai (1994: 329) argues that “ethnoscapes constitute an essential feature of the world” and affect national and international politics. Ethnoscapes characterize the flow of people in the globalized world, describing how, in the current world, people face such conditions that they must perform move, or simply have a compelling desire to move to another place. These population flows come into contact with more stable communities and localities, thus resulting in different responses or conflicts. In this way, even those people who have not been so affected by globalization that they do not have a compulsion to move, become involved in complex ethnoscapes that form around their communities and disturb their stability. The flow of people and the formation of ethnoscapes are shaped by these individuals’ desire to move, but also by movements of international capital, production and technology as well as by the immigration policies of nation-states.

The position of the women trafficked for the purposes of prostitution is especially shaped by the immigration policies of the receiving country as well as the economic hardship in her home country. Prostitutes are often seen as a threat to a local receiving community in many ways. They are considered to be immoral, a threat to local families, bringing organized crime and associated with illegal activities. Russian prostitutes in Finland, for example, have brought the sex business out in the open; yet, because these women are from a different nationality, the “problem” of the sex business has been ethnicized. The immorality and

illegality begin to be associated with a different nationality, rather than one's own. Yet, there is more to this than the local response to the women involved; ethnoscapes also exemplify the deterritorialization of identities in the globalized world.

In the previous chapter I pointed out how international prostitution is often analysed by looking at push and pull factors that induce prostitution and which imply perspectives that regard prostitution as an issue dealing with general immigration patterns. Looking at international prostitution as a formation of ethnoscape or sexscape complicates this economic analysis. In this approach, the movement of women engaging in sexual-economic relations becomes part of the larger phenomenon of the global flow of people and the reasons that make a woman leave and bring herself to a specific location turn out to be intertwined. Yet, the movement of trafficked prostitutes happens in the shadow ethnoscape, the sexscape, which is also shaped by representations of ethnicity and masculine ideas of heterosexual sex, correlating with the other landscapes. The formation of the shadow sexscape of the ethnoscape represents the border between subjectivity in the global village and exclusion. To them, engaging in the sex industry is a means of escaping from "the death" of their home, a home which has moved out from underneath them due to the governmentality of globalization.

The shadow ethnoscape of women trafficked for purposes of prostitution is one of considerable scale. It is difficult to give exact numbers of trafficked women (or men or children) since so far there is no agreement on what exactly is referred to as trafficking and, therefore, on how to count it (see e.g. Kvinnoforum 2002). Different organizations, whether governmental or non-governmental, calculate the number of trafficked women differently. In some cases, there is a distinction between trafficking taking place for purposes of prostitution or for other forms of labor, such as domestic or farm work,<sup>5</sup> and whether or not the victim knew what she was getting into before leaving. There are estimates that from the former Soviet States the number of trafficked women to the West and Japan would be close to 500,000, although Russia's official estimate is that the number is closer to 50,000 women (GSN Report 1997: 5). In the *Trafficking in Persons Report* (2003) by the U.S. Department of State, it is estimated that 800,000–900,000 people are trafficked across international borders annually and, out of this number, 18,000–20,000 are trafficked into the United States. Another estimate is that, at the global level, between 700,000 and two million women are trafficked across borders annually.<sup>6</sup> None of these figures involve domestic trafficking. Konrad (2002: 263) writes that it is estimated that 300,000 to 500,000 people are trafficked from South-Eastern Europe to the European Union.

It is impossible to calculate the number of trafficked women all around the globe. The numbers cited above refer to women who are trafficked by criminal organizations involved in practices in the nature of slavery. This is only one aspect of the movement of women in the global sex industry. Women also move to work as entertainers, strippers, dancers, and as brides; and if they are not regarded as "victims of trafficking," they are not necessarily counted at all. Traf-

ficking in women for domestic labor is also significant (see e.g. Ehrenreich and Russell Hochschild 2003). Trafficking also involves domestic trafficking, namely, from rural areas to sex tourist destinations. (Lim 1998, Hughes 2000). Trafficking in women and children is a complex issue, involving trafficking domestically and across borders. One woman may be trafficked several times and into several countries; and she may also seek these different opportunities.<sup>7</sup> Also, the countries involved in trafficking can be at the same time origin, destination and transit countries. The direction of trafficking also takes all possible forms although it is most common across borders of neighboring countries. Generally, the flow of trafficked women to Europe takes place from former Soviet countries; and the major destination countries are Belgium, Germany, the Netherlands, Italy, the United Kingdom and Scandinavian countries (Konrad 2002, Kvinnoforum 2002).<sup>8</sup> The women from former Soviet countries such as Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan are trafficked to Russia and then to onward destinations. In the U.S., women from the former Soviet countries are increasingly replacing those from Southeast Asia and Latin America as the most commonly trafficked.<sup>9</sup> Trafficking, organized by criminal networks, often entails that one woman is passed from the hands of one trafficker or pimp to another so that she works in several countries and so that her debt bondage is renewed.

The greatest demand for women from the Newly Independent States in Europe is in those countries where prostitution is legal such as in Germany (Hughes 2000). According to estimates, one-quarter of prostitutes in Germany come from East European countries. In the Netherlands, in 1995, an estimated one-third of women working in prostitution came from Ukraine and about 3 percent from Russia. The women are as a norm trafficked to stable Western countries. According to another estimate, about 80–90 percent of prostitutes working in Germany, Italy and the Netherlands have a foreign background and have come from Newly Independent States (Kvinnoforum 2002, Trafficking in Persons Report 2003). The opening of borders and economic crises in these states are important factors. Of course, also the corruption and strength of criminal organizations and traffickers are important (Hughes 2000, Sassen 2000). Yet, poverty and economic crisis does not automatically result in trafficking in women en masse for purposes of prostitution.

It is often argued that trafficking in women is a form of modern day slavery (Hughes 2000, Trafficking in Persons Report 2003). The confiscation of passports and debt bondage indicates this. This also exemplifies the constraints, limits and boundaries that those deemed outsiders to the “global neighborhood” may have to face in their struggle to survive and gain access to the domain of subjectivity. For these trafficked women, the global flow of people represents control and closed doors. As mentioned in the Trafficking in Persons report (2003: 1), “Traffickers use threats, intimidation and violence to force victims to engage in sex acts or to labor under the conditions of slavery for the traffickers’ financial gain.” The report, like many reports of its kind, recounts women’s and children’s testimonies of what kind of methods of control and physical abuse they were subjected to in the hands of traffickers. The response of the receiving

country usually places the cards in the hands of traffickers since in many countries there are no adequate tools to fight the organized crime responsible for trafficking (ibid.). If a woman was to escape, she would face deportation and a direct threat of violence to her and her family.

The trafficked woman struggles in the shadow sexscape of the ethnoscape in these ways: she has moved, but illegally; she has entered the country; but she should not be seen; she needs her invisibility and silence as a guarantee for her safety in the hands of traffickers; and, even if she may have some rights in the receiving country, the control of the pimps and traffickers can prevent her from seeking help (Lefö Report 1997, Trafficking in Persons Report 2003). In this way she is constrained by the traffickers as well as by the receiving states' immigration politics (see also Aradau 2004).

The boundaries between the subjects and objects of globalization are also established by the responses of the local community which the woman, trafficked for purposes of prostitution, enters and also by racist and sexist attitudes that objectify her according to her gender and ethnicity. This is especially clear in clients that seek to use prostitutes from other ethnicities.<sup>10</sup> Yet, it might not be correct to assume that it is only the clients that objectify the trafficked prostitute; for instance, the local women and men who do not use prostitutes may be prejudiced as well. Resentment toward trafficked women can thus be seen as marking the boundary between inclusion and exclusion to the global village.

Consequently, trafficked prostitutes also represent shadow neighborliness. Especially in Finland, the prostitutes are generally stigmatized by the local communities in which they arrive and stir different responses between men and women, creating also conflicts within homes and families. Local women most likely have racist attitudes toward the women and, moreover, associate Russian ethnicity with sexuality, aggressiveness and greed.<sup>11</sup> May-Len Skilbrei (2001) points to these types of developments in Oslo, Norway. In a district where massage parlor prostitution took place, local activists started campaigning against prostitution. Although there was a concern for the well-being of the women in prostitution, the motivations behind the campaign were also the value of the real estate in the neighborhood. The main interest was in protecting "their" neighborhood and children (ibid.). Also, the response of the police to international prostitution mainly concerns the individual trafficked women who face deportation, or low-level procuring. The levels of investigation reach, according to Mushakoji (2000), only local pimps or mama-sans in the Japanese case, but do not reach the very top of the criminal organizations. The legislation against criminal organizations is also seen lagging behind since the issue of international prostitution has not been seen as one of importance and the connection to organized crime has been belittled (Trafficking in Persons Report 2003).

In a sense, seeking opportunities elsewhere in order to overcome the conditions of poverty in Post-Soviet countries is illegal on the part of these women, for they are guilty of illegal migration (Thorbeck 2002, Malarek 2003, Aradau 2004). Rather, the very seeking of recognition in the domain of the subject is "illegal" for the object. That is, it is not allowed. The object cannot exceed her

position and move into the domain of subjectivity as she is associated with dirt and death. Rather, her means of moving through landscapes is mirroring and being a mirror. Her movement is made possible by entering into the global sex industry and appropriating the position of the exotic erotic other.

### ***Sexscape of the technoscape***

Traveling through the ethnoscape leads me to move through another landscape of globalization, that is, the *technoscape*. I do not intend to say that this is a separate landscape either, or that it would stand on its own. Rather the technoscape and its sexscape are layers of the complex flows. I need my feminist lenses to see into the shadow technoscape so that I am not simply amazed and blinded by the new forms of freedom of movement, travel and leisure that technological innovations enable in the domain of the subjects.

*Technoscapes* in Appadurai's (1996: 34) framework describe the global configuration of technology, both mechanical and informational, which "now moves at high speeds across various kinds of impervious boundaries." These technoscapes are predominantly driven by "increasingly complex money flows, political possibilities and the availability of both un- and highly skilled labor" (ibid.) Thus, the technoscape is connected with the formation of an ethnoscape, which represents the actual movements of people made possible by the technology that enables the overcoming of distance and time and influences the opportunities of labor.

What are the implications of the normal technoscape to the shadow sex/technoscape? There are several examples; yet, the impact of the technoscape is in many ways connected to the mediascape as well. The obvious impact of the technoscape is the way in which new technologies enable the overcoming of distances. The technoscape that enables the overcoming of distances meets its shadow in the global sex industry. Pettman (1997) points out the impact of air travel on the increasing sex tourism. Also women engage in "romance tourism" in the Caribbean, where they get involved in sexual-economic relations with local men (Kempadoo 2001). On the other hand, women trafficked by criminal organizations across borders for prostitution, with their passports in the hold of the trafficker, do not experience the freedom of the average Western male or female tourists. Trafficked women can also be referred to as "human cargo" (see *Trafficking in Persons Report* 2003). These women may have to pay exorbitant amounts of money for their trafficking. The discounts in prices to holiday destinations do not affect these women.<sup>12</sup> Generally the criminal organizations involved in trafficking have benefited from the technological innovations and have been quick to tap, for example, the new information technologies (Hughes 2000).

Moreover, the technoscape also involves the possibilities produced through information technology, namely the Internet. The Internet is an important means by which information on commercial sex is passed on and also where much of the sex business is conducted. On the Internet, one can access mail-order-bride

catalogs, buy escorted sex tours in sex tourist destinations and also acquire information on price and services of prostitutes across the globe<sup>13</sup> (Hughes 1996, 1997). The sale of international prostitutes or brides and live stripping shows on the internet decreases the cost of the business and also makes these “services” more easily accessible for clients worldwide (ibid.). The mail-order-bride agencies do not need to print expensive catalogs anymore. The Internet allows for the publishing of high resolution, full color photos that anyone can browse; they do not have to pay for the catalog or order it to their homes, and thus information is immediately and more easily accessible (Hughes 1997). Also, the possibilities for live video conferencing change the practices and means of buying sexual services. Now, a client may be able to order a live strip show without being physically present or even on the same continent as the performer.

### *Shadow sexscape of the financescape*

The new technologies have their impact not only on the global sex business but also on their profits. This brings the *financescapes* as our next destination of travel. Financescape characterizes the rapid and difficult-to-follow movements of money and finances between different locations and players. It refers to the mysterious deployment of global capital (Appadurai 1996: 34). Looking at the movement of megamonies across the globe as a feature of financescape also allows for more complexity in the approach toward the globalized world economy. Describing the operations of capital, currency markets, national stock exchanges and commodity speculations as taking place as well as constituting a financescape of globalization allows complexity of current movement of finance as well as the inherent unpredictability and unprecedented scale to be taken into account. The shadow financescape is inscribed on the skin of the trafficked woman.

The shadow landscape of the financescape is the shadow economy. In terms of narrowing it down to the shadow sexscape of the financescape, this points at first hand to the profit-making capabilities as well as money-laundering practices of criminal organizations involved in trafficking in women. Indeed, it is often argued and shown that trafficking in women is a highly profitable business, with low costs and risks and high income (Malarek 2003). The UN estimates that the profitability of sex traffic is on a similar scale to that of trafficking in drugs, yet with lower risks (Sassen 2000). Trafficking in women is less risky, due to sophisticated control methods, such as debts, fines and violence as well as the illegal status of the woman in the receiving country. Since the women most likely will face deportation, they are not likely to testify against their traffickers. The role of the receiving state is also complex. In countries where only forced prostitution is illegal, international criminal organizations can defend themselves by arguing that the women have known what they were getting into. There was, in fact, a case in which an international criminal organization was acquitted because there was no proof of forced prostitution. Also, the penalties that are imposed on traffickers are disproportionately low in relation to the nature of crimes committed (GSN Report 1997, Hughes 2000).

The global sex industry is a combination of the informal and formal economy; in other words, it comprises both legal and illegal activities. Mushakoji (2000) explains that the formal global commercial sex business is an important part of the leisure industry and as such contributes to national economic growth through taxation. The commercial sex business is, therefore, tolerated and encouraged, for it follows the nature of the political economy. In other words, the commodification of women and children is not a problem as commercial sex is seen as part of the leisure industry (Mushakoji 2000). Masculinism, in my view, is inherent here both at the level of the guiding principles of the global economy and at the level of understanding what leisure and tourism is.

The interconnection between the formal sex industry, as part of the leisure industry and the informal illegal sex trade, are important in terms of how the shadow sexscape contributes to the formal economy. Receiving states do not only facilitate the sex business by immigration laws that strengthen the position of the trafficker against the woman but also encourage the legal sex business. Mushakoji explains that the legal and illegal sex businesses are connected. The legal sex businesses such as erotic bars, sex shops, massage parlors, phone-sex services and pornography are also important and profitable business forms, which benefit states through taxation. However, the legal sex business may be joined with illegal sex services. For example, in Germany the legalization of brothels has contributed to the increase in illegal services as well (Thorbeck and Pattanaik 2002). A similar development has also happened in Australia (Jeffreys 1997). Mushakoji explains that the close conjunction of illegal and legal sex businesses ensure the profitability of both by establishing networks of clients and traffickers. Mushakoji argues that as long as states tolerate legal sex businesses, they are not truly opposing the idea that women and children can be bought and sold. Moreover states benefit from commercial sex through taxation. In addition, the support of libertarian ideology concerning legal sex businesses conveys the message that individuals can be commodified and consumed by others.

So, trafficking in women is highly profitable and less risky than other illicit trades. For instance, the UN estimates that trafficking produces a profit of US\$5–7 billion annually for criminal organizations.<sup>14</sup> It is of course impossible to assess the exact profit from these criminal activities. However, the numbers below give some indication of the scale of the profitability of trafficking. There are some estimates about how much profit has been made by pimps and traffickers of women from Russia and the Newly Independent States to the West. In a study made by Hughes (2000) on the trafficking of women from Ukraine to the West, she explains how an Eastern European pimp, who operated a brothel in Essex, England, had been able to make more than £130,000 (US\$210,000) in a period of eight months. This is an example of just one pimp. Hughes also quotes Mikhail Lebed, Chief of Criminal Investigations for the Ukrainian Ministry of Interior, as saying, “It is a human tragedy, but also, frankly a national crisis. Gangsters make more from these women in a week than we have in our

law-enforcement budgets for the whole year.” Sassen (2000) cites how traffickers in Poland receive about US\$700 for each woman delivered and explains that Russian and Ukrainian women are the most profitable and can earn approximately US\$215,000 per month for their criminal organization.<sup>15</sup> Konrad (2002: 265) writes how, “women can be bought for 1,250 to 1,500 dollars and sold for US\$250–350 per hour.” She stresses how human beings thus become “highly profitable commodities – low risk, expendable, reusable and resellable” (ibid.).

These examples give some idea of the profitability of the trade in women for the criminal organizations. However, money-laundering schemes are also quite telling about the scale of trafficking in women. Hughes (2000) explains that in Israel money laundering is considered quite easy. It was reported that in 1995 there were large investments in banks estimated to be between US\$2.5 billion and US\$4 billion and also US\$600 million in real estate. Another example is the uncovering of a money-laundering scheme through the Bank of New York, USA. In this case, during the period between early-1998 and mid-1999, the money laundered through the bank amounted to US\$10 billion (ibid.).

Kevin Bales (2000) estimates that the direct value of slave labor in the contemporary world is around US\$13–20 billion implicating that the indirect value is much greater. This also makes reference to the formation of ethnoscapes. Bales estimates that there are approximately 27 million slaves in the world. He explains that the modern form of slavery can be characterized by expendability and disposability of slaves. The slaves are not bought to work in a lifetime of service, as in old forms of slavery, but in debt bondage. Of this slave trade, the trade in women and girls for sexual exploitation forms the largest and most profitable part. Also corruption at the governmental level in the sending countries facilitates the operations of traffickers and increases their profit-making practices.<sup>16</sup> These figures refer only to the profits made from the illegal sex industry, in which women work in slave labor. One could also start questioning the scale of profits when these illegal profits are calculated together with profits made in the formal sex trade

Last, from this distanced and cold calculation of profits in the illegal sex trade, I want to travel to the landscapes of globalization that show the connections between the ideology and toleration of the sex industry and the representation of the women serving in it.

### ***Moving through ideoscapes toward mediascapes***

Appadurai calls *mediascapes* and *ideoscapes* the landscapes of globalization that refer to the global flow of images and representations. Ideoscapes refer, in Appadurai’s (1996: 36) framework, to political master narratives such as democratization, freedom, sovereignty and welfare arising from the Enlightenment worldview. One could also add neoliberalism to this list along with the ensuing principles and practices on global governance, as described in detail in the previous chapter.

Feminist analysis reveals the inherent sexism and racism in these ideologies. These readings of the dominating ideology enable us to see once again how

subjectivity and otherness is constructed and how these positions are very much ethnicized. The feminist criticism of the enlightenment pays attention to the gender and ethnicity of those who have developed these ideologies and discloses the white and western male bodies behind them (see e.g. Harding 1991).

Feminists pay close attention to the sex-specific construction of libertarianism which is the shadow sexscape of the ideoscape. Libertarianism rationalizes commercial sex through arguments of freedom and the right to seek pleasure. These arguments are also used by the sex workers' rights movements as discussed in the previous chapter. The pro-prostitution movements also take advantage of the libertarian discourses. In its most positive light, prostitution is seen as a form of "sexpression" (O'Connell Davidson 1998), in which one should be free to engage if one so wishes, it is associated with businesslike activity or even entrepreneurial spirit.<sup>17</sup> Commercial sex, at least in its legal form, has been rationalized through discourses familiar from libertarianist discourses preaching freedom of choice, egotistic individualism and the right to seek satisfaction through consumption (Näre 1999). The idea is that commercialized sex as a form of freedom naturalizes the sex business and ties it together with larger neoliberalist meta-narratives on global governance.

The talk of individual rights derived from liberalism has its shadow equivalent in relation to the global sex industry, for it also enables talk of the right to consume other bodies (see also Spector 2006). Freedom of speech is also shadowed by freedom of expressions of pornography and libertarian cries opposing the regulation of, for example, the Internet which is one of the most important and innovative mediums for pornography and information on commercial sex services.

It should be noted here that the libertarian discourse that legitimizes commercial sex according to principles of individualism can be differentiated from neoliberal discourses that are associated with conservative ideology on the right side of political thought. Arguments that maintain pornography as freedom of speech and call for legalization and regulation of prostitution as an expression of individual rights to buy and sell sexual services (see Näre and Lähteenmaa 1994) might seem too radical for proponents of neoliberalist ideology. Yet, these ideologies have very much in common, as already pointed out in the previous chapter in terms of marketization and consumerism. Yet, there is more; for example inherent in both is the demand for a reduction of the involvement of the state, whether it relates to the market economy or the individual right to seek pleasure through consumption. My argument is that, because neoliberalism is a dominating system of thought in most Western states and also in terms of world governance (see Stiglitz 2004), it also makes space for the libertarian ideology on commercial sex and thus libertarianism represents the shadow sexscape of the ideoscape.

Näre and Lähteenmaa (1994) argue that the libertarian view on commercial sex as an expression of individualism, the individual right to seek pleasure and express oneself through commercial sex, have all become a *fantasma*. This means that the libertarian ideology of free expression of sexuality through

commercial means has become a cultural product and is concretized in society through changes not only in the public domain but also in legislation. However, the obvious point is that the commercial sex business is an institution, which is not based on equality or on an individual's right to seek pleasure through consumption or on individual behavior only, for that matter. On the contrary, it feeds on and relies on the exploitation and objectification of women as commodities and does so more and more by eroticizing other woman's bodies in order to maximize profits. The "fun" and "pleasure" seem to be reserved for the male customer and not for the woman involved in sex-trafficking. Näre argues that therefore, the commercial sex business as an institution is in conflict with the libertarian ideology of individual freedom and thereby reveals how the libertarian ideology is both sexist and racist.

The last destination in terms of landscapes is the mediascape, which brings together other landscapes by forming and mediating representations of ethnoscapes, financescapes and ideoscapes. In the mediascape, many aspects that have been discussed so far come together. The technoscape is present by providing the new technology, as is the financescape by describing the flow of money and aspects of profitability of the sexscape. The ideoscape is also important as it refers to the principles by which global governance is directed. I have argued that the global sex industry takes place in the shadows, taking advantage of the disjunctions that global flows produce. This division becomes a bit more blurred in the mediascape. However, the disjunction in the mediascape refers most evidently to the disjunctions of the ethnoscape, referring to who the subjects are and who the outsiders of the domain of the global village are. In the mediascape, the impact of the complex global flows on gendered and ethnicized bodies is represented and also reproduced and reinvented. Through the mediascape, it is shown what global flows do to bodies and also the kind of bodies that are produced. Moreover, what kind of subjectivities globalization entails along gender and ethnic divides is also shown.

Appadurai (1996: 35) characterizes the mediascapes as the changes that have taken place in the global media, the deployment of images of ethnoscapes, fusing news and entertainment, and producing different narratives. Television, film, the Internet, different newspapers and magazines make these images accessible to different and distant audiences. Already, in the discussion of the technoscape, the importance of the Internet on the globalization of the sex business was noted. One can now acquire information on prostitution in different locations of the world, accessing the characteristics of different regions and ethnicities of prostitutes. An important aspect with the Internet is that it overcomes distances and borders. Also the sale and transmission of, for example, live video-conferencing of strip shows is not regulated. The Internet is a medium by which clients exchange detailed information about prostitutes and services, prices and local legal regulations, also giving tips on how to bargain and avoid the local law enforcement.<sup>18</sup> So, the globalization of the media and technology make the selling and purchasing of sexual services more accessible and easier for both the sex worker/prostitute, business owners as well as the buyer. This

also characterizes how the formal and informal economies work to supplement each other.

Nevertheless, while thinking about the shadowscape of the mediascape, this would rather refer to the informal networks through which information is passed on prostitution, trafficking and other forms of sex work such as stripping and entertaining. Those who are involved in illegal trafficking in women as middlemen and clients form their own networks by which they are able to avoid local law enforcement and conduct the business discreetly. This was especially so in the northern region of Norway and Finland in which a bus, involved in trafficking Russian prostitutes, liqueur and cigarettes from Murmansk, came each Friday at slightly different times. However, those who wanted to buy and be involved with the women had their own networks and knew the exact location of the bus as it traveled and thus were able to pick up a prostitute to take to their homes for the weekend.<sup>19</sup> Informal information networks are also at work when women are recruited for sex work abroad. For example, in Ukraine this happens through former prostitutes who, after paying their debt, begin to recruit other women from their home region. Hughes (2000) explains that, in Ukraine, women are recruited by other women who are relatives or family acquaintances and who can gain the trust of such other women. The shadow mediascape, then, may give a woman, typically facing economic and social hardship, information on possibilities of travel and work abroad in the field that is probably the only one available for her.<sup>20</sup> Then, it is through the mediascapes that ethnicity is commodified and through the finanscape that the profit from her sex work is laundered.

Referring to the last point about money laundering, it can be counter-argued that it is, indeed, the trafficker or the pimp that takes the greatest advantage of these global flows of information and technology. However, that aspect refers to a slightly different question of power relations and subject positions within global flows. The way in which women as ethnic, erotic others may take advantage of globalization is first of all by taking the opportunity of movement across a boundary that previously was impervious or closed. Even if this is mediated by a criminal organization, it shows the kind of opportunities that are available to different kinds of ethnicities in the globalized system. Another aspect is in relation to the line of work she takes on, such as stripping, prostituting or entertaining, and thus refers to the kind of demand there is for different ethnicized bodies in the globalized sex market. The growth in the global sex industry to such a scale as it exists now is a development correlating with the intensification of the complex flows of globalization. In Finland, it involves the change in attitude toward sex from one of conservative to one of more libertarian, independent and "pleasurable," in the wake of the hype on eroticism and the spread of sex shops and striptease clubs, thus also helping to change the meaning of sex, or sexual pleasure. This development of the commercialization of the sex business can be associated with the technoscapes and mediascapes of globalization. It describes the way in which changes in technology and the media, as well as finance in a larger context, affect and shape commodification of sex and produce commodified, commercial sex. These different landscapes then overlap and contribute to interconnection to the

development and growth of the globalized sex market and to its gendered and ethnicized “players.”

The mediascape is essential in the production of sexist and racist representations that are also important to the workings of the global sex industry. The representations of masculine desire, sex and potency are projected conjunctively with the representations of compliant, sexual and subservient Russian, Baltic and Asian women. These women carry these landscapes on their bodies, incorporating them and performing them through their actions and movement across landscapes of globalization. It seems also that these landscapes require these individual bodies and their movement for the operation of complex flows of people, technology and ideas. This brings us back to the question of what kind of subjectivities and what kind of bodies are produced through the landscapes of globalization of the world economy and to the question of how these positions are gender-specific and ethnicized. In short, the question turns out to be, “What kind of truth of subjectivity is at stake when the international sex businesses between the East–West divide become one of the most profitable businesses in the globalized world?”

The rationalization and commercialization of sex in the spirit of neoliberalism/libertarianism is only one aspect of how gendered positions are reified. The global media also plays an important role through the distribution of images of (Eastern) women as eroticized or sexualized others, represented according to stereotypical ideals of sex objects. The media, the Internet, local newspapers and TV play an important role not only in representation but also in the construction of gender and ethnicity. In this, the availability and accessibility to pornographic material and commercial sex services on the Internet, advertisement of sex shops and phone-sex services in local newspapers and on TV are important (Laukkanen 2000). Also, advertisements of massage parlors, information about prostitutes, interviews and the like are the means by which women acquire the information that enable them to turn to prostitution, as in the case of Norway (Skilbrei 2001). The global sex trade takes advantage of the production of gendered and ethnicized imagery and imagination.

The global sex trade benefits from those who are deemed outcasts to this global village or global neighborhood. It takes advantage of a situation where the wealthy can buy the poor.<sup>21</sup> Criminal networks that organize the global sex trade benefit from the openness and penetrability of previously closed borders (Hughes 2000, Mushakoji 2000). In this system, where globalization of the world economy opens different paths to centers and brings information of remote locations, shadow globalization begins to develop, which takes form as the sexscapes of globalization.

This shadow globalization, on the one hand, could be even more real in a *corporeal* sense to its subjects than the globalization that takes place in virtual reality serving the affluent subjects of the global village.<sup>22</sup> I want to emphasize the connection between the formal and informal economy with reference to the success and profitability of the global sex industry. Both the legal and illegal sex trades require and produce a specific kind of woman that is the embodiment of a

stereotypical sex object. The woman who is required in the global sex trade is a woman that is sexualized as the exotic other. Yet, what is also required and produced is the consumer, the masculine subject that is positioned as the one who consumes, who gazes and who is entertained and served.

The flow of women from Russia and the Newly Independent States changes this particular demand for the “exotic other” in the contemporary sex industry. The women from Asia, Africa and Latin America, who have served the global sex trade, have been eroticized differently to the Russian women, who are a novelty for the market, having entered in the early 1990s after the breakdown of the Soviet Union. As before, the woman in the service of the sex business was valued for her exotism in terms of orientalism, and stereotypes associated with Asian, African and Latin American women, the stereotype of the Russian/Eastern woman is much closer to “home.” The first point that makes the “Eastern woman” sought-after in the Western sex market is her fair skin and her being more “European” in that she is almost like the woman whom she is differentiated from,<sup>23</sup> yet significantly different. The difference comes through the sexualization of the “Eastern woman.” Russian women are seen as a stereotypical combination of subservience and independence. They embody femininity “naturally” as the opposite of masculinity and correspond to Eastern ideals of beauty,<sup>24</sup> having also higher education.

As already mentioned briefly, the eroticization of the Russian women as the Other to Western culture is also important in terms of the constitution of the demand for these women. Another aspect, which plays a role as well, is that, coming from poor backgrounds, these women are also more accessible than local prostitutes are, for example, in terms of cost and type of services. As such, a client can buy a “European”-like ethnic woman for a reasonable price, who is most likely willing to serve according to the client’s wishes. Russian sex workers often represent the good middle-class prostitute in the internal hierarchy of the prostitute world (Mushakoji 2000). Yet, as they come from poor regions to a different country and culture, they are more vulnerable than are local Western prostitutes, even if they seem to be in better positions than prostitutes at the lower end of the hierarchy.<sup>25</sup>

Globalization of the world economy not only marginalizes women, who then become the “resource” for the global sex trade, but, as the formal and the informal sex markets require women as ethnicized others, they also require the one who is the consumer, whose “other” these women represent. Pettman (1997) says that the representation of the clients also takes stereotypical forms. They are represented as either “ugly male predator, as en-masse Japanese businessmen, as macho US military man.” My argument is that the global sex business in all its forms requires and imagines the body of the male consumer, who is Western in ethnic origin in the case of Europe and the US and who can assert this subject position through participating in the global sex business. In other words, men appropriate the masculine subject imagined in the sex business and give it different meanings. For example, as Kempadoo (2001) points out, male tourists who engage in sexual-economic relations in the Caribbean see it as

being part of the holiday experience. This means buying sex is part of being on vacation and thus just one aspect of the other things consumed for pleasure. Yet, at home these men do not necessarily buy the services of prostitutes. At home, they are in control. This example also represents the control and self-discipline that the subjects exercise “at home” within the domain of subjects, besides having recourse to prostitute use as part of leisure and travel, this being in the nature of general consumerism.<sup>26</sup> The distinguishing factor of the relationship between client and prostitute, in the context of global sexscapes is ethnicity and gender. In other words, the client can differentiate himself from the woman whose service he buys, or whom he more repressively consumes, as she represents consumable ethnicity and exotic otherness.

### **International sex workers moving beyond the domain of the global village**

For those women from Post-Soviet countries, the embodiment of the position of the erotic other means continuous movement and homelessness in the globalized world. Braidotti’s concept of nomadism is useful here, for it expresses the ways in which globalization incorporates movement across boundaries, cultures and gender positions. I do not want to romanticize the position of the prostitute or the sex worker. This position is in many ways a controlled one, as already discussed; yet, it does not mean either that sex workers are not able to reiterate and reinvent their position in different terms.<sup>27</sup> I want to emphasize that both these positions of clients and also sex workers have been made possible by globalization processes and the following division between the global village and shadow globalization. In these global conjunctures, new forms of agency, subjectivity and abjection are formed, which then are performed on and through individual bodies as incorporated corporeality of globalization. The positions of clients and prostitutes are the new sites of agency through which the larger economic, social and cultural processes of globalization are enacted on. Thus, for “Eastern women,” embodying the imagined position of the exotic other can be a means by which they can exercise agency within globalizing processes. I see this position as an adjustment and adaptation to the power of neoliberalist global governmentality.

The position of nomadic subjectivity implies homelessness, characterized in terms of homelessness in the body<sup>28</sup> or homelessness in a distant country and different culture; yet, it is also a position in which reinvention of the position of otherness becomes possible. Braidotti (1994) characterizes nomadism as a kind of homelessness that allows creating one’s home wherever one is situated at any given moment. It is a position that acknowledges multiculturalism – not only differences between cultures, but within cultures – thus also accepting differences within oneself. In comparing this description of nomadic subject to the position of the Russian prostitute, as in my case study, there can be found many inter-linkages. What I want to stress here are the ways in which the Russian prostitute has been produced as a subject position. By this I refer to the larger processes of globalization, such as the breakdown of the Soviet Union and the

simultaneous growth of the sex industry, which contribute to the emergence of a Russian prostitute as a possible position of agency as described in earlier chapters. Then, the Russian prostitute, moving in and out of Finland, embodies these processes of globalization in her movement in between borders and to different places, using her body to do the work of the globalized sex industry.<sup>29</sup> Yet, her experience of the impermeability of borders might not be so much about freedom to move through and between, but about the constraints and very materiality and concreteness of the different spaces and places where she moves. The spaces in which she moves are material and they control her differently than the masculine subjects who engage with her in sexual-economic relationships.

Here, the experience comes even closer to that of the nomadic subject in the sense that the prostitute involves herself in negotiating her identity in the local and “receiving” community, such identity being any one of these – woman, unemployed engineer/economist, mother, sex worker, prostitute, or whore. These subject positions and places are constraining and also exclusionary in some ways, for if one is to take up an identity as a whore it gives signification also to how she is regarded as a person in other respects. Also, the specific spaces she is connected to impose different forms of control on her. In the poverty-stricken and chaotic “home” she might not have rights to full subjectivity due to her sex or economic disadvantage. Yet, in the Finnish community, she is seen as a Russian whore, or an “Eastern girl,” defined through her sex and ethnicity. It may seem to the outside, that is, to the Finnish community, that she has a singular identity, the one which is determined by her “whoredom.”

The position of abject also relates to the nomadism or homelessness of the international sex worker who engages in temporal “subjectivities” and spaces. The prostitute represents social and legal otherness, representing the position of non-person or a person who is socially dead.<sup>30</sup> Yet, following the conceptualization of the abject, I would like also to claim that the prostitute or erotic dancer represents, especially through the movement between national borders, a position of “unlivable” and “uninhabitable” experience or domain. Here is the link with the nomadic subject position. The position of the international whore is then one in which she is abjected both by her “home” community and her “working” community. By the work that she does, she is stamped with certain constraints in both these communities. Yet, she takes on the possibilities opened up by globalization of the world economy. Here, her nomadic position allows her to move around the globalization as the “global village” and shadow globalization. The abjected domain can be characterized as the domain of shadow globalization, or also as the sexscape. It is that space that functions for the autonomous subjects as a dreaded field of unlivability, a space that one can be happy that one is not in, yet simultaneously as happy, for one can exploit the others who are in that domain.

So far I have emphasized the masculinity of the position of subjectivity enacted through the interplay within shadow globalization. However, the women of the global village may also enter the zone of the sexscape by engaging in “romance tourism” (Kempadoo 2001). Then, the sexual-economic relations with a black Caribbean man, function also for these women as a means to establish

and maintain their positions of subjects of globalization. Through commercial sexual relations, they also enact the subjectivity of those *who are globalized*, that is to say, their freedom of movement, travel, consumption and meanings that leisure travel can take. Although the position of the client of the prostitute is most often male, for the women, buying sexual services can be a means of reinventing the boundaries of their gender.

Here, I want to extend this to the relation of the prostitute as the abject or the “dreaded experience.” Yet, the way in which the international whore steps out of the unlivability of her abjection, is by the corporeality of her work. First of all, this relates to the point made at the beginning that the prostitute resists fixity of identity by the performance of client’s fantasies. I want to argue here that the crucial point in overcoming the abjection is by seeing the whore as transgressing her abjection as she is “unfit” in the heterosexual matrix. The position of the whore is unlivable within the heterosexual matrix, especially because, as a woman selling sex, she becomes degendered. Consequently, as she trades in something that cannot be honorably traded, she is positioned outside the formal global economy, thereby having to function in its shadow. But, as the formal global sex trade benefits from the informal sex trade, the international and illegal prostitute also contributes to that formal economy from the outside. She is then abjected in two ways; she is the abject to the heterosexual matrix and the abject to “honorable trading” in the matrix of the globalized world economy.

But, being a nomad, this international whore can be seen as avoiding fixity in these zones of abjection. She can embrace her identity as the “ethnic other” as a fantasy of the Western white male subject and perform it, but simultaneously avoid being fixed by this fantasy. As a nomad, she is resented and even persecuted by the communities in which she wishes to settle because she has the disruptive quality of the abject and because she poses a threat to the order and stability of such spaces. Here, her threatening position is articulated by referring to the criminal aspects involved in international prostitution;<sup>31</sup> but what seems to be also unsettling for the local communities is how, as a woman, she challenges gender relations and the values inherent in the heterosexual matrix. I will continue this discussion in the following chapters in which I write narratives of embodied globalization.

### **Conclusions: sex-specific and ethnicized subject and abject positions in the sexscapes of globalization**

I have argued that globalization of the world economy is a system of power that produces gendered and ethnicized subject positions, which are incorporated and enacted in the domain of subjects and shadow globalization. The growth of the sexscape benefits from neoliberalism through economic restructuring and from libertarian ideologies that justify the commercialization and commodification of individual bodies and which follow gender and ethnic lines in defining the consumers and the consumable. Subjectivity in the global neighborhood is formed through adaptation and adjustment to the changes that neoliberal governmental-

ity has created. As this domain of compatible subjects is produced as the norm, the zone of the abject is simultaneously formed. The zone of the abject in the frame of globalization is the zone of the sexscapes, where business is made out of the excluded, constrained and controlled spaces of the marginalized, whose only option is to embody the position of socially “dead” and, paradoxically, having to perform it as a means of survival.

In this way, particularly for an individual woman, participation in the informal global sex market may be a way to embrace the opportunity provided by globalization as well as a way to combat the challenges produced by the same system of power. In other words, the foreign, ethnic prostitute or sex worker incorporates and embodies the logic of globalization, which is the logic of marketization and commercialization of everything including bodies and the permeability of borders and spaces (and, of course, the permeability of their bodies by the bodies of masculine subjects). This way, on the surface of the foreign prostitute’s body is inscribed the bio-power of the globalized world economy in its formal and informal modes. For example, in serving the sexual fantasies of white Western heterosexual males, she also embodies and enacts the dominating masculine ideas about her gender and ethnicity, thus making these ideas of subjectivities and desires part of her business. As a result, her sexual work can also be seen as incorporating the dominating ideology of the market even though what she trades in cannot be honorably traded in the domain of the subjects.

The subservience and diffusion between the boundary of a sex worker and girlfriend makes the foreign prostitute a place (or a prop) by which dominating masculinity could be established (even by those who have long ago fallen from the top of the masculine hierarchy). The increase in the number of former Soviet women in the sex market implicates this. In the current global sex market, these women from Russia and the Newly Independent States are in demand for their exoticism, “sexual availability” and “traditional values.”<sup>32</sup> Clearly, these aspects cannot be reduced to the ethnic origin of the women, but rather reflect the masculine and heterosexual imagination of clients, according to which the women are marketed and commodified. Then, what is traded (and profited from) in the global sex market is the fantasy and desire of the Western man in flesh, embodied by the women from the locations in the world that were distant prior to forces of globalization.

This point reveals the workings of bio-power in the globalized world economy, showing how distinct bodies are produced as well as required, and especially made, for purposes of trading and making profit by both formal and informal global economic actors. It also shows how the masculine Western man’s sexual fantasies are commodified and produced as the position of agency and masculine norm. In other words, this masculine desire for the feminine and ethnic Other forms that constitutive moment which establishes the domain of subjectivity in the globalized sex trade, in particular in conjunction with the globalized world economy. The global sex industry makes its business and profit from these constructed positions of masculinity, femininity and ethnicity, leading to the conditioning and contributing to the establishment of the domain of subjectivity and the zone of the abject in the globalized world.

## **4 Narratives of embodied globalization of Russian prostitutes working in the erotic clubs in Helsinki**

Reflections on one night in Helsinki  
from the position of a whore, a client  
and a researcher

The narrative in which this book is written is about to change. This and the following two chapters are based on the case study concerning foreign prostitution/sex work in Finland. The information presented here is for the most part based on my own fieldwork, consisting of observations in places where the trade takes place, that is, in Helsinki, in several nightclubs and erotic restaurants. In the north of Finland, which is presented in Chapter 5, the information is gathered mainly from interviews with local people and my own observations of trafficking in women. The penultimate chapter (Chapter 6) focuses on the experiences of the erotic dancers and strippers and the narratives are for the most part based on the information gathered from the erotic dancers.<sup>1</sup> Other sources are interviews with police officers<sup>2</sup> and the Border Guard Authority<sup>3</sup> and social workers, working with foreign prostitutes in Helsinki.

I have explained the reasons for the narrative method in the introductory chapter. I want to raise here just a few points concerning the method on which the following narratives are based. The main reason for writing my empirical material in different forms of narratives, ranging from the personal narrative, the IR narrative and fictional or fictionalized narrative, into which the women's voices are included is the acknowledgement of power involved in what kind of narratives are possible and the kinds that are not. Also, I acknowledge the relations of power involved in doing fieldwork research and in reporting it. I have wanted to resist the power of the scientific representation that excludes different voices and silences others. I have wanted to bring forth that the position of the researcher is far from neutral; and this is especially so in researching "the silent point" of globalization, in which the Russian and Baltic prostitutes solicit their clients in Finland. Instead, I want to underline that the scientific narrative used in social sciences in general, or in IR theory in particular, is just one narrative, which follows certain kinds of rules of representation and which on its own is not conclusive. My reasons for breaking away from the IR narrative come from

the concerns that feminist theorists in IR have raised the question of research methods and the representation of data. I do not want to take on the position of a privileged, distanced spectating scientist, even if that would be possible. On the contrary, I choose to emphasize the situatedness of the researcher doing the research and also the interaction and process of learning that takes place in field-work research. In feminist research of IR, these methods of ethnography and new forms of representation of data have been widely used.

The objective of my narratives is to grasp moments when globalization is incorporated and enacted by the gendered and ethnicized bodies. As I have said in the introductory chapter, I write about bodies that are out of place, homeless or marginalized and acknowledge that these sex-specific positions are the effects of power in the Foucauldian sense. I see globalization as the system of power that has produced these bodies as “sites” that mediate the public and private and as such are also political sites.

In terms of studying globalization, I have wanted to move away from conceptualizing globalization as something large that happens “out there” and instead concretize it in the very corporealities of sexed/gendered individuals. I have argued that globalization produces subjects, it subjects and subjectivates, in the sense that it produces subject positions as certain types of sites of agency. So, globalization is not merely something that takes place at large economic, technological or cultural levels. Instead, it can be seen as something that becomes concrete at an individual level, producing possible forms of agency and constraining others. I argue that globalization is incorporated and enacted by the individuals that have been subjectivated by globalization. In turn, globalization indeed becomes something that is produced on and by the bodies. Globalization is enacted by the bodies, which it has produced. In this sense, globalization becomes something that is produced, reiterated and reinvented by these bodies. In other words, these bodies become almost like mirrors of globalization, on these bodies globalization is inscribed and in turn reinvented. In turn, these bodies show and describe what the macrolevel globalization is and does.

I want to emphasize that the positions of subjectivity that form through practices of globalization are not open, but involve power in terms of how the social body, or the domain of subjects of globalization is formed. Then, the processes of globalization are comprised of a dominating ideology that determines the right kind of conduct, the ends and means of practices. I have argued in the previous chapters that the dominating ideology can be seen to be neoliberalism as it guides the ways in which economic transition and restructuring are governed and implemented. It is combined on the other hand with libertarianism that is the thriving logic behind the global consumer society, which emphasizes individual freedoms to buy and consume. In short, these ideologies are the grounds for principles and practices that guide global politics and the world economy. These ideologies, principles and practices materialize in the concrete places of the sex bars in Finland, which are incorporated and enacted as a form of adaptation and adjustment to power. (see Dillon and Reid 2000). Following Appadurai’s framework of landscapes of globalization, forming as ethnoscapes, financescapes,

technoscapes, mediascapes and ideoscapes, I see the global sex industry forming shadow sexscapes corresponding to each of these landscapes. The shadow sexscapes can be seen as the domains of abjects. These landscapes are reflected on in the following chapters in terms of how shadow globalization concretizes in the spaces of sex bars and in general in the operation of trafficking in women from post-Soviet countries to Finland.

In a recent study made by the Finnish National Research Institute of Legal Policy *Trafficking in human beings, illegal immigration and Finland*, Lehti and Aromaa (2002) conclude that it is difficult to say anything fixed about trafficking in women in Finland because there is a lack of readymade sources. They have attempted to make a quantitative study of trafficking in women to Finland that would be comparable to other such studies made in an international project (funded by European Union Stop Project). I have faced similar difficulties, although I have not attempted to do a quantitative project. Researching foreign prostitution is extremely difficult for most of it is hidden and takes place in apartments directed by organized crime from abroad (Leskinen 2002). My field of research however concerns the one aspect of foreign prostitution and sex work that is visible and somewhat approachable and that is what goes on in the erotic restaurants. The hidden aspect that heavily involves organized Russian and Estonian criminal networks is however reported in a recent study made by Central Criminal Police.<sup>4</sup> This report summarizes the information from a police investigation on procuring and prostitution in Finland and gives an accurate picture of the shadow activities of procurers, local and foreign, and the flow of foreign women. I will be drawing on this report at length in discussing the Finnish shadow sexscapes of globalization, since this report is the only reliable source describing the operations of organized criminal networks in Finland.

However, I already made a promise that the narrative is going to change. I want to move away from discussing the “issue” of prostitution and trafficking from a general and distanced level. I want to break away from the theoretical script, since all those things that I learned while doing the field research could not be fitted into such a text. It would not do justice to the women I talked with or to their experiences of the silent points of globalization in which they work. More than that, I want to take the reader into those places and confront her with the images and the sense and feel of those places, so the reader cannot remain distanced from the women and men who interact there, embodying gendered and ethnicized positions that the system of power of globalization has inscribed on them.

Therefore, I will present narratives that move away from presenting “trafficked women” or foreign sex workers as simply numbers and statistics, to narratives that flee closure and predetermined endings or a fixed position of the writer. Therefore, in the following chapters I will present the IR narrative as only one way of conceptualizing corporeal shadow globalization (there I go again with fancy terms) and write narratives that enable one to have an experience of shadow globalization.

## **Different scripts, different positions**

There are many scripts I could write about an evening in sex bars. I see those scripts already forming when I enter the bar, where the Russian middle-aged prostitutes interact with Finnish, mostly drunken, men. After the most obvious amazement of the place, a place that is forbidden for people like me, not in law but in practice, I begin to negotiate my identity. I am not a whore and so I should not be here. I am not here buying sex either. I am not here because I get a kick out of it, but as a researcher.<sup>5</sup>

However, this position of a researcher is impossible, almost unattainable. In a bar like this, there is no specific place for a researcher to sit, in a manner that if I sit here my position is clear, I am not part of this “really,” I just came here because I am a researcher. What an awkward thing! Nevertheless, if I want to do my research I know I should not let my identity out so clearly, not to the manager at least. So, I cannot assume a safe position and there are no madonna positions available either; there are only whores and clients. In that case, I would rather be a whore than a client. Anyway, since I inhabit a woman’s body and I am here in this place dressed in a similar way to the women; I am dressed in a new Italian suit just bought for the occasion; and the men see me as a whore. Then, isn’t my position that of a whore already at this point? They have by now recognized me as a whore. What can I do or say to convince them otherwise? And even if I do, it will not change what has already happened. The women there see that I am not a whore, but their seeing me as someone other than a whore still does not change what the men see, or think they see. For the women, I could be a subordinated wife of a man who is there to get some extra action and I am courageously joining the search. I think the women mostly see me as being in the wrong place.

I am with a man, my assistant, who consequently embodies the gendered position at whom the services in these places are directed. The services and the atmosphere are directed toward men, so it actually seems that I am here accompanying him. This position I like because, if he were not here, I would rather feel as if I were falling, drifting between these positions of whore and other than whore, which I don’t know and which I feel uncertain about. I certainly do not want to pose as a client.

Yet, there is one position I could take in a bar like this as a woman and that is “other than a whore.” In such a case, I would have to be in a crowd of more of the “other than a whore women” so that the position would be convincing. This position would be a fixed and secure one. I would have a legitimate reason to be here, if anyone would ask. The position would be that of a social worker from the Pro-Support Center in Helsinki. I could also be from a more overtly feminist-oriented project “Prevention of Violence against Women and Prostitution” carried out by the National Research and Development Centre for Welfare and Health (STAKES). Then I would be a woman, who has a quest either to get these women out of prostitution or help them while they are in prostitution.

Either way, this position is a political one, and I don’t know about these

politics. I am not sure which side to take. Both these positions are then impossible for me. I have to forget about safe and fixed positions here and accept being in between binaries, even if these binaries are composites of internal feminist debates. I try to be somewhere in between the position of a researcher and that of woman other than a whore. Sooner or later someone might ask me, “but who are you ‘really’?” And in that case, I would not know the answer. I don’t think all prostitution is a violation against all women, but I don’t share a view that prostitution could be characterized as sex work either, or that the distinction between forced and free prostitution works all that well, or that there should be a distinction between trafficked women and local prostitutes as if one’s position had inherently been better or worse than the other and as if the first group had needed a special kind of saving.

This is an oversimplification, but the trouble for me is that I know it is not the women in or out of prostitution who are guilty for this going on. It is not even prostitution, as it takes place in any particular city, town or village, that is the problem. Still, I can’t help it; I am against prostitution. I see these women working in sex bars, whether as dancers or as prostitutes, and I can’t help but notice the harm it does to the women. No matter how much I am also aware of the prostitutes’ rights of movement and “happy whore” discourse. I can’t help but conclude that these places are dehumanizing. For me, I could not take this kind of work, the atmosphere is truly depressing and I also see the anguish in these women, which gives strength to the abolitionist voice. As one woman says, “This work is no good, there is nothing good about prostitution, nothing good about having sex with different men everyday.”<sup>6</sup> And I see what she means. I look at these men and it makes me angry that they have the position and right to do this to these women. I do blame the structures and yet I partly feel that I would also close these sex bars, nightclubs, and motels that prostitutes and clients come to if that would help to end all this. Or deport these women if that would be the solution to ending every woman’s exploitation. But I know that it is not the answer; I don’t want to make these women unemployed (again). But I would most certainly want to teach these clients a lesson.

In any case, I am definitely not here to save these women from prostitution. I cannot see how I could. I guess that I would rather be the social worker who distributes condoms and gives immediate advice.

I admit, the things that condition the situation of these Russian women in sex bars, their clients both Finns and foreigners, are out of my reach. The reasons that bring these women and men here have to do with the larger economic and political processes that have hit Finland and Russia – the breakdown of the Soviet Union, recession in both countries, changes toward neoliberalist governmentality on a global scale and the gender specificity of the consequences.

Anyhow, there is a personal voice forming inside me at this point as I walk through the bar. This personal voice is one way of telling about what goes on in bars like this. It is, nevertheless, informed by my background in the field of international relations research, but I cannot immediately voice the events and corporealities of this place according to IR representations and style. I cannot

immediately go to a script in which I would see the women as embodying globalization of the world economy although their situation could be; and I will characterize it as such. At first I need to let some steam out. But I cannot do it in this place, where I am supposed to behave in a manner that allows me to see and hear the most.

This personal voice rises from my gut as a response to the atmosphere in sex bars. It is voiced the day after, when I am not in the bar any longer. It is the typical voice that I assume with my women friends in our long conversations about inequalities between men and women.

Sometimes, I use the stories and examples to shock my friends that have never been to a sex bar and resent such places, women who can't believe I tip erotic dancers and who are easily convinced that men who go to these places are scum. This kind of script would materialize in words, then, not to people in here, but in talk outside the bar, with my friends, during the day, over coffee.

### **A personal feminist voice with friends**

The script runs something like this: the scene is really disgusting, it is depressing and degrading. Imagine having to live a life like this, where you make your living out of letting these gross and dirty men touch you, come inside you. You have to sit there and plead with them to have sex with you, and they take advantage of the situation. They behave in all the wrong ways, they grab, they insult, they harass, they drool and they look like they can have anything and anyone. They pick and choose. But they are losers and alcoholics, they have no style, but here they are behaving as if they were kings.

Do you believe what one man said to me? We were in Helsinki one time. He came over to my table, he was totally drunk and smelly and dirty. First, he said that he was sad and then he said that I looked like a real woman, meaning probably "as opposed to a whore." He assumed that just because we were in a sex bar and I was by myself that I would sit there and listen to his problems and then I would go with him. He probably thought that, just because he believed he incorporated male sex, he could do what he felt like. He thought the women were there to listen and pretend they cared for him, which again would suit him fine. And what does this "real woman" stuff mean anyhow that I do it with him for free? Forget it.<sup>7</sup>

But he was not the only one like that. The men seem to be really soaking in the atmosphere of the place and seem to believe they can do what they want. Whether they are alone or in a group, they are all excited about their manhood. They act as if they were real studs and as if they had somehow earned that position of women's attention by virtue of the status, the money, the right kind of car, or something. The men really have nothing and they are there to raise their ego and get some kicks, because they've got the power there. And the women sit and wait and smile, the women have to entice and mingle among these bastards. It is totally disgusting and depressing to see the beautiful women who do not really have choices to do things other than to serve the revolting smelly men.

This is the point at which I voice my own attitude toward prostitution. It does not come from or exist within prostitution debates directly, but comes from my background in IR. Then, it is also IR that affects me personally and that I embody as an attitude toward the events in the world “out there.” Prostitution politics invariably affects me. My political project within my personal voice has to do with world politics. It is also a point at which frustration sets in, for I know my research work will hardly affect the larger world structures and systems of power. Anyway, I can always debate about it with my women friends.

Look at this! It is these women who bear the brunt of economic transition and the Western hegemonic ideology of the market economy; and it is the “same” sex/gender which imposed it and pushed it through that now take advantage of these women sexually. Women’s position in the globalized world economy is to serve, to travel the world as mail-order brides, domestic servants, or cheap labor, both illegal and legal. Women have to entice men to travel to meet them as sex tourists bringing much wanted foreign currency. And this sex tourism is growing. It will only increase. Finnish men don’t have to travel all the way to Southeast Asia anymore; they can just cross the eastern border to Sortavala and Viborg, or take the boat to Tallinn. Globalization provides the position for men to travel and buy and use and for women to serve. Consider the backlash in the 1990s in Finland. It is, as Sari Näre puts it, official madonna and whore politics, that women should give up their jobs and concentrate on motherhood or seek jobs in the only area of growth, that is, the sex business (quoted in Meriläinen 1998). Although these kinds of politics could have been stronger in Russia, the debates took place in Finland too. It points directly to what a woman’s position is in times of uncertainty and change.

But think about the position of the Russian women, especially in this. First, the women are marginalized and live in poverty in their home country; then, there is one option to get out, the sex trade where the men are physically present to exploit the women. It is no longer just the men in the government, or in international politics who exploit the women from a distance, but real, physical (in this case Finnish) men, foreign businessmen and tourists who exploit and abuse these women’s bodies.

The state of Finland has no concern for the well-being of these women and for the things that they have had to go through to survive, here in our beautiful, pure and clean country, the insults and exploitation they have had to encounter, oral sex with these disgusting men and bareback-blowjobs.

I might then elaborate on how the sex business operates and how the Western men buy and exploit “Eastern women,” saying something of the enormous scale on which it goes on. Saying that it is so huge that governments everywhere practically raise their hands and say, “there is really not much we can do, you know it is so hard to get at organized crime” (but so relatively easy to deport individual women and so it is the cleanliness of the streets that we really care for). It is our cleanliness, our safety *from these women who threaten us* that we have to be protected. As the whole mechanism of the masculinist heterosexist and racist sex business is exactly what organized crime feeds on and which also benefits the state through taxation.

The coffee has been drunk with my women friends – in my mind – and I return to where I am in flesh to the nightclub where the Russian prostitutes mingle with Finnish, drunken clients. There is another cooler script forming right there. I could tell a different kind of story of what goes on in a place like this, at least in different words. It is the script of international relations theorists; it is, nevertheless, a feminist script, but it is not a strategical one.

This script is cool and distanced from the smelliness of the men or the perfume of the women. There is no cigarette smoke, no alcohol or red eyes, no bare shoulders or enhanced breasts. The story forms as if I were moving through this space in a way not really being there embodied in myself, but as if I were watching the scene as a movie. But it is a strange movie, for it is me who has become two dimensional in this space, almost like a piece of white paper floating in air absorbing the details, relations and interactions on its surface, while the piece of paper itself (supposedly) remains neutral. It is only a surface which is written on and which tells the story. The paper is certainly also affected by the inscribed words. The writing does not come off easily; yet, it is not the piece of paper itself that is the object of the story or subject of storytelling. It is a mediator, a transmitter and it is supposed to retain its pure whiteness, its neutrality, whether there is writing on it or not. The paper is not the object that interests the reader; but it is the story that comes from the words and from the images that gain shape through reading the ideas the paper conveys. The paper or the ink itself does not matter. The paper does not have to think about or answer about its position in a bar like this. The paper does not take on a whore position, “an unfixed other than a whore” or the position of a client. It is just paper. And in this way the paper can erase itself from the source of the story that it is in fact telling and transforming into words as well as erasing itself from the reader. It is as if the paper itself were never there.

This is the story that inscribed itself on the floating piece of paper that named itself international relations research.

### **The international relations script**

It is here that international relations, the global economic processes, are embodied; written on bodies and circulated on bodies. It is this interaction between the Russian sex worker and Finnish clients that reveals the larger structures of how economic transition and globalization of the sex business creates gendered and ethnicized subject positions. Taken that we understand the globalization of the world economy as a system of global power, which produces subjects and also constrains subjects to certain positions of agency as well as identity, it becomes interesting how these subject positions vary according to gender and ethnicity. Then, what becomes the object of interest is the actual bodies that are affected by globalization, how these gendered bodies do globalization and how they are constrained or empowered by it.

The transition to a market economy in Russia has resulted in falling living standards that especially affects women. Unemployment is mostly a woman's

problem mainly due to structural reasons and therefore it is also accurate to talk about the feminization of poverty in Russia (see e.g. GSN Report 1997; Bridger *et al.* 1996). The largest employer of women was the State of the Soviet Union (U.S.S.R.), which no longer exists. It has been especially difficult for women to cope with the transition for two reasons: the corruption involved in the privatization processes and the sexist and masculinist atmosphere gaining strength by which women “naturally” are seen as homemakers or servants of men whether as wives or prostitutes. Many women have to seek opportunities for work outside Russia or the former Soviet states. Largely on account of the level of poverty, unemployment and lack of connections to the west, the women may have to turn to criminal organizations for access to the West (Kauppinen 1999). The cleavage between the standard of living in Finland and Russia or Estonia remains great and therefore women will most likely seek opportunities to come to work as prostitutes in Finland (Lehti and Aromaa 2002). Also, the profitability of prostitution in Finland makes it a rewarding means of income. According to one estimate, an Estonian woman in Finland can make in a week the same amount of money as she would make in six months by normal wages in Estonia. I will return to this shortly. First, I want to explain how the foreign prostitutes and their procurers have settled as a shadow landscape in Finland.

### ***Sex worker ethnoscares***

The flow of Russian women and women from other former Soviet states to the West to work in prostitution represents the formation of an ethnoscape. The flow of women constitutes a landscape of globalization. Their presence and their activities have permanently changed the Finnish prostitution scene, in particular and contributed to the ethnicized, sexed and gendered organization of labor in the sex trade, in general. Although the women themselves are constantly on the move and the particular women change their whereabouts, their presence has stabilized and settled as have their customers. In this setting, it is a useless experiment to try to count the exact number of women who have worked in the sex business as prostitutes in Finland. However, there are estimates of the number of foreign women working in Helsinki. According to the report, Prostitution and Procuring in Finland, there was just over 500 foreign women working in prostitution at the time in Helsinki (Leskinen 2002: 13). The majority of these women were from Estonia (70 percent). In the North of Finland, according to this report, there have been approximately 50–80 women arriving each weekend from Murmansk. A yearly estimate of foreign women working in Finland for short periods of time adds up to 10,000–15,000 women, of whom the majority are Estonian, Estonian-Russian, Russian and also Latvian, Latvian-Russian and Lithuanian women (Leskinen 2002: 14).

However, what is more relevant is the permanency of their constant moving. Through this constant movement, the landscapes of globalization are drawn on these women’s bodies. The women enter the country with tourist or invitation visas. They usually work for one to three weeks at a time. Sometimes, as in the

case of northern Finland, they work only for one weekend at a time. Their position thus reflects that of nomadic subjectivity in the context of globalization, characterized by homelessness. Finland is also a transit country for women from Russia going to Norway, Sweden and significantly also to Spain. The holiday resorts in Spain are a favorable destination for the women working in prostitution; and Russian and Estonian organized criminals handle also drug trafficking there in addition to the sex trade (Leskinen 2002: 16). The flow of women to Finland is not always direct across the eastern border from Tallinn to Helsinki although this is the most common form of entry. In addition women come to Finland through third countries, especially through Sweden, Germany and Holland (Leskinen 2002: 15). In some cases women enter Finland but cross the border between northern Finland and Sweden illegally and engage in commercial sex activities in Sweden, although they have reported a Finnish city as the destination of their travel (*ibid.*).

These examples show the women's continuous movement across different places and spaces. Yet, what has enabled their movement is the sex work that they are willing to do. In Finland, however, forced prostitution seems to be rare.<sup>8</sup> Leskinen (2002: 11) sees this pragmatically; a reluctant woman will cause problems to the procurers, in which event their cash flow and profitability will be impacted.

Still, the women cannot move or travel across the landscapes freely. In the current situation, the women work always under the control of the organized criminal networks. I will briefly explain the operation of these networks. The women enter into contracts with the criminal networks that are binding and concrete. If the women do not perform as agreed, they will be sanctioned, that is to say, they will have to work for free for a set period of time, or else, they or their close ones will be threatened. (Leskinen 2002: 12, 20) These threats are also carried out. Women who work in Finland, for the most part have not been deceived and know they will work as prostitutes. They might have been given a more optimistic picture of the income or working conditions, but other than that they know what they are getting themselves into. However, the business is still profitable for the women involved.<sup>9</sup>

The women work in either sex clubs or in private apartments. These apartments and the phones the women use are organized by local pimps that work as a kind of hired "help" to the criminal leaders abroad. It is not uncommon that the pimps confiscate the women's passport and papers and also lock them in the apartment for a set period that has been agreed by the pimp and the woman. The locking of the woman ensures that she will work for the agreed period and not, for example, leave after a couple of days, causing a hassle, since the pimp has to organize another woman to replace her (Leskinen 2002: 11). The clients find the women through advertisements in newspapers and now more and more through the Internet. I will return to this in the section of the shadow mediascape. Women who work in the sex clubs also have pimps, but have more freedom in soliciting their customers.

These examples show that even if the women do constitute an ethnoscape in

Finland, they do have to remain in the shadow, hidden mostly from the public eye and literally being locked away. The locking of the door is beneficial for her, since, if the pimp also keeps his end of the bargain, she will gain great financial rewards. For her, the opening of the border and movement across the border means locked doors, sanctions and concrete threats of violence to her and her family. Whereas, for the subjects, the sex tourists, the opening of the border means even more opened doors as the increasing sex tourism to Viborg, Sor-tavala and Tallinn demonstrates, as men travel to seek especially children in prostitution (see Lehti and Aromaa 2002: 69).

The flow of Russian women for prostitution in Finland started in the early 1990s. At first, this activity was not organized (Kauppinen 1999). Women took advantage of the possibilities to cross the border to earn extra income. It seemed that independent Russian and Estonian women crossed the border and engaged in openly selling sexual services. With the flow of foreign women working in prostitution in Finland and their high visibility as they would conduct their business in public, on the streets, parking lots and restaurants, the issue of prostitution has been explicitly ethnicized. Commercial sexual activity is associated in Finland with women from Russia and the Baltic States in such a degree that a discursive construct “*Itätyttö*” – “Eastern girl” – emerged, which refers to the ethnic other women who offers sexual services for money, as explained earlier. This concept of “Eastern girl” coincided with the attitude in the public media in which sex work was seen as a natural occupation for these “Eastern” women as opposed to Finnish women (Näre and Lähteenmaa 1994). This aspect again ties together the changes in attitude toward tolerance and even celebration of commercial sexual services referring to changes in ideoscapes and the importance of the mediascape in forming and distributing images and ideas of the abject in shadow ethnocapes. I will return to these arguments later.

However, since the mid-1990s, the foreign prostitution has been controlled by Estonian and Russian organized crime to the extent that these different organized criminal networks have divided Finland into geographical areas in which they each respectively operate (Leskinen 2002: 16–18). However, large cities such as Helsinki or Tampere can be divided among several organized criminals (*ibid.*), who might belong to the same crime network and report to the same leader. Or, the city could be divided into districts between Russian and Estonian criminal groups. The division of the cities and the country of Finland into districts controlled by either Estonian or Russian criminal networks is typical of the operation of Eastern organized crime and ensures peaceful and profitable organization of prostitution (*ibid.*). Also, prostitution and procuring is an integral part of the Eastern organized crime (Leskinen 2002: 10) and is also connected with the trafficking of drugs.

Thus, the Finnish prostitution scene is directed from abroad and run according to the Eastern, organized crime culture. The Finnish pimps in this setting represent only the hired help. Even so, according to Leskinen (2002: 16), the Finnish help ensures the profitability and safety of the operations of the criminal leaders. The Finnish pimps rent the apartments for the women and take care of

the bills relating to each apartment. They take care of the installation of phones, phone bills and the phone operators (I will return to this in the context of the shadow technoscape). They know the Finnish system and can make sure that the operation runs smoothly. The rented apartments can also be used as hideaways for the criminal leaders and as warehouses for drugs and alcohol. The local pimps take care of the news paper advertisements for the prostitutes and procurement of all the special outfits and materials that the women need in their work. This decreases the chances of women's deportation at the border. In addition, the local pimps ensure that the district divisions are respected so that the foreign criminal leaders can have a seamless cash flow from prostitution in Finland.

However, the hired, Finnish help is also under the control of the foreign criminal leaders and maybe threatened physically if they do not comply with the demands made of them. The foreign criminal leaders also use violence and the threat of violence to bring the "wild," namely, independent Finnish pimps or independent Eastern sex workers, under the control of foreign organized criminal groups. Leskinen (2002: 20) explains that there have been cases where Finnish pimps seek help and protection from the police in Finland against the foreign criminal groups. This is interesting because procuring in Finland is illegal.<sup>10</sup> Prostitution as such is not criminalized in Finland; nevertheless, in the light of the provisions of the amended Foreigner Act,<sup>11</sup> foreign women of non-European Union origin will be deported or refused entry if they are suspected of selling sexual services. Since 2006, the use of commercial sexual services involving coercion has also been partly criminalized.<sup>12</sup> This means that buying sexual services from women, who have been forced into prostitution, has been criminalized. Therefore, it is still legal to buy sexual services from independent prostitutes. In Finland, this means that it is lawful both for local Finnish prostitutes to operate and for men to buy their services. In this way, the shadow ethnoscape is again drawn on the body of the "Eastern woman" and the embodied position of the Finnish prostitute is brought closer to the ethnoscape of subjects of globalization as her activity is normalized in consumer culture; and her clients are not sanctioned in any way.

### *The shadow financescape*

Organized prostitution is highly profitable, especially to the criminal leaders involved. The organization of prostitution as it takes place in the apartments, for example, in Helsinki, is extremely efficient. The women receive the customers and usually gain half (Lehti and Aromaa 2002) or one-third of their earnings for themselves (Leskinen 2002: 23). The procurers collect the rest each day. However, there have been cases where women receive only ten euros/day for their own expenses and the pimps collect all the profits on the basis of "sanctions."

The Central Criminal Police uncovered in 2001 an organized prostitution ring that operated in Helsinki. This organized prostitution was led by Estonian

organized criminal groups. The bookkeeping of the prostitution ring revealed the profitability of the trade. The Finnish pimps that operated under the control of the Estonian leaders had altogether five apartments operating at the same time. In each apartment there were 5–8 Estonian prostitutes. Each prostitute would have a client for 20 minutes and charge 300 FIM (€50.46) (Leskinen 2002:23). The prostitute could keep one-third of the price and the remainder was collected by the pimps. The pimps used an operator who was able to book clients for the available prostitutes. The estimates of monthly net gain for criminal networks organizing prostitution in Helsinki were at least 100,000 FIM (€16,800), that is, after all the expenses such as the rent of five apartments with furniture, phone bills, daily advertisements in newspapers and the daily needs of the prostitutes had been taken care of (Leskinen 2002:23). In the five apartments there were approximately a thousand Finnish male customers per month, most of whom were regulars.

According to another estimate (Lehti and Aromaa 2002: 64), the net earnings of pimps operating in Helsinki were approximately €150,000–300,000 a year. Lehti and Aromaa estimate that Estonian prostitutes make about €500–1,700 in one week of work. In this way, although the profits of the criminal leaders and Finnish pimps are greater than what the prostitutes earn, the business still seems lucrative in comparison to the possible income they could make at home. Also, as the profit from prostitution does not belong to the formal economy, the earnings are “tax free.” According to the police, by the end of the year 2002, in the area of Helsinki, there were approximately 50–60 apartments in which organized prostitution took place (Leskinen 2002: 25). This indicates also the magnitude of profits made by criminal networks and, that too only within the area of Helsinki.

In this context, I want to emphasize the point made by Leskinen (2002: 22) that the organization of prostitution was done adopting the principles of efficiency and maximization of profits. This is possible by the seamless cooperation of the phone operator and the prostitutes so that the operator was able to direct clients to the prostitutes that were free and so that all the women could be working full time. The sexscape of the financescapes means, in this setting, that the woman is the object of efficient trading for the criminal syndicates who run the sex trade. Through this incorporation of the position as the object of trade, the possibility for her own shadow financescape also opens up as concrete cash is earned behind locked doors in apartments in Finland. The Finnish prostitutes do not have to be subjected to this level of control by others or to this kind of embodiment of globalization.

An important aspect of the shadow financescape, in addition to the profits generated from the shadow activity, is what is done with the money. According to Leskinen (2002: 17) Finnish hired help has been used also to smuggle the money back to Russia or Estonia by freight carriers. In this way, large bulks of cash are trafficked across the borders secretly to the criminal leaders. Although Appadurai talks about the movement of megamonies electronically in split seconds across continents, regardless of time as the characteristic of the

financescape, in the case of the shadow sexscape, the money itself can be physical cash hidden inside freight traffic and transported by land or sea.

However, I have also previously stressed the conjunction of the legal/illegal sex trade; they cannot be disconnected from each other and this, facilitates the organization and “success” of both. This boundary between the illegal and the legal sex business also characterizes the boundary between shadow globalization and globalization of globalized subjects, namely, the global neighborhood.

This making of the boundary and the maneuvering across the boundary is obvious also in the financescape. Here, one can look at the flows of money and the operation of formal and informal economies in the sex business. Although the most efficient and profitable organized prostitution takes place in apartments in Helsinki, there are still a number of prostitutes that solicit their customers in nightclubs and erotic restaurants.<sup>13</sup> The point here is that the erotic restaurants, that is, striptease clubs, as well as nightclubs, do benefit from the shadow sex trade that takes place in their premises. In these clubs, the Russian women seek customers and the main interest of the clients is the contact and company of the prostituting women.<sup>14</sup>

It seems that the prostitutes in these establishments are independent regarding how they solicit their clients. The bar owners do not operate as their pimps by guiding the women to particular men nor do they organize the prostitution directly. In the case of prostitutes soliciting clients in the nightclubs and erotic restaurants, the bar owners do benefit from prostitution, albeit indirectly, as the prostitutes draw in the clients to these establishments and also encourage them to buy drinks. The clients pay a cover charge and a coat check for themselves and the women they escort out of the bar. The prostituting women do not pay any cover charges to any of these bars. However, they do tip the bar owners. As the women attract clients to these bars, it is also in the interest of the bar owners to have the women coming in. However, I want to draw attention to the larger picture at this juncture. It is notable that, as these establishments are legal, the state of Finland also benefits from the sexual labor of the foreign prostitutes and erotic dancers, as these bars, where the women work, are liable to pay taxes. Although the state of Finland does not tax the women’s earnings, it does tax the income of the bars and sexshops that make their profit from the women’s labor, in the case of erotic dancers, directly and in the case of prostitutes, indirectly. The Russian and Estonian women working in the bars most likely have pimps also and live in apartments that have been organized by hired Finnish help that works for foreign criminal organizations. Still, there are a number of women who stay in hostels and rent rooms independently,<sup>15</sup> although they are pressured to come to work for the criminal syndicates dictating the sex trade in Helsinki (Leskinen 2002; Malarek 2003).

### ***Shadow technoscapes and mediascapes in Finland***

The media and new technologies are important in how the information is passed on and whereto and how to find foreign prostitutes in Finland. The mediascapes

and technoscapes, intertwined as they are, contribute to the construction of the “Eastern girls” as a possible concept and offer practical advice for using these women. In the case of mediascapes and technoscapes, the borderline between illegal and legal activity is important. Here, the blurring of this boundary is most obviously exemplified by the use of the Internet as a means to pass information relating to commercial sex. This blurring of the boundary refers to the interconnections between legal and illegal activities.

Information on prostitution in Finland, especially Helsinki, is offered through the Internet.<sup>16</sup> On these sites, there have been discussions on where, in the light of change of locations, one can find prostitutes in Helsinki. As some bars are closed and others have opened, the clients of prostitutes in Helsinki have been quick to inform their peers. The information includes prices and types of services they offer. Also, it is mentioned that, close to the closing time, prostitutes are ready to bargain and lower their prices. In this way, the information is very practical and to the point.<sup>17</sup> On these sites, there has been lots of information, most of which refers clearly to the organized apartment prostitution.

More important in terms of a medium for Finnish clients is the Finnish Internet site whose name translates to “Secretary school.”<sup>18</sup> This site used to have an overt “student list,” posting both male and female prostitutes, their phone numbers and services offered. One could also find a map of Finland and, by clicking on a particular city, a list of prostitutes with their pictures and phone numbers would be displayed. Instead of direct information on prostitution, the site now offers information on “dates” and company. On a list of “sure dates” one can again access to the phone numbers and locations of the women. Another service is also the possibility of sending a text message to the operator to request “a date in a city.” The operator will respond by offering approximately eight phone numbers to the client, depending on the availability of supply of “dates” in that particular city. The client himself can then make the contact. On this site, there have also been advertisements for sex tours to Tallinn, indicating the best brothels, prices and also contacts with prostitutes in Tallinn, with the comment, “how great it is” that, for good sexual services, it is no longer necessary to travel all the way to Thailand. Tallinn has also been included in the new “date in the city” service. It must also be mentioned here that women are also recruited through advertisements in local newspapers in Estonia, which call for women age 20–30 for work in Finland, with good earning possibilities. Knowledge of Finnish language is not required.<sup>19</sup>

These examples show how changes in technology and media enable the flow of information on prostitution and facilitate making contact with prostitutes. However, it is not only the clients who can use sophisticated information networks. As already noted in reference to the efficiency of organized prostitution in Helsinki and other cities, the organizers of apartment prostitution have used phone operators and sophisticated computer programs that have been designed for the purpose of monitoring and facilitating the work of prostitutes (Leskinen 2002: 21). The operator had access to the computer programs in which there was information of each prostitute who was working at the time, the address,

description of the location, driving instructions and also special services that the women would offer (*ibid.*). Necessarily, these computer files were important for the procurers' control of the women. These files contained sensitive information of clients and also statistics of the operations and profits.

Because of these sophisticated computer programs, the phone operator could be placed in a city completely different to that of the working prostitutes. Leskinen writes (2002: 21–22) that one operator could, at the same time, direct clients to prostitutes working in a number of different cities. From the records stored in the computer, the procurer could also see how many clients each prostitute has had during her working period and collect the correct amount of money each day. In this way, the prostitutes could not deceive the operator with regard to the number of clients they have had during the day. The prostitute would always inform the operator the time when she received a client and the time the client left. This way the operator could keep track of available prostitutes.<sup>20</sup> This methodology of using the services of the phone operator and the computer system has been particularly used by Estonian organized prostitution.

The technoscapes and mediascapes in Appadurai's framework refer to changes in technology and the media that result in a new kind of "neighborliness," referring to the possibilities of accessing the world instantly, finding the "world" moving into one's neighborhood and the possibilities to travel across the world. However, in the case of movement of prostitutes between Finland and Russia, the neighborliness refers literally to shadow neighborliness. Finnish men can have access to their hidden neighbors, who are possibly and most likely locked in apartments, by phoning a number posted in a newspaper or on the Internet. In the advertisements, the women, or rather the hired Finnish help on the women's behalf, would request "company for daytime coffee."<sup>21</sup> Or, in some cases, the advertisements refer openly to "massage." These advertisements are the signs of the shadow diaspora of the "Eastern women" staying in Finland for the purpose of selling sexual services, for the most part, to Finnish clients. The clients benefit from the neighborliness that is enabled by the new technologies as they can find information and discount travel to sex tourist destinations, which a city such as Tallinn has become.<sup>22</sup> In this manner, the clients enact their subjectivity in the domain of globalization against the socially and legally dead, abject bodies.

### ***Libertarianism as the shadow sex-ideoscape in the commercial sex trade in Finland***

The emergence of commercial sex businesses in Finland took place in the wake of economic changes and the recession in the early 1990s. These events are connected with the breakdown of the Soviet Union. The Finnish export industry was dependent on trade with the Soviet Union. The collapse of the Soviet Union led to an economic crisis in the eastern neighboring countries of Finland (e.g. Näre 1999). So, the economic crisis impacted Finland and resulted in increased competition among restaurants, which gave rise to the increase of striptease bars

(Näre 1999). However, the increase of the erotic restaurants was also connected with the recession in the wake of cutbacks in public expenditures and decrease in welfare budgets and the growth in the number of unemployed men who spent their time in the sex bars (Näre and Lähteenmaa 1994). In this way the economic crisis resulted in the formation of new and, in this case, masculine spaces.<sup>23</sup>

In Finland, the advent of the commercial sex business developed in close conjunction with adjustment and adaptation to larger global economic processes, encouraged by the dominating neoliberalist governmentality. Here is the connection with the neoliberalist ideoscape of globalization and its shadow variant, the libertarianist discourse, that is used to legitimate the commercial sex business in Finland. As I have argued in the previous chapter, the libertarianist discourse can be seen as constituting a shadow sexscape of the ideoscape, which normally refers to the formation of master narratives in the globalized world, such as democratization and human rights embodied in the master narrative of free trade and global markets.

The shadow sexscape of the ideoscape is thus associated with the libertarian discourses, in which the subjectivities produced by liberal and neoliberal discourses are assimilated into hedonistic meanings. Näre (1999) discusses how commercial sex has been identified with words of freedom, namely, freedom to buy, to consume, to pleasure and freedom to have fun. Commercial sex, in the form of sex bars, was most certainly a part of the fun-culture that Finnish people/men had the right to enjoy. Thus, sex work, whether as a prostitute or as an erotic dancer, became represented as a sound and rational option (for women) when there were no other alternatives. Näre (*ibid.*) discusses how, in the media, men's right to buy and consume commercial sex has often been celebrated. In addition, men could deem themselves as doing these Eastern women a favor by tipping them and buying private shows from them (Näre and Lähteenmaa 1994, 1995). I want to emphasize once more the ethnicized nature of the sex workers. It is important to note that, with the growth of sex bars in Finland, there was not a surge of Finnish women going to work in erotic restaurants; on the contrary, the sex workers/women/dancers were "imported" from the Baltic States and Russia. These bars relied on the "Eastern girls." This has been a contributing factor to the eroticization of the "Eastern girls" or, in other words, in the ethnicization of the sexual labor.

However, the opening of the sex bars in Finland served another function that has to do with the organization of the foreign prostitution. The sex bars offered a space from which the Eastern prostitutes could work. Kauppinen (1999) writes that this development refers also to the move from independent prostitution into a more organized form of prostitution. Again this development in foreign prostitution in Finland refers to the formal and informal flows of information, and thus to sex-mediascapes, in the way in which women "gain" information, or how criminal networks are able to guide women to work in specific erotic bars or nightclubs in Helsinki or in any other city in Finland.

It is at this point in the international relations research script where the paper would spell out words of masculinist bias in the dominating neoliberalist ideo-

logy and practices and its relation to the growing commercial sex business in the manner described in the previous chapters. The piece of paper floating in the air in the sex bar in Helsinki continues to spell out words that fit the international relations research, albeit the topic exists only in the margins of IR. The paper is nevertheless confident of its position as a neutral transmitter of a story. (Am I exposing myself, is my subjective position so impossible to conceal, or is the neutral position so difficult to attain?). I insist, there is only paper, I was never there and have no feeling about my writing process or the topic itself. And if the paper can arrange the words correctly, even this offbeat topic of corporeal globalization could pass as IR.

### **Russian women embodying landscapes of globalization**

I have argued that the position of the foreign prostitute can be characterized as that of the abject, representing an unlivable and uninhabitable position, or as that of a nomad, personifying an experience of homelessness. In fact, the position of the Russian whore in Finland can be seen as manifesting these kinds of positions and even more so after the 1999 amendment to the Foreigner Act that allows for their deportation. The Russian and Baltic women, who are the “Eastern girls,” are positioned in the shadow (sex)landscapes of globalization. They move and travel for reasons that are not in their own control. They, as a matter of fact, have to move, for their locality has been moved from “underneath” them, that is to say, it has changed in such a fundamental way that the position in which they lived “back home” no longer exists. In reality, they face a lack of alternatives to sex work, that would be at all possible or nearly as profitable. Often it is said that the reason that motivates women into prostitution is the economic disparity between “normal” work and prostitution.<sup>24</sup> Prostitution then, ideally, is a way to make a lot of money quickly, which correlates with the adjustment to the dominating form of governmentality, albeit from the shadow.

It is important also to note that most of the Russian and Baltic women do not think of themselves as prostitutes; they rather think they are doing this “work” or “business” for the time being to gain money and to better their lives.<sup>25</sup> Prostitution is something they do, for now. It is not a profession. This also informs my own attitude toward the ontology of prostitution, meaning that I see prostitution abroad as an opportunity and means of coping with globalization, which is available especially to someone who can be identified as a “woman” from the “East.” This position of the erotic other is incorporated and enacted by the “Eastern girls.” And in this way they come to embody globalization.

Globalization is drawn and inscribed on the landscape of the constantly moving female bodies. Still, I want to reiterate that these imprints of globalization on the female body, formed on the surface of skin and openings, in the cuts and bruises on the body, in dividing the body into different regions and zones that have different social meanings (and prices) invested in them, can be “appropriated” by the woman. The appropriation means, in this case, not only engaging in “sex work” as a means of personal survival, for these regions of woman’s

body have invested in the capability of exchange value into them, but also as a means of reinventing the meaning attached to the ethnic, eroticized other. The body can be, for the woman, a means to an end, it can be sold and bought, for in the female body is invested the value of the sexual object of heterosexual penetrative sex. Under these terms, the landscapes of globalization also enable the Western heterosexual male access to have the female body of another ethnicity. He too can be seen as embodying or incorporating globalization in the act of heterosexual sex where he can penetrate the body of the abject and also celebrate her compliance and good value for his money.

Still, the position of the prostitute is also marked by shame and secrets, in general, by the stigma attached to prostitution. This again characterizes the different corporealities of client and prostitute. Whereas the client is exercising his right to pleasure and harmless fun, the “Eastern girl” is a position that is not characterized by freedoms and rights, but by constraints and coping. These freedoms of the clients and constraints imposed on the woman stem from the same ideological source.

The discussion on the relation between economic changes, transition and unemployment, on the one hand increasing demand for commercial sex in Finland, on the other referring not only to the suitable condition for the trafficking of “Eastern girls” to Finland, but it also shows explicitly how the different sexed/gendered “opportunities” and subject positions are created by these conditions. Moreover, it shows what kind of implications this has on the bodies of these subjects and objects of globalization.

These implications on the body can be well exemplified by the consequences of the amendment to the Finnish Foreigner Act on the working conditions of foreign prostitutes in Helsinki. It has resulted in a slipping of safe sex practices, since women aim at making as much money as possible in the time they have, even by lowering their prices. As a result, women are more likely to also take risky clients in order to make money and for fear of the undercover police. The new law has tightened the control of the traffickers since women, who have been expelled once, need false papers and contacts to “secure” themselves from the Finnish police.<sup>26</sup>

The new law was intended to control and decrease the level of prostitution in Finland and, through control of prostitutes, also control the organized criminal networks behind the trafficking of women to Finland. However, this amendment to the Foreigner Act, which explicitly prohibits non-EU citizen from engaging in commercial sexual relations,<sup>27</sup> exemplifies the boundary between belonging to and exclusion from the domain of subjectivity in the context of globalization. The threat of deportation did not cease the inflow of Russian women to Finland; instead, it explicitly changed their working conditions and tightened the control of traffickers, on whom the women become dependent for access to Finland. The incoming Eastern women who practiced prostitution were thus differentiated from the Finnish prostitutes. Expulsion of the “Eastern girl” on the grounds of selling sexual services identifies her as a victim of organized crime. This move binds the foreign prostitute, through her ethnicity and exclusion from “Europe,”

to her position of that of the abject and the nomad. She is forced to live unlivably and into perpetual homelessness in the globalized world.

This story of the international relations theorists is so distanced that I start to become numb and sleepy. I wonder if the reader has stuck with the story so far. I want to go on to tell different kinds of stories, stories that allow diversity of voices and positions for the writer and subjects of the story. The last stories allow complexity and fluidity between the events and positions, including those of the women present and even me. Then, the last story will be the one that I like the most, the one that I tell from the unfixed position of the whore, the “other than a whore” and the client.

From this position, it is impossible to tell a coherent story. There are only fragments, the questions without easy answers. From this unfixed position, I could reveal my own uncertainties and vulnerabilities that become exposed as I face the Russian whores. The way they look at me, when they do, is such a firm and direct look. They expose my ethnicity, my Finnishness. And suddenly, I feel ashamed of it. I try to keep my face, but suddenly I feel almost like a child so fresh in this world. The women’s posture and eyes make me feel as though I were born yesterday. I try to pick up the pieces and to look confident. I don’t want to show this uncertainty and sudden floating feeling. I want to look as if I had known where I am and what I am doing. I want to look as if I *could* be one of them. It is almost as if, in this encounter, when they see me they know more about me than I had learnt about them. Fortunately I do hear good stories, stories women like to tell, funny stories and stories that I guess I want to hear. They tell me success stories.

### **A script from the position of “not a client” and “other than a whore”**

From this unfixed position, it is easy for me to talk about the relative power of women in sex work. I look at these women and envy their guts and courage. I envy their beauty, and think I have to go get advice on hair and make up. I wonder about the strategies by which these women are able to distance themselves from the work they do, from the flesh of these men and their excretions. I wonder about how they can still laugh and smile and joke about all this. The music plays loud and everyone is getting drunk. The women we talk to chain-smoke.<sup>28</sup> They tell us how Finnish men are simple and easy to work with. The drunker they are, the easier it is to get their money.<sup>29</sup> Or, they tell us Finnish men are mostly kind, don’t ask for special services and are satisfied with normal sex. They pay well and working here is really a way to make *easy money* and *fast*. They talk about the advantages of being able to make money in a short time, which enables them to stay at home for a few weeks or a month between shifts.

The money they make is something that allows them also to have luxurious things. Yet, they tell me it is hard to make savings; once they start earning more, they just spend more on clothes and make up. This can be of benefit in the end if they are able to attract better-paying clients. I hear stories how women have

bought apartments for themselves here in Helsinki,<sup>30</sup> or how having all that cash allows them to indulge in luxurious things that they could not otherwise afford.<sup>31</sup> Still, these stories are accompanied by other stories on how these women make money to support their families, children, parents and, in one case, also a former husband.<sup>32</sup> They tell me how their colleagues have married men they have met here, but more than that, they laugh about Finnish men who come here to look for a woman of their dreams. Laughing, they ask, “But seriously, why would anyone come to look for a wife in a place like this?”<sup>33</sup>

At this point, I wish it were really so easy and simple. I wish it were really that great to stay at home for a week or two and then work for a week or two, even if this would mean avoiding the police, maybe getting false papers and paying the pimps. From the conversations I have with these women, it seems that they enjoy the freedom that prostitution in Finland gives them. They have tourist visas that allow them to come and go and apartments in downtown Helsinki. They might say something about changing apartments to more convenient locations.<sup>34</sup> Shortage of rented apartments does not touch these women. They must be earning a lot, since the rent they pay could amount to 18,000 FIM (€3,025).<sup>35</sup> Of course, they are silent about pimps and other middlemen, but talkative about clients and prices. They say they are businesswomen and they have a business to run.<sup>36</sup> The discourses in the sex bars confirm the rational actor model; maximum benefit for minimum time. They tell me gently that I am in the wrong place and they ask my assistant if he wants to buy services. As it becomes clear that he is not going to buy anything, they excuse themselves saying, they have a business to run; we smile and thank them for their time.

Or, they might not be so nice to me. They might overtly tell me that I am stupid, that I have no right to come there and ask them anything, that my research is worthless and insignificant, that it is really stupid to study “whores,” or that “You get paid for this, and we have to do this for money!”<sup>37</sup> They don’t tell me, but they tell my Georgian male assistant how Finland is such a backward country how Finnish people are cold and uncivilized, how things are so much better back home, or at least how they used to be. One young woman in her early twenties asked my assistant during their conversation, “Don’t you miss the Soviet Union?”<sup>38</sup>

The women talk about the Finnish police too with resentment, saying that there isn’t much difference between Finnish police and the Soviet militia,<sup>39</sup> ever since the amendment to the Foreigner Act came into force that allows deportation and denial of entry on the grounds of suspicion of selling sexual services. Then they saw what the Finnish police can do to the women: they follow them, go into their apartments, check the money in their purses, interrogate them and their clients and throw these women out of the country and prevent them from entering again.<sup>40</sup>

Or, they might tell us good and entertaining stories such as the story about “Finnish culture” told by a woman in her forties, a former teacher during Soviet times. She tells us how once she approached a man sitting at the bar and told him, “We can do three things: drink together, have sex, or just sleep together.”

He replied, "In that case, I take the first and the last." So that is what they do; they drink until the bar closes and go to his place. There a surprise waits for her, as it turns out that his place is like an art gallery. The walls are covered with paintings, some apparently done by him and the rest by many others. He puts some music on – it is Sibelius – and starts dancing by himself. She asks him if the piece is the hymn of Finland and he replies, "No, but the next one is." And, when it comes on, he ceases to dance and sings from his heart, putting himself totally into singing. After his performance, she asks him, "Didn't we come here to sleep?" and he replies that, on the contrary, as long as he is paying for her time, she has to listen to him. He soon takes out Finnish art history books and they spend the night looking through them; he explains Finnish art history to her and intermittently and occasionally performs ballroom dancing reverting into his own space.<sup>41</sup>

"This is my experience of Finnish culture," the woman says laughing and leaves us to go about her "business." Later, I see her negotiating with an elderly man about safe sex, saying that she always requires the use of two condoms.

When we are not talking with the women, we talk about what is going on. My assistant says that these women would be unemployed in St. Petersburg even in sex work. He says that, to be a professional prostitute, a woman would have to possess specific style, be fit, gorgeous and trendy. He says that these women look like they have just come from the countryside. And we do learn that there are many women from Siberia. Then I wonder if they came directly or did they stay in St. Petersburg for a while (in this business) and then decide to try Helsinki?

Suddenly, there is a charged atmosphere. A group of men enter the bar, wearing leather jackets with "Hell's Angels" written on the backs. One of them has Amsterdam tattooed on the back of his head. I become immediately concerned that I should not look like one of the women there, although I would most likely not be the type that these men go for. I notice I start leaning toward my assistant, signaling with my body language that either "I am here with him," or that "I have already got a client." A young woman says in Russian to her colleague, "You fuck with one of them, you will die." I realize that I could never do this kind of work. I would not have the courage to go with any of these men, even the Finnish "loser" kind. Probably, I wouldn't even know what to do with them. I could never be a whore. I could not come here night after night and compete for the men, risky or not. It takes so much from a woman: endurance, guts, self-confidence and a sense of control over the men. I do not have these qualities.

I am not convinced about the unprofessionalism of these women that my assistant insists on. I see that the women are basically in their thirties and forties, that is, they are not really that young but they are well dressed and poised. I notice I begin to gaze at the women even more intently, looking to find who is trendy and who is not, who looks like a "real whore" and who looks like "the girl next door." Two sisters from Estonia pass us. They cause a stir in the crowd. These women are young; they are tall and pretty. They could be twins. Middle-aged Finnish men in the next booth begin to talk about them, pointing at them

“look, look, there are the sisters from Tallinn.” And then I notice how I look at these women, sizing them up, evaluating their looks and style, checking out who is the prettier woman. Just then, I realize I am acting just like the clients and I feel uneasy about this. I hope the women don’t notice the way I look at them. But I guess that could be one of the reasons they resent me, for I embody the same gender and yet I can objectify them, look at them, evaluate them and do with this information what I want. Isn’t that a masculine position? Can’t they see that I am on “their” side? How can I be there and be on their side at the same time?

### **Global conjuncture on bodies, the meeting of men and women in sex bars in Helsinki<sup>42</sup>**

The aim of the following narrative is to emphasize the possibilities of agency of the abject. I want to show how the woman, as an “Eastern girl,” enacts her position in the constrained spaces of the sex bar. I want to remind the reader here that I see this incorporation and enactment of globalization in these constrained spaces as a result of adaptation and adjustment to power formed as the global governmentality of the world economy of sex. Then, in the following text, the ways, in which these women enact their positions as the exotic other, are seen as a result of incorporation and adjustment to the dominating logic of globalization as a form of self-discipline. I want to stress how these positions differ according to gender and ethnicity, thus emphasizing the sexed nature of available subject positions in the context of globalization. In the following story, the position of the “Eastern girl” is formed as a body that listens, tries through bodily gestures to attract the interest of the client and embodies a voice only in order to explain the terms of her business whereas the client can use up her time and take advantage of her interest in making a deal with him. The stories also describe how men appropriate the masculine subject positions imagined in the sex business and give it different meanings.

She starts her Friday evening in the afternoon. This erotic bar, to which she goes first, is open during the day, and daytime is the best time for business here. She rings the doorbell and, when she hears the welcoming “buzz,” she pulls the door open. As she is climbing up the stairs, two of her colleagues meet her halfway. They are laughing loudly and talking as they are walking down the stairs with a totally drunk Finnish man. The women hold him up as they go and loudly comment about him in Russian. Their laughter and voice has a kind of sharp sound. It sounds as if they were rather laughing at him than with him. They laugh maybe because this guy is an easy trick. But laughter is also part of the routine; they are performing as though they were amused by him. He sort of drools and mumbles in response. He looks straight down; he doesn’t want to trip on the steps.

While crossing on the stairs, the ascending and the descending women exchange smiles and the woman coming to work also laughs a bit at the client. The women’s smile is a kind professional recognition, it is warm and sympathiz-

ing. They are amused by the mumbling drunk man. They all know he will be an easy trick. He won't last more than ten minutes and pass out. Evidently, he is so drunk that he doesn't even care or know what goes on around him. He feels great that he's got these two women going with him. He will have his fun for the weekend now. He might even think to himself that he is a real stud. These women enable this feeling in him.

The bouncer upstairs greets the woman who is coming to work. He welcomes her in a friendly way and takes her coat. This is not a fancy restaurant, far from it. But it is cozy and straightforward. It is an erotic bar and there are striptease shows every now and then, although hardly anyone comes for the show alone. Of course there are also private strip shows and some women might use the space these private cabins offer for fast extra cash. The police has been interested in this bar as well. This bar has been raided many times since the amendment to the Foreigner Act, but that has not happened recently; and the atmosphere is relaxed again. Nevertheless, some girls say they serve the police too! Who knows? She might just as well believe it. These things are not uncommon, not in her home country, at least.

But she is not afraid of the police. She knows to be careful and she does know how to do her business. Anyway, the police have left the women to do their business. The women know how to do business quietly. They don't disturb the public; they don't work on the streets. They pass unseen during the day, they work in the bars away from public eye and in places that the public in Helsinki can avoid and ignore, even if all these bars are right downtown. Still, the bars are recognized and the discourse of going to the sex bars can be useful. A man can say to his wife, "If you don't do this, I can always go to a sex bar."<sup>43</sup> Going to a sex bar can be used as a threat in a relationship. Going to a sex bar as a threat shows the possibilities that globalization processes have opened for a man in Finland and the way it can be used in private, in the relationship with his wife. These places that withhold the embodiment of shadow globalization have consequences on the outside. They are not separate from the domain of subjects. The man can gaze at himself from the surface of the "Eastern girl," he can recognize his possibilities of agency from her lack of it. This globalization that has brought the Russian woman across the border enables the man "to do some fucking, things that his wife would never do."

This Russian woman has been doing this work for a few years now. Working in Helsinki has been easy for her. The drunkenness and smelliness of the clients are some of the downsides, but she is not afraid of the clients. She thinks of herself as a psychologist, she has developed a sense about the men.<sup>44</sup> She believes she can point out the violent ones and the men who cause trouble. And other women working there would for sure warn her if they knew that a particular man was dangerous. She is able to make good money, enough to cover her expenses and some left over for saving.

The work is easy and she knows how to get a client. She knows the routine. She may not be the most gorgeous one, the tallest or the youngest and there are not many who are so anyway. She is sort of homely looking, in her late thirties,

red brownish hair, she likes to wear jeans to work and a tight T-shirt. It is better to be underdressed than overdressed, especially here at this particular bar. Her Finnish and English are poor, but it is not the spoken language that she needs, it is her gestures and body movements, her smile that works. When she “talks” with a prospective client, she moves and dances around him, almost signaling that she is “so happy” to be with him. She is not threatening in anyway, but looks kind and easy going. It seems as if she is not even taking herself very seriously. Part of her act is the joyfulness, while other women sit around the bar in booths, looking bored. Her advantage is her activeness. Her activeness in enticing the client is not aggressiveness; she doesn’t act like a “phallic woman,” but she conducts herself in a friendly fashion. She has adjusted to power, she disciplines herself to enact the position of the “Eastern girl,” naturally subservient to men and homely enough, and soon she has made contact with a man who is sitting at the bar by himself.

He doesn’t talk much either but she somehow manages to make him buy her a drink. They sit together almost as if they were spending time together, as if they were an old couple, exchanging a few words every now and then. She is feeling him out. What would be the best strategy now? He is in his late forties, wearing a sweater and pants, his clothes seem worn out and old. Their communication takes place through the articulations of her body. She smiles and speaks with her hands, she slips on and off her barstool and nods strongly and smiles right into his eyes. At times, she looks serious as if she were listening to the man, as if she has understood and as if she were able to hear him.

Soon a girl comes on the stage, the music gets louder and the stage is lit up. The stage is a long platform against a mirrored wall, across the room from the bar. In the middle, there is an extension which divides the room into two sides, in front there are booths, cozy couches and a large TV screen, in the rear there are tables and chairs and booths for private shows.

The girl is obviously a Finn; she comes on stage wearing a long glimmering gown and professional high heel platform shoes of the Sunset Strip kind from Los Angeles.<sup>45</sup> The dancer’s face looks serious and bored. She doesn’t look at the people around her, who mostly consist of Russian prostitutes and a few male clients. The Russian woman and her client stop talking, however, and turn around to watch the show. They are probably the only ones who are watching; the others go about their business. The Russian women sit together and talk among themselves about the countries where they have worked. The men eye the selection of women and keep drinking.

After the striptease performance, the Russian woman claps excessively; but no one pays attention to her much less to the dancer. She is signaling to her prospective client that the dancer is beautiful and has done a good show. He nods quietly. Is he a bit embarrassed because she is taking the position of looking at the striptease performance, evaluating and appreciating it? She is, of course, trying to connect with him to share something.

The men who have spent their day here have already gone and now there are only a few more clients slowly dropping in, men who don’t mind that the beer is more expensive here than in other bars.<sup>46</sup> The women keep on talking and laugh-

ing together and sharing experiences. One woman tells others about her experiences in the US, about the demands of clients there and how they wanted women who are really physically fit. The women laugh together, how luckily it is not like that here in Finland. Time seems to be going slowly. The music plays in the background and there are not many customers in the bar for the dancer to ask for tips.

The couple by the bar are getting their second drink, second for her at least. Who knows how many he has already had?

By the table there is another couple talking, a Russian-Estonian woman and a man who is foreign too. They talk in Finnish; but this time it is he who does the talking. He talks and talks and keeps talking while she sits there beside him, playing with the drink in her hand and responding to his ongoing babble with comments such *hmmm, really? hmm, oh no...*

The sports broadcast on the large TV screen is over and a dating game called *videotreffi* (videodate) comes on. It is a game show featuring young Finnish women and men competing for a week's holiday trip up north to a Ski resort with a date picked up from the show. In the show is an openly (hetero)sexual charge in all the interviews and comments by the contestants and show hosts. It is a celebration of a fun-culture of dating and liberated heterosexual sex, accessible for both men and women in an easy going and equal atmosphere.

The foreigner close to the stage continues to talk, or rather whine to the Russian woman. He tells her all about himself, what he is doing in Finland (business trip), his likes (his employees who don't ask for much) and dislikes (how much money he has to pay for everything). He speaks with an accent, they both do. He goes on and on about the men he employs and about the turnover of the business. He whines about taxation and all the other costs in running a business. She doesn't interrupt him, just says *hmm* and soon he changes the topic to his family, to his wife and kids. The woman seems bored, but she still plays her part as a patient listener. He must know that she is there listening to his problems because she wants him to buy sexual services from her. This certainly works to his advantage. He can keep her hanging and use up her time.

His complaining goes on, he says how in his home country, if a man has sex with a girl, he is forced to marry her. If he won't, her brothers will come and force him to do it. She raises her voice in a considerate *really*.

It is sort of awkward. Is he inferring that it is so much better here, where he can buy a woman for sex without any consequences unlike in his home country and, in anticipation of making the deal with him, he expects that she will also listen to his ongoing complaining? Still, she doesn't interrupt him but wants to direct the conversation toward her prices. These are the only things she voices in *words out and loud*, the price for half-an hour, price for an hour, oral sex or not, or normal intercourse. She becomes a voice that he can hear only when she speaks the terms of her business, that is, when she embodies and enacts her position as a prostitute.

The only time when *he* responds to her and elevates *his* voice into a considerably high pitched, "*really and really, always?*" is when she insists on condom

use. His reluctance on this last point irritates her. She seems annoyed and a bit uncertain if she has been wasting her time with him. But even if the discussion on prices and terms of her business did not get her closer to the deal, she figures she might just as well stay. At least she has made a contact and hopefully he will buy her services. At least, he ought to know why women are in bars like this. He sounds so cheap that he is definitely not paying her for her time here.

Later, they continue their evening together in an erotic bar that is open till late hours, where they engage in playing a card game machine. His voice is still ongoing, she leans against the machine he is playing and is silent. She looks quiet and serious and distant from him, preoccupied with her own thoughts.

While the dating game is still on TV and another dancer is finishing her round of collecting tips from the customers, the Russian woman by the bar has managed to convince the man to go with her. As if preventing that he would change his mind, she takes him by the hand, in a way guiding, but firmly as if pulling him out of the bar with her. She looks happy, she is grinning. She looks victorious, as she passes her winning smile to the men and women in the bar.

Soon after they have left, a man emerges from the back of the bar. He looks as though he might be a pimp. He is short and fat, dressed in a black suit and has a heavy golden orthodox cross pressing down on his bulging stomach. His bow tie is crooked and the buttons of his shirt seem to be about to burst. With his cane, which has a golden handle, he tries to animate the women a bit, to get them up and moving and making contacts with clients. But the women there don't care much and jokingly tell him off. He is much older than them; he is in his sixties and looks like a father figure. This Russian man and these women laugh together, and he keeps sort of guiding and grouping them with his cane. He is like a (moneymaking) good shepherd looking after his flock. He seems to have a perfect knowledge of the women, individually and collectively. He guides them to convenient ends.

Then, something happens to break this warm family atmosphere. This man is not pleased at all when he notices that the stripper gives a customer a kiss on his cheek in thanking for a generous tip. The Russian man (or, pimp?) aggressively approaches the slender young dancer in a bikini and yells at her rudely for being so friendly with the client. In response, the client steps up and tries to defend the girl, but she blushes nervously. And then, she apologizes swiftly, her voice stutters when she promises not to touch the clients again, not to overstep her boundaries and not to get too close again. She looks terrified. The Russian man backs off reluctantly and she looks away. The client looks at her, but doesn't dare to comfort her. Instead, he puts an additional 20 FIM (€3.50) bill in her G-string so as to compensate and make her feel better. She thanks him shyly and quietly, lowering her head down like a nice girl and then runs off, escaping the violent words and atmosphere, back to the strippers dressing room.

Later that evening, the Russian woman who had left the bar that is open during the day, continues her evening in another bar that closes late. It is also an erotic bar, but supposedly more classy than the previous place. There the men are slightly better dressed, or at least they used to be. The atmosphere is also

more tense and active, there are more men and more women, but there are always more women than there are men. Every once in a while, a black dancer comes on stage and does her striptease routine. Men collect around her in the small room where she dances, the men that are not inside stand by the doorways, peeking, looking over each others' shoulders. The "Eastern girls" stand back. They have seen her performance already too many times and it is of no interest to them.

This bar is located in a cellar. Right at the entrance there is the coat check and entrance fee, but the Russian woman passes as usual by greeting the doormen. Of course, they know her and she, like other women in her "profession," never has to pay. She walks down the stairs that lead to the bar, to the dimmed lights, loud music, laughter and noise. It is already well past midnight and the women there seem to be getting busier with making deals. The women work intensively. As men enter the bar the women swiftly make eye contact and smile enticingly, as if it was really these specific men they were looking at, that they desperately want in every way. The atmosphere is relaxed, but charged with sexual energy.

The black dancer comes on stage again to strip and dance. She moves and flows around by holding the steel bar attached to the stage that links the ceiling and floor together. She moves up and down, exposing her soon-to-be totally nude body from every angle and in every angle possible. The lights flicker as special effects, for a split second the light is on and off, on and off, on and off, emphasizing the fast beat of the music. Her performance, or rather the exposure of her body, her tanned skin, her movements, all these become almost like a peep show for a fraction of a second. Now you see her (nude body) now you don't, now you see her, now you don't. The flickering of lights in this way to emphasize the rhythm are used in normal nightclubs as well. But here, it gains more meaning; the light as it goes on and off cuts off and then allows again the penetrating gaze of the men on her body, on her skin. She moves and the lights emphasize how she exposes and reveals her body to the men. But the flickering light also protects her self, it makes her body and performance distanced from her physical presence; the light shines on her, but in a way it conceals her, for it makes her appear to be just a combination of surfaces, sounds, lighting, skin, a female body. It is not she, who is exposed, but the body of a woman as a stereotypical sex object. Then she has only played with those surfaces and the images inscribed on her body as the "erotic dancer" and stepped into that presence for that moment of her performance.

The men look at her possessively because they have come there to buy women for sex. They look at her too in a manner signaling that they can have her and that they could do the honor and choose her to serve them. She looks past them, she doesn't look at them, but ignores them. She has already seen all of them too many times. The men no longer strike her. She has dealt with this kind enough not to let them get to her. Her embodied position, which is the performance of the erotic show, can be seen as adjustment and adaptation to the governmentality of the globalized world economy. She not only adjusts to power in a way that she incorporates the position of an erotic and ethnic other woman

that is the only moneymaking position available to her in Finland, but she does this so that she can brush off the idiocies of the Finnish men, their possessive looks and the harassment she is about to encounter when she comes off the stage. She materializes in person only during the moment when after her performance she goes around the bar for tips; even then, her enactment in the bar is disciplined by the role of the erotic dancer.

But all the men did not cease from doing their thing, picking and choosing among the "Eastern girls." In small rooms the bargaining and flirting goes on. And so it does at the very back of the bar, where booths are chained, looking like jail cells. In one, there is a chair resembling an electric chair; some of the bar stools are toilet seats. Here at the back, the Russian woman who started her work in the bar earlier, is taking a look at whom to approach next. She decides on a man who is sitting in one of the booths by himself. He is in his late forties, obviously Finnish and obviously very drunk. He is sitting there staring into his almost empty drink. A couple of Russian women have tried to negotiate with him, but unsuccessfully. He was too drunk even to notice them, or that's how he seemed. But this Russian woman is more persuasive and sees an opportunity in him. She goes and sits in front of him.

I don't know what she says or how she says it because her English and Finnish are otherwise non-existent, so she uses her eyes and her hands to convince him. Then it happens; she gets his interest. He looks up at her. He seems to have woken up from a long sleep. He is alert and interested in her. She takes out her notepad and writes numbers on the paper. He nods, or shakes his head, and she continues. They arrive at an agreement and she smiles confirmingly almost like a car salesman, smiling in a way that says, "It is expensive but I assure you, you made a very good choice."

He smiles back at her and she takes the paper on which the deal is written and tears it into bits and pieces. She puts the pieces in his empty highball glass. What has he had, gin and tonic, rum and coke? The pieces of paper fill the glass that has been emptied of the beverage that filled it before; the glass is now filled with numbers and symbols of money and the agreement. The glass is now filled with symbols for time, service and costs. His smile is almost sad, he looks like an addict who can't help but follow his addiction, always thinking of fighting it sometime in the future. He comes here partly because it has become a way of life for him, but also because he can't help it, he can't not come here. He comes here because it is possible and here he can find women coming to talk to him. She leads him too by the hand outside from the bar and he passively follows. She smiles again, happy and looking as though she has just won a prize.

The same client that she had taken from the bar before enters this one. Is this a way of life for him too?

In the back of the bar, the soliciting of the clients goes on. There are also two blondes with sleek gelled haircuts talking with a Finnish man in his thirties. He is having a party; he is surely having a good time; while the black woman danced, he was sort of dancing too, joining the fun and doing his own routine. But he certainly didn't take his clothes off. He keeps drinking and laughing,

talking loudly. The women start flirting with him. He brags, boasts about his money, telling how much he owns and how much he makes and says seriously, looking at these women straight in the eyes, "I have a house with ten rooms." The women reply touching and caressing, happy that this man seems like a good trick; "How great, can't we go to your house then?" He avoids answering and continues his monologue about his earnings and property. The women are keen on asking "Can't we go to your house?" So far things are going well. He wants the women there with him and tries not to give a straight answer, but then he has to spill it out.

"No, we can't go to my house."

"Well, why not?"

"Because my wife and children are there

"Oh, well then, that's too bad."

He pauses for a moment.

"...Anyway, I had a house..."

The women leave him immediately and he doesn't look at them as they leave. He just keeps to himself and continues drinking. Anyway, he doesn't have to stay alone for a long time; there will be more women trying to get him to go with them

...for a coffee in his house...

...until he is too drunk to stand up.

### **Conclusions: the "Eastern girl" as the embodiment of shadow globalization**

Through these narratives, I have wanted to give a picture of what belonging to the domain of subjectivity and the zone of the abject entail corporeally for the men and women interacting in the spaces of the sex bars and private closed apartments. My argument here has been that the "Eastern girl" embodies shadow globalization. In the interaction with the clients in the bar, she performs her position as the exotic other woman. Still, it is a matter of performativity.<sup>47</sup> This position is the only one available for her and which enables her to cross the border and "have a job."

Yet, in each case the position of the abject, or the homeless in the domain of subjects, is enacted, reiterated, redone individually. In this sense, her position is not only about subjection as subordination, but subjectivation in the position of the abject. It gives her agency, albeit a controlled and constrained kind. This position of the "Eastern girl" is however first and foremost the product of Western imagination. Her position is imagined and created in the sex industry that is oriented for the most part toward Western heterosexual men. Her physical

body that embodies and enacts the imagined exotic other then becomes a surface on which he can gaze at his own subjectivity and enact the forms of agency that his subjectivity in the “global village” enables him to have. He can penetrate her body in ways agreed, depending on time and cost.<sup>48</sup> For him, her body and presence as the exotic other is the means by which he can enact his existence in the hedonistic consumer culture. Or, he can have her as a body that listens to his problems. Yet, this consumption takes place on the borderline between the domain of the subjects and shadow globalization and, in this way, the man as a client can emphasize his freedom to step in and out of these domains which the other, the woman, cannot. In this sense, her body serves concretely as the surface on which his subjectivity is formed. Her position as the exotic other, imagined in the sex business, is not only useful but a necessary condition for the subject.

It is also in this way that she comes to embody the shadow landscapes that are the sexscapes of the ethnoscape, technoscape, financescape, mediascape and ideoscape. The “Eastern girls” in Finland form a shadow diaspora, a shadow neighborliness that takes place in the secret apartments in which these women engage in sex work. Or similarly, in the spaces of the sex bars in which she embodies her position as the exotic other only during the night and passes unseen during the day. The shadow technoscapes are drawn on her body by the efficiency and profitability of her work enabled by the use of new technologies as in the case of the computer software programs and phone operators used by Estonian and Russian organized crime. The Internet assumes an important role in the sex trade as the network of information on prostitution and also as a space in which the exotic and erotic “Eastern girl” is imagined and marketed. The use of her body also enables immense profits for organized crime that are similar to drug trafficking but involving less risk. The profits from her work in Helsinki and the rest of Finland form a concrete shadow financescape as large amounts of cash are smuggled in freight traffic out of the country on a daily basis. Last, she incorporates the shadow ideoscape as she describes her work through libertarian discourse as her individual business and names herself a businesswoman.

In this sense she can be seen as embodying the governmentality of the globalized world economy through the shadows as she trades in something that is not recognized as legitimate market activity. She is there to incorporate the market logic as she strives to gain maximum benefit in minimum time from the use of her body. Nevertheless, her position cannot be simplified into the utilitarian model, but it represents forms of self-discipline and subjection to the dominating discourses of the market. However, it is not competition nor the neoliberalist state that guides her to the convenient ends, but the local procurers and middlemen and the leaders of the organized crime that do it. These men are the ones who “protect” her from the Finnish authorities and enable her to do her business quietly and efficiently and who provide her with the papers, apartments and phones that she needs. In the next chapter, I am going to continue this discussion of the “Eastern girl” as a position embodied by the “regular woman” in the context of the sex trade and trafficking in women in Northern Finland.

## 5 Sounds of silence in Lapland

### Narratives of trafficking in women across Finnish–Russian and Norwegian borders

In this chapter, I am going to describe and analyze “trafficking in women” and foreign prostitution in the North of Finland. I refer overtly to trafficking in women in this chapter because foreign prostitution in Lapland is organized and operated in such a way that it fulfils the characteristics of trafficking in women. Women are transported in Russian minibuses to brothels or private homes in predetermined destinations. This is in comparison to the organized prostitution in Helsinki, where women may independently solicit their customers in sex bars and the pimps are not as evident to the public. The chapter is divided into two sections, each of which refers to the goings-on in one of two towns. The first narrative takes place in the region of Ivalo, which is a cross point in Lapland, where the road from Murmansk intersects the road to the north toward Utsjoki and Norway and to the south toward Rovaniemi and Keminmaa. For this reason, Ivalo is a town through which the Russian minibuses in which women are trafficked for purposes of prostitution must pass. In this first section, I am going to discuss the northern foreign prostitution scene in the context of global flows. The second section is written as a “fictional” narrative, in which I will be writing about one Finnish-Saami man and a Russian woman planning a marriage in Utsjoki. In this narrative, the focus is on a concrete example of sex-specific subjectivities that are the result of globalization, that is to say, the kinds of sex-specific positions of agency that globalization provides and the kinds of sex-specific necessities it entails. In the first section, also my own position of agency and subjectivity is included in the text. The second is written in a fictional form, in order to disguise at least to the larger public the identities of the people involved, even if locally these persons could still be identified. In the second narrative, I also include the responses of the local community in Utsjoki in northern Finland and Tana on the Norwegian side. This is done in order to show what kind of agencies are formed when a shadow ethnoscape collides with the local inhabitants.

In this and the last chapter I break even more away from the logico-scientific narrative and move toward narratives that bring the reader closer to these odd global conjunctures in which globalization is embodied and enacted through gendered and ethnicized subjects and objects. These narratives are informed by the theoretical discussion presented in the previous chapters. I urge the reader to

keep in mind how the landscapes/sexscapes examined in the previous discussion shape the realities and present sex-specific means of adjustment and adaptation to globalization operating as a form of bio-power.

### **Global conjuncture at a parking lot: a narrative of illegal traffic at the crossroads in Ivalo<sup>1</sup>**

We arrive at the last minute at the rear of the parking lot where things are supposed to go down. There is still one minibus there. I suspect and this is what the taxi driver has told us that there are three or four of them altogether per weekend. They don't stay long here in Ivalo, only for a few hours, since they still want to reach the final destinations for the weekend by midnight. Three out of four busses would head up north across the border to the Norwegian side and one head down south to Rovaniemi, to the Kemijoki region. This is what I was told by the Border Guard Authority at Rajajoosseppi in Ivalo.<sup>2</sup>

It is 8:30 on Thursday, November 23. There is hardly any snow. The winter and snow are late this year, but it is surprisingly cold and windy. It is the time of year when there is sunlight only for a couple of hours at noon, that is if it is not cloudy. I don't know about my assistant, but I am freezing.

The lights are on in the minibus and two women step out. One is over forty, the other closer to twenty. They don't pay any attention to us but head straight inside the kitschy northern style hotel known for its good food. Inside it is warm and loud. There are already lots of people there for partying. I guess, in Ivalo, this would be the place to go. The crowd is quite young, people are drinking and tonight is karaoke night. The women go to the bar and change 100 FIM bills to 20s, both of them. I wonder what they need this change for. Is the price for one trick 80 FIM, or what else is it for?<sup>3</sup> They hardly speak any English and the barman acts almost as if he can't, or doesn't want to understand these women. I guess he could be reluctant about changing the money. He is young, in his early twenties, with trendy clothes and trendy hairstyle, bleached and spiked. It is the older woman who speaks and conducts this event, while the younger one stands there silent, looking yet avoiding eye contact with anyone. I guess the fuss is because they don't want to buy anything and their intention is just get change. Another reason could be that a few years ago, the Russian women had stayed in this hotel conducting their business from here. But this hotel soon ended it and Russian women like these were not allowed to enter or stay there. They still are not invited to the party. They can step in and soon, very swiftly, they must step out before they are thrown out. They do not use the ladies room, but go together into the bathroom for the disabled. I can understand this, I would not want to stay there standing alone, feeling awkward and being stared at for being a Russian woman.

Everyone knows why they are traveling at this time, but nobody seemingly pays any attention to these women. They, the locals, are probably used to it by now. I am surprised at the ignorance of this specific moment. The party goes on without even noticing that inside have stepped two women of a group, whose

passports and papers are in the hands of the driver, who are going to engage in sexual-economic relations in places far-off, and neither luxurious or necessarily even clean, from where they will be picked up on Sunday and carried back. The locals seem to have become used to trafficked women passing by. Or, maybe it is because the general perception is that the clients are only lonely old men, who drink a lot, making this whole thing a matter for someone else. And, maybe it seems to them that these men, because they are lonely and alone have the right to have women trafficked to their needs. Or, maybe they think that these lonely men and the Russian women deserve each other, that their meeting, albeit a commercial one, can be like a love plot for the unfortunate. I am surprised at the calm here concerning this matter. Is it normal to have trafficked women resting here for few hours on Thursdays? Does their ethnicity normalize the issue?

Trafficking operates in this region in the way that the women are in all probability brought into private homes of regular customers, or they might be going to camping areas, which have been operating on the Norwegian side.<sup>4</sup> As such, if these women don't stay at this hotel selling sexual services, prostitution does not really disturb the public. They can come inside but not *disturb*. I guess what happens in private homes on a small scale is not unsettling for the public. The women can be in the public only for the moment of passing through.

Any kind of professionalism that is associated with prostitutes is lacking here. I can't possibly imagine these two women advocating for prostitute's rights. It doesn't look like this is their career. It is something they do for now, for the time being, for the money. They do this because this is the one thing that is available for them and because there are Finnish, Norwegian and Saami men, who are interested in buying sexual services and the booze they bring along. The relationship between the clients and trafficked women has settled and been organized, although the incoming women change.

### **“Eastern girl,” regular women, or red meat? Naming the position of the Russian women in the North**

These women at this specific moment can be seen as appropriating the position of an “Eastern girl.” It is in this case an embodied position of the abject, produced through processes of globalization, the opening of borders and economic transition. Before the 1980s, sex tourism to Murmansk flourished; then it was men who traveled east to buy sexual services.<sup>5</sup> Since the opening of the border in early 1990s, the women themselves could leave and seek opportunities in the West. This embodied position of the exotic and ethnic feminine other is enacted through and between the boundaries of the global village and its shadow version, the sexscapes of globalization. “Eastern girls,” as they are called in the south of Finland or simply Russian women, as they are called here in the North, refer to this sex-specific and ethnicized position of the abject. It is as if selling sexual services would be natural for her due to her gender and ethnicity and it is assumed that she understands the value of the dollar. She is naturally exchangeable for money. *She is subordinate to men and truly feminine.*

Yet, I must say that most “Eastern girls” that I have seen seem like regular women. What does this regularity of a woman mean? Is a regular woman a mother, sister, or daughter, implying that a professional prostitute is different to a regular woman? Does it mean that a prostitute cannot be a woman? In this case, the professional prostitute would be characterized as a phallic, degendered woman.

The “Eastern girls” in the North are not professional prostitutes for the most part, although there are those who serve the elite clientele and who play also a significant role in the mafia organization (Vertinskaya 2000). However, for a Russian woman, the appropriation of an eroticized “Eastern girl” position may be the only available means by which she can survive. The women in Murmansk are more and more the only wage earners in the family. The traditional jobs that women have, such as jobs in education, health and the service sector, are low-paid. If they work in the private sector in production, often the jobs they have are such that the work can be done in a few days and they don’t get paid for the rest of the month; the wages even for the work done may be retained by the employer (*ibid.*). Also the majority of the unemployed are women.<sup>6</sup>

The “Eastern girl” can then also be seen as a form of performativity in the manner that Judith Butler writes about the performativity of gender. This subject position is like an assignment; it is constrained and one has to carry it through; yet, it is not fully determined or fixed. The position of the abject, the erotic other woman, is a site, which she can appropriate, but it is also a necessary condition. She must appropriate and enact that position, for there is no other position available for her. Therefore, it is not only a site, or a place, but a necessity. She does not have any other position of agency that she could enact in northern Finland except that of a Russian woman. The “Eastern girl” is a nodal point in the matrix of globalized subject positions. The site of the “Eastern girl” is available if one is both a woman and from the East.

But what kind of assignment does the Russian woman as the ethnic other perform? For the Russian woman, the appropriation of the position of the abject, the exotic other and the embodiment of femininity and sexuality, so as to fit the stereotypical sexual object in the heterosexual matrix, is a paradoxical position of a constrained choice. It is a position that materializes through her body and thus she comes to embody globalization, for the opportunity of sex work abroad has only become a possibility for her after the globalization of economic and cultural processes.

The “Eastern girl” is not in the position of the professional prostitute or sex worker, which also could be appropriated by a person defined as a western woman. Instead, a Russian woman is a *regular woman*, for the position of a subordinate, sexual and “feminine” woman is regarded and represented in the West as *regular* for women who are Russian or East-European.

Here in northern Finland, I have heard these women named just as Russian women, or Russian whores, brides, even red meat,<sup>7</sup> but not as prostitutes. *As if sexual labor would be natural, a biological fact if one is situated as Russian and as a woman.*

So, these women are not called prostitutes, although their work can be characterized as the work of a prostitute, namely, selling sex, engaging in commercial sexual relations and providing sexual services for money. There is talk of prostitution, but not of prostitutes. This could be seen as implying that women are seen as being in prostitution, but prostitution is not what they do. This also implies that they are not *doing* sex work but rather something else. *They are Russian women and not prostitutes, as prostitutes are not women.* Then, should the traffickers and the clients be considered as those who are actually doing prostitution?

Yet, nobody here has called them trafficked women either, at least to my knowledge, although the manner and means by which they move (are moved) here is a textbook example of trafficking. They are trafficked literally, for they come in minibuses which fit eight women and the driver, where the driver usually is a Russian man, who withholds the women's passports and papers in his breast pocket and delivers the women to the destinations for the weekend.<sup>8</sup> I guess these women could also be called temporary girlfriends or wives; they do housework chores as well.<sup>9</sup> So they also cook and clean for the men.<sup>10</sup>

When Sunday comes, at the Finnish–Russian border there are usually some Finnish men and Russian women hugging and kissing as the women must return to Murmansk. Could these men be then also called *temporary boyfriends* instead of clients? What is the male client's role to the woman? Could he be a boyfriend to her? What if he is deceived by the woman who he perceives as his girlfriend? She may use him to her advantage as a gateway to the West and take advantage of his earnings. Her position as the abject is not simply about subordination; she may well have a few tricks up her sleeve. Could she think of him as her companion, or is he only a means to an end? Is the relationship pragmatic or romantic for her and would these two aspects be mutually exclusive? I have heard stories of affectionate relationships and stories of how the Finnish men help the women by bringing them and their children food and clothing, although I have also heard stories of deception of the local men in Lapland, who have thus lost in love.<sup>11</sup>

The incoming Russian women have also placed a strain on local marriages. This seems to happen now across the eastern border. Some Finnish men leave their wives of the same ethnicity and marry a Russian woman. Yet, of course, not all relationships between Finnish men and Russian women end like this. The man could be keeping also two families, one in Russia and the other in Finland.<sup>12</sup> Maybe some of these women may also be double-crossing! In the relationships these women have with Finnish, Norwegian, or Saami men, there are the variations between genuine relationships, or genuine commercial relations and different levels of deceit by the man or the woman. Sometimes it happens that, after a while, when a Russian woman gains her citizenship, she will bring her original husband along, or simply just leave.<sup>13</sup> She might also be forced to return to Russia if the “mediator” of the relationships so demands.<sup>14</sup> These things have been known to happen.

### **Trafficking of Russian women through Ivalo for the purposes of prostitution**

So, this is basically what happens here in Ivalo. The women from the Murmansk region are trafficked to Finland, or across Finland to Norway, on Thursdays through Ivalo and picked up on Sundays and brought back. Sometimes they are brought back to the border in private cars.<sup>15</sup> This is the traffic through Ivalo at its simplest.

At the Border Guard in Ivalo, I am told that there are about 60–70 women from Murmansk passing through Rajajooseppi border every Thursday.<sup>16</sup> Not all the women are from Murmansk. There can be women coming from as far as Moldova or Ukraine to prostitute in northern Norway and Finland.<sup>17</sup> One explanation is that it is easier to obtain a visa from Murmansk to Norway.<sup>18</sup> The police in Ivalo and the Border Guard Authority insist that the majority of the cars are just passing to Norway and that they don't stay here. Somehow, I am not totally convinced. If there were so many men eager to buy the women's services before<sup>19</sup> (when there were 200 women and they stayed in Ivalo), why would they (all) cease now? Whatever is going on now in Lapland does not happen out in the open, the way it used to be before.<sup>20</sup>

The Ivalo police talk about the situation in Ivalo.<sup>21</sup> Ivalo is at a crossroads, the road from Murmansk comes through the center of Ivalo to the road that leads up to Utsjoki and down to Rovaniemi. The buses that head north may cross the Norwegian border at Karigasniemi, Näätämö, or Nuorgam. If they stay in Finland it would be at Kaamanen or Inari, or at least these women and the buses have been seen there. Or, then they go down south to Rovaniemi and Keminmaa.<sup>22</sup> In this region the majority of clients come from Sweden.<sup>23</sup>

From Kaamanen, the police has expelled a few Russian women, that is when the new law came into force that allows the deportation of non-EU citizens if they are suspected of selling sexual services. *We deported about five of them, just because the new law came into force.* I ask about the effects of the law. They say that the law works for what it was intended for. Yet, they say also that in the place of one deported woman there is always another. *The seats on the buses are never empty.* Wouldn't then the new law that stipulates deportation indeed increase the actual number of different women being trafficked and, in turn, decrease the capabilities of one woman in making earnings? However, the police work in collaboration with the Norwegian police; they share information on the traffickers' cars. They do keep an eye on the trafficking.

The police officers say that they are sympathetic to the Russian women who pass through here. They acknowledge the misery that these women live in, their poverty and unemployment. They acknowledge that the women are controlled by the pimps and traffickers and are not really able to earn that much here. And that is not all; some of the women seem to have been forced into prostitution. In any case, there is the control of the pimp and the relative advantage of the client over the women. Then, the kind of rationalization often used about the prostitutes and clients that goes, "If two consenting adults make an agreement, why

should anyone interfere?" is not applicable in the northern context.<sup>24</sup> In the North, the women are controlled physically by the pimps in the closed doors of the bus, the houses of clients or the camping grounds and also by the vast distances in the North between these private spheres and the public, or by the distance to their home in Murmansk. However, men have also been controlled by the traffickers and they have been forced to participate.<sup>25</sup>

All of the sex traffic passing through the northern borders nowadays is organized. The prostitution is organized and is controlled by organized crime syndicates from Murmansk, who have taken over the prostitution and trafficking in Lapland (Leskinen 2002: 14).<sup>26</sup> I am informed that there are no *amateurs* anymore trying to take a piece of the action.<sup>27</sup> Most probably, they would get busted for bringing too much booze, or not having enough cash; that is the other reason. The traffickers that now cross the border have everything in order, passport, visa, cash, and not too much alcohol. There is nothing that the Border Guard Authority can do to stop them from crossing.

The police say they don't want to interfere with prostitution that goes on in private homes and which doesn't disturb people and the public. It is also difficult to track the women and find the evidence which points to organized prostitution, even if they do travel in these minibuses. The women on the bus may have applied for their visa in a number of cities such as Moscow, St. Petersburg, Petroskoi and not only in Murmansk. For this reason, it is difficult to point out that there are women traveling together to the same locations in the North with the intent of selling sexual services.<sup>28</sup> They apply most probably for single tourist visas. However, as Finland (and Norway) are part of the Schengen agreement, the women may apply for a multiple visa for six months, allowing them to stay in Finland for 90 days, or one year visas that would add up 180 days. In this case the trips to Finland must have other grounds than tourism, for the visa to be granted. At this point also, false documents are used. If the reason for the travel in Finland is not valid, the visa is denied; suspicion of selling sexual services is one such cause. Also the police could take measures against the drivers, for, if one charges money for the travel s/he would need a license in Finland, which the Russian traffickers obviously do not have. The Finnish consulate in Murmansk is aware of the problem, but it is hard to discern the women who apply for visas in order to come to Finland to sell sexual services from those of the women who are coming genuinely as tourists. This is because the women coming to prostitute look like regular middle-aged women.<sup>29</sup>

### **Global conjuncture: the parking lot again**

But let's go back to the parking lot, into the darkness and the quiet and the cold. The Russian minibus is not parked in front of the hotel but further down. If the car would not have lights on it, could almost pass unseen. The two women come out of the hotel and go inside the car and the lights are turned off. I think there goes my chance; I should have said something, I should have made contact with them. I take two steps toward the car, or think about taking two steps. I can see

the driver in front staring at me, without blinking. I say to my assistant, let's think of something to say, let's go toward the car. He says, "*I am not going, look at the guy in front. I don't think we should mess with him.*" I believe him; he is from Ukraine.<sup>30</sup> He has told me stories about the mob. And even though my eager researcher mind had set out on making contact with these Russian women, I notice how my body freezes and I am unable to move. I think about writing a paper *When the researcher gets scared*. That's how it was at that moment. I was so scared of the women and the driver that I froze and was not capable of doing what I had set out to do. It was as if there were an invisible wall that I could not pass through. I don't know what I was so scared of. Probably, nothing would have happened. They would perhaps just have told us off and to mind our own business. After this incident, I would hear more horror stories, but at that moment I had never had a bad experience. I felt I was on foreign ground; this was more their territory than mine.

I was scared of the women, since I did not want to look stupid in front of them and when it came to the driver, a surge of movie images about the mafia went through my head, stereotypical I admit. But his clothes and position seemed stereotypical to me at that point.

What could I have said? Hi there, I am a researcher, tell me about your experience of prostitution in Lapland? How does it work for you? Or, I would like to buy a bottle of vodka, please? This would have hardly been convincing. I guess it could have been easier if the girls would have been there hanging around, working the street, so to speak. Maybe then I could have had the guts to approach them. I have, in nightclubs in Helsinki and erotic clubs in Tampere. I am supposed to know these things. But this was not a good time. The women *are* behind the closed doors of the minibus and as I turn toward them, they turn off the lights. I cannot cross this boundary. I find myself hoping that I would just be inside having a nice glass of wine. Inside, where it is safe and warm.

Later on, I learn that some of these drivers are just *regular men*, just drivers. I make an image in my mind of a family man, making ends meet in poverty stricken Murmansk.<sup>31</sup>

In this parking lot, the domain of subjects, those inside the hotel and the zone of the object, in the shadow of the parking lot, come into contact. There is the boundary that the women cannot cross; they can go in the hotel, but they cannot stay. Even if they would meet clients here in Ivalo, these women would not be choosing the place in which to conduct their commercial relations, but they would be picked up from the bus in the parking lot, taken to the client's place and dropped back by a (local) middleman.

What sense is it to talk of globalization taking place in the parking lot? Ivalo is not a center, it is not a global village prototype, a global city. It is a tourist destination, however. There is an airport and the famous ski resort only 30 km away at Saariselkä. Nonetheless, the locals spending their evening at the bar in this hotel, singing karaoke, can be seen as those who are globalized. They are not cosmopolitans or hybrid citizens, the first things that comes to mind when thinking of the stereotypical position of a subject of the global neighborhood.

However, it is globalization that makes this event, this moment in the parking lot, possible. This parking lot is a concrete global conjuncture that creates new forms of subjectivity and agency according to ethnicity and gender divides. Globalization of the world economy and the breakdown of the Soviet Union are there behind the reasons that led the women here tonight as well as the opening of the border and new possibilities of movement (albeit, in the shadow). The negative effects of the economic development in the 1990s led the women here, now, tonight. This globalization is materialized and enacted on the skin of the Russian woman when she meets her client somewhere here in Lapland between Murmansk and Norway.

Yet, the new spaces of agency at this global conjuncture, forming at this parking lot, concern also the local people inside the hotel, who seemingly have nothing to do with the women in the bus outside. The locals can on this particular night and at this particular moment pay no attention to the passing Russian cars. This exemplifies the differences between the subject positions between them and the women outside, or the male driver. Notice the gendered subjectivities here. The women on the bus that are driven across this landscape are always women, led by the driver who is always a man. They are always Russian in ethnic origin. The locals, however, who are inside the hotel and ignoring this event, represent both genders and possibly a range of ethnicities. They can be Finnish and Saami and also tourists from the south, Norway or further abroad. Obviously, these people have a different kind of range of options to choose from than the Russian women from Murmansk. The locals and the tourists do have their own passports and papers. None of the people here would have to sell sexual services, neither is their ethnicity represented and understood as inherently erotic and exploitable. Yet, the flow of Russian women through here cannot occur without leaving a mark. At least, the locals can differentiate themselves from the abject that (have to) pass by. They can be annoyed or afraid of them, or they can joke about them. Yet, they cannot pretend that they do not know. They are in a position in which they can ignore the women. They do not have to care.

The Russian women have to remain in the shadow when the locals pass by the minibus to go inside the hotel for karaoke and a beer. Then there is the researcher, me, who does not know where to go, shivering in the cold, simply looking. This is an odd conjuncture of embodied subjectivities.

### **Flows of information and misinformation**

A lot had happened before we got to the parking lot on time. This is because of the different flows of information and misinformation I had been faced with that had directed me to be hanging around desperately in circles with my assistant.<sup>32</sup> Although it is common knowledge that the trafficking of Russian women for purposes of prostitution goes on here and everyone knows that they pass through here (on Thursdays), I could not get one single story of how things happen here now in November 2000. Everyone recognizes (has to) the Russian minibuses

passing. They cannot be missed, for the town is so small and the buses have been coming since the early nineties. Then it was much more open. It was not a shadow activity literally in the way it is now. Instead, there would be a couple of larger buses coming to the bus station and women there trying to sell anything possible, from artifacts, souvenirs, wooden spoons, vodka and champagne and also sex, for 50 FIM (€8.50). *Cunt 50 mk*<sup>33</sup> written on the palm of their hands, another *corporeality* of globalization. Then, in the early days the women would approach the men openly, on the sidewalks, in a local bar, or at the bus station.<sup>34</sup>

Things have settled down since then, I am told by the police.<sup>35</sup> Obviously, things have settled down. But wouldn't it also mean that things have become more organized. There are no wild<sup>36</sup> Russian women walking around Ivalo offering sexual services to anyone passing by. Instead it is the driver and the organizers who are calling the shots. I guess the measures against the wild market place of booze, sex and wooden spoons have had some desired effects but also some unintended consequences too, another constraint and boundary enforced around the zone of abjects. As Lieutenant Colonel Uljas Turunen said, there are no *amateurs* crossing the borders for this reason anymore.<sup>37</sup>

The heydays of the early nineties are over. Now, Ivalo is only a stopover, where the Russian *whorebuses*<sup>38</sup> take a break before continuing and where the "Eastern girls" can do a bit of shopping at the supermarket across the parking lot with the little money they have earned.

Anyhow, when I wanted to get information about when and where exactly things happened in Ivalo that night, on Thursday the 23rd of November, I was conveniently told different stories, different times and different meeting points. The stories differed, depending on whether they were told by a local journalist or a taxi driver, or whether I heard it from anti-prostitution oriented women from Utsjoki, another town further up north and adjacent to the Norwegian border.<sup>39</sup> Some of the stories about locations and timetable were genuinely old information of how matters had been for sometime before, such as names of motels from which women had been working, before they were denied entrance as their business was revealed by the motel owners.

But then, there was direct misinformation too. This kind of story would start off with, "There's nothing here anymore, absolutely nothing, but if there is, it is at 2 p.m. in the afternoon when the bus comes from Murmansk." There is a bus coming from Murmansk; true, but this is a normal bus. The traffickers' buses don't go to the bus station nor do they follow bus schedules printed on shiny paper, obviously. I became frustrated when, on the one hand I am told that there is foreign prostitution in Ivalo and, on the other that there is none. The different stories about how and where things had happened were in conflict with each other but also overlapped so much that I didn't know what to believe. Then, at the last minute, we decided to go to Saariselkä, the ski resort where things were also supposedly happening. I heard this from the feminist-oriented women,<sup>40</sup> whose stories in the end happen to be closer to the truth of how prostitution is operated here.

At Saariselkä, a ski resort resembling a cruise liner with all the restaurants, discos and spas, we figure that whatever happens here would go on behind

closed doors, or in cottages further away from the center and not out in the open in the restaurants. The Russians who come here for skiing and partying are of a different crowd to the ones who engage in sex traffic (that is, at least as exchangeable bodies). Moreover, one could also think that, in fact, it would be the men involved in the organized criminal networks who could circulate between domains of globalization of the subjects and of shadow. Since with the profits they make, they could easily buy a week of skiing here, would the traffickers then sometimes take a weekend off and drive here with their families instead of a busload of women for prostitution? In any case, Saariselkä is one more place in which the “Eastern girl” is not invited.

However, when I asked at the Border Guard Authority whether it seems that the traffickers had been getting richer over the years and whether they are driving better cars. Lieutenant Colonel Uljas Turunen replied, “No, the cars are not getting any better, maybe in so much as they have winter tires in winter, that much better.”<sup>41</sup> To me it appears that they just won’t invest more than what is necessary in the women’s transportation.

We decided to head back to Ivalo and refigure how we should go about finding the traffickers and the women. I simply couldn’t believe there would be no traffic this Thursday, knowing that at Saariselkä there is also a jazz festival going on. We take a taxi one last time and I start talking. At this point, we get the most accurate story. The driver tells us that the buses stopover at the parking lot of one hotel in Ivalo around 8 p.m. My watch shows it is just 8 p.m. Considering the 30 minutes drive, we will be at that hotel around 8.30 p.m. I find myself keenly hoping to be there on time (strange to hope to see trafficked women, wouldn’t it be better if there were no trafficked women at all, ever). The driver is talkative and tells us a lot about how prostitution is organized here. He says there are not many women staying in Ivalo. He says something along the lines that things are now slow. He doesn’t say that there is absolutely nothing going on. It seems that finally there is someone who doesn’t need to convince us one way or the other.

We arrive at the hotel and there is still one bus there. This is the hotel were we are staying at and to which I was told that the women come. We arrive just in time and two women come out of the bus and go inside to get changed and to use the bathroom.

Then, faced with the driver of the *whorebus*, as it is called by locals here, we get scared (silly, stupid, Western?) and go inside. From there we see that there is another car, a Finnish one that arrives. A girl comes out of this car and goes into the Russian car and the lights that were on at the moment go off again. The Russian car starts and drives away. We run outside to see if it turns north or south. This car goes up north and we wonder about its final destination. Is it really going to Norway or will it stay in Finland? The Finnish van that had brought the girl drives across the block back to the parking lot. My assistant and I decide to go for a walk since we are out anyway and the Finnish car follows us. It goes around the block comes back around and passes us time and again. It does this for a while and when it is the third or the fourth time that the car is

passing, the driver rolls down the window to get a good look at us. Later it stops and parks by the taxi that had brought us back from Saariselkä. We have been figured out.

### **Landscapes and sexscapes of globalization in Lapland**

This incident at the parking lot, the flows of information and misinformation about trafficking itself reveals how landscapes of globalization form and are formed. As I already discussed, the ethnoscapas in Appadurai's framework reflect the movement of people and new neighborliness, here in the North these ethnoscapas and sexscapes take specific forms. The people moving through here (besides local people) are concretely the tourists, on the one hand and the trafficked women and their traffickers, on the other. They drive through the same roads, yet the destinations differ slightly. Therefore, the latter can be seen forming a shadow neighborliness also here in the North, in offbeat camping grounds, in travel hostels and in the private homes of the local male clients.

The Russian women here form an ethnoscape which mainly takes place in a temporary form, as an ethnoscape for the weekend, but which has nevertheless a permanent impact on the local community. The crossing of the border is never final for the Russian women. They do not form a diaspora in Norway or Finland in a way that immigrants do. Instead, their entry into the West is temporary and it has to take place in the shadow, in the brothels and private homes. In other words, the traffickers and clients control their movements and sexual labor. Moreover, they pay the traffickers for their travels and "naturally" also give them a percentage of their earnings. She cannot exit the specific physical space in which she is constrained or leave her traffickers. And what makes it possible for her to cross *toward* the West, in which she exists in these constrained spaces, is her sexual labor, which is a source of profit for someone else.

The local people who do not engage with the prostitutes and their traffickers cannot avoid being affected by the incoming Russian whorebuses, especially in the Utsjoki region. This relation between the trafficked women, traffickers, local middlemen and local people show the many conflicts and contradictions as well as negotiation of identities that happen as a result of formed ethnoscapas.

These flows and positions in the domain of subjects or the shadows reveal different forms of constraints and concrete materiality on the sex-specific and ethnicized bodies that are the result of the shifts in global politics, the opening of borders and the economic transition in the East as well as neoliberalist and libertarianist ideoscapes in the West. These factors create the conditions for the "Eastern girl" to emerge as the site for a Russian woman to enact and which enables her entry to the West with the *help* of trafficking organizations. This site is also produced in the sex-mediascapes of globalization. Similarly, the position of the Finnish, Norwegian, or Saami male client who can buy, use and exploit the Russian women emerges as a site that the man can occupy. The role of the traffickers and Russian organized criminal networks, benefiting from the breakdown of the Soviet Union and organizing the trafficking of Russian women to

Finland, reveals the subjectivities enabled by the globalizing processes as well as the boundaries formed between the global village and the Other. In this case the criminal networks can be seen benefiting from the boundary between the domain of subjects and shadow globalization and also how this boundary can be transcended.

The mediascape and technoscape are present in the interactions of traffickers and the local and tourist clientele in the North. Here the media and technoscapes are formed through formal and informal variants. Needless to say, there are informal networks of information on the locations, dates and specific times of the “whorebus.” Over the years, these informal networks have been established by the formation of a regular clientele and organized traffic.<sup>42</sup> However, the shadow technoscape presents itself here even more concretely. As I have already mentioned, the women do not as such enjoy the benefits of speedy and comfortable travel, but are trafficked in minibuses and cars that are not the latest models. However, it is important to note that, when they are trafficked by the local people in Finnish or Norwegian cars, their traffic becomes invisible, since a local car does not draw attention in a way that a Russian car would.

The recruitment of women into prostitution in Murmansk happens also openly through ads on local TV. On television, there are advertisements of *Dating Clubs*; these dating clubs are located in Murmansk and the women working for a club serve local men in Murmansk. It can be suspected that these dating clubs also organize prostitution abroad, even as far as Israel.<sup>43</sup> I have also been told that a Norwegian man advertised his camping site by the Tenoriver on the Internet by featuring a naked Russian lady standing in water fishing, implying also the other kind of tourist attractions available in the region besides fishing.<sup>44</sup>

These examples obviously show how, through technoscapes and mediascapes, images of ethnoscaping are formed and circulated. These women, sitting on a bus that I see, could have answered an ad on TV, or they might have heard about this option through a friend or relative. They could also have been approached in a bar, for example, and told about a work opportunity. I do not know about these particular women here. I only know in general about their recruitment. This information is gained from other women from Murmansk.<sup>45</sup>

Although in Appadurai’s framework the financescape refers to the movement of megamonies and those most powerful *absent bodies* moving them, the link to the bodies in the parking lot is indirect, but concrete. This is because the movement of these megamonies and the macrolevel economic processes indeed have to do with the conditions under which women turn to the sex business as a way of coping. Instead of being in a position of absent, powerful and male bodies, these women are in the position of the powerless, material and especially sexed bodies. They could be thus figured once more as the binary opposite to the subject of globalization. As such, they are also tied to the subject as the Other that enables the maintenance of the boundary of the subject and marks the position of the excluded. These women exist in time, measured in weeks and months through which their sexual labor is regulated. For them, the globalization of

absent others becomes a *corporeality*, which materializes through the body, in time and place, in Murmansk, Ivalo and those many other destinations across northern Finland and Norway in which the bus arrives.

For the local men, the cutbacks in government subsidies and the attractiveness of involvement in trafficking and prostitution reflects also the formation of the financescape of globalization and the shadow economy. Then, what is crucial in northern Finland is the simultaneous marginalization of the North and institutionalization of the informal economy. What this implies then is that illegal traffic is beneficial for both Finnish and Norwegian middlemen and Russian traffickers. With the prostitution scheme, it is possible to also keep the region attractive to male tourists around the year, not only during the fishing season or winter. The local taxi drivers would definitely profit from organizing some of the traffic by bringing clients to women and vice versa. And as a local Saami man from Utsjoki pointed out, trafficking in women to lonely old men is hardly any kind of charity work.<sup>46</sup>

The shadow ideoscape in the northern region refers, in this case, to the changes in discourses concerning commercial sex, both in Finland and in Russia. However, here in the North, this libertarianist ideology institutionalizes in a manner different from that prevailing in the sex bars of Helsinki. The representation of sex work as a normal and sound option for women in difficult times may influence at least the clients to think that this is a relationship that is normal and beneficial for both parties. Also, the atmosphere in Murmansk has become more tolerant of prostitution than it was during Soviet times.<sup>47</sup> This tolerance refers to the libertarian discourses that have become reinforced along with liberal discourses on individual freedoms. The individual pursuit of happiness translates to the right of an individual to search for pleasure and sensation even if, or especially when, it involves the buying of sexual services. The discourse of the exchange of money as a legitimating basis for commercial sex is present here in the North as well. Generally in the Nordic context, the exchange between the Russian women and the clients is naturalized through discourses of liberalist and libertarian economics. It is definitely a matter of showing economic superiority and agency. It is a means to show a kind of subjectivity that has been challenged due to marginalization in the region. Still, it is a misconception that clients are only lonely old men. They do come from all walks of life and have families, wives and children.<sup>48</sup> Supposedly also, young men have been clients in the brothels, as a part of the process of initiation into local gangs. Going to a brothel has been a test of manhood and courage, making a sexual debut in a place like this would be proof enough.<sup>49</sup>

### **Embracing opportunities at the time when the brothels closed: the marriage deal between a young Finnish-Saami man and a former Russian prostitute in northern Finland<sup>50</sup>**

The “fictive” narrative below, constructed from interviews with a young Finnish-Saami man, in which he told me of his involvement with organized

prostitution in the region, aims to show how globalization concretizes at the local level and more specifically on sex-specific and ethnicized bodies. In the following story, I will be able to tell what happens when the two worlds collide and what kind of possibilities of agency emerge from this global conjuncture.

I guess I could start telling this story by explaining what happened last week, when the cops came over and searched his house for drugs. Or, when this guy, unfortunately, maybe arrogantly, gambled his fishing boat to the man from the south. All these events follow from previous events. These events are effects, inevitable consequences. So, let's go a few months further back in time. Let's go back to early summer, to the time before the fishing season. These events take place at the beginning of June 2001, in Utsjoki, at the northern border, across the river from Norway and closer to the eastern border than to the south of Finland.

He talks to his friends; "I am free this weekend and I have a new car. You know, to the southern border of Finland it is over 1,000 km, but to the eastern border it is only 150 km. Maybe I will go for a drive." This time he is thinking about meeting his bride to be, a Russian woman from Murmansk, ten years older than him.

150 kilometers is no distance at all in the North, it is just next door. This is a distance that a man would easily drive, if the destination would be worth it. And it has been so for some years now. Women, booze and parties at camping sites that turned into brothels for the weekend, since the early 1990s over on the Norwegian side as long as the "whorebus" arrived from Murmansk, Russia.<sup>51</sup> This was going on until November 2000.<sup>52</sup>

The camping site, near the village of Tana, was located in a "normal" neighborhood of private homes. Similarly the camping site by the Teno River was alongside a strip of houses of local people. There was no separate red-light district, no separate street or city district where the trafficking took place, where someone who wanted to find a prostitute could do so and the rest could ignore it.

These days, there is only an occasional minibus passing on Fridays by the Teno River, driving swiftly to the predetermined destinations of private homes. There seems to be peace and quiet now. Only those inside the network know when and where the bus travels.

### **The meeting of a Finnish-Saami man and a Russian woman**

He says he is a professional fisherman. He says they met at Laxness. This means that she was a prostitute at the time. Or, rather they met because she was in prostitution. He doesn't tell exactly what her position was in the business. Her ability to provide for him financially points to her being more than just a prostitute. Anyway, for simplification, I am going to call him the fisherman and her: how should we call her? Let's call her a *Russian woman*, for that is what women like her, coming from Murmansk and engaging in prostitution, are called, implying that anyone, identifiable as Russian and as woman, would be a whore. I could also call her *red meat*.<sup>53</sup> He calls her "this current one," he calls their connection "an international relationship," a factor that adds a special flavor to dating.

She promised to meet him this weekend in Utsjoki. This is how they and other “couples” like them meet, over the weekend from Friday to Sunday. Sometimes the woman would not even see the man who has invited her to Finland. She would meet other men, yet the men who organize the travel and come and pick her up remain the same.

Another opportunity that could be available for her is marriage. Many relationships have been formed at these camping sites. Even then, it is her gender that makes possible what is probably hoped to be a final escape, to cross the border once and for all.

The young fisherman and the Russian woman have been involved for nine months by now, which for him is exceptional. This is the longest time for him to be in a relationship. Before they have lasted half a year at the most. This Russian woman must be special for him, since she keeps his interest. What is her secret? Now the real test is coming; the fishing season is starting soon. This is a test that he is setting out for her. His relationships have never lasted over the summer because he is fishing every night. His previous local, Finnish girlfriends have never been able to accept that. His terms in a relationship are that he is always out and that he will always be late. That is who he is, a professional fisherman.

It is already late and finally she arrives at the place where they promised to meet. It is on the Norwegian side. They are meeting at the point where they met for the first time. That is some years ago. They have known each other for a long time. It is only last year that they became *romantically* involved, around the time when the operation of the brothels was under threat of closing. Something had to be done.

She became his fiancée.

### **The marriage contract**

He sees the Russian minibus coming from afar. He steps out of his car already in waiting for her. Anyway, it is she who enables him to have the new car, both directly and indirectly. He couldn't have made that money from taking tourists fishing. Yet, I don't think that he thinks of his car as being enabled by her. His car is what he owns. His car is his. He has it now because of who he is in terms of sex and gender.

The Russian bus stops, she steps out. They smile at each other and go inside his car. There is anticipation in the air for both of them. They both think about whether this weekend will be a good one. They both anticipate how it is going to go, albeit for different reasons.

What do they say to each other when they are by themselves in his car, driving to his home? What language do they speak to each other? They speak to each other in English, a language that neither of them knows very well.

How do they find the words? Does she tell about the drive from Murmansk? Does she tell him how her son is doing, or how she has been since their last meeting? He would not be interested in hearing about any of these things. He would rather find out whether she has been able to get a move on selling the

apartment in Murmansk that she promised to do. Would they talk of business, about trafficking drugs and booze across Norwegian and Russian borders? Are they that open to each other?

What kind of things does she keep from him, so that she can achieve her ends? What kind of things does he cease to ask, in order to keep his illusion of the naturally feminine and subordinate Russian woman that he thinks he has captured.

He holds out his hand to her and she puts an envelope of money in it. At this specific moment, he does feel superior to her. He thinks she cannot but give it to him when he asks for it. He thinks he has made a real find because he captured a woman who had the most money to give. He thinks that the Russian women give their money away if a man asks for it, and that being so, he had to find himself the woman who had the most to offer.

“They can’t hold on to it, you know. They just give it away. It is a misconception that Russian women are poor. They don’t have money because they cannot handle it. I see them with this pile of cash in their hands and if some man would ask for it, they just give it away.”<sup>54</sup>

To whom do they give the money? Do they give the money to the clients that became their friends in the circumstances of these weekend brothels? Has he probably only witnessed women giving part of their earnings to their traffickers and other middlemen, which would mean that the money they had in their hands did not really belong to them. They had earned it with their work and from the profit of booze and cigarettes they had sold, but the money really wasn’t for them to keep.

He thinks she hands out the money to him because he is a real man, because he is so charming that she cannot but do so and because he has mesmerized her. This is the impression he likes to give to his peers.

But who has captured whom? Can he be sure that it is he who caught her and not vice versa?<sup>55</sup>

She may think that he is a fool. Nevertheless, she knows how to play her part and keep him believing that he is calling the shots. And in a way he is, but probably in a different way than he perceives. Now, is the crucial moment, since summer is coming and she wants to move on with their deal; she doesn’t want anything to go wrong. And she may very well have more plans for him than he suspects. She still has her “business associates” on the Russian side and it does not look probable that she could or would want to break away from them. He might not realize that it could be the Russian woman who is taking advantage of him. She might think of other contracts that he couldn’t refuse, once he is tied into this one.

He likes to think that he is making a wonderful deal, the best possible one. That is what he was after. He is young and has a mind for risks. He knew he could do this, so he needed to think for a while. Which one of them, which one of the girls would he marry? He saw the women at the camping site as possibilities. For him, they were a selection, like loose candy in the candy store. He wanted to choose the sweetest one. And, in a twisted way, he sees himself as a

benefactor. He can explain his actions through a mindset of benevolence. It was because he felt for the women, for their economic hardship that he became involved and that he would summon his pals and other local men and take them to Laxness for sex and booze.

Finally he asks her, when they are safely in his home, about her situation in Murmansk. Will she be able to proceed with the selling of the house? She is somewhat reluctant and slow in answering. She wants to keep him hanging, but at this time she cannot make definite promises.

“Things should go as planned” she says, waiting for him to reassure his own position in the contract. That he is ready to marry her and that she can move to Finland and bring her son with her.

Instead of reassuring her, he too leaves the backdoor open and says, “You know I cannot promise you eternity. I can’t promise you that we will be together forever. I can promise you something for now. But you know how I am and you have to accept that. You know I will always be late and I’ll be fishing every night during the summer. This is not a secret, how I am. So, let’s see how things go this summer. Let’s see if we can make this work.”

And, at that moment, for a split second he wasn’t sure whether he actually did want the relationship to work, or not. It could have been just easier to revert to his old ways, be independent, spend time in a local bar, or pick up girls from different towns. Just have a blast, no responsibilities. But this Russian woman had her advantages compared to the Finnish girls. It seemed like she really respected him as a man. He could get the kind of admiration and compliance from her that he could not get from Finnish girls, who couldn’t accept him for who he was and who always complained when he was late. Finnish girls were so demanding, they really didn’t understand the nature of things. And the nature of things, for him, was that the man is always superior.

And now this Russian woman seemed different. She was ready to do what he said, it seemed like she was the one woman who did understand the natural order between a man and a woman and truly think the same way. She came from a different culture to him and he found it intriguing. After all, she was *a Russian woman*.

And not just any Russian woman, but the hottest of them all. His friends would both congratulate and envy him for being able to tame her. This was proof of his true manhood, for she was known for being able to serve the most men in the shortest time. Now, he could have her all to himself. And, among his peers, this proves his capabilities, as if sexual labor had been about her insatiable needs and desire for multiple partners.

How easily are his friends convinced? It didn’t cross their mind that she is having sex with them because that is her job now, for the time being, because there are no alternatives? She needed to make as much money as possible in the time available to her, the period of one weekend. In the end, it means she has to work one weekend to make money for the whole month.

She has to keep her mind cool, she has to make sure that he keeps his end of the deal. It is crucial for her and she has her reasons. And the reason is not that he is such a magnificent guy.

What he has going for him is his Finnish citizenship. This is his uttermost asset. This is the key he has: his citizenship and his gender. This combination is what makes him the pathway for her escape. She has to convince him that he will be rewarded for his agreement to marry her.

To make it clear, to bind him to the deal one more time, she says, “Just think, what you are getting out of this. I will pay you 10,000 US dollars for every year we are together and once I have sold the apartment in Murmansk, we can start building a new home right here, for you, me and my son. It sure will be better than this place, you’ll see.”

His silence is making her nervous; this was supposed to be a done deal. Why is he being so difficult about it? She has already given part of the money that’s how he got his new car and they have done business together for a long time. They have had an agreement about this.

He knows he has the power in this situation and this is how he likes it. He can keep her wanting and begging. He knows the reason why the marriage contract is so important for her and why he can ask for so much money. And then it dawns on him: It is not because he is such a great stud or a real man that she is eager to marry him, but because she is doing it for her son. She wants to save her son from violence. She wants to save her son from military service. He understands the real threat that her son is facing, coming from Murmansk. It is easier there for guys from St. Petersburg and Moscow. But for a young man from the North or another periphery in Russian terms, the military can be deadly. The Russian woman is ready to do everything in her powers to save her son from such a fate. He is taking it to the extreme to benefit from it financially.

He says, “Let’s see how things go over the summer. I can’t promise you eternity, I promise you something, just for now.”

### **Local responses in Utsjoki to the objects emerging through the shadow ethnoscape**

If a Russian woman marries and comes to live in Lapland, ridding herself of the inscriptions of the sexscapes in front of the local community, it is extremely difficult, if not impossible. For her prospective husband, it is also a question of being tied to the sexscapes and being speculated about where and how they met, which one of the brothels it was and in which bus she travelled.

The responses of the local community to prostitutes and traffickers is another embodied position, which also forms as a space for agency in a global conjuncture. I do not want to give a simplified picture of Russian women being simply oppressed by both Russian and Finnish, Norwegian, or Saami men or her being resented by local women. This is not the case. The local people struggle against male violence against women and for women’s human rights.<sup>56</sup> And certainly there are genuine marriages, in which there is intention between both the parties to make it work and there are Russian women who have been accepted and become part of local Norwegian and Saami communities. Notwithstanding all this, there are stories about the possibility that marrying a Norwegian, Saami, or

Finnish man is a gateway to the West.<sup>57</sup> Then, obviously the position of the Russian woman is not directly a position of a victim as already mentioned.

The Russian woman coming to Norway or Finland still retains her pride. What we have learned about her is this: She doesn't trust the local authorities nor does she give interviews. She distrusts the local people and keeps to herself. In the village of Tana, the local doctor reserved a special time for the women, for health check-ups.<sup>58</sup> They never showed up and when she approached the women, they were reserved about their situation. The women don't talk about their life and they don't complain about their situation. They are silent when people other than clients approach them, that is, people like me.

Their silence is also a form of resistance to the local communities and to the Finnish and Norwegian public more generally. They retain their dignity and may even seem uppity toward the Finns and Norwegians. They take hold of the space they have. Then, what is seen to the outside is what they perform in the position of a Russian woman. They may even make a parody of their abjection to ethnic and social others and flaunt their sexualized and ethnicized bodies. In this sense, the women in the embodied position of the Russian whore also contribute to the formation of Russian woman as an erotic and sexual ethnic other.

This brings us to the conjunction with the local resistance movement to prostitution at the camping site near Tana. A local organization, Duovvi, organized a demonstration in front of the camping site. There were speeches by Finnish and Norwegian authorities, local people, both old and young, men and women and members of feminist groups. The demonstration took place in winter, in a slight drizzle of snow, across the street from the camping site.<sup>59</sup> It was already dark and quite cold. The demonstrators wore piles of winter clothes and warm hats. The speakers would take the megaphone in turns and there were also anti-prostitution banners and exclamations.<sup>60</sup> The demonstration, which was part of the organized international resistance against prostitution in the region, represents also global flows of information and people and what kind of subjectivities form on the side of the domain of subjects.

During the demonstration, as long as there were men who spoke and there were young speakers, both male and female, the Russian women within the brothel would withdraw from the windows from which they watched the demonstration done against prostitution. But, when middle-aged women came to the fore and took the megaphone, the women would return to the windows, take off their bras and dance with vodka bottles in their hands.<sup>61</sup> Thus they not only showed what they had to offer, but emphasized their sexuality and ethnicity (through the vodka bottle) to the women from local communities. Then, the dance, stripping and holding of the bottle can be seen as a form of exaggeration of the position of the Russian prostitute as the exotic other, which is formed through differentiation (and becomes possible through the distinction and opposition) from the frigid, non-sexual, local Finnish, Saami, or Norwegian women.

This event was filmed and shown on Finnish national TV, which shows also how in mediascapes the images of ethnoscapas and their shadow variants are

formed.<sup>62</sup> In this and other TV shows, such as the evening news, concerning foreign prostitution, images depicting Russian women walking the streets wearing fur coats and high heels reinforce the stereotypical image. In the northern case, this stereotypical image of the exotic other, naturally sexy woman, was parodied and mirrored back as exaggeration. The landscapes that are drawn and inscribed on the skin of the Russian woman do not determine her but activate her, in other words, enact her into being as the abject.

Returning to the local resistance to the prostitutes, the resistance movement against prostitution in the northern region reflects not only the kind of conflicts that arise when a shadow diaspora of Russian prostitutes is formed but also the subject positions of local men and women in the community. What is crucial about the situation in this region is that it takes place in close-knit communities in a region where people are related to each other and know each other closely. Family members and friends know about interactions with prostitutes and the crime syndicates. It is not something one can do in secret. Prostitution in this region affects local families and strongly affects the local community.<sup>63</sup>

However, the local people in Utsjoki have, nevertheless, been successful in bringing attention at a nation-wide level to the organized prostitution. The resistance has taken also individual and outward forms. It has been a matter of the local people actually going to the brothels and being outward and open about the situation. They have confronted men who have visited the brothels and who have been suspects of greater involvement with the Russian traffickers. In this way, the resistance against the operation of brothels and organized trafficking takes concrete and physical forms. Local women and men have literally gone inside the brothels and carried out intoxicated youths. They have spoken openly to the men in these places, telling them to go home to their wives and children. And they have also addressed the Russian women and offered health services and safe sex information.

It seems to me that the local people have not accepted the situation by thinking that nothing could be done. And so the local people have at least tried to combat organized crime and trafficking by the means that they have had. This has meant confronting the men who have been involved with the traffickers and women, showing that this cannot be tolerated and also bringing the situation to the attention of a wider audience. In this way, the subjectivities, not only of the Russian women, but of each in the community are formed in the global conjuncture with the abject and with the locals' own possibilities of agency in relation to the constrained others.

### **Coming to conclusions: shadow sexscapes in the North**

The shadow globalization, the sexscape, is corporeal, sexed, gendered and ethnicized. It is in these shadowscapes of globalization where the effects of globalizing economic and cultural processes materialize on the bodies of both sexes. The sexscape is then the opposite to the domain of the global village or neighborhood, marked by transformation from place to space and time to speed.

As the actual traffic and sex business today takes place in the shadows, backyards and in the privacy of the clients' home, it obviously has consequences on the ways in which the boundaries between the domain of subjectivity and abject could be transcended. It seems then that the client can have the possibility of coming into contact with the abject to the global village at will. The possibilities of transcending the boundary between the sexscapes and the global village are more limited to the Russian woman than to the client. Although, she does physically travel to the West in the minibus, she is constrained in the bus in which she travels and by the concrete and physical spaces of camping grounds and clients' homes. Her last option in the North maybe to marry and cross the boundary once and for all and then find her own ways, but before that the embodiment of the "Eastern girl" is her only available option.

Yet, in relation to the most powerful absent male bodies, the body of the male client in the North is closer to that of the "Eastern girl." He faces constraints of place and time as well and the landscapes result in the way he is positioned. The most northern towns in Finland do not gain profits from information technology in the way that southern cities do and when I say southern here, I refer to cities south of the Arctic Circle. Proportionately more people have moved away from the community of Utsjoki than any other region in Finland.<sup>64</sup> In northern Finland too there is unemployment and poverty. But, against the Russian woman, the northern man can still find himself superior and can show financial advantage. He also holds the key to the West. By marrying him, the woman can escape from poverty and gain the possibility of free movement as she would gain a residence permit and later also citizenship in Finland. His position in the periphery and the positions of choice that he has in comparison with those of the Russian woman are still more open. His position is not a question of necessity as hers is.

The client's position is also similarly corporeal and it also reflects the way in which the opening of borders and economic shifts can be reproduced through the body. He is in a position in which he can encounter the other, indeed enter the other but also leave the other inside the constrained spaces of the brothels and speeding buses. He can, as a client of a Russian prostitute, cross the boundary between landscapes of globalization and shadow sexscapes. Moreover, he is able to do this because he incorporates a male and his is "Western"<sup>65</sup> body. He can leave the places, to which she comes, at his will and he knows that, through him, she would also be able to escape her situation.

For her, taking the opportunity of global flows is a matter of engaging in them corporeally, in the body of a woman which possesses physically the possibility for economic activity. And it is a body that is desired on the side of the West. Then the chance that globalization provides for a woman in Murmansk is right here and that is closest to her, her own body. Then it may seem that her own body becomes the means at least to try to escape from the economic distress of her home region, or make things better for herself and her children.

*In other words, she embodies her escape.* In one sense, here is governmental-ity of the globalized world economy at work again. The Russian woman must

adapt to the situation that the transition of the market economy has placed her in. She adjusts to the power by entering the bus that travels the Northern route to the camping sites in northern Norway or across Finnish Lapland, where she enacts that position of the Russian woman time and again and reiterates the position globalization has enabled her to have and required her to take.

## 6 “The land of perverts”

### The domain of subjectivity from the position of an abject to the global village – narratives of foreign erotic dancers in Finland

The narratives in this chapter are constructed from notes of my fieldwork in erotic restaurants in Tampere. Some voices are included of the “girls”<sup>1</sup> whom I met in an erotic club in Rovaniemi. However, since the dancers work in a number of towns and the bars are similar throughout the country, I am combining these into the narratives of the “land of perverts” which is an expression commonly used by the erotic dancers about Finland. This can be seen as a counter-narrative to the expressions used by the Finnish for these girls, “Eastern girls” and Russian whores, both of which are demeaning expressions. In one sense, these stories could also be seen as a generalization of the positions that erotic dancer in Finland embody. This is not my direct aim. Instead, throughout this text, I want to emphasize how globalization concretizes in the spaces of the sex bars on sex-specific and ethnicized bodies. As the women I have interviewed were quite talkative and seemingly open about their situation (for the most part), this chapter addresses also the “voice” of the abject more concretely than the previous chapter, which characterized the position of the “Eastern girls” as that of silence. Therefore, in this chapter also the position of the subject, the client, is addressed through the voices of the erotic dancers. In this chapter, I do not go through the framework of landscapes and sexscapes in relation to sex bars in Finland, since this has already been done in the previous chapters. Instead, I want to focus on the specific corporealities of globalization by going into the detail of the enactment of these positions within the sex bars that in my framework represent global conjunctures.

In the narratives I emphasize the corporeal consequences of globalization, that is to say, in other words, what globalization means for ethnic others undressing and performing erotic dancing. Also, globalization at the individual level is the possibility to order the other to undress and command her to perform the client’s erotic fantasies. Then, even if the emphasis on larger processes of globalization is not spelled out overtly, it remains there between the lines and is the context in which the writing of this piece was set. My aim in this chapter is to evoke a feeling in the reader about these corporealities of globalization and bring the reader close to the events that take place in the sex bars. Therefore, in this chapter the focus is on the very individual level of concrete physical enactment and reiteration of the bio-power of globalization.

### **"Finland, the land of perverts"**

It's time to open the door to the sex bar again.<sup>2</sup> This time to meet with Baltic strippers. Yet, I must correct myself, just as I have been corrected so many times by the performers in erotic clubs. These are erotic clubs, not sex bars. The distinction is important, for the strippers and for the managers at least. The dancers differentiate themselves from the Russian women who prostitute and the managers distinguish themselves from any illicit business involved in the sex business. Maybe the only ones, for whom the distinction is not so important, are the male clients who are always looking for extra services. Or me, who confuses sex work and strip clubs as effects of the same system of power. The narratives here move from the shadow globalization to the borderline of the shadow and global village to the spaces of the sex bars belonging to the leisure industry and consumer culture. Could this be characterized even as part of the service industry? Maybe, the erotic dancers do help the men by listening to their problems about marriage and their sex life. But on a general level, erotic clubs are part of the fun-culture where (hetero)sexuality is produced as entertainment.

The women working in the erotic clubs draw the boundary at engaging in commercial sexual activities, which require physical contact with the customers. They are performance artists, what they do is art and they don't see prostitution as art. Let's reflect on this for a moment.

There is more to this distinction, however; and that is the degree of acceptance. These girls can distance themselves from sexual labor by interpreting and naming what they do as dancing and artistic performance. By naming their work as art, they are placing it in the domain of legal and recognized professions. They are etching at the barrier between them as ethnicized erotic others and the domain of subjects. By emphasizing their work as performance artists, these women distance themselves from stigmatized and illegal sex work; and their work becomes a socially legitimate one. However, their work is not legally recognized in Finland. They are, as "real" prostitutes are, engaging in work that is not legally recognized. Whether they have physical, sexual contact with clients or not, does not change their position as legal others in Finland. Moreover, in practice, their work as erotic dancers is a profession, which is not only associated with their ethnicity, but a form of work which is primarily performed by women who are ethnic other women. Therefore, the position of the stripper is a matter of performativity as is the position of an "Eastern girl" as a prostitute. These two positions are the ones that are available in the West for "women" from the East.

After the boom in sex bars in Finland in the mid 1990s, the working conditions of the incoming erotic dancers were inspected.<sup>3</sup> Soon, work permits for erotic dancing were refused consistently, since the clubs, in which these women danced, were regarded as not conforming to minimum work standards. The dancers would be given work permits only if they were to receive a minimum wage and the erotic show would meet the standards of good taste. This meant that the show would have to meet professional standards and that it would be on

a separate stage, clearly distanced from the audience. None of the erotic clubs at that time or thereafter have met these requirements. Therefore, no work permits have been granted either. Moreover, any kind of private show was to be forbidden. Any bar, which offers a private show, can be fined and they can lose their license. Since the private show service is not recognized as work in the Finnish system, profits that bars gain from this cannot be recorded. The measures concerning the working conditions of erotic performers were taken in order to prevent an area of work being formed, which would be primarily filled with people of a specific gender and ethnicity. The jobs that are available in Finland would have to be the kind that could be attractive for anyone in Finland and within the EU/ETA area. So far the work of the erotic dancer has not been so. The problems that the denial of work permits caused was, in practice, solved by the bars and managers by not applying for them anymore for the women that would come to work as erotic dancers. Therefore clearly, since the beginning of 1996 the erotic dancers in Finland have worked without any work permits. No longer would there be any application for work permits, but the women would travel on tourist visas, which allow them to stay in Finland for a total of three months per year.<sup>4</sup>

However, the hold of bars and managers over these women did not cease. The women do not travel independently in such a manner that they would by themselves find out in which bars there is work in Finland and arrange for their travel. Instead, the majority of the incoming women come with the “help” of the manager. They pay back to the manager their travel and accommodation from their earnings in Finland. The money, these women make, comes from tips and mostly from private shows. They are not paid any kind of minimum wage except on rare occasions. In such cases the woman has settled in Finland, is married and has a residence permit.<sup>5</sup> The majority of the incoming women, who work in erotic clubs, come from Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania or other Newly Independent States. They stay for a few weeks at a time working in several cities and smaller towns in Finland. They might on the same trip travel to Norway and/or Iceland before returning home. The managers organize their travel and apartments. The managers form a network with the bars operating in these countries. Even if the women could travel independently and arrange their own work places, in practice, it is difficult to do so. They cannot step on the toes of those who manage the business. This shows what the sexscapes mean for the women from the East.

The erotic dancer faces the kinds of constraints similar to those faced by the prostitutes, although the strippers work in a more socially acceptable area. I will return to the aspect of informal networks of managers and their relation to the movement of ethnicized women’s bodies. I will discuss in more detail the erotic bars in the context of landscapes of shadow globalization further below.

In my framework, however, I do not overtly distinguish between prostitution and erotic performance work, since the positions of legal otherness are similar for both the groups; so too it is in their recruitment and dependence on “organizers.” Of course there is the distinction of naming the profession and it may be a crucial one, for it may be the reason that allows these women to talk so openly

about their work. For the women, there is a difference between being a whore or an artist even if both positions in this case operate within the zone of the abject, within shadow globalization. However, the ease at which they talk about their work can be also because Finnish officials have not taken any overt measures in recent years to control the operation of the erotic clubs, or the women do not know their precarious position in the eyes of the Finnish law. The position of the erotic dancer is conditioned and created in a manner similar to what applies to the position of the foreign prostitute. The development of the position of erotic, ethnicized and gendered labor has to do with the social, political and economic changes in the 1990s both in Finland and the former Soviet states. These changes are connected in turn to processes of globalization of the world economy.

As already explained in the previous chapters, the emergence of the commercial sex business and also erotic clubs has to do with complex global flows as well as with the ensuing shifts in gendered and ethnicized subjectivities. These erotic bars rely on hedonistic individualism, consumer culture and male rights to consume commercial sex, in this case, in the form of strip shows on stage or in private. The individualistic freedom and right to buy commercial sexual services is overtly a male right. Finnish women do not use the bars as customers, nor were they involved in performing erotic shows. In turn, the object of consumption was not a Finnish woman, but an ethnically other women, to whom erotic labor was seen as a natural quality. These bars were spaces exclusive to men, where the eroticized ethnic other women were the entertainers.

The increase in sex bars and the sex-specific subject positions they entailed caused a stir in public discussion. Sari Näre (1998) was the first to take up this discussion in the media and he also conducted interviews with male clients in sex bars in mid 1990s. Näre theorizes that the success of sex bars in the early nineties had to do primarily with a crisis of masculinity, which followed from changes in Finnish culture and sexual relations between Finnish men and women. She explains how, in the face of growing sexual demands made by women and in an environment, in which women began to recognize their rights of sexual expression, beginning in the 1980s, men responded by celebrating the new sex bars, in which the women were there for the males to gaze at and for their entertainment. Within the sex bars, the men would be able to "gain back" the position of superiority.

However, the growth of sex bars in Finland and their success has to do also with economic changes in the early nineties, namely, the recession that placed restaurants under strain and increased competition with each other. They had to compete for customers and lower their prices. Näre (1998) explains how turning a restaurant into a sex bar did not take large investments and by offering also erotic shows, the bars hoped to attract more customers. Sex bars also relied on the abundance of women from the former Soviet states as their cheap (sexual) labor. However, the number of sex bars started to decrease from 1995 onwards, partly because the fad was over and also because the consumption of alcohol among customers was quite low (Näre and Lähteenmaa, 1995). Since then the

number of erotic clubs has settled down, leaving a few persistent ones. It seems also that clients have become more demanding in terms of the service these clubs offer. I will return to this in the following sections.

In my view, the emergence, existence, and persistence of erotic clubs in Finland is primarily an effect of global conjunctures and disjunctures, as characterized by the landscapes and shadow sexscapes of globalization. In this case, the position of the erotic dancer is that of an abject to the global village. Indeed, I want to emphasize that her position is that of a nomad, who travels and moves between boundaries of the global village and shadow globalization (see Chapter 3). As with the prostitute, what grants the erotic dancer access to Finland is her sexual labor. Similarly, she is also constrained in the shadow, since she will not be granted work permits for the erotic labor that she does. She is also constrained by the "contract" she has made with her manager, who benefits from her erotic labor and from her position as a social and legal other. Indeed, then, it is her body, her sex and ethnicity that provides her with the possibility to move across the border and the possibility for income. A woman can come to Finland to earn money, if she performs the position of the erotic other woman and serves as a surface on which the Finnish male client reiterates his subjectivity.

### Specular women

Therefore, the erotic dancer belongs to the zone of abjects because of her work, although she distances herself from prostitutes. Her profession is not easily dissociated from herself in public. As the dancers tell me, if they were to go to a normal restaurant or a night club to dance, or any public place where "normal" people interact, they would be often, if not always, propositioned by men and asked for commercial sexual services. I have heard stories how in queues, in banks and in grocery stores, men approach these women, whom they have seen working in an erotic club. A few dancers have told me how they hate going out in public during the day at all, since there will always be men who come and ask for commercial sexual services. The work these women do in erotic bars is associated with their ethnicity. Women tell me how clients think that striptease is not what these women *do* for money, but that they do it because they *are* sexy.<sup>6</sup> Often, if not always, when a stripper performs a private show, she has to establish her boundaries and insist on them in the face of eager clients. And the male clients still use these women as instruments for their own sexual pleasure. In Finland, it is uncommon *not to* masturbate, when a dancer performs the private show. In this way, even if the women draw the line at being more than performance artists, for the male clients, they are sex workers, existing in and outside of the bar for the men. This association of the Baltic strippers as being sexy and erotic others represents, in my view, the dividing practice by which the subjectivity is formed. This entails that the women working as erotic dancers in Finland are not seen (on the part of the clients) as engaging in work but rather their behavior as something that is natural or essential to them as Baltic women.<sup>7</sup>

What the women *do* consists of stage shows, private shows, special stage

shows (such as lesbian couple, S/M shows) and in some places "Lady Domina"<sup>8</sup> sessions in private, which are the most profitable shows. As already mentioned, the earnings these women make are made mostly from the private shows and from the tips collected from customers after a stage show, and also from lady drinks.<sup>9</sup> I will return to the aspect of salaries and costs later on through the women's stories. Yet, it is important to emphasize here that these women's earnings are made from entertaining the clients. When they collect the tips, advertise private shows and so on, women perform as if they had been attracted to the men, or that they had got interested in them. Men, in turn, play their part in this illusion and act as if they were "seduced" by the women.<sup>10</sup>

Indeed, the women can be seen as performing a mimesis of femininity, defined as the binary opposite to masculinity.<sup>11</sup> In these terms, following Irigaray's thesis, these women perform the position of the woman, as stereotypical sex objects. In a sense, their role is that of the speculum in that they offer to the man the possibility to gaze at himself in this mirror that is the woman. They make a complete performance of femininity that allows the men to situate themselves in a stereotypical superior masculine position. Thus, their performance tells more about how men are positioned and what qualities and attributes they are given in a male-dominated commercial sex culture.

The objectification of erotic dancers takes place also through the differentiation between them and the women with whom the men live. The women in sex bars are differentiated from the men's girlfriends and wives, women who make demands, women who no longer are desirable in a way these women are. The strippers are beautiful, gorgeous and feminine women whereas wives are referred to as "that cow, that stupid cow."<sup>12</sup> However, these comparisons and compliments given to the dancer often pave the way for more convenient requests for sexual services. The encounter with the stripper is a convenient one.

Performing this feminine masquerade is also business for these women; they perform something but one cannot tell where these women are or what their true selves are. Also, these men don't necessarily care or even want to know what the "true selves" of these women are, even if this erotic labor is seen as a natural aspect for these women. Men play their own part in the illusion. It is also convenient for them. When these women speak to the men, they speak what feminine others are supposed to say. They speak things that the men want to hear and what they expect to hear. By this, the erotic dancers subtly establish themselves as somewhere out of reach of the male clients. One stripper tells me, "If the men want me to say that they are great, I tell them that they are great. When they want me to feel sorry for them, I feel sorry for them."<sup>13</sup> The clients get only the performance of the specular, feminine woman.

Yet, what do these women perform to me, a researcher inhabiting a woman's body? In one sense, one could think that, since I am an outsider, a researcher and I am not there only for the show, these women could perhaps tell me something that reveals something of their "true selves."<sup>14</sup> This is not the case however. Although, while speaking with me, these women tell stories about their experiences, about their backgrounds and especially about Finnish male clients, I

cannot say or claim that I am collecting their “own stories.” This is for several reasons. First of all, my position as a researcher in an erotic bar is not unproblematic. I am not purely an outsider to them, someone in whom they could confide “naturally.” I do inhabit a woman’s body and I ask them questions in which I want to get their opinions about everything that is going on. This has its advantages. Maybe these women can in some sense relate to me, since I am a woman and I am interested in what they have to say. I have also a male assistant with me – he speaks Russian, so if these women, who often do speak good English and some also Finnish, want to engage in a conversation in Russian, which is in most cases their first language, it is possible.<sup>15</sup> Also, with my foreign male assistant, I can cross the bridge between different ethnicities. Since my assistant and the women in the sex bars have similar backgrounds, it always opens the possibility for small talk. Yet, in spite of these advantages I am not claiming that these women have told me their “own stories” or revealed their true selves to me, or the absolute truth about sex bars. This is because I am not totally an outsider to the sex bars, once I am in a sex bar. This has the consequence that I have to ponder about my own position inside the bar. One thing is clear: I am not an erotic dancer and second, I am not an ex-Soviet woman in Finland.

Indeed, when I come to the bar, I have to negotiate my identity between researcher and client just as I had to do in the sex bars of Helsinki. As I have already mentioned, in places like these, there are no places for researchers to sit. I stand out immediately and also cause a stir among the women working there.

Whenever, we have entered a bar, there has most often been conversations among the dancers themselves as to what or who I am,<sup>16</sup> which, I guess, might be on the following lines, namely, “Are they a couple?” “No, they don’t look like one.” “Is she a lesbian?” “Could be.” “If she is a lesbian, she is a client and has come to look at the women.” Although my position as a researcher is soon made clear and often this has gained a positive response, a few laughs on the part of the women, my position as a client somewhat remains. I still often watch the shows they perform, depending on where we are sitting. I do tip the women, since not tipping seems awkward. However, on many occasions the girls invite me to their table or to the place they are sitting at and they like to talk at length and don’t ask for a tip. Still, when I sit on the side where the dancers collect tips after the show and they ask for a tip from me, obviously I do tip. Dancers have sometimes asked me, that being a woman, why do I tip? And the answer is that I tip because they have done a show; the tip is for the show. My answers reveals then that I want to be a good client, one that tips well and neatly, one that does not harass or grope the women and does what she (he) is supposed to do. The client pays the tip for the stage show, for this is the only salary these women get.

For these reasons then, I am not completely outside the embodied subjectivity available in the bar, although I am this “other than” to a degree. For this reason too, I cannot suspect that the women enact a totally different position, a position different from the mimesis they perform to the male clients. I can suspect that my being somewhat “other than a client” can open a possibility for the women

to speak from a position of "somewhat beyond the mimesis of an ethnic other woman." Still, I cannot directly show where these boundaries are, or what these "other than mimesis" experiences or stories would be.

Instead, what I can do is to offer some of the recurring stories and experiences of Eastern erotic dancers in Finland, the way these stories have been told to me. I am not claiming then that these are true stories or these are the women's own stories, but they are stories that have been told by these ethnic others, abjects or nomadic subjects. And in this way, these stories do reveal something about that position and that experience, but most of all about us in the domain of subjects belonging to the global neighborhood.

### **"Finnish sex culture" ... (laughter)**

We are sitting with the girls in a new sex bar in Tampere.<sup>17</sup> It is for this reason a bit cleaner and neater than others that have operated for a while. This place is behind a hotel. The girls say that it used to be a Chinese restaurant that went bankrupt. With small renovations, this place was turned into an erotic bar. I guess the tables and chairs are almost the same as they used to be, small booths surrounding the walls. And the walls that are painted red could have also been like that when it was a Chinese restaurant. The seats are not really organized so as to surround the stage. There are some couches in the back of the bar, behind the stage and a few tables and chairs around the stage and for this reason there is a bit of an awkward feel to the place. The restaurant is divided into two parts; to the right of the entrance is the bar and next to it by the wall is the booth in which the girls sit and where we are invited to sit with them. From this booth you can't see the stage or much that goes on in the main area. It is almost like a small private area within this bar. Girls, who are not dancing or entertaining the clients, sit here, read, have coffee, tea and chocolates, listen to CD-players, or chat among themselves in Russian, which again separates them from the average Finnish clients and occasional tourists who drop in.

It is a weeknight and so quiet. Although I am glad these women are willing and interested to talk to me (there isn't much else to do), I get really worried about their income. All four of them are from Estonia this time and they are all Russian-speaking. It was a similar experience last night at another bar in Tampere. There we saw altogether three clients by midnight. I wonder how these girls handle this.

Soon after we have sat down with the dancers in their own booth, one of them goes to dance on the stage. It was her turn to dance and, now that there is one customer, she goes to do her routine. She started just as we arrived, but as soon as we joined the other girls, she stopped dancing; why bother when no one was there to watch. Off she goes, and the music gets louder, she does one song, during which she strips totally naked dancing around the steel bar connected to the stage, swinging herself around it. I can't see her but just some part of her legs at times, her high heel shoes.

After her performance, she puts on a yellow bikini and goes to ask for a tip.

The one customer in the bar is an elderly man in his late sixties. He is wearing a blue jacket and grey pants; he looks sober. Yet, when the girl asks for the tip, he replies that he will tip her only if she strips again right in front of him, right there. She replies that that’s what the private show is for and it costs more money. This tip is for the dance, for the performance on the stage. He is reluctant and insists she strips again for him and she leaves him frustrated and angry and heads toward the girl’s table. I ask what happened and she says:

“This is what I mean, *finska sex culturen*, Finnish sex culture, the men are cheap and have no manners.”<sup>18</sup>

This is a favorite topic for the girls tonight and also during many other nights. They complain about Finnish men and how they really don’t care for the show at all. They just want to see a naked body and *runkkaa* (jerk off).<sup>19</sup> The girls tonight don’t know many words in Finnish but they know this one. And then the girls mention about better places or better times, for example, how in Norway or Iceland the customers know how to behave; they come for the show and even in private never masturbate; they tip well. They know the rules of the game, are really nice to the girls and appreciate their work. Here, in Finland this never happens. The men are cheap, they don’t want to tip because they already paid a cover charge. And in private they always ask for more and always expect the girls to at least give them handjobs. But, the girls say, it’s good to come to Finland first because here you don’t need any experience. Girls start here and then move to work in Norway or Iceland. Here the men just want to see the girl naked and don’t care about the performance itself. They say Finland is “the land of perverts.”

It seems to me that it is quite difficult for these women to earn money from this work. They come to Finland with expectations of making money, but they have to live with constant uncertainty and unpredictability of their income. I have seen it happen in another erotic bar in Tampere also, where there is karaoke on the upper floor. There, when the stripper goes on her round for tips, the men leave and go upstairs.<sup>20</sup> The men come back to watch another performance, sitting around the stage, almost drooling but still not willing to pay the dancer and then they leave and go upstairs again. The reluctance of Finnish men to pay gets many complaints from the girls and these complaints are accompanied by stories about the generosity of the Norwegian men,<sup>21</sup> or of the occasional Russian male tourists, who also know how to engage in intelligent conversation *and* tip well.<sup>22</sup> In a bar, where there is also karaoke, by the stage and across the bar are signs on the wall that say that the dancer’s salary consists of the tips. The bar informs the clients, who in turn choose to ignore the information.

One of them said how the dancers have an educative role to teach Finnish men how to behave in bars like these, that is to say, that they should understand that this is a show, art, performance and not sex business like prostitution. Another girl mentioned how it is really the tourists who cause the most trouble; they really don’t understand that the girls dancing are not for sale. The worst are the Japanese, she says.<sup>23</sup> One woman said that to marry a Finnish man, she should have to have gone mad.<sup>24</sup>

But the perversities of Finnish men get many laughs from the girls. They say how, in bars where they have worked in Iceland or Norway, they never encounter the kinds of things that they have to see or do here in Finland. However, in erotic clubs in Reykjavik, prostitution does take place out in the open.<sup>25</sup>

According to the girls, a good example of this perversity are the Lady Domina shows. One dancer says how men that come here (the addicts) are sick and for this sickness there is no cure. But there is an added bonus in doing these sessions; you make more money. A normal private show costs on average 200 FIM (€34) for ten minutes, but Dominatrix shows costs at least 300 FIM (€51) for ten minutes. Some girls have been offered in the private room 500 FIM (€85) in cash straight up, if they were to pee in the mouth of the customer, or allow a customer to drink their urine from a cup.<sup>26</sup> A Finnish curiosity, of course, is the private show in a sauna. The client can take the stripper to the sauna with him, watch her shower, and so on. But fortunately, not many clients ask for this kind of service.

But there are many funny stories about what goes on in the private room. One dancer tells me, "I just sit there and smoke while they jerk off, it's really easy. Or then, they just sleep in the private room, if they are drunk enough; that's easy too."<sup>27</sup> But there are exceptions to this. Another stripper tells me how a client was so immersed in licking her shoe that she duped him into buying more time, by adjusting her watch. She doubled her salary in that hour. Still it is rare that men appreciate the erotic show, don't demand more, tip well and leave. This is the ideal portrait of a Norwegian man, not a Finnish one.

The girls tell me these stories of how, sometimes when they go into the private room, the man has already gone to the room beforehand, that it is he who wants to strip and dance naked. Then the girl sits in the chair reserved for the customer and applauds his performance.<sup>28</sup>

And then he masturbates.

And then the show is over.

And once a couple walked in and wanted to have sex in the private room, but since it was close to the closing time, they were kicked out...

Or, another time when a lesbian couple kept yelling and calling the girl names during the private show, saying "we want more," all the time "we want more," behaving like some of the worst male customers.<sup>29</sup>

But the hardest clients are those who just want to talk. They may buy hours of time to talk about their problems. One girl told me how a man bought an hour with her every night for a week. "You can imagine," she says, "By the end of the week there wasn't much to say. Still I couldn't refuse him. I just had to sit there. By the end, it was really hard to act concerned."<sup>30</sup> The men come to these bars to talk mostly of their marital problems or sexual problems. Strippers tell me how they are psychotherapists and sex therapists. Sometimes, the dancers are sympathetic, saying that it is good that men have these places in which they can

come in and talk about their problems, when they feel reluctant to go to a professional. It maybe easier to talk to erotic dancers than to therapists. I asked one dancer whether she listens to what the men tell her and she answered that it depends and that sometimes she does.<sup>31</sup>

And then, the girls say how in the end it is always the same thing. The men talk to them as if the girls were the women of their dreams. They might praise their beauty and tell the women how wonderful and feminine they are and how much better they are than the Finnish ones. They brag about their properties, cars, money and everything. They ask them for dates and dinner and everything. They put a bit of romance in their pursuit.

But in the end it always comes down to this:

"Would you come and do this for me" (handjob, blowjob, or some whipping)?" "Would you sleep with me?" "Would you have sex with me (for this or that amount of money, or for free (because I think you are so beautiful and I love you))?"

At this point my theoretical voice breaks through. I want to look back at what I said about global conjunctures and embodied subjectivities and reflect on the Finnish sex culture as discussed by the erotic dancers.

### **An odd global conjuncture in the private room**

The private room inside the sex bar is another space that has been created by globalization processes. It is a new kind of space that has been opened as the new commercial sex culture started to develop in Finland in the 1990s. In the private room, the dancer and the client are seemingly alone. Seemingly, since in some bars they install surveillance cameras. The cameras are there for the bar owners to watch over the girls, so they can intervene if a client oversteps his limits. Yet, the cameras function also to control the women from not doing more than allowed. These places show how globalization creates new spaces that concretize sex-specificity at the level of the body. The private room is the space in which it is the female who undresses and the man who masturbates. The position of the erotic dancer in this global conjuncture is a form of adaptation to the challenges of globalization. She becomes a body, which enacts the client's fantasies in the private showroom, where her body serves as a tool for him. Her adaptation is not only this performance, but her constant traveling to different countries to work and perform this position time and again as a means of coping with globalization, but also enacting what globalization is.

The examples above that show the sex-specific embodied positions of agency in the private showroom and in the sex bar show the different possibilities of agency that are available to the subject of the global village and the objects. The examples show the specific deeds that the male clients can do against the ethnic other who, in turn, must enact her part in the relationship. Because these "girls," embody the erotic ethnic other as their "work," the men can enact their subjectivity as freedoms to do things not acceptable in other spaces, in which normal women exist. The ethnic other woman has entered Finland, because there is a

space available for her, if she performs with her body the position of a stereotypical sex object. Enacting this position of the male fantasy is (hopefully) more profitable than staying in her home country. In addition, because she comes from an economically disadvantaged position and her income depends on the client's good will, he can declare his economic superiority over her. It seems to me that this aspect is an important part of the client's position in the sex bars, especially in the way he can enact his subjectivity in these specific spaces. At its simplest, the position of the "Eastern girl" in the bar is to perform the position of a sex object according to masculine fantasies. She performs stereotypical pornographic movements on stage and in the private. And she has to flirt and act interested in all the clients individually while collecting her tips, if she wishes to make money. And yet, he can play into the illusion, acting enticed by the girl and play with his position as a paying customer because he knows "she needs the money."

In my view, masturbating in the private room represents the possibility of doing things in sex bars that are not accepted in normal spaces. It states that the client can order the woman to undress and perform for him, while he exposes himself. He is indeed paying her to watch his performance. In a sense adaptation to globalization means for the woman in the position of the "Eastern girl" as an erotic dancer to have to put up with and accept his masturbation. In this way, the Finnish male client enacts his position in the domain of subjectivity as he can step in and out of these spaces in which she has to be subjected to the client's wishes. Through his actions in the private room, he uses her body and position, as the ethnic other, as a surface, a mirror upon which he declares his subjectivity and agency in the context of globalization. For it is globalization that brings her there naked in the private room, for his use. By the open masturbation he claims his superior position and institutionalizes the difference between him and her in possibilities of agency. For him, subjectivity is being able to pay for her to undress herself and watch him expose himself. For her, agency in the context of globalization is traveling to another country to undress and watch the men who masturbate in the private room. In this way, she carries out a specular function for him. She makes it possible for him to show his masculine sex as a mark of difference between him and her, showing what he can do and what she must do. In my view, what is at stake here are the sex-specific and most definitely ethnized positions created in the global conjunctures and enacted at a very individual level, in the enclosed setting of the erotic bar, or in even the smaller private room of a couple of square meters.

Her work is such that she bears the costs herself, if there are not enough clients. In fact, her work opportunity could turn into debt and she may not be able to earn the income she hoped for. Accepting and working in these conditions can also be seen as adaptation to the bio-power of shadow globalization. Indeed, most of her salary will come from the private shows and she will most likely need or want to increase her earnings by letting the clients touch her while she performs and thus also letting the men do to her things that they are not allowed to do to "normal" women in "normal" clubs. She does, in a sense, make

her earnings from practices that could be seen as sexual harassment in other places and again helps the bars and managers make a profit from her sexual harassment. In a way she disciplines herself to accept the men’s sexual harassment as a means of income, exemplifying the bio-power of shadow globalization. This characterizes the *corporealities* that are inherent in the position of the “ethnic sexualized” and how the landscapes and sexscapes produce her position as a corporeality and, in turn, draw globalization on her body.

### **It’s all about the money?**

A common misconception is that every girl does this for the money. Some girls do it for the money, but some girls *do it to be more free*.<sup>32</sup>

[After a long silence] I don’t know what to answer, I don’t know what to say to you, I do this for the money, *only for the money*.<sup>33</sup>

What is all this money worth, if you have to put up with *all this*?<sup>34</sup>

A business owner, Stephanie, who has her own erotic bar in Tampere, explains in an interview<sup>35</sup> that the dancers have a lot of freedom. They can choose when they work, or when they want to take a day off. The girls who work for Stephanie come mainly from Estonia, Latvia and Russia but have lived here many years and all speak Finnish. Their motivation to work is that they are dancers and love to dance. They can’t stay still. Most have had dancing experience for a long time. Erotic dancing is the most profitable form of dancing, if one wants to make a career in dancing. From erotic shows it is possible to make more money than, for example, from show dance. Stephanie explains that the girls here choose dancing first, but everyone must make a living and therefore erotic shows are the best option. This is not porn. This is a form of art.

In this place is no stage show at all. This place is open during the day and customers come in for coffee, tea, muffins and private shows. She explains to me that there are all the time a lot of girls who want to come and work for her. But she does not provide the required minimum wage and the earnings of the women are dependent on the number of clients that drop in. She soon makes clear that, although erotic dancers make good money and have a lot of freedom because of it, they still bear the costs of the profession themselves. In erotic dancing, there is no job security.

There is no protection in the form of sick leave, no maternity benefits, no pension plan. A dancer can have a holiday when she has made enough money; and when she needs more money, she can always come back to work. This is her only security.

Another dancer explained, “This is not like a business because, when you have a business, you have some idea about your income. Here you never know how much you will earn.”<sup>36</sup> Another says, “Sometimes you make 200 FIM in one night, but sometimes you can make 2,000 FIM; you never know. I haven’t been able to count a monthly salary ever. It always changes. But I have managed

to pay the rent. I have done this for four years now, I have learned to live with it."<sup>37</sup>

This is a serious downside to this work. The girls talk a lot, almost every night of those better times, those times in the mid-nineties, when these erotic bars were a new thing. Then, in those golden times, male clients behaved well, they tipped well and always appreciated the show. Then there were fewer demands for sexual favors; seeing a nude dancer was plenty for men in those better times.

"We used to walk away with plastic bags full of money." I am probably looking at her as if I don't believe her, because she insists, "Seriously, we would have these bags full of cash by the end of the evening, money just from tips." I want to believe in her story. I wish that at least these women had made something from this. So far tonight there has been only that one customer, who was unwilling to tip. Last night, there was by midnight only three customers and none of them gave any tips and the girls were not selling any private shows during either of these nights. Tonight they didn't ask for a tip from me either; well for us they didn't dance. I feel a bit bad. I don't know how to compensate them for taking their time to talk to me (or us) and sharing their chocolate.<sup>38</sup>

The attention is drawn back to the situation at hand and the girls talk about how quiet it is now during the week. At the weekends it is a bit better, but even then you never know. And then we get into the sensitive issue: managers and their work "contracts."

As already mentioned at the beginning, the girls gain their income from tips and what they make from the private shows. There is no minimum wage, no monthly payment that the bar owner pays the girls. In some bars there might be, or sometime in the past (in the beginning) there has been, but overall the rule is that the girls are not paid any wage. They must earn everything themselves. And in most places the dancer can earn more if she allows the client to touch her during the private show. The price for touching breasts is of course more than for touching legs or arms.<sup>39</sup> In this way, the woman's body is also priced according to the body part, signaling what is valued the most in that setting, but also conveying the message to the dancer as to what she should allow to be done to her, in order to increase her earnings.

Now, here's the deal. A majority of the girls have managers who organize the bars in which the girls are going to work. He makes travel arrangements and arranges for accommodation. He has apartments, or connections with apartments, in which these girls stay. The girls pay, of course, for their travel and accommodation from the money they make (from tips). Each night they work, the profit from the first private show goes always to the manager. If a girl is not able to persuade anyone to buy a private show debt starts to accumulate.<sup>40</sup> The next evening she owes the manager the profits from one show and will have to pay the manager the profits from two private shows. This goes on. If a dancer has not been able to sell any private shows during the weeknights, on Friday the manager will take the profit from five private shows. If the dancer is able to do just one private show each night, she is not making any money for herself at all.

If she does only those five private shows on Friday she still would not be making any profit. This kind of work contract is clearly exploitative and unacceptable in the context of the Finnish employment system.<sup>41</sup>

But, I do also hear good stories of how these girls enjoy the traveling and the possibilities it brings. One dancer from Tallinn says that she prefers Norway for skiing and good money, Finland is a convenient location and when she goes back home she doesn't have to work, but can go on a shopping spree in Russia.<sup>42</sup> Another says how back in Estonia she used to work in a textile factory and how she had to get up early in the morning, travel to work one hour and back. The work was heavy, exhausting, tiring and monotonous. She says that three years just went by and there is no recollection of time. Now, she considers her work easy, she works a few weeks in sex shops doing the private shows, then in an erotic bar and then takes a break. Now, she is able to send money back home to her parents and she also buys clothes for her mother. “My mother has never had these many shirts and dresses as she now has.”<sup>43</sup>

And then I look around and I see no customers and four girls waiting. One says, “I called, I am going to go to another bar tomorrow night.” I tell her that yesterday it was like this there as well and she replies, “But I hope it will be better, we are always hoping.”<sup>44</sup> “Of course, it is stressing, but it is even more stressing to stay at home with no income and no idea of how and wherefrom to get money.” Knowing that you can't have any money is worse than being unsure about the income.

That's why we always have to leave and try. From a normal job in Estonia you make so little you hardly can have what you need; here the income is always more than there. Even if it is nowadays less than what it used to be.

But, it is not easy money. “People have this misconception that this is easy money. It is not easy money at all; this is hard work.”<sup>45</sup>

“Sometimes, I work like a horse, during the day in sex shops doing private shows and then in the evening in a bar.”<sup>46</sup>

“This work is so hard. Sometimes after work we just go to a disco, to dance and to get drunk and when we go back to our apartment, we just sit there and cry ourselves to sleep.”<sup>47</sup>

“But we do this for the money, what else is there to do.”<sup>48</sup>

I now want to finish this chapter by looking at the corporeal position of the sexualized other in the context and space of the erotic club, characterized as a space of global conjuncture of different ethnicities and subjectivities. Moreover, it is a space in which the (male) subject is formed against the social other, the abject. In the following section, I will discuss the formation of the position of the abject and the space of agency for the abject *herself* and for the subject in this limited space of the erotic clubs in Finland.

## Subjects at global conjunctures

The customers think that we are not performing, that this is not performance at all, that this is what we really are. They think that because we come from the Baltic states that this is what we really are. They don't think we do this as a job for money, they think we do this because we *are* sexy.<sup>49</sup>

I have learned now, what the men want me to be. They want me to be a bit perverse, they want me to be *a woman*.<sup>50</sup>

I don't like what I become when I do this work, I become a man, aggressive. My language changes. I begin to say things like "She will marry him," when the proper version (in Russian) is to say: "He will marry her."<sup>51</sup>

I suspect it is going to be another quiet evening at the sex bars tonight. It is a weeknight and winter, cold and windy and snowing outside. The streetlights give the air a strange yellow color as we walk toward the entrance. This bar is situated across the street from the Orthodox Church; its golden cupolas glisten against the dark heavy sky. But the bar is shielded from the outside by red painted windows, black silhouettes of nude women pictured on the red. These are silhouettes of women represented in pornographic poses, on their hands and knees with face turned toward the street, or as sitting and leaning back, head thrown back, hair down, legs slightly spread out.<sup>52</sup>

These pictures, of course, convey the image of what is to be expected inside. But somehow the silhouettes of these women seem awkward on these windows. These are basement windows and so they are not tall enough to fit a picture of a woman standing or sitting so that the one figure would fill the whole window. These windows fit only figures in these vulnerable positions, on their backs or hands and knees, passive and waiting, in positions from which it is hard to run away or fight back. It is almost as if the shape of the window forces these women to be (and be represented) in such constrained positions, in a horizontal manner. The red brick building forms a heavy frame for these silhouettes. The space of the window is limited and framed by a heavy brick material, the kind that the figures could never blow apart. The silhouettes are pictured on these rectangles of red color surrounded by unbreakable material, showing thus the concrete limits that the women inside the bar are constrained by, and which they have to face once they have entered the bar as the entertaining erotic women.

The message that the windows give to the public is that the women take these positions out of their free will because they like to be eroticized and objectified and because it is useful to them. It is a form of work, it is part of the entertainment business, or even part of the service industry. These windows make a statement that anyone passing by can either choose to see or choose to ignore. Passersby can resent these places, walk swiftly pass them and think only sick people go in there, or they might accept them as part of a normal consumer society, inside a system in which there should be consumable items according to

every taste. People are getting used to them, and authorities are getting used to them, to these places where former Soviet, Estonian, Latvian, Russian women perform the position of the erotic dancer and corporealize the masculinist fantasies of the exotic other. In this society a space is reserved for the erotic, exotic other to appropriate; it is to be appropriated in these semi-illegal erotic clubs, legal on paper and exceeding the limits of laws and norms in practice. The position of the exploitation of these women is of secondary importance. After all, the opinion seems to be that they wanted it; they are it.

These are the abject of our time. They are constrained behind the doors of erotic clubs, sex shops and brothels all over Finland. They are constrained by the stereotypical representation of the erotic, exotic other woman in stereotypical poses and pictures. They are “employed” to perform the erotic fantasy woman, a woman that does not exist, but a woman which is nevertheless to be incorporated time and again in every stage and private show. Here they mimic and carry out the embodiment of the feminine other in a way that only the ethnic other can do because of her position in shadow globalization. It seems that the women then in these marginalized positions learn to want their sexualization and exploitation, for it is a means of income and indeed survival. It is as if she had learned to become a woman in Irigaray’s terms, she learns that pain is part of pleasure and pleasure (existence) is what the male teacher teaches her (Irigaray 1985: 198–200). She does depend on the benevolence of the clients in paying for the show and buying more time from her, which the clients in erotic bars are not in anyway obliged to do.

As I open the door to the erotic bar the warm air filled with cigarette smoke and the smell of spilt beer makes me forget about the snowy breeze outside. The red color of the windows was a hint and promise as to what is found inside. The bouncer seems to know me and we are welcomed to the bar. I am happy that I don’t have to explain why a person in a woman’s body is entering such a masculine sphere. The red color dominates the atmosphere. It continues on the walls and lighting, there are comfortable looking couches around the stage and here and there solitary men sitting, waiting with a glass of beer in front of them.

(We find ourselves seats close to the stage and close to the couches were the dancers are sitting while they are not entertaining the customers or dancing. It is still early and the “girls” are sitting together chatting and smoking.)

The music changes and gets louder. The men look up and start paying attention again to the environment in anticipation of the woman coming on stage to strip for them. As the men are sitting by themselves, there is no cessation of chatter as the show starts, since they have been quiet all along. The men might sit back in more comfortable positions and take long sips of their beers, or uplift their postures almost as in reaching out toward the stage and so trying to soak in all that is coming.

The music gets slightly louder still, and the girl comes on stage with the rhythm of the music, the drums almost the only sound in the intro. She has long blonde hair and is wearing a silver dress, a short one, covering her hips only slightly. She leans against the steel bar lifting her hands up above her head and

taking hold of the bar. She is facing the few customers there as she moves up and down and on her way down spreading her legs open.

The singing starts; it is a male voice. The lyrics call to the audience to *Reach out and touch*<sup>53</sup> which in this case does not mean physically touching her but an idea of the erotic dancer as a *Personal Jesus*, someone who is there for the men individually and collectively, caring for them and hearing their prayers.

The lights flicker to the distinctive drumbeat. The blonde performer moves to the rhythm either pushing her legs apart or bending her chest down so that the steel bar is suggestively between her G-stringed bottom.

The song is getting more intense and so is her performance, she removes her dress, one by one, her bra and her G-string. At times she kneels on the floor, swaying back and forth on her hands and knees. She is facing the back door herself, looking away from the bar while the clients center around watching her moving bottom, imagining maybe that they are doing the moving, or hoping that she is asking for them to do it to her. The dancer changes her positions on the floor and continues the same rhythm; at times fondling her breasts with that familiar painful look on her face. But who is she touching when she is touching her breasts at that moment. She is not touching herself, but an image of herself. She is indeed touching, and by the touch forming her body as a feminine object. In Irigaray's terms the dancer can be seen as performing a woman's position in a pornographic scene.<sup>54</sup> In that case, she represents on stage his idea of feminine and masculine pleasure, only to state that that is not where she is. She is not pretending on stage to perform what she is or feels, but her performance of the sexual object is an exaggeration. She mimics the pornographic scene with her body, but in this pornographic scene there is no single male star and the male star can be every man in the audience.

The men sit quietly staring at her show without even blinking. Some have satisfied looks on their faces, as if they were truly enjoying the sexual encounter with her as she is performing. And like the song lyrics suggest, the performer is not simply a silent object in this performance of her objectification. She is indeed "inviting" the men to embody the masculine position. Then, her performance is also a means for these men to make them feel compatible with other men because she seemingly desires them. The illusion of these women's desire then could be a means to establish the existence of these men in the homo-social order, in which women's value is formed through the exchange value among men.<sup>55</sup> For Irigaray (1985: 202–203), heterosexuality is only a pretence that functions to establish the patriarchal society and the grounds for the economy, which is based on productive and reproductive labor. The erotic dancers could in that frame be seen protecting the hom(m)osexual<sup>56</sup> monopoly from being disclosed, since the culture of erotic bars is naturalized by discourses of desire and pleasure and "individual" freedom to express (hetero)sexuality.

The song has a faster beat than most of the songs used by the women in their stage shows. The usual stage show, which has a kind of dreamy quality about it, is being done by her at almost double tempo. In one sense it is intense, in another sense it gives the impression that the stripping and pornographic

simulations are something she wants to be quickly over and done with. Does she look distracted and bored at times? Maybe, the lighting and the rhythm do hide it well.

The song is over and she comes off the stage and puts her G-string and bra on before she goes to collect the tips. In this outfit she goes and stands in front of the male clients holding out her G-string and smiling kindly. At this point she is not aggressive, but behaves like a nice girl, as girls are taught to be. She might lean over to kiss the clients in thanking for the tip. She might touch and caress them and pretend interested in the men.

The space she is using for her performance has now changed. While she is on stage, she is safe in a sense that no client can come on the stage or touch her while she is there. The rules that govern how she can use her body in the space of the floor change from that of the stage. Whereas the stage is "her territory" and the male bouncer will protect this space as hers, the space of the floor is different. The floor is the client's territory. It is also a space in which negotiation takes place over tips, lady drinks and private shows. In this space the dancer has to be in a sense sensitive to the client's wishes, if she wants to make more money out of him. Also, she has to be more alert, for this is the space for groping, name-calling and attempts to get a feel inside her g-string (see also Ronaï 1992). For this reason, it might be more useful for her to enact aggressive masculine sexuality as her own.<sup>57</sup> In this case, she would not go around asking for tips like a nice girl and in doing this hope to avoid harassment. Another strategy would be to perform *even more* than the clients expect and in this way control their reactions. Then, she might sit on the client's lap with her legs apart, and by pushing her chest toward his face or neck, simultaneously rubbing her body against his. In a way these extreme gestures suggest that she is performing her part as the object of male sexual fantasy to the last detail possible in such a setting and that she has learned her position in a heterosexual pornographic scene.<sup>58</sup> But there is more. In one sense it looks almost as though she was attacking him, that indeed she was going to suffocate him with her chest or strangle him while he was being too sexually aroused even to notice. And for such intense pleasure, he would tip her generously. In this way, at least in the form of a momentary fantasy, the objectification of the female body and sexuality would be turning against him. Indeed, she would be using the stereotypical pornographic scene and turn it back to the client, as a means of making money and not because she is (or would ever have been) embodying it as an identity.

Maybe she does not employ either of these strategies on the floor. She might just sit beside the men and politely join their company. Then she would go through the routine list of questions she has been advised to ask by the bar owners. She would ask about what they do, how they liked the show and what their interests are. She might tell her name and her background and usually the men ask for this. After a few words then she would propose, "Would you like to buy me a lady drink?" Or go directly to "Would you like to have a private show?" Here again in her speaking she is expressing the operations of masculine language. She herself is mute.<sup>59</sup> She is enacting a specular function as she speaks

his desire. This muteness does not matter in this place, for he would not be interested in listening to *her*. For this reason she cannot hear herself either. She speaks what is expected of her, as she advertises her sexual service, the erotic show for him. While she listens to his marital and sexual problems as part of her job, she is again there as a specular woman. She allows him to look at himself in her. This is possible especially because she is the ethnic other woman and as such separated from the women of the client's own ethnicity. While she speaks to him she indeed voices what is expected of her. She incorporates a position that ensures his subjectivity.

This is an essential quality for the abject.

Yet, in Irigaray's terms, the language that the erotic dancer speaks, while she is not speaking the masculine, is fluid. Therefore the woman cannot hear herself. Her speaking fluid is a form of adaptation, but also of resistance. It does not follow the binary laws of liquids and solids. She is the abject, the fluid, the necessary condition of life and mark of excrements and death. I will return to this.

Finally, one customer does pay her interest and offers to buy a lady drink, which she goes to get herself from the bar. They engage in small talk, but it seems that it is not getting anywhere and she downs her drink quickly and moves on. After her tour, she goes to have a cigarette in the smoking area close to the entrance. However, after she has lit up her cigarette, an angry customer who is totally drunk starts pushing her away. She tries to defend herself, but he is taller and bigger than she is. The dancer tries to explain that she is going to smoke there, but he starts yelling at her that she cannot do that. He is pointing to the corner where the dancers normally sit while they are not working and yells that that is the only place where the dancer can sit and that the smoking area is for customers only. Nobody on behalf of the bar intervenes in this and the scene ends by him yelling at her and pushing her away.

She returns to where the other dancers are sitting and they start talking about the incident and about the guy, but there is nothing they can do. The harassment and name-calling are the downsides of this work. It is part of the profession and what the women know they can expect to get. We engage in a conversation about the incident. The girls are angry and assure me that clients behave like this all the time.

Then they start talking about how, through this job, they have learned all about what men are. One dancer explains how, before taking on this work, she was intimidated by men. She used to think that she was dependent on men. She tried to please them and, if they didn't show up or call at the time they had promised, she would have been devastated. This has all changed now. She knows now how to get at any man. There is no mystery about men for her. She knows how to handle them. She won't be intimidated anymore.<sup>60</sup> But, the question that starts to trouble me is, "What is she learning when she is learning about men?" In Irigaray's terms she would be learning the composition of heterosexual relations and about her position in it.<sup>61</sup> Yet, I am not sure, maybe she is learning about the things that subjects can do, when they come into contact with abjects in erotic bars.

Finally there are more customers coming in and things start getting busier. As the clients walk in, the girls soon go to entertain them, they flirt and joke around, lean toward the men and laugh at their jokes. They animate the clients to buy drinks and entertain them while they have their lady drinks. The objective is to sell as many private shows as possible.

One dancer succeeds in getting a man to buy a private show from her. The trouble is that he did not bring enough cash with him and so he goes to the bar to get some. While he is waiting for the bartender to do the transaction, he smiles excitedly and eagerly. The dancer stands there beside him, waiting for him to get his cash and pay for her. While this is happening, the dancer makes eye contact with me and smiles. She rolls her eyes and makes faces at him behind his back. When he has received his money and turns toward the dancer in order to pay for her, she puts on her sexy smile again. He follows her as she leads him to the private room in the back of the bar.<sup>62</sup>

Later, I ask her if it is easy to undress in front of the men, or if it gets easier over time. She leans toward me and whispers:

"I hate it."<sup>63</sup>

She does not want anyone to hear.

### Coming to conclusions on the "land of perverts"

As I have discussed in Chapter 2, how Butler argues that the maintenance of the category of the abject is a necessary condition for the domain of subjectivity to exist. Therefore those who belong to the domain of subjectivity indeed simultaneously create and sustain the categories of the socially dead. Here there is also a link to Irigaray's specular woman as well. The abject serves as a mirror against which the subject can form its own position in the domain of social subjects by separating oneself from the category of the socially dead. The abject bodies in sex bars are there to fulfill the client's sexual fantasies in private showrooms but also to listen to the client's problems and worries.

The abject prostitute or the erotic dancer as a social category is then useful in this respect as it allows for the reiteration of the position of the subjectivity of the male customers. In my view, this also explains the air of tolerance of erotic bars and exploitation of ethnic others that takes place in these establishments. The clients enact their subjectivity concretely and corporeally through eye and skin contact with the erotic dancers inside. However, the erotic bars are also useful for individuals, who are not clients. Women can differentiate themselves as not being "Eastern girls." Here the madonna/ethnic-other-whore division is again reinstated. In this sense the category of the "Eastern girl," abject, erotic dancer, cannot be purged, for it is the *alter ego* of the Western subject of globalization. It is part of the subject and marks the subject's horror of exclusion from the domain of the globalized subjects.

The foreign abject body marks the differences of social significance given to different bodies. The body of the abject is faced with different kinds of social rules governing exit and entry as opposed to the bodies that claim existence in

the domain of social subjects. The male and the few female clients in erotic bars can exceed the norms that govern the interaction of different bodies in normal social life. The abject is a body that can be exploited and groped at will, since, as argued in chapter two, it is impossible to exploit a person who is socially dead.

The abject becomes a position to be incorporated and a possibility of labor for those who are marginalized by political and economic globalization. These ethnic others are what the global sex industry, as it manifests itself in Finland, feeds on. I see the erotic dancers also embodying the position of nomads, since they are constantly traveling from one country to another to do erotic dancing. This is a kind of organized nomadism, for it is the managers who arrange the travel plans for the girls, so that the specific towns and the order in which the girls travel in Finland is designed beforehand. Also, the girls maybe traveling from Finland to Norway and then heading on to Iceland before returning home to Estonia and starting the traveling all over again, all arranged by the managers for whom the girls work.

I see the incorporation of the position of the abject-nomad in Finland, in which these positions in the sex industry are created, as adaptation to the challenges of globalization. This position of the abject is repeatedly recreated everyday and every night in the numerous sex bars and brothels in Finland. This repetition of the stage shows and private shows or numerous contacts with prostitutes is a means for the clients to reiterate their position of subjectivity in the context of globalization.

Then indeed, the abject are not bodies produced by shadow globalization as others, but others produced through establishment of the global village, in order to mark its boundaries and mark the subjectivities that can belong to that domain. The abject is necessary for the subject.

## 7 Conclusions

### Narratives of corporeal politics

do not imagine that the exploration  
ends, that she has yielded all her mystery  
or that the map you hold  
cancels further discovery

(Gwendolyn McEwen)<sup>1</sup>

The last three chapters have been written in a narrative form, drawing from the forms of representation that are characteristic of new ethnography, which are also familiar in many feminist IR texts. Employing the narrative method is a matter of using plurality of expressions, including personal and “fictive” narratives and also poetry. The point is to etch away at the binary oppositions constructive of logico-scientific methods of writing. Writing in a way that makes use of different narratives, voices and speaking positions is a way to tackle the exclusionary practices of modern epistemology that silences voices and expressions that do not fit into logico-scientific representation. Choosing an alternative form of writing arises from the acknowledgment of the power involved in the construction of what counts as science and, moreover, from the acknowledgment of the inherent masculinism of these practices.

The acknowledgment of relations of power in doing and reporting research has been central to my choice to turn to a narrative form of writing instead of a logico-scientific representation. My aim has been to write manner that is sensitive to the representation of the “object” of research and to write narratives that expose the position of the researcher in “the field.” As I have chosen a very sensitive topic, that of foreign women engaging in prostitution and erotic dancing in Finland, I have also had to become aware of the way in which, through my own writing strategies, I would be reproducing their position as social and ethnic others. I have wanted to write texts that do not reinforce their abjection in Finland, texts that would not objectify and silence these women. Writing in a narrative form, drawing on new ethnography, postmodern feminism and IR in general has been for me a strategy to tackle the issues of power involved in writing scientific reports.

However, writing in a narrative form arises also from the criticism toward

logico-scientific representation that rests on the notion of possibility to represent the real world objectively with the use of neutral language. With the narrative turn, it is claimed that all texts are situated and subjective, but in the logico-scientific representation, these aspects are hidden. With the narrative turn, it is claimed that it is impossible to write a text that would be truly neutral and objective of the world out there.

I have wanted to follow a way of writing that overcomes the position of scientist as a distanced observer from the topic of research, who could theorize and write in a neutral language with no concern of how relations of otherness are reinforced by such texts. My method of doing this research as a form of ethnography, as actual field research engaging in conversations in the places where the ethnic others are, has also been a strategy by which to overcome the position of hierarchy of the IR researcher, who theorizes about the world events from a distance. This method draws also from the feminist criticism in that it addresses the position of the researcher in relation to the object of research. Writing in a narrative form is therefore a writing strategy that aims not to reinforce these relations of hierarchy. Also, this method of writing allows one to write in a way that is socially situated and sensitive to gender, race and class. The objective is to produce openly situated and subjective texts and open a possibility for plural narratives instead of one single monolithic narrative that is hierarchic over others. Writing in a narrative form is a way to tackle the question of power involved in producing scientific knowledge and stretch the limits of what counts as knowledge. An important aspect of this criticism has been to expose how writing in the neutral language of science is also a masculinist practice which operates through binary oppositions in which the lesser position is attached to the feminine. Then also, scientific knowledge as defined by modern epistemology has been shown to be a gendered practice, which prioritizes the masculine that is associated with reason and rationality over the feminine that is associated with emotions and feelings qualities that do not count as knowledge in that context.

Writing science in a narrative form is therefore a way to underline that the neutral language of science is one narrative alongside other narratives. The point is to address the issues of power and exclusion involved in the construction of the hierarchy of a scientific narrative as above and better than other forms of representation. However I do not argue that the narrative form of writing should be intended to replace the traditional way of writing scientific reports. The point is not to replace the old system completely with new ways of representation of research data, as that would mean simply creating new forms of exclusion. Instead, what I want to propose is the possibility to write in different forms and have a plurality of expressions and, in this way, undo the exclusionary and masculinist practice of modern epistemology. The narrative turn is not about arguing that the logico-scientific form of expression should be considered absolutely wrong and that these kinds of texts should be dismissed. The narrative turn is not about exclusion, but about the move toward "pluralism that promotes multiple forms of representation and research" (Bochner 2001: 135). This pluralism

means also opening the concept of what social science can be and, as such, opening the possibility also to question what international relations research can be.

I want to emphasize here that the writing in a narrative form is, for me first and foremost, a textual move. It is a matter of writing in a manner that is sensitive to sex, race and class and which acknowledges the position of the researcher in relation to the object of research. I do not claim that I have objectively reproduced the “voice” of others by writing their “own stories.” My objective has not been to emancipate social and ethnic others. Instead my claims are more modest. My emphasis is on the textual representation in which I want to replace generalization and closure by details and open endings. The personal and “fictive” narratives are based on the idea that, from the personal and the particular, we can learn something general. The personal narratives are always connected to the larger cultural narratives and, subjective experiences are never private and isolated, but they are formed in relation to the social world (see Sparkes 2002). My own narratives are filled with meta-narratives and also narratives of others that I cannot separate myself from. Thus from these narratives, which are filled with experiences and detail, it is also possible to gain an idea of what kind of narratives are possible, which in turn conveys the idea of possible lived spaces.

The “fictive” narratives that I have written on the basis of my fieldnotes have been done in a way that does not imply closure. I am not implying then that I have written conclusive stories of the objects at global conjunctures or that the constructed narratives are exhaustive. My own background in studying IR also affects the kinds of things I pay attention to and which I want to emphasize in the narratives. It is as in the opening quote; “*do not imagine that the exploration ends, that she has yielded all her mystery or that the map (in my case the map of international relations) you hold cancels further discovery.*” Instead, I have wanted to use the narratives as mirrors through which we could see how the larger systems of power, by which subjects are constituted, operate and the implications this has at the very individual level of sex-specific and ethnicized bodies.

I have designed my research questions, topic of research, methodology and writing strategy in such a manner that I could continue the tradition of feminist International Relations research and thus stretch the limits of what is researchable in IR. I situate myself with the postmodern feminist claims addressing the question of power and inherent masculinism in what is researchable and what counts as knowledge in social sciences. Yet, my research topic of foreign prostitutes in Finland could also be situated with standpoint feminist writing. I bring these two “feminisms” together in my research, which formulates the standpoint feminist question, “Where are the women in international relations?” into the question, “Where are the sex-specific and ethnicized bodies in international relations?”

I have wanted to bring the question of the body to international relations research because it is something that has been neglected, since IR has been traditionally a discipline that involves the relations of states and international

agents and questions of sovereignty and security. The issue of the sex-specific and ethnicized body follows from the feminist concerns that place emphasis on how the international affects and constructs the sphere of the private, which is associated with the feminine. The feminists in IR have taken up the thesis “personal is political” and investigated its meanings in the context of international relations. What I want to emphasize here is that this move in stretching the limits of state-centric IR and its guiding paradigms also opens the possibility to address the issue of the body. I have wanted to address in the context of IR research how “the international” materializes on bodies. Bringing the body into IR research has also required addressing the question of sex-specificity and ethnicity of bodies, producing and using knowledge. Philip Darby (2003) has criticized that, in the discipline of IR, the concept of the international has been taken over and separated from the experiences of ordinary people who are nevertheless affected and live the international such as in postcolonial societies. However, Darby also proposes that the concept of globalization could be a key by which the discipline of IR could be opened up to more multidisciplinary and interdisciplinary approaches and thus open up the study of IR to concern topics that have been excluded from it before.

The main question that has guided my research has been how globalization operates as a system of power that produces sex-specific and ethnicized subject positions and how these positions are embodied and incorporated. This approach comes from Foucault’s theory of bio-power and Butler’s theory on becoming a subject, which I have explained in Chapter 2. I see globalization as a system that subjectivates. In other words, it produces positions of subjectivity that are incorporated by individuals who is subject to power through self-discipline and adaptation. Foucault (1983) has explained how power that produces subjects operates in three modes of subjectivation. It establishes the subject in language, it forms the subject through dividing practices and by turning the individual into a subject. This last point of turning oneself into a subject has been of concern for Butler who has discussed this process at length (1997) *The Psychic life of Power: Theories in Subjection*. In this work Butler explains how this turning into a subject involves an eclipse of subjectivation. This means that the individual must subject to power, but upon subjection the individual is granted agency and social recognition. From this position the subject reiterates and reproduces the power that formed her as a subject. This is what is meant by subjectivation that the power *acts on* a subject and *enacts* the subject into being (see also Foucault 1983). This enactment of subjectivity is a matter of performativity; the subject reiterates and enacts through her body the power that has produced her as a subject. However, this reiteration is not completely predetermined, but the subject can redo the power and give it variations. In this way subjectivation is not simply subjection as subordination, but about gaining agency and social recognition upon subordination to power.

What has interested me has been to investigate how globalization, as a system of power, subjectivates, that is, how globalization *acts on* and *enacts* subjects into being. And, in turn, how globalization is reproduced and reiterated by those

who become subjects of globalization. I have wanted to explore what kinds of bodies the current globalized world requires and needs. This has guided me also to question the sex-specificity and ethnicity of these subject positions. I see the operations of the global sex industry as an example of how subjectivities are formed through globalization. The operations of the global sex industry also reveal the sex-specificity and ethnicity of the available subject positions in the context of globalization. Therefore, I see prostitution as an effect of international politics or rather of the corporeal politics of globalization.

I have used Foucault's concept of governmentality in order to exemplify how globalization operates as a system of power that produces subjects of globalization through adjustment and adaptation. In Chapter 2, I have explained how neoliberalism can be seen constituting the governmentality of globalization of the world economy that creates subject positions through adaptation and adjustment to global governance (Dillon and Reid 2000). Neoliberalism, as the guiding principle, determines the practices of world governance of globalization and thus forms what is governed and how. In Chapter 2, I have placed emphasis on the sex-specific effects of neoliberalist governmentality. I have explained how the neoliberalist governmentality of the globalized world economy has led to an increase in trafficking of women for the purposes of prostitution and to the increase of the global sex industry in both illegal and legal forms. At its simplest, this means that countries, in which economic transition according to neoliberalist policies have taken place, have become the sending regions for women trafficked abroad for purposes of prostitution. In the 1990s, the breakdown of the Soviet Union influenced the flows of the trafficked women so that the women from the former Soviet countries entered "the market." I see resorting to prostitution abroad as a means of adaptation to the governmentality of globalization and as a means by which the dominating market ideology is incorporated by the sex-specific bodies of the prostitute, trafficker and the client. In other words, globalization of the world economy could be conceptualized as the globalization of world economy of sex.

In order to avoid simplistic and isolationist conceptualization of globalization, I have found Appadurai's framework of landscapes of globalization useful. Appadurai (1996) approaches globalization as a system of complex global flows that operate through landscapes of globalization. These landscapes form new global conjunctures, in which new kinds of possibilities for subjectivity and agency are formed. I see the landscapes of globalization forming the *domain of subjects*, which is a domain in which those *who globalized* are engaged and benefit from the complex global flows and the new opportunities these flows bring.

However, following Appadurai (1996), I see globalization as *fundamentally disjunctive*. This means that a necessary condition of globalization is that it cannot be global<sup>2</sup> and that it does not create equal positions of subjectivity and opportunity across the globe. In my framework of globalization as a system of power that subjectivates, this means that at the same time that globalization produces the domain of subjects; it does this by simultaneously creating the zone of

the abject. In other words in order to maintain and reiterate the domain of the subjects of globalization, the zone of the abject must be maintained as well. This division is characterized by the formulation of the landscapes and sexscapes of globalization in Chapter 3. I have constructed my framework of the sexscapes of globalization that characterize the operation of shadow globalization, following Appadurai's framework of globalization as a system of complex flows of people, money, information and images forming the landscapes of globalization. I have used these landscapes to characterize the domain of subjects as in who belongs to the global neighborhood. Once more I want to emphasize that in my framework I do not refer to the global neighborhood, or global village, as a geographical space that has set boundaries on planet earth. Instead, by the framework of landscapes, I have wanted to emphasize the new possibilities of agency that are available for the subjects of globalization. Then the landscapes characterize the global flows to which the subjects of globalization can have access and which the subjects can take advantage of. This brings the attention to the zone of the abject against which the category of subjects is formed. This zone of the abject is characterized by complex global flows that operate as shadow globalization. The abject within shadow globalization are not excluded, or outside globalization. On the contrary, globalization is what affects them, but, instead of new possibilities, globalization represents itself in terms of new constraints and boundaries. The abject also engage in globalization, but from the shadows. Whereas globalization, for the subjects, can be about the possibility to engage in global flows as an absent body, for the abject, globalization means corporeal constraints.

In Chapter 3, I aligned the landscapes of ethnoscaples, technoscaples, financescaples, ideoscaples and mediascaples with their corresponding sexscapes of globalization. From this framework, I wanted to show how the global sex industry benefits and uses the same currents of globalization that form the landscapes of globalization, but from the shadows. I wanted to show how globalization enables the operation and growth of the global sex industry and also how illegal and legal forms of the sex trade work together.

I have shown how the global sex industry requires the bodies of ethnic other women, who travel and are trafficked across borders and across continents. The women from post-Soviet countries, trafficked for purposes of prostitution to Europe and the United States, are seen as being naturally erotic, subservient and truly feminine. I am not saying that these women from post-Soviet countries are naturally more erotic and feminine than Western women. Instead, this position of the exotic and erotic Russian woman is a product of the Western imagination. This position of the erotic Russian woman, who in Finland is also named the "Eastern girl," can be seen as a site, or a position that a person who is both from "the East" and "a woman" can come to occupy, which has become possible through the processes of globalization. These women form the abject bodies against which the domain of the subject of globalization is reiterated and reinforced. Yet, I argue that this position of the abject woman is also a matter of performativity. Therefore, appropriating this position of the exotic other woman in the West is not only a possibility, but a necessity.

I have argued that in the sex trade globalization is embodied. I see these embodied positions in the global sex industry also reflecting what globalization is. In other words, not only is globalization, at the individual level, prostitution, but prostitution is also globalization at a general level. In other words, I see globalization concretizing at the level of the abject woman's body as a necessity for prostitution and for the man as a possibility to buy sexual services and to have access to the other woman's body. These corporeal enactments of globalization reveal how the possibilities of agency vary according to sex and ethnicity and how globalization is gendered.

I have argued that the position of the abject is a necessary condition for the subject. According to this argument, the subjects must sustain the category of the the abject in order to maintain their own existence. The body of the prostitute, the abject woman, represents the "uninhabitable and unlivable" spaces, which, in Butler's words, are still "densely populated" (Butler 1993: 3). The prostitutes remind the subjects of the risk of death and loss of their position of subjectivity and social recognition. The clients of prostitutes can in one sense play with this boundary between the domain of the subject and the abject. They can enact their own subjectivity by entering the zone and body of the abject and then return "home" to the domain of globalized subjects. Yet, the abject women do not enjoy such possibilities of transcending their abjection, but are constrained by the concrete walls of the brothels, client's homes and the physical distances they have traveled. The women are also constrained by their traffickers and managers. The clients do not face such concrete and physical constraints.

Globalization as bio-power has acted on these bodies and formed them as subjects, but it also activates these bodies into being. Therefore, these bodies also enact and reiterate globalization and thus give it also different meanings and expressions. I want to emphasize once more that subjectivation is not simply about closure, but it enables the reiteration of power in different ways. Still, the position of the abject is more constrained and controlled than the position of the subject. For the abject, there is also space, albeit constrained, to reiterate her position, give it meanings and use it for different ends.

This appropriation and enactment of the position of the abject is exemplified in the last three chapters in which I have written narratives of corporeal globalization as enacted in the spaces of sex bars in Helsinki and Tampere and in the area of northern Finland. These spaces represent global conjunctures, which open space for new kinds of subject and abject positions.

In the narratives that I have constructed from my fieldwork in Helsinki and Tampere and in Lapland in Ivalo and Utsjoki, I have wanted to write how globalization is incorporated by the subjects and the abject and what is "done with it." I have written how the prostitutes in the sex bars of Helsinki characterize their position as that of a "businesswoman" incorporating the language of the market and how they negotiate with their clients so that they can increase their earnings with drunken clients. However, I have also openly written about the constraints caused by the government of Finland, in the form of regulatory measures against foreign prostitution in Finland that have caused women to take

more risky clients and slip in safe sex practices, as they fear deportation and at the same time try to make as much money as possible in the time available to them. In this way, I see the government responses resulting in corporeal politics. Also, I have written in the context of Helsinki about the shadow neighborliness formed in the secret apartments in which women are locked in and which the clients find with the help of phone operators working for Estonian crime syndicates, exemplifying the operation of shadow ethnoscares and technoscares. The operation of the shadow finanscape is exemplified by the concrete smuggling of the profits in freight traffic from Helsinki to Estonia. The shadow ideoscares have to do with the legitimation of the use of foreign prostitutes on the basis of libertarian discourses on the right to buy and express personal freedom through consumption. The shadow sex-mediascape is represented for example by the operation of internet sites that offer information on how to find prostitution in Helsinki or even providing the clients with phone numbers of “sure dates.”

In the narratives concerning foreign prostitution in Lapland, I have discussed the possibility of marriage as a means by which the boundary between the domain of subjects and objects could be transcended. The possibilities and necessities of agency of subjects and objects is exemplified by the fictive narrative on a “marriage deal across borders.” In that narrative, I have written about the positions and means of agency that have become available through the processes of globalization in that region and which concretized at the moment when the brothels were closed. The women who came into the brothels (on the Norwegian side) to prostitute needed to find new ways to enter the West. Then marriage with a local man could be seen as one possibility for escape from the challenges imposed by globalization. In that chapter, I conclude that it is however the woman’s body that provides the escape. Having a woman’s body opens the possibility of entering the West to sell sexual services. It is also the woman’s body that opens the possibility for marriage. The local women do not save men from Russia through marriage. But once more I want to remind that the sexual labor in which the woman engages is a matter of performativity; it is her only available option, but it is available for her because of her sex and ethnicity. Nevertheless, this position may also be useful. The woman may be seeking to marry a man in Lapland in order to gain access to Finland so that, after receiving a residence permit, she can start her life over. Yet, because of her ethnicity, she will be nonetheless associated with prostitution. As I have written in the context of prostitution in Lapland, a Russian woman means *a whore*; therefore, a Russian woman, even if she does not engage in prostitution, is assigned that position and this is difficult for her to undo.

This erotization of the Russian woman is not simply something that takes place in northern Finland, but sex work or prostitution is seen as natural for the “Eastern girls” generally in Finland. This is also the way in which the women who work in Finland as erotic dancers are seen. In Chapter 6, I have discussed the position of the erotic dancers in Finland as also belonging to the sphere of shadow globalization. These women come mainly from the Baltic states and most of the women I have talked to have been Russian–Estonian. In the erotic

bars, there are hardly ever Finnish women dancing. The foreign women who work as erotic dancers are not seen by the clients as doing work, but rather doing erotic dancing because they *are* sexy. In the sex bars, part of the women's work is entertaining the clients, listening to them as they talk about their lives and their problems. The dancers also perform the clients' erotic fantasies in the couple of square meters of the private room, in which the man can also touch the dancer's body according to the agreed price. In this way, the position of the foreign erotic dancer is formed as a body that listens, who says to the man only the things he expects to hear and who enacts his fantasies in the private room and on stage. I see her position as a mirror woman, as a surface upon which the client can gaze at himself. In this way, the position of the erotic dancer is also that of an abject or specular woman in Irigaray's terms. It enables the man to form his own subjectivity on the surface of the dancer. The way in which the dancers talk about the clients can also be used as a means by which to describe the domain of the subjects from the position of abjects. However, I also characterize the position of the erotic dancers as nomads, since it is characteristic of their work that they travel constantly working in different towns and bars in Finland, Norway and Iceland. In my framework I see this constant movement and the actual erotic dancing as an adaptation to globalization and also as a way of reiterating the complex global flows at the level of the body.

As I have done my research as a form of ethnography and thus engaged in field research, I have also had to address the issue of how my own position in the field has affected what I see and how "it" (the field) and the people I interact with affect me. I have chosen to write my own position openly in the text in order to show how my own subjectivity is formed in relation to the field and also how the interaction in the field with the "research objects" affect my research outcomes. My research has been about researching "the silent point of globalization." In the field I have not been able to write notes, or even carry a notepad in the open. I have entered spaces in which there are no places for researchers to sit, let alone, for that matter, for any woman other than prostitutes. I have not been able to take a tape recorder, nor would the women I have talked to ever been able or willing to talk to a recorder. For them, it would have posed too many risks that are known to exist in organized prostitution. In this way my research has been done in the sphere of shadow globalization, where I cannot follow the procedures of standard qualitative research. I wrote my notes the day after, trying to recall and record all the events and conversations that had taken place the night before and also my own reactions. From this research "in the shadow," I have constructed my narratives that are read by those who belong to the domain of subjects. I feel indebted to the women I have had the chance to interact with in the spaces in which they have to exist in Finland as erotic other women. I feel I have a responsibility toward them in terms of how I write about them. I want to represent them as well as I can, without reinforcing their position as "Eastern girls" in Finland, but allowing for all the complexities of their position and experiences to come through in the constructed narratives.

As these women are seen as embodying the position of abjects, positioned as

silenced others, who reflect the position of subjectivity of the clients through their erotic labor, I have wanted to write narratives that try to overcome this binary. So that the women positioned as “Eastern girls” could also be also seen from between the binary oppositions of subjects and abjects. With the use of plural narratives and speaking positions, I have also wanted to avoid closure and simplistic representation of the women and the events that have taken place. With the different narratives, I have wanted to underline how different perspectives and positions guide the way in which the narrative is formed, and thus each narrative by itself is not conclusive.

For these reasons also, I have wanted to write texts that the reader can feel. The aim has been to bring the reader close to the events and places where the sex trade takes place so that the reader cannot remain in the position of a distanced and neutral bystander, the way in which the logico-scientific narratives would allow, but instead engage with the text and acknowledge the corporealities and complexities in investigating shadow globalization.

# Notes

## 1 Introduction: the silent point of globalization

- 1 Here I am referring to Luce Irigaray's (1985: 198–204) account of pornography, in which women perform as objects of masculine desire in such a way that they seem to take pleasure in it. In this enactment the rightness of phallic sex is confirmed, as the women simulate penetrative sex as a source of their pleasure. Irigaray argues that feminine eroticism would not emphasize penetration. I also want to raise a point by Rosi Braidotti (1994: 68–69) on pornography, which is that explicitly showing male and female genitals interpenetrating each other and claiming “this is sexual pleasure” is the same manner by which science making things visible to the eye can claim their true origin. Braidotti calls this cannibalistic eye of visual culture, which misinterprets the visible for true meaning, whereas the image is only that which meets the eye, and not “everything.”
- 2 Irigaray emphasizes that the subject can only be masculine, whereas the feminine is the other of masculine. The feminine/other can establish her position through addressing “you” that is the one through which subjectivity is determined.
- 3 Therborn (2000) also develops an account of globalization happening in waves of globalization and deglobalization as well as surges of globalization, which can be exemplified for example by the processes of democratization after the Second World War and the creation of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.
- 4 See, e.g., Gill and Mittelman (1997), Axtman (1998), Gill (1997a, 1997b), Cox (1997) for post-Cramscian criticism of neoliberal global politics.
- 5 See Cerny (1996, 2000a, 2000b) for an extensive analysis of globalization as a form of competition economics.
- 6 See, e.g., Hirst (1997), Hirst and Thompson (1996) for a discussion on the role of the state in generating globalization.
- 7 Therborn (2000) and Evans (2000) discuss in detail how the problematics involved in the human rights discourse connected with the ideology of free trade. See also Albrow (1996) for a discussion on globalization in relation to this.
- 8 See also Baudrillard (1988) for an analysis of postmodernism and consumer culture.
- 9 See also Goverde *et al.* (2000) for an analysis of globalization from multiple perspectives, also seen as globalizations.
- 10 See Pettman (1996) and Enloe (1988, 1993) for examples of standpoint feminism in IR and Sylvester (1994, 2002) for postmodern feminism in IR; see also Zalewski and Parpart (1998), and for postcolonial feminism see, e.g., Mohanty (1994).
- 11 For example, Bakker (1997, 1999) and especially Harding (1991).
- 12 Enloe's book *Bananas, Beach and Bases*, published in 1988, is a classic text of standpoint feminist IR; it covers areas from tourism, prostitution on military bases to global production and manufacture.
- 13 Meyer and Prügl (1999) deal in detail with the issue on means and methods for global

gender movements and also emphasize discussing gender and not simply women's oppression.

- 14 For this reason, I want to steer clear of the fervent debate that revolves around defining "Trafficking in Women." I want to offer an analysis of the global sex industry so that both the illegal and legal forms that enable prostitution are taken into account. The concept of trafficking takes the analysis easily toward addressing only the illegal sex industry and toward differentiation between forced and voluntary prostitution. I see the position of the prostitute as a result of bio-power as a possible space of agency in the context of globalization – discussed in more detail in the following chapters.
- 15 Foucault, quoted in Richardson (1997: 58).

## 2 Bio-power and subjectivation in the globalized world economy of sex

- 1 There is an ongoing debate as to how the issue of trafficking in women can be defined – whether it should be defined with or without reference to prostitution. Feminist NGO's also share this battleground being roughly divided into pro-prostitution and against prostitution movements. Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW) wants to make a distinction between forced and voluntary prostitution. The Coalition Against Trafficking in Women, on the other hand, sees trafficking in women as a form of violence toward all women, and claims there should not be a distinction between forced and voluntary forms of trafficking (Jeffreys 1997). An important factor in these debates has been raised by pro-prostitution movements, who criticize the representation of Asian prostitutes as victims of trafficking, implying that western prostitutes are rational sex workers (Pettman 1997). Pettman argues that this shows how woman's bodies have become battlegrounds over definition and appropriation, which also different feminist groups fight over (see also Wijers 1998).
- 2 The subjectivity of an erotic dancer is discussed also in Frank (2000), who uses fiction to elaborate and analyze the experience of erotic dancing, and in Ronai (1992), who uses self-reflexive narratives, writing autoethnography of erotic dancing. Both avoid discussing prostitution politics.
- 3 I am using here subjectivation as a term, which is a translation of Foucault's French term *assujétissement* (see Butler 1997: 90–91). This means both the process of subjection as subordination and becoming a subject as agent. It is important that both these elements are always present, when one "turns" herself into a subject.
- 4 For extensive debate on the sex industry, see Specter (2006). This book combines discussion of both prostitution and pornography from the perspective of feminist theory.
- 5 See Haugaard (2006) for a discussion on the hegemonic and counter-hegemonic discourses.
- 6 See discussion in Chapkis (1997) on the dividing practices involved in the pro-sex work debate.
- 7 These policies are examples of deportation on the basis of suspicion of involvement in commercial sex in Finland or criminalization of demand in Sweden (Gould 2002).
- 8 In my use of the term "object" I rely on Judith Butler's conceptualization of the social object (as in Butler 1993). Therefore, I do not address the discussion on the object in childhood development in learning to control bodily excrements. However, the agency of the object is also seen arising from the disruptive quality. Whereas the bodily waste may disrupt the idea of the coherent body as dirt that is danger, in my work the social object disrupts the order of coherent domain of subjects. As such the object is not literally seen as "shit," only metaphorically.
- 9 See also Foucault (1997: 51–57) for a discussion of the role of "the Abnormals."
- 10 In *Discipline and Punish* (1977), Foucault discusses different historically specific imaginary ideals about the body and the condition involved in the change of these ideals. These involve the production of docile bodies through timetables, confinement

- and enclosure, correlation of body and gesture and so on, which were used in schools, factories and prisons.
- 11 Runyan makes reference to “Draft Regional Platform for Action: Women in Changing World – Call for Action in ECE Perspective” (4 October 1994). The Economic Commission for Europe (ECE) includes 54 countries including United States and Canada, western European countries (including Turkey), the countries of the former Soviet Bloc, referred to as 24 economies in transition.
  - 12 Runyan (1999) lists several feminist NGO’s working to provide alternative accounts of neoliberal policies on women. These are Network Women in Development Europe in Brussels (WIDE), Alternative Women in Development Washington, DC (Alt-WID), National Action Committee on the Status of Women (NAC) in Toronto, Canada and Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women (CRIAOW) in Halifax, Canada.
  - 13 See the extensive discussion on gendered effects of neoliberal globalization in *Canadian Woman Studies* (2002) and *Women, Globalization and International Trade* Vol. 21/22, and also Wichterich (2002).
  - 14 See also “Economic Reforms, Women’s Employment and Social Policies,” *World Development Studies* 4, 1995.
  - 15 See Stiglitz (2004) for a detailed analysis of the negative impacts of neoliberalism on people, especially women in post-Soviet countries.
  - 16 Angeles (2002) writes how many women still remain in the rural areas and are forgotten when feminist studies focus on women’s position as the cheap labor working sweatshops and maquiladoras.
  - 17 See also O’Connell (1998) for an extensive discussion of men’s prostitute use and the expression of masculinity.
  - 18 The Commission of Global Governance conceptualizes *Our Global Neighborhood* (1995), which can be seen as constructing the boundaries of the domain of subjectivity and thus possible lived spaces. It shows what the “art of living” according to neoliberalist ideology would mean and speaks the language of “global values” and neighborhood ethics of the “global village.” The report is clear on neoliberal principles and practices as the means to sustainable development by emphasizing market force governance as the means by which the standard of living could be raised globally. It is explicit that this adherence to the market is the means by which humankind develops and by which also basic individual rights can be promoted. However, problems arise with defining those who belong to the global village and those who are seen as “strangers” to it (Baxi 1996). To whom does “humankind” refer? What are the boundaries and limits of the global neighborhood, and how can those “outside” be included, or is that even the objective?

### 3 Sexscapes of globalization: constructions of subject and object positions in landscapes of globalization

- 1 This an advertisement phrase found at [www.allaescort.com](http://www.allaescort.com), which is an Internet site that provides contact details of women in sex work all over the world. Accessed 10 November 2006.
- 2 Naming the global sex industry as the *sexscape* of globalization was originally Prof. Tarja Väyrynen’s idea, Director of Tampere Peace Research Institute, Finland.
- 3 Appadurai (2001) has discussed the tension of intense local manifestations of problems that are tied to global context in and the challenges it poses for social science research.
- 4 Appadurai follows Anderson’s thesis on *Imagined Communities* and extends this to the context of globalization.
- 5 See U.S. Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report* (2003).
- 6 These data are in Kvinnoforum Report (2002) and derived from *IOM Quarterly Bulletin* No. 23, 2001.

- 7 These aspects of the individual agency of the “international prostitute” or “trafficked women” are taken up in Chapters 4–6 in the context of Finland.
- 8 Konrad (2002: 264) writes that there are well-known trafficking routes, such as through the Balkans to the EU, the “Eastern route” through Poland to EU, the “central route” from central European states leading via Croatia and Slovenia into the EU and another route via Turkey, Bulgaria or Romania to Albania then into Italy and the EU. There is also a Mediterranean or “Southern” route from Africa via North Africa into Spain, Portugal, Italy and Greece.
- 9 In the Kvinnoforum Report (2002) report, there are country-specific details of origin, transit and destination countries as well as estimates of the number of women trafficked and received in different countries.
- 10 See O’Connell (1998) and Hughes (2000) for how men seek, especially, prostitutes who represent another ethnicity to their own.
- 11 This point comes through quite often in communication with women whose communities are affected visibly by trafficking in women. This may also represent the attitude of the Finnish prostitutes, as they may see their profession threatened by the lower prices that Russian prostitutes demand (Reet Nurmi, personal communication, 2001).
- 12 Bauman (1998: 89) also discusses how illegal immigrants pay exorbitant sums of money for their trafficking to the Western countries.
- 13 On these Web sites, one can find details of women who can be ordered, including details on their height, weight, education and hobbies (Hughes 1996, 1997). There are also Web sites maintained by clients themselves, where they engage in sharing information on their experience with prostitutes and offer advice on services, bargaining with prices and the like. Such Web sites are, for example, [www.worldsexguide.com](http://www.worldsexguide.com) and [www.allaescort.com](http://www.allaescort.com). For a mail-order-bride catalog on the Internet, see [www.getmarriednow.com](http://www.getmarriednow.com).
- 14 See Kvinnoforum Report (2002: 5). Sassen (2000) presents an estimate by the UN that the profits generated from trafficking amount to US\$4 billion in 1998.
- 15 See, for more figures, *A Resource Book for Working Against Trafficking in Women and Girls* (2002) and also the Web sites of the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women (CATW) and the Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW).
- 16 See also GSN Report (1997) for examples of corruption in post-Soviet countries.
- 17 This point comes through from most of the interviews with sex workers that I have conducted; also in the hearing documents where women have been heard as witnesses they most often refer to themselves as “businesswomen.” I will develop this further in the next chapter. See discussion in Chapkis (1997).
- 18 For example, in [www.worldsexguide.com](http://www.worldsexguide.com), there was a discussion on how to buy a prostitute discreetly in Stockholm, following the legislation that criminalizes the demand of sexual services came into force.
- 19 Personal communication (25 November 2000) with Annukka Aikio, leader of DUOVVI, an association for violence against women and prostitution in northern Finland, Norway and Russia.
- 20 This point is to exemplify the functioning of globalization and not to simplify or universalize prostitutes, or their experience of prostitution.
- 21 See discussion on sex tourism in O’Connell (1998).
- 22 See Bauman (1998) for a discussion of “tourists” and “vagabonds” as a relation similar to “ego” and “alter,” constituting each other in the global village.
- 23 By the woman who the prostitute is differentiated from I am referring to the good woman, the wife and mother of the client’s own nationality. It has been argued in many occasions (see, e.g., O’Connell 1998) that the differentiation between good woman and loose woman is essential in how clients justify their prostitute use, which is also an important aspect of the erotization of buying sexual services.
- 24 See GSN Report (1997).

- 25 Although black and Asian prostitutes belong to this “lower” end in many European countries, in Finland the relationship is different. In Finland, the majority of the foreign prostitutes are Russian, yet as a novelty to the market there are as few as four or five African women working in the same nightclubs in Helsinki, who seem to be in a better position, as they represent a minority and “new” ethnicity to the sex market. This information is based on interviews with Seastar project workers in Helsinki, 8 and 22 October 1999.
- 26 See Lantz (1999) on the ambivalence of prostitute use.
- 27 See Gaffney and Beverley (2001) and also Rickard (2001).
- 28 See discussion on dissociation of the body by the prostitutes in Jeffreys (1997: 271–274) and, in relation to time, Brewis and Linstead (2000).
- 29 Sassen calls this process “feminization of survival” (2000).
- 30 O’Connell (1998: 133–134, 209) argues that prostitutes can be seen as “socially dead”; they represent the legal and social “other” as they are not granted the same rights or status as “normal” people in society. This is because women engaging in prostitution are seen as immoral and are also treated differently within the local community and by legal authorities. She argues that clients do not see themselves exploiting women when they buy services from a prostitute, since the prostitutes are seen as socially dead. This can be established by the commercial transaction in the sexual encounter. In other words, male clients pay for sexual services from a person who is not a person (O’Connell 1998: 134).
- 31 Here I am referring to the Foreigner Act, which came into force in Finland in May 1999, by which non-EU prostitution is criminalized. This measure was taken especially to fight Russian organized crime. This is taken up also in the following chapter.
- 32 This point comes across clearly in the GSN Report (1997) *Crime and Servitude*, which shows that even South American women are marketed as Russian, since most profit lies now in trafficking Russian women.

#### **4 Narratives of embodied globalization of Russian prostitutes working in the erotic clubs in Helsinki: reflections on one night in Helsinki from the position of a whore, a client and a researcher**

- 1 For the main part, the interviews were done in erotic clubs in Tampere, but some interviews were done also in Rovaniemi in northern Finland. The dancers tour Finland, working in several different cities before continuing to Norway and Iceland. These aspects will be explored in more detail in Chapter 6.
- 2 I have interviewed police officers in Tampere and Ivalo, Finland
- 3 The Border Guard Authority at Rajajooseppi, Ivalo, has been an important source for information on trafficking in northern Finland and Norway.
- 4 See Leskinen (2002).
- 5 This story is mainly based on notes from fieldwork in a nightclub in which Russian women came to solicit clients. This place has been recently closed. The fieldwork took place on 4 February 2001 and 24 March 2001. Information and stories that are from other notes and sources are listed separately.
- 6 Notes on fieldwork, 24 March 2001, Helsinki.
- 7 Ibid. This encounter took place late in the night in one sex bar in Helsinki.
- 8 Malarek (2003) disagrees with this point, and there has been a case in 2006 in which a disabled woman was sold sexually against her will in Helsinki. Malarek sees the control exercised by criminal syndicates resulting in conditions that resemble forced prostitution.
- 9 The issue of forced prostitution is not crucial in this work. However, in the public debate the issue is always of concern, since the debate involves questions of methods necessary to combat organized crime involved in prostitution. The central criminal police especially stress this.

- 10 The regulation of prostitution is based on the Finnish Penal Code §20:9 that criminalizes procuring and §20:6–7 that criminalizes the sexual exploitation of children (Lehti and Aromaa 2002: 3).
- 11 In an amendment to the Foreigner Act in 1999, the selling of sexual services was added to §37 as a grounds for deportation.
- 12 Since 1 October 2006, buying sexual services from someone who has been forced into prostitution or who prostitutes under the control of organized criminal syndicates or pimps has been criminalized. See [www.finlex.fi/fi/uutiset/?id=72](http://www.finlex.fi/fi/uutiset/?id=72), accessed 15 November 2006.
- 13 Some of these bars in Helsinki and Tampere have been closed.
- 14 The striptease performers do not engage in prostitution, although they do offer private shows in which the customers are allowed to masturbate.
- 15 Communication with Seastar project workers Merle Hani and Maire Henno (interviews on 8 and 22 October 1999).
- 16 [www.worldsexguide.org/Helsinki.txt.html](http://www.worldsexguide.org/Helsinki.txt.html), accessed 17 September 2001. This Web site is still in operation and field reports have been updated; [www.punternet.com](http://www.punternet.com) (accessed 17 September 2001) also offered detailed information.
- 17 There are also translations available for basic vocabulary in Finnish needed to negotiate with a prostitute and advice on how to read prostitution ads in local newspapers. [www.worldsexguide.org/Helsinki.txt.html](http://www.worldsexguide.org/Helsinki.txt.html), accessed 17 September 2001. See discussion on men sharing their experiences of prostitutes on the Internet in Bishop and Robinson (2002).
- 18 [www.sihteeriopisto.net](http://www.sihteeriopisto.net), accessed 10 November 2006. Since advertising of sexual services was criminalized in Finland in summer 2004, the operation of this Web site was transferred abroad.
- 19 *Helsingin Sanomat*, 17 June 2001.
- 20 The operator was most often either a Finnish prostitute or an Estonian prostitute who could speak Finnish adequately (Leskinen 2002: 22). As the women working in the apartments could not speak Finnish (*ibid.*) the use of the operator secured the inflow of customers and the women could avoid the difficulty of soliciting clients with a foreign language.
- 21 Local newspapers in Finland that have published the advertisements of foreign prostitutes also benefited from the sexual labor indirectly as they sell the advertisement space in the paper. Publishing such advertisements was criminalized on 1 August 2004, HE34/2004. [www.finlex.fi/fi/esitykset/he/2004/20040034](http://www.finlex.fi/fi/esitykset/he/2004/20040034), accessed 15 November 2006. After the Central Criminal Police uncovered that the organized criminal networks used local newspapers as a means of advertising the prostitutes services, many newspapers stopped publishing the advertisements even before changes in legislation. Nonetheless, these advertisements of foreign women were published together with the advertisements of Finnish female and male prostitutes and were placed close to the array of other legal sexual services, such as phone-sex advertisements, sex shop and erotic bar advertisements. This shows the blurry boundary between profit made from the illegal and legal sex business and the co-existence of foreign (illegal) sex business/prostitutes with Finnish (independent) sex business/prostitutes. For a detailed study of the advertising of sexual services in Finnish daily newspapers, see Laukkanen (2000).
- 22 In April 2004, the national news reported that Finnish corporations paid for their employees trips to brothels in Tallinn (Malarek 2003: 283).
- 23 Näre and Lähteenmaa (1994, 1995) write that some sex bars refused entry to female customers.
- 24 Personal communication with Seastar workers Maire Henno and Merle Hani (10 September 1999).
- 25 Personal communication with Seastar workers Maire Henno and Merle Hani (10 September 1999).

- 26 This information refers to the situation in Helsinki, where prostitutes have been seen operating relatively independently. See also Lehti and Aromaa (2002).
- 27 See the discussion in Lehti and Aromaa (2002) on the working conditions and control of prostitutes after the new legislation came into force.
- 28 Notes on fieldwork, 24 March 2001, Helsinki.
- 29 Ibid.; see also notes on fieldwork, 4 February 2000, Helsinki.
- 30 Notes on fieldwork, 4 February 2000, Helsinki.
- 31 This information comes through also from conversations with Baltic erotic dancers and notes from various fieldwork in Tampere. Also, researcher Reet Nurmi, in the project "Prevention of Violence against Women and Prostitution" carried out by the National Research and Development Centre for Welfare and Health (STAKES), confirms this point; personal communication, 23 March 2001.
- 32 Notes on fieldwork, 4 February 2000, Helsinki.
- 33 Notes on fieldwork, 24 March 2001. According to these women, in these bars, men do come to look for women to marry. Women may be inclined to marry in order to gain residence permit in Finland. Many of these marriages are fake.
- 34 Notes on fieldwork, 24 March 2001, Helsinki, in a striptease club.
- 35 *Helsingin Sanomat*, 17 June 2001. Also, personal communication with Reet Nurmi, 23 March 2001.
- 36 Notes on 4 February 2000 and 24 March 2001 in two different sex bars.
- 37 Notes on 4 February 2000 in two different sex bars in Helsinki.
- 38 Same as above in one of the places.
- 39 Notes on 24 March 2001 in Helsinki.
- 40 Same as above. Also, the Seastar workers Maire Henno and Merle Hani talk about women's dismay at the Finnish police (interviews in October 1999).
- 41 Notes on 24 March 2001 in Helsinki.
- 42 This story is based on the fieldwork in two striptease clubs on 24 March 2001 in Helsinki. Other sources of information used in the story are included separately.
- 43 Personal communication with Reet Nurmi, 23 March 2001.
- 44 Ibid.; notes on 4 February 2001. Also interviews with Maire Henno and Merle Hani on 8 and 22 October 1999.
- 45 Notes on fieldwork in Tampere 17 May 2001.
- 46 *Helsingin Sanomat*, 17 June 2001.
- 47 See discussion in Butler (1990).
- 48 See discussion on feminine and masculine time in the interaction of male clients and female prostitutes in Brewis and Linstead (2000).

## **5 Sounds of silence in Lapland: narratives of trafficking in women across Finnish-Russian and Norwegian borders**

- 1 This first section is based on the field notes on the Ivalo fieldwork trip on 23 November 2000 and 31 May 2001.
- 2 Interview with Lieutenant Colonel Uljas Turunen. Border Guard Authority, Rajajooseppi, Ivalo.
- 3 100 FIM is approximately €16.5; 20 FIM is approximately €3.5.
- 4 There was also a camping site "Kapernaum" in Keminaa where these women stayed for weekends, and customers picked up the women to take to their private homes. "Laajamittainen naiskauppa jatkuu vilkkaana Keminaassa" (Large-scale trafficking in women continues in Keminaa), *Helsingin Sanomat*, 29 July 2003. This place has since been closed.
- 5 See Snellman (2001).
- 6 In 2000, the unemployment rate of women increased and was up to 61 percent; this concerns 23,000 women in the Murmansk region. Also, in the Murmansk region, overall, there are more women than men (Vertinskaya 2000).

- 7 Red meat refers to the red meat of salmon, which tourists come to fish.
- 8 Interviews with police officers in Ivalo, 23 November 2000, and the Border Guard Authority, 31 May 2001.
- 9 Information from locals in Utsjoki, 1 June 2001. See study on different forms of sex work, including temporary wives in the Caribbean Kempadoo (2001).
- 10 Personal communication with Kari Vuorinen, Ministry For Foreign Affairs, 17 September 2003.
- 11 Information from locals, 1 June 2001, in Utsjoki.
- 12 These kinds of double relationships take place across the eastern border. "Unelmien prinssi, josta tuli painajainen" (The dream prince, who turned into a nightmare), *Helsingin Sanomat*, 5 August 2001. In this article, several Russian women from Viborg were interviewed, who had been involved with Finnish men.
- 13 Personal communication with Lieutenant Colonel Uljas Turunen, Ivalo Border Guard Authority, 31 May 2001.
- 14 Personal communication with locals in Utsjoki, 1 June 2001.
- 15 Information from police officers in Ivalo, 23 November 2000.
- 16 The Central Criminal Police estimates the number of women coming to Lapland to be approximately 50–80 during summer 2002 (Leskinen 2002: 14).
- 17 Personal communication with Kari Vuorinen Ministry for Foreign Affairs, 17 September 2003.
- 18 See Vertinskaya (2000).
- 19 In Ivalo, there were buses of women that would come to trade in sex, but also in souvenirs.
- 20 The longest open prostitution operated in Keminmaa. "Laajamittainen naiskauppa jatkuu vilkkaana Keminmaassa" (Large-scale trafficking in women continues in Keminmaa), *Helsingin Sanomat*, 29 July 2003.
- 21 Field notes on 23 November 2000.
- 22 The police measures resulted in the movement of women to seek new locations from which to seek clients. After the police had taken measures to tackle prostitution of women from the Murmansk region in Inari, Ivalo, and Rovaniemi, the women were found traveling further down south to the Tornio region to prostitute. *Pohjolan Sanomat*, 22 November 2000.
- 23 *Helsingin Sanomat*, 12 November 2002 "Jari Vilén: Hallituksen puuttettava seksikauppaan: Venäläisten ilotyttöjen asiakkaita suuri osa tulee Ruotsista Suomeen" (Jari Vilén: the government must tackle the sex business: the majority of clients of Russian prostitutes come from Sweden).
- 24 The police officers refer to this phrase in their discussion of the prostitution scene, personal communication, 23 November 2000.
- 25 Personal communication with locals, Utsjoki, 25 November 2001. The clients have been expected to also continue as clients. If not, they might have been forced to pay for not having to be involved.
- 26 This refers to the division of Finland by Russian and Estonian criminal networks, into different regions in which they conduct their activities (Leskinen 2002).
- 27 Border Guard Authority in Ivalo 31 May 2001.
- 28 Personal communication with Kari Vuorinen Ministry for Foreign Affairs, 17 September 2003.
- 29 Ibid.
- 30 Fieldwork with Arseniy Svynarenko, 23 November 2000.
- 31 Personal communication with locals in Utsjoki, 1 June 2001. Travel can be also arranged by local travel agents who specialize in this kind of travel arrangements (Lehti and Aromaa 2002: 55)
- 32 Field notes on 23 November 2000 with Arseniy Svynarenko.
- 33 In Finnish written with a slight spelling error (double consonant missing); "pilu, vitu 50," translates to cunt.

- 34 Interviews with police officers in Ivalo, 23 November 2000.
- 35 Ibid.
- 36 “Wild” refers to independent prostitutes who do not work under the control of criminal organizations.
- 37 Field notes on 31 May 2001.
- 38 “Whorebus” is an expression used by the locals in northern Finland.
- 39 Personal communication with Annukka Aikio from Duovvi organization, 21 November 2000.
- 40 Ibid.
- 41 Interview on 31 May 2001.
- 42 Personal communication with locals in Utsjoki, November 2000 and June 2001. In Utsjoki the members of the Duovvi organization have been better able to track the flows of information.
- 43 See Vertinskaya (2000).
- 44 Personal communication with Annukka Aikio and other members of Duovvi organization, 25 November 2000.
- 45 Personal communication with Luobov Vertinskaya from Murmansk, who is a legal advisor at the crisis center “Priyut” in Murmansk, meeting at a conference on trafficking in women in Stockholm, January 2001.
- 46 Personal communication with Aslak Pieski through e-mail and a meeting on 1 June 2000.
- 47 Ibid.
- 48 Personal communication with Annukka Aikio, 25 November 2000. See also Snellman (2001).
- 49 Ibid.
- 50 This story stems from my field research on prostitution and trafficking in Russian women in northern Finland. The story is based on an interview with the Finnish-Saami man, in which he told me of his involvement with organized prostitution in the region and explained his actions. The meetings took place on 1 June and 24 November 2001. This story has been published before in 2003 in *Canadian Woman Studies/les Cahiers de la femme*, Vol. 22, No. 3, 4.
- 51 Trafficking takes place from Murmansk across the Norwegian border to towns such as Tana and the border region between Norway and Finland where Norwegian, Norwegian-Saami, Finnish, Finnish-Saami and also tourist men would go. At the busiest time there were two buses in which 80 women could fit, and also 300–400 liters of vodka and Russian champagne. Just to compare these quantities, it has to be recognized that in the community of Utsjoki there are approximately 1,500 inhabitants. The first stopover of the buses used to be a motel in Tana, from which locals would pick up the women. The rest would continue to the camping sites.
- 52 The camping sites were closed on the grounds of risk of contagious disease. The proprietors were later jailed and charged for procuring Russian prostitutes. The charges were dropped in 2003 due to lack of evidence.
- 53 As already noted, this red meat refers to salmon, which also attracts many tourists to come fishing in the region.
- 54 This is a translation of a direct quote of his words during the interview on 1 June 2001.
- 55 A comment on the situation by a friend.
- 56 I am referring here to the Duovvi organization.
- 57 In Norway, residence permit is gained after three years of marriage (Haaland 1998). In Finland two years of marriage are required.
- 58 Personal communication with local doctor Aino Snellman, 25 November 2000, Utsjoki.
- 59 There were altogether three demonstrations in the winter of 1999.
- 60 Notes on the meeting with members of Duovvi organization, 25 November 2001, who had organized the demonstration.

- 61 Personal communication with Maaret Länsman, 24 November 2000.
- 62 The demonstration was shown on *Silminäkijä* on TV 2 in the spring of 1999.
- 63 See also Haaland (1998) and Snellman (2001).
- 64 Personal communication with Aslak Pieski, 1 June 2001, Utsjoki.
- 65 I make here a generalization based on various different routes of traffic of women from Russian, Eastern Europe, Southeast Asia and Africa to Western Europe and the United States, although I am aware that trafficking to Japan is as important as is trafficking between Nepal and India, where Indian men are indeed clients, and as such these clients do not fit the definition of “Western” unproblematically. Also, Saami ethnicity is seen as Other to Finnish identity in the past. Yet, in relation to the Russian woman, this Saami identity is constructed as superior.

**6 “The land of perverts”: the domain of subjectivity from the position of an object to the global village; narratives of foreign erotic dancers in Finland**

- 1 In this chapter, I call the dancers “girls,” for that is what women working as erotic dancers are referred to in general, in terms of the sex trade, implying that erotic dancing could not be done by women. I do not imply that the “girls” are really *girls*, meaning minors.
- 2 The narratives in this chapter are constructed from the field notes on fieldwork in a number of sex bars in Tampere and Rovaniemi. Information from other sources is separately specified. Also, the particular field notes are specified when relevant.
- 3 This was done by the Helsinki Employment Agency, which deals with applications for work permits for foreigners.
- 4 Personal communication with Tuula Karvonen (Helsinki Employment Agency), who has dealt with applications for work permit for erotic dancers since the early 1990s.
- 5 Notes on fieldwork 17 May 2001.
- 6 Field notes on 14 March 2001.
- 7 The Baltic erotic dancers often tell me how Finnish dancers are respected and not sexually harassed. Finnish dancers are seen as working as an erotic dancer, whereas Baltic women are seen as being erotic dancers.
- 8 This refers to a “Dominatrix” show.
- 9 The dancer is given half of the price of a lady drink. The cost of the lady drink used to be approximately 50 FIM (€9).
- 10 This aspect comes through also in Näre (1998).
- 11 See discussion in Chapter 2 of Irigaray (1985).
- 12 Field notes on 17 May 2001.
- 13 Field notes on 14 March 2001.
- 14 I am not implying here an essential identity that is formed in an inner psychological space, but an identity other than the one as an exotic other, as imagined in the sex industry.
- 15 The majority of the erotic dancers I have met have been Estonian-Russians.
- 16 This issue has come up on almost every occasion.
- 17 Notes on fieldwork the night of 15 March 2001. This place has also been recently closed.
- 18 Field notes on 15 March 2001.
- 19 Ibid.
- 20 Field notes on 17 May 2001.
- 21 Field notes on 12 January 2000.
- 22 Field notes on 14 March 2001.
- 23 Field notes on 17 May 2001.
- 24 Field notes on 22 November 2000.
- 25 Personal communication with Reet Nurmi, 25 November 2001.
- 26 Notes on 12 January 2000.

- 27 Ibid.
- 28 Field notes on 15 March 2001.
- 29 Above stories are from the notes on 15 March 2001.
- 30 Notes on 21 November 2000, Rovaniemi.
- 31 This aspect of being a therapist or a psychologist has come up in almost every conversation.
- 32 Field notes on 15 March 2001.
- 33 Field notes on 16 May 2001.
- 34 Field notes on 12 January 2000.
- 35 Taped interview on 10 January 2000.
- 36 Notes on 14 March 2001.
- 37 Notes on 17 May 2001.
- 38 Notes on 15 March 2001.
- 39 Notes on 12 January 2000 and 21 November 2000.
- 40 This way, the erotic dancers' otherness is doubled and the erotic dancers are constrained to the shadows in a similar way as are the foreign prostitutes. Yet her constraining to the shadows takes place in the public eye even more openly, since the erotic clubs and erotic dancing belongs to the entertainment business and thus also to the legitimate consumer culture in a way that prostitution does not. This makes explicit the connections of the legal and illegal sex business at an ideological level, referring to libertarianism and consumer society and, at a practical level, referring to profit-making possibilities from ethnic others.
- 41 Personal communication with Tuula Karvonen, Helsinki Employment Agency. Since the erotic dancers are not recognized by Finnish law, they cannot claim the rights that legally employed individuals can. It seems to me that their working conditions are of secondary importance to the Finnish authorities, for it is not Finnish women citizens who are being systematically exploited.
- 42 Field notes on 12 January 2000.
- 43 Field notes on 17 May 2001.
- 44 Field notes on 15 March 2001.
- 45 Field notes on 14 March 2001.
- 46 Field notes on 12 January 2000.
- 47 Field notes on 15 March 2001.
- 48 Ibid.
- 49 Field notes on 14 March 2001
- 50 Field notes on 21 November 2001.
- 51 Field notes on 22 November 2001.
- 52 This narrative is based on the notes on 12 January 2000 and 14 March 2001 and the appearance of one sex bar in Tampere as it was at the time. Soon afterward, the decorations were changed and a few years later the place was closed.
- 53 This song by Depeche Mode, written by Martin L. Gore, is titled "Personal Jesus," produced in the album "Violator" (1989) and reproduced in *Depeche Mode the singles 86–98* (1998) EMI Publishing Ltd.
- 54 Irigaray (1985: 198–204) analyzes a pornographic scene.
- 55 See discussion on male bonding in sex bars in O'Connell (1998: 164–166) and Jeffreys (1997: 193–195).
- 56 See Irigaray (1985: 202–203)
- 57 See also Irigaray (1985) "Commodities among themselves," in which she criticizes Freud's analysis of female homosexuality as a form of male homosexuality.
- 58 See Irigaray (1985: 106–119).
- 59 See discussion on Irigaray's theory in Chapters 3 and 7.
- 60 This is based also on the notes on 15 March 2001. However, the issue of "learning about men" is often brought up by the dancers. Many of them say that, as a result of this work, they know what men are.

- 61 Irigaray (1985: 198–204).
- 62 Field notes on 17 May 2001.
- 63 Field notes on 15 March 2001.

## **7 Conclusions: narratives of corporeal politics**

- 1 This quote is the first paragraph of a poem, “The Discovery,” by Gwendolyn McEwen, pp. 388, in *The New Oxford Book of Canadian Verse in English*.
- 2 Richard Ashley’s comment on the question of “How global is globalization?” was that globalization cannot be global. International Studies Association conference 2002 in New Orleans.

# Bibliography

- Albrow, Martin (1996) *The Global Age: State and Society Beyond Modernity*, Cambridge: Polity.
- Angeles, Leonora C. (2002) Reflections on Feminist Policy Research on Gender, Agriculture and Global Trade, in *Canadian Women Studies: Women Globalization and International Trade*, 21/22 (4/1), pp. 34–39.
- Appadurai, Arjun (1994) Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy, in Patrick Williams and Laura Crisham (eds) *Colonial Discourse and Post-colonial Theory: A Reader*, pp. 324–339. London: Harvester Wheatsheaf.
- Appadurai, Arjun (1996) *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Appadurai, Arjun (2001) Grassroots Globalization and the Research Imagination, in Arjun Appadurai (ed.) *Globalization*, pp. 1–21. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Aradau, Claudia (2004) The Perverse Politics of Four-Letter Words: Risk and Pity in the Securitization of Human Trafficking, *Millennium*, 33 (2), pp. 251–277.
- Ashley, David (1997) *History Without a Subject: The Postmodern Condition*, Colorado: Westview Press.
- Ashley, Richard (1989) Living on Border Lines: Man, Poststructuralism and War, in James Der Derian and Michael Shapiro (eds) *International/Intertextual Relations: Postmodern Readings of World Politics*, Massachusetts: Lexington Books, pp. 259–322.
- Ashley, Richard (1996) The Achievements of Poststructuralism, in Steve Smith Ken Booth, Marysia Zalewski (eds) *International Theory: Positivism and Beyond*, pp. 240–253. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Axtman, Roland (1998) Globalization, Europe and the State: Introductory Reflections, in Roland Axtman (ed.) *Globalization and Europe: Theoretical and Empirical Investigations*, London: Pinter.
- Bakker, Isabella (1997) Identity, Interest and Ideology: The Terrain of Global Restructuring, in Stephen Gill (ed.) *Globalization, Democratization and Multilateralism*, London: Macmillan Press Ltd.
- Bakker, Isabella (1999) *Engendering Macroeconomic Policy in the Era of Global Restructuring*, paper presented at the Conference on Feminist perspectives on the Paradoxes of Globalization, organized by Research Group: Globalization, Sustainability and Gender, Free University Berlin/University of Münster, 5–6 November 1999.
- Bales, Kevin (2000) Expendable People: Slavery in the Age of Globalisation, *Journal of International Affairs*, 53 (2), pp. 461–484.
- Bartelson, Jens (2000) Three Concepts of Globalization, *International Sociology*, Sage Publications, 15 (2), pp. 180–196.

- Baudrillard, Jean (1988) *Selected Writings*, Mark Poster (ed.), California: Stanford University Press.
- Bauman, Zygmunt (1998) *Globalization: The Human Consequences*, UK: Polity Press.
- Baxi, Upendra (1996) Review Essay, Global Neighbourhood and the Universal Otherhood: Notes on the Report of the Commission on Global Governance, *Alternatives*, 21 (4), pp. 525–549.
- Beneria, Lourdes (ed.) (1982) *Women and Development: The Sexual Division of Labor in Rural Societies*, New York: Praeger Publishers.
- Berndtson, Erik (2000) Globalization as Americanization, in Henri Goverde, Philip G. Cerny, Mark Haugaard and Howard Lentner (eds) *Power in Contemporary Politics: Theories Practices and Globalizations*, pp. 155–169, London: Sage.
- Bishop, Ryan and Lillian S. Robinson (2002) Matkakertomuksia: Thaimaasta palaavien turistien seksipäiväkirjat, in Susanne Thorbek and Bandana Pattanaik (eds) *Rajat ylittävä prostituutio: Globaalien toimintamallien muuttuminen*, pp. 31–45, Sari-Anne Ahvonen (trans.), Helsinki: Like.
- Bochner, Arthur (2001) Narrative's Virtues, *Qualitative Inquiry*, 7 (2), pp. 131–157.
- Braidotti, Rosi (1991) *Patterns of Dissonance: A Study of Women in Contemporary Philosophy*, Elizabeth Guild (trans.), London: Polity Press.
- Braidotti, Rosi (1994) *Nomadic Subjects: Embodiment and Sexual Difference in Contemporary Feminist Theory*, New York: Columbia University Press.
- Brewis Joanna and Linstead, Stephen (2000) *Sex, Work and Sex Work: Eroticizing Organization*, London: Routledge.
- Bridger, Sue, Rebecca Kay, and Kathryn Pinnick (1996) *No More Heroines? Russia, Women and Market*, London: Routledge.
- Butler, Judith (1990) *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*, London: Routledge.
- Butler, Judith (1993) *Bodies that Matter: On the Discursive Limits of Sex*, London: Routledge.
- Butler, Judith (1995) Contingent Foundations, in Linda Nicholson (ed.) *Feminist Contentions*, pp. 35–58, London: Routledge.
- Butler, Judith (1997) *The Psychic Life of Power: Theories in Subjection*, Stanford California: Stanford University Press.
- Canadian Women Studies (2002) *Women Globalization and International Trade*, 21/22 (4/1), pp. 1–235.
- Cerny, Philip G. (1996) What Next for the State?, in Eleanore Kofman and Gillian Youngs (eds) *Globalization: Theory and Practice*, pp. 123–137, London: Biddles.
- Cerny, Philip G. (2000a) Globalization and the Disarticulation of Power: Towards New Middle Ages?, in Henri Goverde, Philip G. Cerny, Mark Haugaard and Howard Lentner (eds) *Power in Contemporary Politics; Theories, Practices and Globalizations*, pp. 170–186, London: Sage.
- Cerny, Philip G. (2000b) Restructuring the Political Arena; Globalization and the Paradoxes of the Competition State, in Randall G. Germain (ed.) *Globalization and Its Critics: Perspectives from Political Economy*, pp. 117–138. London: Macmillan Press Ltd.
- Chapkis, Wendy (1997) *Live Sex Acts: Women Performing Erotic Labor*, London: Routledge.
- Chow, Esther Ngan-ling (2003) Gender Matters: Studying Globalization and Social Change in the 21st Century, *International Sociology*, 18 (3), pp. 443–460.
- Commission on Global Governance (1995) *Our Global Neighbourhood*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Darby, Philip (2003) 'Reconfiguring the International: Knowledge Machines, Boundaries, and Exclusions', *Alternatives*, 28 (1), pp. 141–166.
- Dean, Mitchell (1999) *Governmentality: Power and Rule in Modern Society*, London: Sage.
- Denzin, Norman K. and Yvonna S. Lincoln (1998) 'The Fifth Moment', in Norman K. Denzin and Yvonna S. Lincoln (eds) *The Landscape of Qualitative Research: Theories and Issues*, pp. 407–429, California: Sage.
- Der Derian, James (1989) 'The Boundaries of Knowledge and Power in International Relations', in James Der Derian and Michael Shapiro (eds) *International/Intertextual Relations: Postmodern Readings of World Politics*, Massachusetts: Lexington Books, pp. 3–10.
- Dillon, Michael and Reid Julian (2000) 'Global Governance, Liberal Peace and Complex Emergency', *Alternatives*, 24 (1), pp. 117–143.
- Doezema, Jo (1996) 'Choice in Prostitution', in Marjut Jyrkinen (ed.) *Changing Faces of Prostitution: Conference Book Helsinki 3–5 May 1995*, pp. 56–68, Helsinki: Meripaino OY.
- Doezema, Jo (1998) 'Forced to Choose: Beyond the Voluntary v. Forced Prostitution Dichotomy', in Kamala Kempadoo and Joe Doezema (eds) *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*, pp. 34–50, New York: Routledge.
- Ehrenreich, Barbara and Arlie Russel Hochschild (2003) *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy*, London: Granta Books.
- Ellis, Carolyn and Arthur Bochner (eds) (1993) *Composing Ethnography: Alternative Forms of Qualitative Writing*, California: Altamera Press.
- Ellis, Carolyn and Leigh Berger (2002) 'Their Story/My Story/Our Story', in Jaber Gubrium and James A. Holstein (eds) *Handbook of Interview Research: Context and Method*, pp. 849–875, California: Sage.
- Ellis, Carolyn and Michael G. Flaherty (1992) 'An Agenda for the Interpretation of Lived Experience', in Carolyn Ellis and Michael G. Flaherty (eds) *Investigating Subjectivity: Research on Lived Experience*, pp. 1–13, California: Sage.
- Enloe, Cynthia (1988) *Bananas, Beaches, Bases: Making Feminist Sense of International Relations*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Enloe, Cynthia (1993) *The Morning After: Sexual Politics at the End of the Cold War*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Enloe, Cynthia (1996) 'Margins, Silences and Bottom Rungs: How to Overcome the Underestimation of Power in the Study of International Relations', in Steve Smith, Ken Booth and Marysia Zalewski (eds) *International Theory: Positivism and Beyond*, pp. 186–202, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Evans, Tony (2000) 'Citizenship and Human Rights in the Age of Globalization', *Alternatives*, 25 (4), pp. 415–438.
- Farrell, Graham, Matthew H. Fleming and John Roman (2000) 'The Shadow Economy', *Journal of International Affairs*, 53 (2), pp. 387–412.
- Foucault, Michel (1977) *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*, Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Foucault, Michel (1980) *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972–1977 by Michel Foucault*, in Colin Gordon (ed.), London: Harvester Wheatsheaf Press.
- Foucault, Michel (1983) 'Afterword, The Subject and Power', in Dreyfus and Rabinow (eds) *Michel Foucault Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*, pp. 208–225, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

- Foucault, Michel (1984) *The Foucault Reader*, New York: Pantheon Books.
- Foucault, Michel (1988) On Power, in Lawrence D. Kritzman (ed.) *Michel Foucault: Politics, Philosophy, Culture, Interviews and Other Writings 1977–1984*, pp. 96–109, New York: Routledge.
- Foucault, Michel (1991) *The Foucault Effect, Studies in Governmentality*, Graham Burchell, Colin Gordon and Peter Miller (eds), Exeter: BPC Wheatons Ltd.
- Foucault, Michel (1997) *Ethics, Subjectivity and Truth: Essential Works of Foucault 1954–1984 Vol I*, in Paul Rabinow (ed.), New York: The New Press.
- Frank, Katherine (2000) The Management of Hunger: Using Fiction in Writing Anthropology, *Qualitative Inquiry*, 6 (4), pp. 474–488.
- Gaffney, Justin and Kate Beverley (2001) Contextualizing the Construction and Social Organization of the Commercial Male Sex Industry in London at the Beginning of the Twenty-first Century, *Feminist Review: Sex Work Reassessed*, 67, pp. 133–141.
- Gill, Stephen (1997a) Transformation and Innovation in the Study of World Order, in Stephen Gill and James H. Mittelman (eds) *Innovation and Transformation in International Studies*, pp. 5–24, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Gill, Stephen (1997b) Globalization, Democratization & Indifference, in James H. Mittelman (ed.) *Globalization: Critical Reflections*, pp. 205–228, Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers.
- Gill, Stephen and James H. Mittelman (eds) (1997) *Innovation and Transformation in International Studies*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Gould, Arthur (2002) Ruotsin prostituutiolaki: feminismi, huumeet ja ulkomailta tuleva uhka, in Susanne Thorbek and Bandana Pattanaik (eds) *Rajat ylittävä prostituutio: Globaalien toimintamallien muuttuminen*, pp. 282–301, Sari-Anne Ahvonen (trans.), Helsinki: Like.
- Goverde, Henri, Philip G. Cerny, Mark Haugaard and Howard Lentner (eds) (2000) *Power in Contemporary Politics: Theories Practices and Globalizations*, London: Sage.
- Grosz, Elisabeth (1993) *Volatile Bodies: Towards a Corporeal Feminism*, Sydney: Allen Unwin.
- GSN Report (1997) *Crime & Servitude: An Exposé of the Traffick in Women for Prostitution from the Newly Independent States*. Prepared by Gillian Galdwell, Steven Galster, and Nadia Steinzor, Washington: Global Survival Network.
- Haaland, Asta Beate (1998) Tana Report Network North Against Prostitution and Violence, Norway ([www.uri.edu/artsci/wms/hughes/catw/tanarep.htm](http://www.uri.edu/artsci/wms/hughes/catw/tanarep.htm)), Accessed 30 August 2001.
- Harding, Sandra (1991) *Whose Science? Whose Knowledge? Thinking from Women's Lives*, Milton Keynes: Open University Press.
- Hattori, Tomohisha (2006) A Critical Naturalist Approach to Power and Hegemony: Analyzing Giving Practices, in Mark Haugaard and Howard H. Lentner (eds) *Hegemony and Power: Consensus and Coercion in Contemporary Politics*, pp. 151–167, Lanham: Lexington Books.
- Haugaard, Mark (2006) Power and Hegemony in Social Theory, in Mark Haugaard and Howard H. Lentner (eds) *Hegemony and Power: Consensus and Coercion in Contemporary Politics*, pp. 45–64, Lanham: Lexington Books.
- Hirst, Paul (1997) Challenges of Globalization to the Nation State, *Politiikka*, 39 (1), pp. 3–13.
- Hirst, Paul and G. Thompson (1996) *Globalization in Question: The International Economy and the Possibilities of Governance*, Cambridge: Polity.

- Hughes, Donna (1996) Sex Tours via the Internet Published in *Agenda: A Journal about Women and Gender* (South Africa) 1996, No. 28, pp. 71–76, found at the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women web site, [www.catwinternational.org](http://www.catwinternational.org). Accessed 15 May 2001.
- Hughes, Donna (1997) Policing the Internet – Combating Pornography and Violence on the Internet: A European Approach, found at Coalition Against Trafficking in Women web site, [www.catwinternational.org](http://www.catwinternational.org). Accessed 15 May 2001.
- Hughes, Donna (2000) The Natasha Trade: The Transnational Shadow Market of Trafficking in Women, *Journal of International Affairs*, 53 (2), pp. 625–652.
- Irigaray, Luce (1985) *This Sex Which Is Not One*, Catherine Porter (trans.), New York: Cornell University Press.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (1997) *The Idea of Prostitution*, Australia: Spinifex Press.
- Kauppinen, Jaana (1999) Liikkuva Prostituutio ja Kansainvälinen naiskauppa, in Rosa Meriläinen and Matti Säteri (eds) *Seksibisnes*, pp. 25–32, Helsinki: Vihreä Sivistysliitto.
- Kauppinen, Jaana (2000) Kansainvälinen Ihmiskauppa ja Suomalaisten suhtautuminen ulkomaalaisiin prostituoituihin, *Naistutkimus*, 2, pp. 60–65.
- Kempadoo, Kamala (2001) Freelancer, Temporary Wives, and Beach Boys: Researching Sex Work in the Caribbean, *Feminist Review: Sex Work Reassessed*, 67, pp. 39–62.
- Kong, Travis S. K. (2006) What It Feels Like for a Whore: The Body Politics of Women Performing Erotic Labour in Hong Kong, *Gender Work and Organization*, 13 (5), pp. 409–434.
- Konrad, Helga (2002) Trafficking in Human Beings – the Ugly Face of Europe, *Helsinki Monitor: Quarterly on Security and Cooperation in Europe*, 13 (3), pp. 260–271.
- Krause, Jill (1996) Gender Inequalities and Feminist Politics in Global Perspective, in Eleonore Kofman and Gillian Youngs (eds) *Globalization: Theory and Practice*, pp. 225–238, London: Pinter.
- Kvinnoforum Report (1998) *Trafficking in Women for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation: Mapping the Situation and Existing Organizations Working in Belarus, Russia, the Baltic and Nordic States*, Stockholm: Foundation of Women Forum/Stiftelsen Kvinnoforum, funded by the Swedish Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Accessed 4 May 2001. [www.qweb.kvinnoforum.se](http://www.qweb.kvinnoforum.se).
- Kvinnoforum (2002) *A Resource Book for Working against Trafficking in Women and Girls*, Stockholm: Kvinnoforum.
- Lantz, Inger (1999) The Punter- Prostitutes Clients in Stockholm, in Laura Keeler and Marjut Jyrkinen (eds) *Who's Buying? The Clients of Prostitution*, pp. 42–46, Ministry of Social Affairs and Health, Publications on Equality 1999:4, Helsinki: Oy Edita Ab.
- Laukkanen, Mari-Elina (2000) Suomalainen päivälehdistö seksikaupan foorumina, *Sosi-aali ja terveystministeriön selvityksiä*, 2000: 12, Helsinki: Oy Edita Ab.
- LEFÖ Report (1997) Migration of Women – Reflection of Unjust World: A report on the experience of LEFÖ regarding migration of women and trafficking in women, *Trafficking in Women: Women's Policy Perspectives after the 95' World Conference on Women*, Vol. 4., Vienna: Federal Chancellery.
- Leskinen, Jari (2002) Organisoitu Paritus ja Prostituutio Suomessa, *Rikosraportti 2002*, Keskusrikospoliisi (KRP), Helsinki: Hakapaino, pp. 9–30.
- Lim, Lean Lin (ed.) (1998) *The Sex Sector: The Economic and Social Bases of Prostitution in Southeast Asia*, Geneva Switzerland: International Labor Office.
- Macleán, John (2000) Philosophical Roots of Globalization and Philosophical Routes to Globalization, in Randall G. Germain (ed.) *Globalization and Its Critics Perspectives from Political Economy*, pp. 3–66, London: Macmillan Press Ltd.

- Malarek, Victor (2003) *Natashat: Seksibisneksen uhrin*, Leena Nivala (trans.) (2005), Keuruu: Otava Kirjapaino Oy.
- McCormack, Brian (2002) Postcolonialism in an Age of Globalization: Opening International Relations Theory to Identities in Movement, *Alternatives* 27 (1), pp. 99–116.
- McEwen, Gwendolyn (1983) The Discovery, *The New Oxford Book of Canadian Verse in English*, Poems chosen by Margaret Atwood, Second edition 1983, Toronto: Oxford University Press, p. 388.
- Martti, Lehti and Kauko Aromaa (2002) *Trafficking in Human Beings, Illegal Immigration and Finland*, Helsinki: Finnish National Institute of Legal Policy.
- Meyer, Mary K. and Elisabeth Prügl (eds) (1999) *Gender Politics in Global Governance*, Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Mies, Maria and Vandana Shiva (1993) *Ecofeminism*, Halifax: Fernwood Publications.
- Mohanty, Chandra Talpade (1994) Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses, in Patrick Williams and Laura Chrisam (eds) *Colonial Discourse and Postcolonial Theory*, London: Harvester Wheatsheaf, pp. 196–220.
- Mushakoji, Kinhide (2000) *Trafficking and Gender Security: The Global Sex Industry, the States and Criminals*, paper presented in International Political Studies Association World Conference in Quebec 1 August, in session FS 4 on Globalization, Democratization and Gender.
- Näre, Sari (1998) Seksibaarien seksuaalipolitiikkaa, in Taava Koskinen (ed.) *Kurtisaaneista kunnian naisiin*, pp. 219–232, Helsinki: Yliopistopaino.
- Näre, Sari (1999) Libertarianism in the Discourse of Sex-Bar Customers, in Laura Keeler and Marjut Jyrkinen (eds) *Who's Buying?: The Clients of Prostitution*, pp. 29–33, Ministry of Social Affairs and Health, Publications on Equality 1999:4, Helsinki: Oy Edita Ab.
- Näre, Sari and Jaana Lähteenmaa (1994) Lama ja Helsingin seksibaarit (The Recession and Sex Bars in Helsinki), in Vesa Keskinen (ed.) *Lama sulkee – Lama avaa*, pp. 195–210, Helsinki: Helsingin kaupungin tietokeskus.
- Näre, Sari and Jaana Lähteenmaa (1995) Seksityötä baarien yössä- kiista seksibaareista (Sex Work in the Bar Night Life), in Jaana Lähteenmaa and Laura Mäkelä (eds) *Helsingin yö*, Helsinki: Helsingin kaupungin tietokeskus.
- O'Connell, Davidson Julia (1998) *Prostitution, Power and Freedom*, USA: University of Michigan Press.
- Palin, Tutta (1996) Ruumis, in Anu Koivunen and Marianne Liljeström (eds) *Avainsanat: 10 askelta feministiseen tutkimukseen*, pp. 225–244, Tampere: Vastapaino.
- Pellerin, Hélèn (1996) Global Restructuring and International Migration; Consequences for the Globalization of Politics, in Eleanore Kofman and Gillian Youngs (eds) *Globalization: Theory and Practice*, pp. 81–96, London: Biddles.
- Penttinen, Elina (2000) Capitalism as a System of Global Power, in Henri Goverde, Mark Haugaard, Howard Lentner and Philip Cerny (eds) *Political Power: Theories, Practices and Globalizations*, London: Sage.
- Penttinen, Elina (2004) Whose Voices Matter? Feminists Stretch the Boundaries of International Relations Discipline, in Subhash Durlabhji (ed.) *Power in Focus: Perspectives from Multiple Disciplines*, pp. 63–93, Ohio: Wyndham Hall Press.
- Penttinen Elina (2006) Providing Security: White Western Feminists' Protecting "Other" Women, in Mark Haugaard and Howard H. Lentner (eds) *Hegemony and Power: Consensus and Coercion in Contemporary Politics*, pp. 133–149, Lanham: Lexington Books.
- Peterson V. Spike (1996) Shifting Ground(s): Epistemological and Territorial Remapping in the Contexts of Globalization(s), in Eleonore Kofman and Gillian Youngs (eds) *Globalization: Theory and Practice*, pp. 11–28, London: Pinter.

- Peterson V. Spike and Anne Sisson Runyan (1993) *Global Gender Issues*, Colorado: Westview Press.
- Pettman, Jan Jindy (1996) *Worlding Women: A Feminist International Politics*, New York: Routledge.
- Pettman, Jan Jindy (1997) Body Politics: International Sex Tourism, *Third World Quarterly*, 18 (1) March, pp. 93–108.
- Posadskaya, Anastasia (1994) Women as the Objects and Motive Force of Change in Our Time, in Anastasia Posadskaya (ed.) *Women in Russia; A New Era in Russian Feminism*, pp. 8–13, Kate Clark (trans.), London: Verso.
- Rabinow, Paul (1984) *Introduction: Michel Foucault: The Foucault Reader*, New York: Pantheon Books, pp. 3–29.
- Richardson, Laurel (1990) *Writing Strategies: Reaching Diverse Audiences*, California: Sage.
- Richardson, Laurel (1997) *Fields of Play: Constructing an Academic Life*, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press.
- Rickard, Wendy (2001) Been There, Seen it, Done it, I've Got the T-shirt: British Sex Workers Reflect on Jobs, Hopes, the Future and Retirement, *Feminist Review: Sex Work Reassessed*, 67 (1), pp. 111–132.
- Ronai, Carol Rambo (1992) The Reflexive Self Through Narrative: A Night in the Life of an Erotic Dancer/Researcher, in Carolyn Ellis and Michael G. Flaherty (eds) *Investigating Subjectivity: Research on Lived Experience*, pp. 102–124, California: Sage.
- Runyan, Anne Sisson (1999) Women in the Neoliberal Frame, in Mary K. Meyer and Elisabeth Prügel (eds) *Gender Politics in Global Governance*, pp. 210–220, Lanham, Maryland: Rowman Littlefield Publishers Inc.
- Sassen, Saskia (2000) Women's Burden: Counter-Geographies of Globalization and the Feminization of Survival, *Journal of International Affairs*, 53 (2), pp. 503–524.
- Skilbrei, May-Len (2001) The Rise and Fall of the Norwegian Massage Parlours: Changes in the Norwegian Prostitution Setting in the 1990s, *Feminist Review: Sex Work Reassessed*, Spring 2001, 67, pp. 63–77.
- Snellman, Aino (2001) Lääkäriinä koettua ihmiskaupasta ja Venäjän Arjesta, *Naiskauppa Euroopan Reunalla: Tenonlaakson prostituutio maailmanlaajuisen verkoston osana*, Utsjoki: Duovvi ry, pp. 12–13.
- Sparkes, Andrew C. (2002) Autoethnography: Self-Indulgence or Something More?, in Arthur Bochner and Carolyn Ellis (eds) *Ethnographically Speaking: Autoethnography, Literature and Aesthetics*, pp. 209–232, California: Altamira Press.
- Spector, Jessica (ed.) (2006) *Prostitution and Pornography: Philosophical Debate about the Sex Industry*, Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Stark, Christine (2006) Stripping as a System of Prostitution, in Jessica Spector (ed.) *Prostitution and Pornography: Philosophical Debate about the Sex Industry*, pp. 40–49, Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Stiglitz, Joseph E. (2004) *Globalisaation sivutuotteet*, Juhani Yli-Vakkuri (trans.), Helsinki: Like.
- Sylvester, Christine (1994) *Feminist Theory and International Relations in a Postmodern Era*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sylvester, Christine (1996) The Contributions of Feminist Theory to International Relations, in Steve Smith, Ken Booth and Marysia Zalewski (eds) *International Theory: Positivism and Beyond*, pp. 254–278, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sylvester, Christine (1998) Masculinity, Femininity, and International Relations: Or Who Goes to the Moon With Bonaparte and the Adder, in Marysia Zalewski and Jane

- Parpart (eds) *The Man Question in International Relations*, pp. 185–198, Colorado: Westview Press.
- Sylvester, Christine (2002) *Feminist International Relations: An Unfinished Journey*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Therborn, Göran (2000) Globalizations: Dimensions, Historical Waves, Regional Effects, Normative Governance, *International Sociology* 15 (2), Sage Publications, pp. 151–179.
- Thorbeck, Susanne (2002) Euroopan perintö: miesnäkökulmia, in Susanne Thorbeck and Bandana Pattanaik (eds) *Rajat ylittävä prostituutio: Globaalien toimintamallien muuttuminen*, pp. 46–70, Sari-Anne Ahvonen (trans.), Helsinki: Like.
- Thorbeck, Susanne and Bandana Pattanaik (eds) (2002) *Rajat ylittävä prostituutio: Globaalien toimintamallien muuttuminen*, Sari-Anne Ahvonen (trans.), Helsinki: Like.
- Tickner, Ann (1992) *Gender in International Relations: Feminist Perspectives on Achieving Global Security*, New York: Columbia University Press.
- Truong, Thanh-Dam (1990) *Sex, Money and Morality: Prostitution and Tourism in Southeast Asia*, London: Zed Books.
- Uçarer, Emek M. (1999) Trafficking in Women: Alternate Migration or Modern Slave Trade?, in Mary K. Meyer and Elisabeth Prügl (eds) *Gender Politics in Global Governance*, pp. 230–244, Lanham: Rowman Littlefield Publishers Inc.
- TRIP Report (2003) Trafficking in Persons Report, released by the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, U.S Department of State, accessed 11 June 2003. [www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2003/](http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2003/)
- Vertinskaya, Luobov (2000) Prostitution and the Local Society, *Network North against Prostitution and Violence: Collected Materials of the International Conference "Prostitution is a Global Problem,"* 18–19 November 2000, Murmansk, Russia.
- Whitebrook, Maureen (2001) *Identity, Narrative and Politics*, London: Routledge.
- Wichterich, Christa (2002) *Globalisoitu nainen: Raportteja epätasa-arvon tulevaisuudesta*, Helsinki: Like.
- Wijers, Marjan (1998) Women, Labor, and Migration: The Position of Trafficked Women and Strategies for Support, in Kamala Kempadoo and Joe Dozema (eds) *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*, pp. 69–78, New York: Routledge.
- Young, Iris Marion (2003) The Logic of Masculinities Protection: Reflections on the Current Security State, *Signs*, 29 (1), pp. 1–25.
- Zalewski, Marysia and Jane Parpart (eds) (1998) *The Man Question in International Relations*, Colorado: Westview Press.

### Newspaper articles

- Helsingin Sanomat*, 17 June 2001 Ari Lahdenmäki and Riku Rantala: Itämafia tuo ilotyttöjä Helsinkiin (Eastern mafia brings prostitutes to Helsinki).
- Helsingin Sanomat*, 5 August 2001 Irina Panitsh: Unelmien prinssi josta tuli painajainen (The dream prince, who turned into a nightmare).
- Helsingin Sanomat*, 12 November 2002 Jaakko Tahkolahti: Jari Vilén: Hallituksen puuttuttava seksikauppaan: Venäläisten ilotyttöjen asiakkaista suuri osa tulee Ruotsista Suomeen. (Jari Vilén: the government must tackle sex business: The majority of clients of Russian prostitutes come from Sweden).
- Helsingin Sanomat*, 29 July 2003. Henriikki Timgren: Laajamittainen naiskauppa jatkuu vilkkaana Keminmaassa (Large scale traffic in women continues in Keminmaa).
- Pohjolan Sanomat*, 22 November 2000 Sari Pelttari-Heikka: Tyttökauppa pesiytyi nyt Tornioon (The girlbusiness is found now in Tornio).

# Index

References to notes are prefixed by *n*.

abject bodies 20–21, 22–24  
adaptation 36, 80, 122  
adjustment 36, 54, 80  
advertisements 73, 101  
agency: of the abject 80  
anti-trafficking feminist debate 18  
apartment prostitution 69–70, 72  
Appadurai, Arjun 36, 40–41, 45, 138  
Aromaa, Kauko 60, 70  
autoethnography 11–14

Bales, Kevin 48  
Baltic women 1–2  
bar owners 71  
bars *see* sex bars  
Bartelson, Jens 3  
bio-power: of globalization 16, 23, 24–31  
Bochner, Arthur 8, 10  
bodies: kind needed 38; kind of 25  
body 9–10, 12; and IR research 136–137  
Braidotti, Rosi 20, 54  
Butler, Judith 13, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 137

capitalism: and bio-power 26  
case studies: Russian prostitutes 62–88  
child prostitution 47, 68  
children 43  
Coalition Against Trafficking in Women 145*n*1  
commercial sex 47, 49–50  
commercial sex business 73–74  
consumerism 30, 49  
corporeal politics: globalization as 6–7  
corporeality: and subjectivation 24–25  
corruption 48  
countries: involved in trafficking 43

criminal organizations 42, 43–44, 45, 46, 68–69, 69–70, 76, 100–101  
cultural identities 40–41

Darby, Philip 9, 137  
dead matter (excrement) 22, 23  
Dean, Mitchell 28  
demonstrations 108–109  
deportation 76  
Descartes 10  
Dillon, Michael 35, 36  
discrimination: against women 4, 5  
Doezema, Jo 15  
drug trafficking 67, 68  
dualism 9–10, 12  
Duovvi organization 108

earnings 69–70  
“Eastern girls” 1–2, 53, 68, 72, 74, 91–93;  
*see also* Russian women  
economic policies: effect on prostitution 33  
economic recession 73–74  
embodied subjectivity 22–24  
Enloe, Cynthia 5  
enterprise: rules of 30  
erotic clubs 112–133  
erotic dancers 16, 141–142; narratives 112–133  
erotic restaurants 71, 73–74  
ethnicity 53–54  
ethnoscapes 40, 41–45, 50, 66–69, 100–102, 108–109, 141  
excrement (dead matter) 22, 23  
exoticism 2, 26, 53, 57, 88  
export labor 34–35

*fantasma* 49  
feminist approaches 3, 4–6, 11, 18, 136–137

- feminist criticism 48–49  
 feminist maps and guides 38–39  
 financescapes 40, 46–48, 50, 69–71, 101–102, 141  
 flows: global 40–41  
 fluid: woman as 23–24  
 forced prostitution 15–16, 29, 67  
 Foreigner Act 69, 75, 76  
 Foucault, Michael: bodies 25; governmentality 26–27, 138; liberalism 28; objectification 19; population and bio-power 17; on power 137; social bodies 26; subjectivity 15, 22
- GAATW *see* Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women  
*Gender Politics in Global Governance* 4  
 gendered effects: neoliberalist governmentality 30–31  
 Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW) 145*n*1  
 global flows 40–41  
*Global Gender Issues* 4  
 global neighborhood 35–36  
 global villages 54–55  
 globalization: study of 59; as a term 3  
 governmentality: as bio-power 25–31; of globalized world economy 25–26  
 Grosz, Elisabeth 9–10, 12
- Helsinki: case studies 62–88  
 homelessness 54, 55, 67  
 hospitality services 5  
 Hughes, Donna 47, 48, 50  
 human rights discourse 6, 15
- ideologies 59  
 ideoscapes 40, 48–50, 50, 73–75, 141  
 illegal sex trade 35, 47, 52–53, 71  
 IMF 5  
 immigration policies 41  
 income: from erotic dancing 124–126  
 individualism 49  
 Internet 45–46, 49, 50, 67, 72  
 IR literature: and globalization 2–3  
 Irigaray, Luce 2, 13, 23–24, 128, 129, 144*n*1  
 Ivalo 89, 90–102
- Kauppinen, Jaana 74  
 Kempadoo, Kamala 53  
 Konrad, Helga 42
- Lähteenmaa, Jaana 49
- landscapes 59–60, 138, 139; ethnoscapescapes 40, 41–45, 66–69; financescapes 40, 46–48, 69–71; ideoscapes 40, 48–50, 73–75; in Lapland 100–102; mediascapes 40, 50–52, 71–73; and Russian women 75–77; technoscapes 40, 45–46, 71–73
- Lapland: case studies 89–111  
 Lebed, Mikhail 47–48  
 legal sex trade 35, 47, 52–53, 71  
 legal situation: Finland 69  
 Lehti, Martti 60, 70  
 leisure industry 47  
 leisure travel 56  
 Leskinen, Jari 67, 69, 70  
 levels: of globalization 1  
 liberalism 28–29; and feminist critics 4  
 libertarianism 49–50, 73–75
- McCormack, Brian 3  
 mail-order brides 45–46  
 Malarek, Victor 148*n*8  
 male clients 34  
 male consumers 53–54  
 managers 125–126  
 marriage deal narrative 102–108  
 masculinist bias 4, 5, 32–33  
 masturbation 116, 120, 122, 123, 149*n*14  
 mediascapes 40, 71–73, 101, 108–109, 141  
 Meyer, Mary K. 4  
 migration 32, 34–35, 44  
*Modernity at Large* 40  
 money-laundering 46, 48, 50  
 movement: of women 66–67  
 Murmansk 101  
 Mushakoji, Kinhide 47
- Näre, Sari 49, 50, 64, 74, 115  
 narrative turn 8–14, 134–136  
 narratives 58–59  
 neighborhoods 35–36, 44  
 neighborliness 73  
 neoliberalism 48, 59  
 neoliberalist global governmentality 29–35, 49, 138  
 neoliberalist globalization 17  
 nightclubs 71; *see also* erotic clubs  
 nomadism 54–55, 67, 133, 142  
 numbers: of trafficked women 42–43
- objectification: three modes of 19–22
- pastoral power 27–28  
 performance of femininity 116–117

- performativity: and subjectivity 137  
 personal narratives 11  
 Peterson, V. Spike 4, 5  
 Pettmen, Jan Jindy 4, 5, 32, 45, 53  
 phallic sex 1  
 phone operators 70, 72–73  
 pimps 67, 68–69, 70, 78, 94, 95  
 police 78, 81  
 political economy: of sex 5  
 population 35–36  
 population flows 41  
 pornography 49  
 post-Soviet countries 32  
 postmodern feminism 4, 5, 19  
 power: and globalization 137; and  
   subjectivation 21–22; *see also* bio-  
   power  
 prejudice 44  
 private rooms 121, 122–124  
 pro-prostitution movements 49  
 pro-sex worker debate 17–18  
 profitability 46, 47–48, 69–70  
 prostitutes: categories 17–18; ethnoscapes  
   41–45; and subjectivation 16–17  
 prostitution: forced and voluntary 15–16,  
   29  
 Prostitution and Procuring in Finland  
   report 66  
 prostitution rings 69–70  
 Prügl, Elisabeth 4  
 push and pull factors 32–33, 42  
  
 racist representations 52  
 “red meat” 92  
 Reid, Julian 35, 36  
 representations: stereotypical 52  
 researchers: position of 61–63, 117–119,  
   142  
 resistance movement 108–109  
 rights 17  
 rights movements 17, 18  
 “romance tourism” 45, 55–56  
 Runyan, Anne Sisson 4, 30  
 Russian prostitutes: case studies (Helsinki)  
   62–88; nomadism 54–55  
 Russian women 1–2, 33, 53; *see also*  
   “Eastern girls”  
  
 Saariselkä 98–99  
 safe sex practices 76  
 Sassen, Saskia 48  
 scale: of trafficking 42–43  
 science-based knowledge 28  
 scripts: international relations 65–75; “not  
   a client” and “other than a whore”  
   position 77–80; personal feminist 63–65  
 sex bars 61–63, 73–74, 81, 115  
*Sex, Money and Morality* 32  
 sex objects 52, 53, 85, 117, 123  
 sex tourism 5, 32, 34, 45–46, 53–54, 64, 68  
 sex tours 72  
 sex-trafficking: as a term 16  
 sex workers: as a term 16  
 sex workers’ rights movements 17, 18  
 sexist representations 52  
 sexscapes: ethnoscapes 66–69;  
   financescapes 46–48, 69–71; ideoscape  
   73–75; in Lapland 100–102;  
   mediascapes 71–73; technoscapes  
   45–46, 71–73; as a term 39  
 shadow globalization: meaning of 7  
 situated narratives 11–14  
 Skilbrei, May-Len 44  
 slavery 43–44, 48  
 social other 22  
 Southeast Asia 33–34  
 Sparkes, Andrew C. 11–12  
 standpoint feminism 4  
 stereotypical representations 52, 109  
 stereotypical sex objects *see* sex objects  
 strippers *see* erotic dancers  
 striptease routine 85–86  
 subjectivation 16–17, 19–22, 24–25, 59,  
   137, 145*n*3  
  
 Tallin 72, 73  
 technoscapes 40, 45–46, 50, 71–73, 101,  
   141  
 Thailand 34  
 tipping 1, 114, 118, 120  
 Tompkins, Jane 10–11  
 tourism 34; *see also* sex tourism  
*Trafficking in Human Beings, Illegal  
 Immigration and Finland* 60  
 trafficking in women: case studies 89–111;  
   definition 15–16; flow 43; numbers  
   42–43  
 trafficking routes 147*n*8  
 travel: of women 66–67  
 Truong, Thanh-Dam 32  
 Turunen, Uljas 98, 99  
  
 unemployment 33, 65–66  
 United Nations Decade for Women 6  
 Utsjoki 102–108, 110  
  
 violence 46; against pimps 69; against  
   women 6, 15

- voluntary prostitution 15–16, 29
- wages 4
- websites 46, 72
- Whitebrook, Maureen 11
- woman: as fluid 23–24
- women: in Asia 32; as cheap labour 4; and discrimination 4, 5; “Eastern” *see* “Eastern girls”; specular 116–119, 131, 132; as stereotypical sex object 52–53; trafficking in *see* trafficking in women; travel 66–67; and unemployment 33, 65–66, 92; and violence 6
- women’s movements 6
- women’s rights 6
- work permits 113
- World Bank 5
- Worlding Women* 4, 32